



Monitoring system for the implementation of development
projects financed by the European Community

Monitoring Review of the Tacis NP Monitoring Programme Ukraine



This project is funded by
the European Union



On behalf of
the consortium

October 2005

MONITORING REVIEW OF THE TACIS PROGRAMME PERFORMANCE IN UKRAINE (in the period 2002-2005)

Contents

- General provisions	1
- Priority areas of cooperation	2
- Main observations	3
- General recommendations	4
- Recommendations by sectors	5
- Recommendations by project components	8
- References	10
- Annexes	

GENERAL PROVISIONS

The objective of this document, prepared by the Kiev Monitoring Team in support of the preparation of a new Country Strategy Paper (CSP) for Ukraine after year 2006, is to review to what extent the targets of the previous CSP 2002-2006 [3] and respective National Indicative Programmes (NIP) during 2002-2005 [3-5] have been achieved and what key factors influenced the performance of the Tacis Programme in Ukraine.

This review cannot be treated as a programme evaluation since the analysis focuses on individual project level with certain comments on the performance in distinct sectors. Also, it is beyond the scope of the monitoring mandate to make evaluation of projects after their completion. Finally, monitoring does not take into consideration all aspects of the project context, like for example preparatory phase of the project or support given by other donors.

The present review is based on the monitoring reports and monitors' assessment of the Tacis projects implemented during 2002-2005. The monitoring of the projects was based on the Project Cycle Management (PCM) approach: project design (ToR), project implementation (delivering of results) and possible follow-up actions (sustainability). With regard to the methodology, the logical framework approach (LFA) was applied and result oriented monitoring (ROM) was used. Only the ROM reports (loaded in the MONIS during 2002-2005) have been taken into consideration in this review, which total number is 217, as at August 15, 2005. A full list of the monitoring reports reviewed is attached as Annex 1. Only the performance of the National and Regional Tacis Programmes was analysed, neither the Nuclear Safety Programme nor the Tempus Programme have been reviewed. References from the previous monitoring assessment document [8] also were used for comparison with the proposed conclusions and recommendations.

The main project features and components like *Contractor's performance, Contribution of the Project Partner to the project, Relevance and quality of design, Achievements of results, Achievement of project objectives and Sustainability of results* were respectively analysed and commented. Such analysis might be potentially useful for enhancement of certain elements of the Tacis programming.

The review focuses on the priority areas of cooperation, which will be commented further in more details. The relevance of the projects to the stated priorities and national strategies was analysed, as well as their impact and potential sustainability. No attempt was made to grade the analysis on the basis of project budget, as well no review was made of the programming and further administrative management of projects.

PRIORITY AREAS OF COOPERATION

The EU assistance during the reference period 2002-2005 covers the priority areas of co-operation defined in the Country Strategy Paper 2002-2006 [3] and respectively replicated in the Indicative Programme 2004-2006 [5]:

- **Support for Institutional, Legal and Administrative Reform**
 - Legal and administrative reform
 - Justice and Home Affairs Action Plan and border related issues
 - Civil society, media and democracy
 - Education and Training
- **Support to the private sector and assistance for economic development**
 - Assistance to enterprise development
 - Development of financial markets
 - Local development in selected municipalities
 - Energy sector reform
- **Support in addressing the social consequences of transition**
 - Health sector reform
 - Support to the development of social assistance policy and services targeting vulnerable groups

The EU-Ukraine Action Plan [7] prepared under the European Neighbourhood Policy (ENP) [2,6] also was properly taken into consideration for estimation and formulation of the type and scope of further EU assistance. The EU-Ukraine Action Plan supports the Ukraine's political and economic reforms and includes elements to strengthen democracy and to help prepare Ukraine in the preparation for membership of the WTO. It also sets out steps towards deepening the dialogue on energy, transport and the environment and facilitates the opening of some Community programmes to Ukraine:

- Further strengthening the stability and effectiveness of institutions guaranteeing democracy and the rule of law.
- Ensuring the democratic conduct of elections in Ukraine in accordance with OSCE standards.
- Ensuring respect for the freedom of the media and freedom of expression.
- Developing possibilities for enhancing EU-Ukraine consultations on crisis management.
- Enhanced co-operation in the field of disarmament and non-proliferation.
- Enhanced co-operation in our common neighbourhood and regional security, including addressing border issues.
- Accession to the WTO, which is a first and crucial step towards a Free Trade Agreement with the EU.
- Intensified bilateral trading links, focused on the gradual removal of restrictions and non-tariff barriers that impede bilateral trade. As part of this the EU will support the Ukraine in implementing the necessary regulatory reform.
- Improving the investment climate, through non-discriminatory, transparent and predictable business conditions, simplified administrative procedures and by the fight against corruption.
- Tax reform, improved tax administration and sound management of public finances.
- Establishing a constructive dialogue on visa facilitation between the EU and Ukraine, taking account of the need for progress on the ongoing negotiations for an EC-Ukraine readmission agreement.
- Gradual approximation of Ukrainian legislation, norms and standards with those of the European Union; further reinforcing administrative and judicial capacity.
- Encourage dialogue on employment issues and best endeavours to ensure that treatment of migrant workers does not discriminate on grounds of nationality.
- Full implementation of the Memorandum of Understanding on the closure of the Chernobyl nuclear power plant.

MAIN OBSERVATIONS

The main observations of the performed review may be summarised as follows:

- The *overall performance* of the Tacis Programme was reasonably good. More than one-third of all projects show a performance higher than standard (commitment of the parties involved was higher than average), more than half had a standard performance and only one-sixth is below standard (certain problems reported).
- The *political commitment* of the Ukrainian side towards the project objectives is a crucial precondition for a successful project. A demand-driven approach, if it is embedded in a firm reform-oriented strategy and supported by an appropriate legal framework, is most successful. Involvement of Ukrainian high political level, preferably in Steering Committees and in certain cases from a level above the formal Partner Organisation, is often essential to guarantee this political commitment.
- Selection of partners was in general appropriate. However, the roles and responsibilities of the participants in multi-stakeholder projects have not been always clearly defined.
- The Tacis programme has been concentrated more on *Justice and Home Affairs Action Plan and border related issues* (44) and *Environmental projects* (44): nearly 40% of all monitoring reports issued were devoted to these two sectors. Then in descending order follows *Human Resources Development* (38), *Assistance to Enterprise Development* (20), *Infrastructure Development (Energy, Transport and Telecommunications)* (24), *Financial services* (20) and *Agriculture* (10).
- Main types of Tacis intervention have been the following: formulation of the policy, preparation of the strategy, legal support, development of the infrastructure, investment support, institutional and capacity building.
- *Geography* of the Tacis projects. With a strong orientation of many projects on support to central governmental bodies these projects were carried out in Kiev. About two thirds of the projects were implemented in other regions with some overrepresentation in the following oblasts: Kharkiv, Odessa, Lviv, Donetsk and in Crimea.
- Generally, the latest projects are more consistent from the point of view of the *better design*, application of the LFA, comprehensive planning and internal monitoring, but still some components and actions require certain corrections.
- Some sectors have been mostly affected by a poor execution of projects related to the *delivery of equipment*, which was significantly delayed. This happens due to the complexity (or ignorance) of the EC procurement rules. Another reason is a complicated and time-consuming VAT exemption procedure in Ukraine, which some suppliers are not willing to deal with. In case of EU supplier, the timely delivery is often problematic due to the uncertain national customs and certification rules. Delays undermine the effectiveness of projects, not to mention the cancellation of promised procurement.
- The SME development is of paramount importance in ensuring economic growth, and that the state regulatory policy has exhausted its resources and that substitution of market mechanisms with direct administrative interventions is detrimental for development. The Government of Ukraine has cancelled almost all the tax privileges for enterprises that had been seriously distorting the competitive environment in the past years.
- Ukraine is a transit country with four internationally recognised transport corridors. The further development of international transportation and improvement of border crossings would be an important step towards integration of Ukraine into Europe. The TRACECA projects have not involved Ukraine up to a level compatible with its importance to the EU as a transit country.
- The 'Global Climate Change' and 'Joint River Management' projects proved to be effective in Ukraine, having strong governmental support, tangible results and a good synergy with other donors, and should be supported and continued as an 'environmental mainstreaming'.

- *Small-scale environmental interventions* (pilot projects at regional and oblast level) with potential impact across the country have been successful and replicable in most cases (in the field of solid domestic waste, public awareness, water management), but their number and impact was rather limited.
- The use of a *long-term expertise* is preferable and more effective as compared to short-term expertise. However, the outputs yielded due to long-term expertise did not always correspond to the inputs utilised.
- The quality of the *training techniques* and *training materials* should be improved, in particular the training materials by providing comments and suggestions by the trainees' side. The training materials should be not only translated, but also *adapted* to the local terminology and practices.
- *Language training* (mainly English) foreseen in some projects was well received, and a clear interest in expanding such training was expressed. There is a high demand for translation of EU legal documents. It may be addressed by building capacity of the translators.
- *Study tours* have been deemed important by the beneficiaries. A positive experience was the organisation of study tours to the new EU member countries.
- *Project title*. In many cases, the discrepancy between the project title and actual content is striking. It may provoke certain misunderstandings or even conflicts. E.g., the project called 'Bank Sector Reform' provides consulting services in a limited number of selected problem areas to ten banks. The project 'Enterprise Restructuring Facility' has not restructured any enterprise, but helped a limited number of them to increase their competitiveness. In the second case, the mentioned discrepancy has provoked series of misunderstandings and conflicts.
- *Duration of projects*. Practically all projects have too short a duration for achieving their aims. The consequence is that even in those cases when the projects succeed to produce the planned results, there is not enough time to demonstrate the effectiveness of the newly established systems.

GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS

□

Most Tacis projects could have had a stronger and more lasting impact. The crucial factors identified are the existence of a global (sector) strategy, proper involvement (and selection) of project partners, inclusion of legal approximation support activities, attention to enforcement components and project impact monitoring per sector, at least on an annual basis.

- The presence of an officially recognised *strategy* and comprehensive *national programme* agreed with the country authorities should be an essential element for prioritisation of the respective sector and further planning of the donor intervention, as well as public support.
- Assistance should be aimed at the *improvement of the investment climate*, through non-discriminatory, transparent and predictable business conditions, simplified administrative procedures and fight against corruption. To foresee and stimulate wider involvement of the private sector and pay more attention to *investment support* as a catalyst to leverage IFI funds, the preparation of business plans and investment projects proved effective.
- The current policy of Ukraine towards the *EU integration* should be supported by the *awareness raising* activities among the Ukrainian general population. Communication strategy needs to be included in the design; co-operation with non-governmental organisations with regard to their involvement in the promotion of integration in the EU needs to be envisaged.
- *Legal support*. Many projects include legal assistance components. Further assistance is required, especially in support of the National Programme for the Adaptation of Ukrainian Legislation to the EU Legislation.

- Attention should be paid to evaluation of progress in the law approximation process. Further development and use of benchmarking methodology in the law approximation process should be promoted.
- Proper attention should be given to the *enforcement* and implementation of legislation. Support the most efficient way of drafting legislation through the establishment of joint working groups composed of the project experts, representatives of the partner and other relevant organisations and MPs.
- *Secondary legislation.* On the model of UEPLAC, an instrument should be devised in order to support the full development of actual regulatory framework and its enforcement.
- *Institutional assistance.* Due to the certain influence of the political instability, frequent changes of the Government and the leadership of some Ministries (e.g. Economy, Energy and Fuel, Public Health, Environmental Protection) *institutional assistance* will be beneficial and creation of a permanent Expert Board within the Ministry (structure similar to UEPLAC) will be advisable.
- *NCU support.* Stronger institutional support should be given to maintain appropriate status of the Tacis NCU. The NCU status and role is essential at programming stage and programmes' follow-up during their implementation.
- *Coordination with other donors.* Generally ToRs charge the Contractors with the responsibility to co-ordinate with them. Usually it is secured through exchange of information and organisation of joint events but has never reached an optimum level. It is recommended to enhance and ensure proper co-ordination and avoidance of duplication on the design stage and not to leave this to the Contractors.
- Promote cooperation in *environmental governance* (coordination, information and public participation, environmental impact assessment and communication strategy) and in enhancing cooperation on global environmental issues and initiatives (climate change, EU water initiative, EEA and regional cooperation in relation to trans-boundary impacts), which were highlighted in the EU-Ukraine Action Plan. However, donor intervention is essential, because real budget financing is insufficient and irregular.
- *Logical framework approach.* LFA is being used more and more as a practical tool to stimulate Contractors and project partners/beneficiaries in the establishing an effective internal monitoring system. However, lack of reliable and measurable OVI is a common problem. Original *project design* seldom reflected all essential elements of LFA participatory planning methods and therefore the use of inception phase for adjusting the ToRs to reality is essential for the success of a project.
- *Translation.* Language training and building the capacity of translators involved in translation of legal documents deserve attention.

RECOMMENDATIONS BY SECTORS

Support for Institutional, Legal and Administrative Reform

- *Legal and administrative reform.* The assistance focused on legal and policy advice, building administrative capacity and institutional development. The projects in this area have been sensitive and dependent on political developments in Ukraine, and thus needed adjustments to the pace of the legislative process. The commitment expressed by the new President of Ukraine to move towards integration with the EU adds to the impact prospects of the projects implemented in this sector and makes further assistance in this area highly relevant in principle. However, practical steps are still awaited.
 - The support to *reform of the judiciary* within the period under review has so far been limited to the project supporting the Court Administration and the reform of arbitration courts. Given the status of the judiciary system in Ukraine, only a limited impact may

be anticipated. Systemic approach to the judiciary reform remains a *high priority* including at enforcement level.

- *PCA implementation.* The key instrument for support in the PCA implementation has been UEPLAC. The third phase of UEPLAC project implemented in 2002-2005 was recognised as the most effective of the three completed phases. In agreement with the beneficiaries, the main emphasis of UEPLAC was support the process of approximation of Ukrainian legislation to the EU legislation. UEPLAC should be also credited for introducing the scoreboards and benchmarking methodology that had never been used before. The scoreboards developed have facilitated the process of development of the ENP Action Plan for Ukraine. *Further support in the PCA implementation as an intermediate stage towards a Free Trade Agreement with the EU will be a high priority.*
- *WTO accession.* There are a number projects related to the PCA and WTO launched under the area of co-operation 'Private sector and Economic development' that provided or are still providing assistance in approximation of the legislation and building an administrative capacity in the areas of competition, intellectual property rights, technical rules and standards, and agricultural standards. *Further assistance in the establishing and running of the national WTO information office will be required.*
- The projects supporting Ukraine in the *legal reform* have already produced a great number of deliverables, including training manuals, guidelines surveys and analyses, glossaries etc. in both printed and electronic form. *Inventory of these deliverables might be useful.*
- *Justice and Home Affairs Action Plan and border related issues.* The assistance has been focused on enhancing integrated border management, improving migration and asylum management and combating organised crime and international terrorism.
 - *Cross-Border Cooperation.* Ukraine continues to demonstrate a commitment to the development of the border infrastructure. Usually the border-crossing projects included an investment component with funding from different budget years. That caused problems due to the deadline for the funds disbursement. A work contract usually requires much more time than originally envisaged the ToR, including the warranty period, which runs longer than the main contract. As a result, a contract extension has been requested and granted in many cases. Long and sustainable effect of the improvements will heavily depend on proper border management including rational use of human resources. *Further support in the development of border infrastructure and combating illegal activities will be required.*
 - *Migration and asylum management.* Further support is required taking into account EU enlargement process and growing EU-Ukraine bilateral relations.
 - *Measures against Money Laundering in Ukraine.* During 2002-2004, the situation concerning combating money laundering has improved considerably in Ukraine. *However, further assistance in the development of the national financial monitoring system and respective law enforcement will be required.*
- *Civil society, media and democracy.* Further support of institutions guaranteeing democracy and the rule of law is premature.
 - *IBPP.* May be considered as a useful complementary tool for support of civil society and other local initiatives. *Further support should be envisaged.*
 - *Civic society and education.* Civic Education is a good example of well-coordinated efforts of the different donors. Complementary actions in this sector will be high priority and will be well supported by Ukrainian side.

Support to the private sector and assistance for economic development

- *Assistance to enterprise development.* The enterprise development projects properly took into account the lesson learned from the former Tacis assistance and did not distort the

market by establishment of new business infrastructure (business centres, consulting companies, etc.). While the earlier projects delivered direct assistance to SMEs and larger enterprises in the form of training and/or consulting services, further assistance should prioritise the reforms of tax, licensing and permits system at the national level, as most problems are concentrated in these areas. The competitiveness of Ukrainian large and smaller enterprises is still undermined by obsolete technologies, poor marketing functions, low labour productivity, the burden of unprofitable social units and lack of competence to access external finance. Addressing these problems can be a subject for further assistance, providing that

- Existing service providers are used and not deprived of their market by the projects.
- Proper Project Partners (associations of enterprises) are selected, that can ensure dissemination of good practice. Three out of four enterprise assistance projects of AP 2000-2003 faced the problems of improper identification of the Project Partner. These problems have led to recurrent discussions on refocusing the projects, and to undeserved criticism towards the projects.
- The practice of taking as many enterprises on board as possible is abolished, as this leads to scattering of resources.

SME development. The focus of technical assistance should be shifted from the central level to the regional level. It is necessary to complement Tacis support to SMEs with support to regional development, e.g. by supporting regional administrations in the development and implementation of regional business strategies.

- *SME in rural sector.* The projects responded well to the sector needs. Private sector development should remain a top priority for cooperation in order to increase the competitiveness of the national food products. However, emphasis should be put first on creating a favourable environment at legal, financial and physical levels in particular.
- *Development of financial markets.* Strengthening of the banking sector and further development of financial markets remain a high priority for Ukraine, in particular credit co-operation and co-operative banking, including development of the currently lacking normative base for co-operative banks.
 - Further support of *tax reform* and assistance to *tax administration* with relevant actions in efficient management of public finances is required.
- *Local development in selected municipalities.* Civil society development is deficient and slow due to many factors, including lack of a legal framework for the relations between civil society and state structures. Reform in social policies (social protection, pensions, consumer rights, military conversion, education) suffers from lack of strategic targeting and decisiveness.
- *Energy sector reform.* The reform process suffers from inadequate allocation of budget for its implementation and a coherent and well-balanced energy strategy for Ukraine is still missing.
 - The priority task is the *restructuring of the enterprises* in the energy sector to improve their efficiency conforming to the EU experience.
 - *Educational projects* in energy technologies, energy efficiency, energy management, international cooperation in energy area, etc. still will be beneficial.

Support in addressing the social consequences of transition

- *Health sector reform.* The Ministry of Health did not have necessary economic and legal leverages for large-scale reforms of the sector. There is a lack of co-ordination in the positions and actions of different governmental bodies. All Tacis projects related to the health reform were launched in the absence of relevant Governmental programme for reforming the national health care system. The impact of the health reform projects has been modest so far. The pilot projects being implemented have the potential for nation-wide

replication, as these have successfully designed models of health care organisation and financing that involve minimum contradictions with the national legislation.

- The main lesson learned is that any further assistance of the sector should be delivered only after a *health sector reform programme* and an action plan to implement it are adopted at the highest level. The technical assistance should be directed at the implementation of certain parts of the action plan.
- Most of the health sector projects faced the problem of shortage of local expertise. Although the projects employed highly qualified EU experts, however, these experts did not possess the necessarily deep and cross-sector knowledge of the organisational, administrative and legal peculiarities of the health sector in Ukraine. It is necessary to involve more *local expertise* and expertise from CEE countries.
- *Support to the development of social assistance policy and services targeting vulnerable groups.*
 - In the field of strengthening democratic structures and developing *civil society* assistance might be focused on NGOs and associations aimed at generating local initiative (in developing small business, self-employment, and social sphere), to support the most vulnerable strata, to smooth the social impact in restructuring coal industry, of the Chernobyl NPP closure, and to support conversion from former military to civil life.

RECOMMENDATIONS BY PROJECT COMPONENTS

- 1.► *Contractor's performance* is usually adequate to the project needs. Generally Contractor's performance can be considered as good, or even excellent in some areas. This confirms the validity of the 'demand-driven' approach, providing proper *dialogue* is maintained with the stakeholders.
- 2.► *Contribution of the Project Partner* to the project results shows a wide variety in commitment. The selection of the Project Partner has generally been done well, but exceptions can be found in some projects. It is more effective to have only one formal Project Partner, which should not necessarily be a state institution, and to identify other beneficiaries to be involved in a project. Commitment from beneficiaries is to be gained not only through formal procedures (Statement of Endorsement), but also through defining in advance their responsibilities and tasks in the project (including local resources needed), as well as on the basis of a clear project management structure in which major beneficiaries are represented. Usually national Tacis projects in Ukraine have a Steering Committee in which project parties are represented in a balanced way. This is a good condition for strategic project decision-making and enhancing the cooperation between project parties.
 - The absence of a clear and common vision regarding the *project implementation strategy* plays a negative role, together with an inappropriate *project planning*. One of the main reasons for project failure is the lack of a well-established and permanent dialogue between the project partners. Consequently, the implementation of projects is often slower than foreseen by the project planning.
- 3.► *Relevance and quality of design*. Tacis is to a high extent a demand driven programme. Lack of projects' appropriateness in certain areas stems from insufficient tuning to external conditions (which may have changed since the ToR were drafted), a too supply-driven approach, contradictory policies of the beneficiaries or lack of relevance or quality of the project outputs.
- 4.► *Achievements of results*. Coordinated mutual efforts of Contractor and beneficiaries are of great influence on the extent to which initially planned results have been achieved. In general the Tacis programme was moderately successful in this respect.

5.► *Achievement of (specific) project objectives* is a key criterion to assess the relevance of the Tacis programme. The external conditions to some extent have limited the possibilities to fully achieve all project objectives. Further analysis reveals that the external conditions were unfavourable for achieving objectives in the following sectors:

- *SME-development*. The development of the SME sector has been complicated by many factors: an unstable and complicated tax system, a high administrative burden for enterprises, problems of tax evasion and corruption, lack of access to financial resources, complicated practices of business licensing, product certification and state inspections.
- *Food & Agriculture*. The external conditions are negatively influenced by the absence of a financial credit system, land ownership not yet legally regulated in a satisfactory way, shortage of inputs, and an undeveloped distribution and market structure.
- *Human Resources Development*. In administrative reform the process of modification of the legislative framework is steady but slow. It is slackened down by permanent discussions between the major centres of power.
- *Energy*. A comprehensive energy strategy for Ukraine is still missing. The major problems are the non-payment of energy bills, the accumulation of energy debts of enterprises, lack of metering and monitoring systems, and an underdeveloped transportation infrastructure still requires further donors' intervention.
- *Transport*. The Ministry of Transport and Post suffers from institutional weaknesses and lack of specialised staff. The transport policy is gradually targeted on integration into European and world transport systems. Relevant legislative reform decisions have been taken to build up a national network of international transport corridors. A start has been made to establish a competitive environment in the transport services market. It will be advisable that future Tacis intervention in the area of transport infrastructure should consider the possibilities of linking to investment programmes.
- *Environment protection*. Organisational instability of the Ministry of Ecology was a hindrance for building of good working relations within Tacis projects. Lack of funds for implementation of environmental policies and lack of trained human resources negatively influence projects as well. The economic situation in Ukraine, in general, has not been favourable for the implementation of Tacis environmental projects and for guaranteed sustainability of their results.

6.► *Sustainability of results*. Sustainability depends on the quality of the results of the projects, the capacity of the institutions, but also on external conditions, ability and willingness of the Project Partner to continue the activities and on the financial resources after the project has ended. The Project Partner is insufficiently involved in the project management and has rather limited impact upon the Contractor's capacity to implement the project efficiently. Partner Organisations should actively intervene in the project, including by making clear one's own expectations regarding the content of the project and the conditions of its implementation.

- Looking for long-term project sustainability it is necessary to consider at the early stage of project development the provision of relevant strategy, legislation, infrastructure, investment support or finances from state or local budget.
- Sustainability is highly dependent on the possibility (or ability) to implement planned follow-up measures. The project partners should ensure that resources of the future projects are in line with their immediate and wider objectives. The structures for sustainability must be considered as early as possible and set in place. Involvement of relevant authorities is essential for a successful project with a long-term impact.

REFERENCES

1. The Partnership and Co-operation Agreement (PCA) (enforced in 1998)
2. The European Council Common Strategy on Ukraine (adopted by the European Council on 11/12/1999)
3. Country Strategy Paper 2002-2006, National Indicative Programme 2002-2003, Ukraine (adopted by the European Commission on 27/12/2001)
4. Tacis Regional Cooperation: Strategy Paper and Indicative Programme 2004-2006 (adopted by the European Commission on 11/04/2003)
5. National Indicative Programme, Ukraine 2004-2006 (adopted by the European Commission on 04/08/2003)
6. European Neighbourhood Policy (ENP) Country report, Ukraine (12/05/2004)
7. The EU-Ukraine Action Plan under the European Neighbourhood Policy (ENP) (adopted by the EU-Ukraine Co-operation Council on 21/02/2005)
8. Tacis Indicative Programme Ukraine, 1996-1999 An Assessment, Tacis Regional Monitoring Team Kiev, September 2001

ANNEXES

Annex A Scoring of Monitoring reports issued in 2003, 2004 and 2005-09-01
Annex B Summary Recommendations of Individual Projects monitored

Total number of monitoring reports

Total number of monitoring reports	2003	88
Total number of monitoring reports	2004	82
Total number of monitoring reports	2005	65

Average Rating**Average Score**

Relevance and quality of design	2003	2.4
Relevance and quality of design	2004	2.6
Relevance and quality of design	2005	2.8
Efficiency of implementation to date	2003	2.5
Efficiency of implementation to date	2004	2.9
Efficiency of implementation to date	2005	2.9
Effectiveness to date	2003	2.7
Effectiveness to date	2004	2.9
Effectiveness to date	2005	3.0
Impact to date	2003	2.8
Impact to date	2004	2.9
Impact to date	2005	2.9
Potential sustainability	2003	2.9
Potential sustainability	2004	2.8
Potential sustainability	2005	3.0
Average Score in Total	2003	2.6
Average Score in Total	2004	2.8
Average Score in Total	2005	2.9
Note: A = very good (4); B = good (3); C = problems (2); D = serious deficiencies (1)		

Nr. of reports falling in category

		a	b	c	d	n/a
Relevance and quality of design	2003	0	39	47	2	0
Relevance and quality of design	2004	3	47	32	0	0
Relevance and quality of design	2005	6	42	16	1	0
Efficiency of implementation to date	2003	2	39	44	3	0
Efficiency of implementation to date	2004	5	60	17	0	0
Efficiency of implementation to date	2005	9	43	12	1	0
Effectiveness to date	2003	2	58	27	1	0
Effectiveness to date	2004	6	61	13	1	1
Effectiveness to date	2005	7	51	7	0	0
Impact to date	2003	1	66	20	1	0
Impact to date	2004	5	64	13	0	0
Impact to date	2005	3	54	8	0	0
Potential sustainability	2003	1	73	14	0	0
Potential sustainability	2004	1	64	17	0	0
Potential sustainability	2005	4	56	5	0	0

% of reports falling in category		A	B	C	D	n/a
Relevance and quality of design	2003	0.0	44.3	53.4	2.3	0.0
Relevance and quality of design	2004	3.7	57.3	39.0	0.0	0.0
Relevance and quality of design	2005	9.2	64.6	24.6	1.5	0.0
Efficiency of implementation to date	2003	2.3	44.3	50.0	3.4	0.0
Efficiency of implementation to date	2004	6.1	73.2	20.7	0.0	0.0
Efficiency of implementation to date	2005	13.8	66.2	18.5	1.5	0.0
Effectiveness to date	2003	2.3	65.9	30.7	1.1	0.0
Effectiveness to date	2004	7.3	74.4	15.9	1.2	1.2
Effectiveness to date	2005	10.8	78.5	10.8	0.0	0.0
Impact to date	2003	1.1	75.0	22.7	1.1	0.0
Impact to date	2004	6.1	78.0	15.9	0.0	0.0
Impact to date	2005	4.6	83.1	12.3	0.0	0.0
Potential sustainability	2003	1.1	83.0	15.9	0.0	0.0
Potential sustainability	2004	1.2	78.0	20.7	0.0	0.0
Potential sustainability	2005	6.2	86.2	7.7	0.0	0.0

Relevance

Total number of monitoring reports

Total number of monitoring reports	2003	88
Total number of monitoring reports	2004	82
Total number of monitoring reports	2005	65

Relevance and quality of design

Average Score

Original design	2003	2.3
Original design	2004	2.5
Original design	2005	2.7

Adaptability	2003	2.5
Adaptability	2004	2.7
Adaptability	2005	2.9

Input adequacy	2003	2.5
Input adequacy	2004	2.6
Input adequacy	2005	2.8

Average Score in Total	2003	2.4
Average Score in Total	2004	2.6
Average Score in Total	2005	2.8

Note: A = very good (4); B = good (3); C = problems (2); D = serious deficiencies (1)

Nr. of reports falling in category

		A	B	C	D	n/a
Original design	2003	0	28	57	3	0
Original design	2004	2	38	40	2	0
Original design	2005	4	37	22	2	0
Adaptability	2003	0	50	33	3	2
Adaptability	2004	2	51	24	1	2
Adaptability	2005	7	46	11	0	0
Input adequacy	2003	0	43	42	1	2
Input adequacy	2004	3	45	30	1	3
Input adequacy	2005	6	42	15	1	1

% of reports falling in category		A	B	C	D	n/a
Original design	2003	0.0	31.8	64.8	3.4	0.0
Original design	2004	2.4	46.3	48.8	2.4	0.0
Original design	2005	6.2	56.9	33.8	3.1	0.0
Adaptability	2003	0.0	56.8	37.5	3.4	2.3
Adaptability	2004	2.5	63.8	30.0	1.3	2.5
Adaptability	2005	10.9	71.9	17.2	0.0	0.0
Input adequacy	2003	0.0	48.9	47.7	1.1	2.3
Input adequacy	2004	3.7	54.9	36.6	1.2	3.7
Input adequacy	2005	9.2	64.6	23.1	1.5	1.5

Efficiency

Total number of monitoring reports

Total number of monitoring reports	2003	88
Total number of monitoring reports	2004	82
Total number of monitoring reports	2005	65

Efficiency of implementation to date

Average Score

Input timeliness	2003	2.5
Input timeliness	2004	2.7
Input timeliness	2005	2.8
Activity timeliness	2003	2.4
Activity timeliness	2004	2.7
Activity timeliness	2005	2.8
Results achievement	2003	2.6
Results achievement	2004	2.9
Results achievement	2005	3.0
Flexibility	2003	2.9
Flexibility	2004	3.0
Flexibility	2005	3.3
Average Score in Total	2003	2.6
Average Score in Total	2004	2.8
Average Score in Total	2005	3.0

Nr. of reports falling in category		A	B	C	D	n/a
Input timeliness	2003	0	44	41	2	1
Input timeliness	2004	2	51	29	0	0
Input timeliness	2005	2	44	18	0	1
Activity timeliness	2003	2	38	44	4	0
Activity timeliness	2004	5	49	27	1	0
Activity timeliness	2005	7	40	18	0	0
Results achievement	2003	2	46	35	2	3
Results achievement	2004	6	61	14	0	1
Results achievement	2005	11	42	11	1	0
Flexibility	2003	0	9	1	0	78
Flexibility	2004	0	3	0	0	79
Flexibility	2005	3	9	0	0	53

% of reports falling in category		A	B	C	D	n/a
Input timeliness	2003	0.0	50.0	46.6	2.3	1.1
Input timeliness	2004	2.4	62.2	35.4	0.0	0.0
Input timeliness	2005	3.1	67.7	27.7	0.0	1.5
Activity timeliness	2003	2.3	43.2	50.0	4.5	0.0
Activity timeliness	2004	6.1	59.8	32.9	1.2	0.0
Activity timeliness	2005	10.8	61.5	27.7	0.0	0.0
Results achievement	2003	2.3	52.3	39.8	2.3	3.4
Results achievement	2004	7.3	74.4	17.1	0.0	1.2
Results achievement	2005	16.9	64.6	16.9	1.5	0.0
Flexibility	2003	0.0	10.2	1.1	0.0	88.6
Flexibility	2004	0.0	3.7	0.0	0.0	96.3
Flexibility	2005	4.6	13.8	0.0	0.0	81.5

Effectiveness

Total number of monitoring reports

Total number of monitoring reports	2003	88
Total number of monitoring reports	2004	81
Total number of monitoring reports	2005	65

Effectiveness to date

Average Score		
Flow of benefits	2003	2.7
Flow of benefits	2004	2.9
Flow of benefits	2005	3.0
	2003	
Secondary effects of results	2003	2.9
Secondary effects of results	2004	3.1
Secondary effects of results	2005	3.2
Adaptation at results level	2003	3.0
Adaptation at results level	2004	2.7
Adaptation at results level	2005	3.0
Average Score in Total	2003	2.9
Average Score in Total	2004	2.9
Average Score in Total	2005	3.1

Note: A = very good (4); B = good (3); C = problems (2); D = serious deficiencies (1)

Nr. of reports falling in category						
	2005	A	B	C	D	n/a
Flow of benefits	2003	2	58	27	1	0
Flow of benefits	2004	6	61	13	1	0
Flow of benefits	2005	6	51	7	0	1
Secondary effects of results	2003	0	13	1	0	74
Secondary effects of results	2004	2	14	1	0	65
Secondary effects of results	2005	4	13	1	0	47
Adaptation at results level	2003	0	1	0	0	87
Adaptation at results level	2004	0	2	1	0	79
Adaptation at results level	2005	1	10	1	0	53

% of reports falling in category						
		A	B	C	D	n/a
Flow of benefits	2003	2.3	65.9	30.7	1.1	0.0
Flow of benefits	2004	7.4	75.3	16.0	1.2	0.0
Flow of benefits	2005	9.2	78.5	10.8	0.0	1.5
Secondary effects of results	2003	0.0	14.8	1.1	0.0	84.1
Secondary effects of results	2004	2.4	17.1	1.2	0.0	79.3
Secondary effects of results	2005	6.2	20.0	1.5	0.0	72.3
Adaptation at results level	2003	0.0	1.1	0.0	0.0	98.9
Adaptation at results level	2004	0.0	2.4	1.2	0.0	96.3
Adaptation at results level	2005	1.5	15.4	1.5	0.0	81.5

Note: A = very good; B = good; C = problems; D = serious deficiencies

Impact

Total number of monitoring reports

Total number of monitoring reports	2003	88
Total number of monitoring reports	2004	82
Total number of monitoring reports	2005	65

Impact to date

Average Score

Wider planned effects	2003	2.8
Wider planned effects	2004	2.9
Wider planned effects	2005	2.9
Wider unplanned effects	2003	3.0
Wider unplanned effects	2004	3.1
Wider unplanned effects	2005	3.0
Adaptation at purpose level	2003	3.0
Adaptation at purpose level	2004	2.9
Adaptation at purpose level	2005	2.9

Average Score in Total

Average Score in Total	2003	2.9
Average Score in Total	2004	3.0
Average Score in Total	2005	3.0

Note: A = very good (4); B = good (3); C = problems (2); D = serious deficiencies (1)

Nr. of reports falling in category

		A	B	C	D	n/a
Wider planned effects	2003	1	66	20	1	0
Wider planned effects	2004	5	64	13	0	0
Wider planned effects	2005	3	53	8	0	1
Wider unplanned effects	2003	2	17	0	1	68
Wider unplanned effects	2004	1	16	0	0	65
Wider unplanned effects	2005	1	13	1	0	50
Adaptation at purpose level	2003	0	28	1	0	59
Adaptation at purpose level	2004	0	25	3	0	54
Adaptation at purpose level	2005	2	28	4	0	31

Note: A = very good; B = good; C = problems; D = serious deficiencies

% of reports falling in category

		A	B	C	D	n/a
Wider planned effects	2003	1.1	75.0	22.7	1.1	0.0
Wider planned effects	2004	6.1	78.0	15.9	0.0	0.0
Wider planned effects	2005	4.6	81.5	12.3	0.0	1.5
Wider unplanned effects	2003	2.3	19.3	0.0	1.1	77.3
Wider unplanned effects	2004	1.2	19.5	0.0	0.0	79.3
Wider unplanned effects	2005	1.5	20.0	1.5	0.0	76.9
Adaptation at purpose level	2003	0.0	31.8	1.1	0.0	67.0
Adaptation at purpose level	2004	0.0	30.5	3.7	0.0	65.9
Adaptation at purpose level	2005	3.1	43.1	6.2	0.0	47.7

Note: A = very good; B = good; C = problems; D = serious deficiencies

Sustainability

Total number of monitoring reports

Total number of monitoring reports	2003	88
Total number of monitoring reports	2004	82
Total number of monitoring reports	2005	65

Rating Sustainability

Average Score

Policy support	2004	2.8
Policy support	2005	3.0
Institution building	2003	2.8
Institution building	2004	3.0
Institution building	2005	3.1
Socio-cultural adequacy	2003	2.9
Socio-cultural adequacy	2004	3.0
Socio-cultural adequacy	2005	3.0
Technological adequacy	2003	3.0
Technological adequacy	2004	3.0
Technological adequacy	2005	2.9
Environmental adequacy	2003	3.0
Environmental adequacy	2004	2.8
Environmental adequacy	2005	3.1
Economic adequacy	2003	2.6
Economic adequacy	2004	2.7
Economic adequacy	2005	2.8
Average Score in Total		2.9
Average Score in Total	2004	2.9
Average Score in Total	2005	3.0

Note: A = very good (4); B = good (3); C = problems (2); D = serious deficiencies (1)

Nr of reports falling in category

		A	B	C	D	n/a
Economic adequacy	2003	1	51	30	1	5
Economic adequacy	2004	1	53	25	1	2
Economic adequacy	2005	3	46	14	0	1
Policy support	2003	2	71	15	0	0
Policy support	2004	3	63	16	0	0
Policy support	2005	8	50	7	0	0
Institution building	2003	2	67	18	0	1
Institution building	2004	9	62	8	1	1
Institution building	2005	11	52	2	0	0

Socio-cultural adequacy	2003	0	14	2	0	72
Socio-cultural adequacy	2004	3	58	6	0	15
Socio-cultural adequacy	2005	7	37	7	0	13
Technological adequacy	2003	0	4	0	0	84
Technological adequacy	2004	0	9	0	0	73
Technological adequacy	2005	1	15	3	0	45
Environmental adequacy	2003	0	29	1	0	58
Environmental adequacy	2004	0	30	1	2	49
Environmental adequacy	2005	3	20	1	0	41

% of reports falling in category

		A	B	C	D	n/a
Policy support	2003	2.3	80.7	17.0	0.0	0.0
Policy support	2004	3.7	76.8	19.5	0.0	0.0
Policy support	2005	12.3	76.9	10.8	0.0	0.0
Institution building	2003	2.3	76.1	20.5	0.0	1.1
Institution building	2004	11.1	76.5	9.9	1.2	1.2
Institution building	2005	16.9	80.0	3.1	0.0	0.0
Socio-cultural adequacy	2003	0.0	15.9	2.3	0.0	81.8
Socio-cultural adequacy	2004	3.7	70.7	7.3	0.0	18.3
Socio-cultural adequacy	2005	10.9	57.8	10.9	0.0	20.3
Technological adequacy	2003	0.0	4.5	0.0	0.0	95.5
Technological adequacy	2004	0.0	11.0	0.0	0.0	89.0
Technological adequacy	2005	1.6	23.4	4.7	0.0	70.3
Environmental adequacy	2003	0.0	33.0	1.1	0.0	65.9
Environmental adequacy	2004	0.0	36.6	1.2	2.4	59.8
Environmental adequacy	2005	4.6	30.8	1.5	0.0	63.1
Economic adequacy	2003	1.1	58.0	34.1	1.1	5.7
Economic adequacy	2004	1.2	64.6	30.5	1.2	2.4
Economic adequacy	2005	4.7	71.9	21.9	0.0	1.6

Management Reporting – Key Observations

RESTORATIVE SOCIAL TRANSFORMATION IN UKRAINE

The Project Manager is advised to request the Contractor to:

- Revise the LF, paying attention to the formulation of the OO and PP and definition of the related OVI;
- Consider and submit a proposal for budget neutral project extension to be able to accomplish all the envisaged tasks;
- Closely follow up and contribute to the drafting of the corresponding national legislation on mediation, where possible.

The EC Services are recommended to analyse the possibility of funding of a project aiming at supporting the country-wide implementation of the VOM mechanisms.

TOP 'TRIANGLE OF PARTNERSHIP'

The Project Manager is recommended to:

- Request the Contractor to finalise the elaboration of the development strategies for the selected towns and present them to the local communities within the tight schedule before the planned final conference in Kyiv;
- Instruct the Contractor to start the preparation to the final conference at an early stage in order to avoid any logistical problems;
- Request the Contractor to reduce delay in payment of the local partners;
- Instruct the Contractor to consider a possible extension of the project duration in order not to crumple the planned activities in the remaining project period.

IMPROVING SME ENVIRONMENT

Institution building projects should be given enough time. The Project Manager is recommended to:

- Discuss with the Contractor the possibility to reconsider the presently applied system of support provided to the rayon Business Centres, and to find a compromise solution between the donor financed and the present model, ensuring development, motivation of the staff and sustainability.

CAMPAIGNING AGAINST TORTURE AND CRUEL TREATMENT IN UKRAINE

The Project Manager is advised to recommend the Contractor to:

- Pay more attention to building the capacities of the new POs in the regions, especially in terms of improving their analytical skills.
- Revise the LF to include specific, measurable and time-bound indicators at all the levels of the intervention logic. They must be available at the end of the appropriate period they characterise.
- Find intermediary solutions, and/or some indicators that are able to reflect the direct benefits provided to the beneficiaries by the end of the project.
- Analyse the possibilities of and take measures to enhance sustainability of the project results.

PROJECT AGAINST MONEY LAUNDERING IN UKRAINE

The Project Manager is advised to instruct the Contractor to:

- Consider timely launch of the contracting procedure for the follow-up project in order to avoid any interruptions and minimize transition period. Also, to consider possibility and appropriate resources for translation of the key documents which will be circulated between the project partners within the follow-up project; To provide more detailed planning on the extension period, including activity for transition to the follow-up project and preparation of the Final Report
- Request the Beneficiary to provide list of the required assistance, resources and consultancy for the period of transformation of the SDFM into a State Committee, including central body and territorial branches;

- Request the Beneficiary to provide information on the setting up of a new National anti-money laundering training centre within the SDFM, including required support from the project, planned number of the training courses and participants.

AUDIT OF PUBLIC FINANCE

The project was made visible and expectations were raised. However, there was a slippage in inception phase activities. The inception phase still cannot be considered complete even five months after the official start date of the project. The Project Manager is advised to:

- Demand the Contractor and the Beneficiary to agree on a plan for immediate fully fledged implementation of project activities and immediate commencement of their implementation,
- Request the Contractor to revise the Inception report to include proper presentation of the planned inputs, anticipated results and target dates,
- Request the Contractor to prepare a proper, more detailed justification for the requested increase in the project budget.

SUPPORT TO THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE STATE REGISTRATION SYSTEM OF LEGAL PERSON AND NATURAL PERSONS - ENTREPRENEURS

The Project Manager is advised to;

- Consider the Contractor's request for project extension with respective budget reallocation, taking into account the appropriateness of work on 'facilitating of Ukrainian membership in the EBR' to the problems the project is addressing, the favourable policy environment in the country and available project resources.
- Regard positively the possibility of study tours for beneficiaries to facilitate the adjustment of the Ukrainian registration system with EU requirements in practice.
- Request the Contractor to discuss effectiveness, impact and sustainability (especially financial aspect) of the project results during the final seminar, and incorporate the lessons learned in the Final Report.
- Ensure that institutional and capacity building issues are anticipated during design and implementation of future Tacis projects related to the regulatory policy in Ukraine. - Instruct the Contractor to analyse the achievements at all the project intervention levels (objectives, results and activities) in the Final Report.

CIVIC EDUCATION IN UKRAINE

The Project Manager is recommended to:

- Advise the Contractor that it is important for the Project Team at the current stage of the project to establish the widest forum of stakeholders at all levels: ministerial, national and regional;
- Remind the MoES to fulfil their obligations and provide the necessary space or the project office;
- Request the Contractor to report on the input utilisation and to include in the OPO more detailed information on activities planned at the level of each task;
- Request the Contractor to revise the draft Inception Report and to complete it taking into account comments provided by the Monitoring Team.

COMBATING TRAFFICKING IN HUMAN BEINGS IN UKRAINE

The Project Manager is advised to

- Recommend the contractor to assist the law enforcement agencies in creation of the coordination mechanism to prevent and combat trafficking in human beings with neighbouring countries as well as at the EU level;
- Recommend the IOM to collect information on issues of reintegration of trafficked men so that to use it as a feasibility study for opening crisis centres for men as a follow up project.

TRADE FACILITATION AND INSTITUTIONAL SUPPORT

It is recommended to consider the definition of activities related to the Black Sea PETrA in order to follow the ToR objectives and to include them into the work plan.

It is recommended to enhance operation of the Kiev office by either more frequent visits by EU experts to the region or by the permanent placement of the Supervisor in the office, that will intensify cooperation not only with Moldova, but with non-Tacis TRACECA countries in the region – Bulgaria, Romania and Turkey. This may also give impetus to the Black Sea Pan European Transport Association (PETrA) activities.

It would be useful to arrange a meeting with the Ukrainian transport authorities, when the project Team Leader and the Secretary General of the PS IGC TRACECA visit Ukraine, in order to emphasize the importance of each country contribution for the TRACECA future.

BLACK SEA INVESTMENT FACILITY - GEORGIA, MOLDOVA, RUSSIA, AND UKRAINE

The Project Manager is advised to request the Contractor to:

- Supplement the 'BSIF Project Pipeline' with the schedule of work for the whole project period. - Accelerate analysis of the existing WB and EBRD proposals for Ukraine and start the preparation of ToRs a.s.a.p.
- Intensify the work on involvement of IFIs-financers in the project and report to the next Steering Committee meeting.
- Continue establishing cooperation with other relevant target groups as important precondition of achieving the OO.
- Regularly analyse in the progress reports related OVI and R/A for achieving Results and Objectives.

SUPPORT TO SME IN THE RURAL SECTOR - ESTABLISHMENT OF MECHANISMS FOR FINANCING AGRICULTURE AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT

The Project Manager is advised:

- To continue pushing for design of the system of the indicators of the project effectiveness upon its target groups.
- That the following priorities are recommended for the extension of the project:- (i) Promotion and further development of the 'Strategic Vision to Develop a Co-operative banking system', in order to achieve consensus and eventual official high-level endorsement; (ii) Development of the currently lacking normative base for co-operative banks; (iii) Further strengthening of regional associations and united credit unions; (iv) Further development of micro-lending tools, as well as training in marketing in rural areas, to be disseminated through the associations; (v)-Public awareness campaigns.
- It is recommended to cease the assistance to individual CUs as well as the training in such general issues as accounting, management, psychology and business planning.

APPLICATION OF A FOREIGN TRADE REGIME - ESTABLISHING A FRAMEWORK FOR THE PROTECTION OF INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS

The Project Manager is advised to

- Recommend the Contractor to wrap up revision of the project activities and to produce the Inception Report with an agreed work plan including Objectively Verifiable Indicators as soon as possible;
- Recommend the Contractor to speed up establishing contacts with the State Customs Service of Ukraine to define related activities in order to finalise the work plan and start implementation.

IMPROVEMENT OF LOGISTIC AND MARKETING SERVICES FOR SMEs IN AGRICULTURE

The Project Manager is recommended to:

- Follow-up the process of the Project Steering Committee establishment and pay attention to proper functioning of the regional offices in the pilot regions;
- Request the Contractor to intensify cooperation with other donor projects and programmes; request the Contractor to report on the input utilisation and to include in the overall planning more detailed information on activities planned at the level of each task;
- Request the Contractor to revise the draft Inception Report and to complete it taking into account comments provided by the Monitoring Team.

TUBERCULOSIS PREVENTION AND CONTROL IN KYIV CITY, UKRAINE

The project is developing well. The delays occurred so far in the implementation of the OPO and the delivery of the Results are not regarded as jeopardising the overall success of the project. The Project Manager is advised to:

- Instruct the Contractor to reduce and eliminate delays in future planning and implementation. Support the Contractor to achieve better participation of the national level health authorities. Initiate measures to solve the difference between the deadline of the Financing Agreement and that of the project;
- Support the Contractor in using a part of the training budget for study tours of the local staff to Donetsk and/or other locations in the NIS where the implementation of DOTS has sufficiently progressed;
- Instruct the Contractor to identify OVs to the OO level.

SUPPORT AND STRENGTHEN THE ENERGY MARKET REFORM AND ASSESSMENT OF THE ENERGY SECTOR SUSTAINABILITY

The Project Manager is advised that:

- Design and planning of this project does not fully correspond to the standard PCM requirements; one of the major design deficiencies of the project is the lack of a plan for output delivery;
- IT procurement process should be completed within the proposed extension period till 30/06/05; the web-site development was completed, but both sites are still not available for users.

MUNICIPAL SERVICE SUPPORT

The Project Manager is recommended to:

- Consider the approval via Addendum of the revisions to the scope of work and staffing programme proposed by the Contractor;
- Instruct the Contractor to follow the situation with regards to the change of status of the beneficiary organisation.

NIS MANAGERS' TRAINING PROGRAMME (MTP-3)

The Project Manager is recommended to request the Contractor to:

- Prepare a work plan for the project remainder with indication of required input;
- Improve the system for assessing the project effectiveness with emphasis on collecting the success stories, including Local MTP and company assistance, and their presentation on a web-site;
- Consider combined efforts with the Tacis TICA Programme with a view of MTP promotion in the EU member states.

The Commission Services are advised to ensure that MTP 4 activities in Ukraine start without major interruption.

It is also recommended:

- that design of MTP 4 envisage that equal attention is given to different programme components with clear indication of the related tasks and planned achievements. Such programme elements as Local MTP, support to companies, regional authorities and training institutions deserve continuation and further strengthening.
- that support in developing the resource centres provided to Russia be extended to Ukraine as well starting from 2-3 pilot regions.

IMPROVING THE HUMAN RIGHTS SITUATION IN UKRAINE THROUGH LEGAL AID PROVIDED BY NGOS

- The Project Manager is advised to Consider a Return Monitoring Mission in a few months to revise the LF structure, define specific, measurable, time-bound OVs for all the levels of the intervention logic
- Request the Contractor to:
 - improve the financial discipline, management of period they characterise;

- revise the Plan of Action for the resources and project administration; whole project duration for consistency and needed updates in close collaboration with all parties involved, including the part related to the second contractual year;
- revise and improve the quality of the INR for the first contractual year, with particular accent on the problems encountered during the first contractual year and remedy solutions to improve the project performance.
- ensure proper coordination of the project with other donor projects/programmes;
- develop and make available to Legal Aid Offices of a comprehensive methodology for data collection, analysis and synthesis of comprehensive reports;
- analyse the possibilities of and take measures to enhance the sustainability of the project results.

TRAINING SPECIALISTS IN AGRICULTURAL MANAGEMENT FOR UKRAINE AT THE EU UNIVERSITIES

The Project Manager is advised to

- Consider possibility to extend the project duration by 3,5 months, as requested by the Contractor, enabling students to finalise the mobility programme and to get scholarships abroad.
- Assist the Contractor in delivering the enlarged final dissemination conference in Ukraine to share the gained experience and promote the impact of the project.
- Assist the project in getting visa from the Irish Embassy for seven Ukrainian students enabling implementation of the respective task.
- Instruct the Contractor to utilise the LF for the project management, in cooperation with the three local coordinators, by analysing it regularly and initiating measures accordingly.

RESTRUCTURING THE B.SC. IN ECONOMICS AND MANAGEMENT

The Project Manager is advised to consider:

- i) time extension as a possibility to deliver good quality results in full aimed at mobilities, further development of the B.Sc. programme, library modernisation and dissemination. As an option, opportunity to complete a full study programme for Ukrainian students in 2005 should be considered.
- ii) involvement of the Ukrainian Coordinator in the follow-up dissemination activities (complementary and structural measures) taking into account good results achieved to date and participation in the Bologna experiment in Ukraine.

SUPPORT TO INDEPENDENT MEDIA IN UKRAINE

The EC Services are advised to:

- take note of use of requested extensions in time for future projects as in this case the extension allowed the contractor to complete the project and ensure sustainability. Without the extensions, it would have been unlikely that the project would have succeeded in this regard.
- take care in the selection of project partners to ensure that they can be clearly focussed on the project and have the resources to support it and more importantly, do not have any conflict of interest that hampered this project's early ability to develop.

EFFECTIVE STATE BUDGET MANAGEMENT

The Project Manager (PM) is advised:

- That the draft IR of 22/03/05 requires revisions, namely: (i) Inclusion of an updated log frame, with completed horizontal logic of the project, i.e. with the Objectively Verifiable Indicators defined for all levels of the intervention. (ii) The deliverables/outputs should be presented in a proper form of the Overall Output Performance Plan.
- To request the Contractor to clarify the following issues with regard the planning of the project: (1) Whether the attestation programme will be actually initiated in the framework of the project, and what number of accountants is expected to pass the attestation with the assistance from the project; (2) The approach to the selection of pilot oblasts and the content of the pilot projects; (3) The duration and milestones of the three project time

phases. - To discuss with the Contractor the possibility to accommodate the Project Partner's request for assistance to define its proper status in the system of the national executive power, in view of the ongoing administrative reform.

- request the Contractor and the Project Partner to invite representatives of the 'indirect target groups' and other donors (first of all, the World Bank) to take part in work of the Advisory Board of the project.

FLOOD RISK ASSESSMENT AND MANAGEMENT IN ZAKARPATSKA OBLAST

The Project Manager is advised to:

- Make a decision on reallocation of the project budget in respect of two outstanding lots for equipment and data.
- Discuss the likelihood of achieving the Project Purpose and the Results in full within the project time during the next Steering Committee meeting.
- Support the Contractor in involving the new Ukrainian staff in project steering and working structures.
- Consider together with the project parties during the next Steering Committee meeting the usefulness of the Technical Committee for the coordination of the project implementation. - Instruct the Beneficiaries (HMS and ESD) to accelerate the solution of the equipment-related problems (permission to use certain radio-frequency spectrum and accreditation at customs).
- Encourage the OVG to better coordinate the work on reconstruction of the Flood Forecasting Centre.
- Instruct the Contractor to prepare the OOPP and the OPR in compliance with the LFM/PS and the reporting requirements and analyse the OVI and R/As for each level of the intervention logic in the progress reports.

BELARUS, UKRAINE AND MOLDOVA ANTI-DRUG PROGRAMME, "BUMAD" PHASE 1&2

The Project Manager is advised to:

- emphasise the importance of systematic POs involvement in further BUMAD phases design and to request the Contractor:
- accelerate the appointment of the new Country Coordinator;
- consider a revision of the Programme management set up;
- develop and make use of a fully fledged LF analysis covering all the levels of the intervention logic, a detailed workplan and an overall output performance plan;
- prepare a proposal for a time extension of BUMAD2;
- closely follow the progress of the Inter-service Agreement (P2);
- perform a gap analysis in collaboration with the POs to identify areas for support within the next BUMAD phase.

UKRAINIAN POLICY AND LEGAL ADVICE CENTRE (UEPLAC)

The Project Manager is advised to:

- Request that following reallocation of resources that is currently awaited, the Contractor avoids further staff changes;
- Consider organisation of quarterly meetings of the team leaders of the Tacis projects contributing to PCA implementation;
- Request that efforts continue to be made by both the Contractor and the Ukrainian side to trash out still existing differences in approach to legal approximation; the issue of shared approach is important for continued assistance as well; ideally the approach needs to be negotiated already at the design stage;
- Request that the Contractor envisages analysis of the project effectiveness on the basis of the analysis of the NPA implementation schedule if the latter is adopted within the project lifetime.

ACCOUNTANCY TRAINING PROGRAMME

It is recommended that a clear commitment on the side of the decision-makers be sought in negotiating any future projects related to the accounting reform or other similar sectors engaged in the transition process.

The EC services are recommended that in future similar multi-component projects, the ToR should envisage clear and documented mechanisms of collaboration between the Contractor and the Project Partner, including a feed-back mechanism. The responsibilities of the Project Partner need to be better defined in the ToR with due consideration of the existing management practices. Closer involvement of the top management of the ministries and direct contacts need to be envisaged. In the projects containing an institution building component, sustainability and phase out strategy should be a matter of high concern already at the early stages of the project. The final destination of the equipment should be more clearly fixed in the ToR, and all the issues related to transfer of equipment should be agreed accordingly and formally documented between the EC and the official beneficiary.

LEGAL TRAINING IN UKRAINE: KIEV AND SELECTED REGIONS

The Project manager is advised to:

- Bring to the attention of the authorities the importance of proper attendance of the training courses by the civil servants and suggest that relations between the Contractor and the ministries are formalised and fixed in the orders to be issued by the latter;
- Request the Contractor to reconsider the resource utilisation schedule to ensure sufficient presence of a team-leader and a key expert in EU Law in the field;
- Address the Contracting Unit to solve the issue of discrepancy between the end of Contract date and deadline set in the Financing Agreement;
- Suggest the Contractor to distribute the developed questionnaire on distance learning to all the relevant ministries;
- Recommend the beneficiary educational institutions to activate negotiations in developing a common approach to networking.

ESTABLISHMENT OF AN AGRICULTURAL STANDARDS CERTIFICATION AND CONTROL MECHANISM IN LINE WITH WTO-SPS REQUIREMENTS

The Project Manager is recommended to:

- Advise the Contractor to optimize the utilization of local resources in the remaining project period and to revise the reporting discipline, focusing on timely issue of the reports, proper reflection of the delivery of results and accuracy of presentation of inputs and outputs;
- Request the Contractor to finalize the procurement procedure taking into account the rights and preferences of the MAP, as a project beneficiary;
- Consider follow-up activities for laboratory accreditation in the veterinary, grain and phyto-sanitary arrears supported by the actions on strengthening the building capacity and to continue support at regional level for selected manufacturers in different sectors in product traceability and HACCP, already initiated in the current project;
- Foresee procedure for transfer of the current project web site to the MAP in case the SPS Information point will be not established before the official project end date.

DEVELOPMENT OF A SYSTEM OF CONTINUING EDUCATION AT WORKPLACE

The Project Manager is advised that:

- it is important for the Project Team at the current stage of the project to establish and maintain direct working contacts at ministerial level (with both MoLSP and MoES) in order to complete establishment of the Project Steering Committee and reach agreement on the legal and institutional status of the Resource Centres (national and regional);
- during the inception phase the activities concentrated on the analysis of the situation, organisation of the project office, establishment of work plans and planning of other project activities;
- the Inception Report was produced on time after completion of the inception phase, the quality of the report in general is good;
- the project design in its current status is in line with the Project Cycle Management (PCM) requirements, based on the present needs of the vocational training system in Ukraine, adequate to the existing project environment and suitable for further implementation and monitoring;

- the project is progressing well and is managed and coordinated effectively by the Contractor's Management Team.

ENSURING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF TERRITORIAL COMMUNITY RIGHTS GUARANTEED BY THE LAW 'ON LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENTS IN UKRAINE'

The Commission Services are advised to recommend the project for replication in other (selected) NIS countries.

SUPPORT TO THE NATIONAL COORDINATING UNITS

The contractor should specify the skills to be obtained by the NCU by the anticipated completion of the assistance; setting out what the NCU will be able to do on its own if it is to be considered to have achieved the desired capability.

The pre-programming document should be disseminated by the contractor to other NCUs as a model framework for setting out the policy and strategy base for technical assistance.

The Commission Services should discontinue the provision of one of the two foreign long-term experts on completion of the current contract since, as a result of the achievements to date and in the light of the remaining tasks, there is no longer justification for two advisers.

NIS MANAGERS' TRAINING PROGRAMME (MTP-3)

The Project Manager is advised to:

- Request the Contractor to develop a clear and reliable plan of activities for Ukraine for the next year that should present interventions aimed at support of all the target groups defined in the ToR and to take the measures to ensure that during the next stage of the MTP-3 all the project components defined in the ToR receive proper attention;
- Request that a monitoring system for assessing the effectiveness is introduced, including collection of information on success stories, to ensure that effectiveness can be formally verified;
- Request the Contractor to develop further co-operation with the Tacis project that supports the Ukrainian Initiative in order to prepare a plan of MTP activities related to support of training institutions and regional working groups. Since these target groups are expected to receive assistance from both projects is important to ensure complementarily and avoid duplication and also to adjust assistance to the absorption capacity of the groups mentioned.

MANAGEMENT OF THE BUG, LATORITZA AND UZH RIVER BASINS, UKRAINE

The Project Manager is advised to:

- Assist the project parties in resolving the issues related to commissioning and maintenance of available and new equipment. Recommend them to assist the laboratories with technical issues and staff, if necessary.
- Recommend the Project Partner to liven up the participation in the project's work and respect the project steering and approval procedures. Advise the MoE to inform the Contractor in advance about important events related to water resources management and transboundary water cooperation planned to be held in Ukraine.
- Regard positively the additional Activity on the Pilot Project suggested by the project parties, as it would contribute to achieving the Specific Objectives of the project.
- Recommend the project parties to work on enforcement of the project strategy on development of Regional Monitoring Centres, as significant for sustainability of the project results.
- Instruct the Contractor to include the LFM in each administrative report and regularly analyse related OVI and R/A for achieving Results and Objectives.
- Promote the long-term trans-boundary water cooperation at institutional level in the future programming.

SUPPORT TO THE DEVELOPMENT OF A SYSTEM OF MEDICAL STANDARDS

The EC Services are advised:

- That co-ordination of technical assistance should be ensured at the level of projects' ToRs.

- To conduct an evaluation/inventory of what has been produced in the framework of the ongoing projects in the area of health care, in order not to include these tasks again in the ToRs of future projects.
- That adoption of a national programme for reforming the health care system should be a pre-condition for any further EC assistance to Ukraine in the health sector. The Project Manager is advised:
 - To request that the joint meeting of all Tacis projects in the health sphere, that is planned for 14/03/05: (i) involves projects' counterparts from MoH; (ii) includes the small project dealing with the record system for pharmaceuticals; (iii) results in precise proposals on co-operation and not mere promises to meet and exchange information.
 - To request the Contractor to elaborate on issues raised in section 1, and to propose improvements to the intervention logic of the project (definition of a single PP and OVs) not later than in the first Progress Report.
 - To discuss with the Contractor the possibility to extend the project in time without additional budget.
 - That the process of selection of pilot sites should be wrapped up asap. However, for the sake of fairness, and in view of the plans to establish one of the pilots in Kiev, it is recommended to launch an extra call for proposals for Kiev City and Oblast, through the Kiev City Health Administration and/or Kiev Oblast Association of Family Doctors.
 - To involve representatives of relevant 'adjacent Ministries', NGOs, research institutions, other Tacis projects and other donors in work of the Steering Committee.
 - It is advisable to investigate the opportunity to use the remaining public awareness budgets of three Tacis projects – PHC, HFM and Medical Standards to design a joint campaign that would promote health reform, explain its content/major steps and what should be expected as an outcome.

BORDER MANAGEMENT IMPROVEMENT: IMPLEMENTATION OF THE BORDER CROSSING PROJECTS

The Project Manager is advised to consider the necessity to extend the project duration to address the delay in order to deliver all envisaged results in a full scope including the Defect Liability Period. The Addendum is also needed reflecting the increase of the short-term expertise for the design review and supervision.

The Project Manager is advised to consider the possibility of allocating additional resources to enhance the design for the Jagodin and Rava Russka BCs. It is recommended to check the status of Uzhgorod BC design also to avoid similar problems in the future.

BANK SECTOR REFORM, UKRAINE

The Project Manager is advised:

- To oversee that the individual advisory work programmes for banks conform to the commitment assumed by the Contractor in the TP – 'where relevant, interim outputs (milestones) and corresponding timelines for achieving these, will be formulated to ensure that overall project progress can be tracked'. Such specification does not exclude the flexibility in case the needs are changed in the course of implementation.
- To discuss with the Contractor the possibility for an extension of the contract already at this stage of the project, in order to: (i) incorporate additional time in the individual advisory programmes for banks; (ii) to facilitate the capacity by the banks-recipients to absorb the technical assistance.
- To propose the Contractor to re-apply the Performance Scan upon completion of the advisory assignments, however not in full but in a reduced version, restricted to the most common priority areas.

ASSISTANCE TO REGIONAL DEVELOPMENT

The Project Manager is advised to recommend the Contractor to:

- Bring the project intervention logic into line and to produce the properly developed Logframe Matrix, which enables project management to have a quick overview of the project and to verify whether project design is consistent and logical;

- Improve operational level of communication with the beneficiary securing the participatory approach to work.

PARTNERSHIP IN EFFECTIVE HIV PREVENTION AND PLWHA SUPPORT IN PRISONS

The Project Manager is advised to:

- Help the Applicant to clarify the misunderstandings with the European partner thus ensuring smooth continuation of the project.
- Request the Applicant to urgently carry out, together with the European PO, the training foreseen to enhance the capacities of the local POs involved in the project implementation.
- Request the Applicant to organise a joint event with the participation of all the project stakeholders, in order to share experience, exchange information, ensure transparency of all the project Activities and strengthen the cooperation with the GOs concerned.
- Request the Applicant to continue paying special attention to aspects of sustainability.
- Request the Applicant to develop clearly formulated and time-bound Results/sub-results.
- Request the Applicant to make all the OVI specific and time-bound as well as to re-consider and fix the most important Assumptions and Risks related to the project.

SUPPORT TO THE UKRAINIAN INITIATIVE

The Project Manager is recommended to:

- Request the Contractor to refine the Inception report in order to improve presentation of the intervention logic. The needed improvements mainly refer to removing the redundant tables and bringing the required tables into compliance with the Tacis guidelines for reporting. The Project Synopsis should be amended as well. Specific objectives should correspond to those stated in the ToR;
- Request the Contractor to update the LFM, in particular to develop measurable OVI;
- Request the Contractor to facilitate co-operation with the MTP;
- Bring to the attention of the Project Partner the importance of support to the project at a decision-making level.

REFORM AND MODERNISATION OF THE UKRAINE CUSTOMS ADMINISTRATION

The Project Manager is advised to instruct the Contractor to submit the Best Practice Guides for Airport to SCSU. The equipment delivery should be under control of the EC. It is important to pay attention to actions proposed by the Contractor for the follow-up Customs project to ensure the continuity of the programme and its sustainability in Ukraine.

SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT OF REGIONS AFFECTED BY THE CHERNOBYL DISASTER

The EC Services and the Project Manager are advised to:

- Ensure that financial and contractual framework of future projects is appropriate for delivery of anticipated Results.
- Design the future projects with full adherence to the requirements of the Logframe Approach.
- Consider a decentralised approach with strong utilisation of local initiatives and development actions at low cost as replicable for other relevant projects.
- Ensure timeliness of micro-projects approval, enabling the project progress according to the work plan.
- Envisage more comprehensive dissemination activities for future social-oriented projects to promote results and disseminate best practices.
- Find possibilities to improve cooperation with other donors in the Region and coordination of activities in the future.
- Consider further support of the settlements affected by the Chernobyl disaster for sustaining the achievements.

LEGAL AND INSTITUTIONAL BASIS FOR PROTECTION OF COMPETITION IN UKRAINE

The Project Manager is recommended:

- to discuss with the Contractor and the Beneficiary how to handle the completion phase (final reporting and closing the project) because the work plan for some activities is very tight and covers the last month of the project (December 2005);
- to draw the Contractor's attention that the 'Output Performance Report' table in the Progress Reports should be brought in line with the OOPP to avoid misunderstanding during the project assessment; to encourage the Contractor to make self-assessment of the project effectiveness during the final reporting phase;
- to discuss a formal issue of the intellectual property rights/ licensing for software and other products developed by the project and to be used further by the AMCU and its branches;
- to advise the Contractor to revise Logframe once more in order to take into consideration the changes made during the implementation phase;
- to discuss with the Beneficiary a possibility for further EC support.

PREVENTIVE AND PRIMARY HEALTH CARE UKRAINE, KIEV AND SELECTED REGIONS

The Project Manager is advised:

- To instruct the Contractor to include in the Final Report the analysis of the effects of the project on the health care capabilities in the pilot areas.
- To consider the extension of the project until the end of the current year within the same budget.

The EC services are advised to make adoption of a national programme for reforming the health care system a pre-condition for any further EC assistance to Ukraine in the health sector.

SUPPORT TO THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE ACCIDENT INSURANCE SYSTEM IN UKRAINE

The Project Manager is advised to request the Contractor:

- To explain precisely in the next Progress Report, which is due in April 2005: (i) which tasks cannot be implemented as per TOR and/or Technical Proposal, and for what reasons; (ii) how the reduced scope of work will be compensated by enhanced assistance in other areas – legal advice, prevention and rehabilitation. The other highly necessary but presently omitted task is the design of training and information materials (films, brochures, presentations) in the area of accidents prevention and occupational health and safety (OHS) to be further replicated by the resource centres.
- To improve the project design by: (i) design of a detailed OOPP; (ii) adjusting different planning documents in accordance with each other.
- To intensify the project implementation by: (i) Continuing assistance in the legal field, in particular in the medical and rehabilitation issues; (ii) Compensating the current delays by an earlier implementation of Activities planned for later periods; (iii) Finalisation of Communication Strategy, design of an Action Plan for the Fund on the basis of this Strategy, and selection of pilot actions from this plan to be financed and implemented in the framework of the project.
- To assist the Project Partner in designing business plans for the resource centres.

REFORM OF ARBITRATION COURTS AND SUPPORT TO COURT ADMINISTRATION

The Project Manager is advised to:

- Request the Implementing Agency to discuss the expectations regarding the project timetable, deliverables and required input with both official Project Partners;
- Request IA to improve presentation of the work programme in the Inception Report. The latter should include Overall Plan of Operations, a detailed Plan of Operations for the next reporting period and Overall Output Performance Plan; update the LFM supplementing it with measurable indicators at all levels of the project intervention;
- Request the Implementing Agency to submit the draft Inception report to the High Commercial Court;
- Request the parties involved to agree on composition of a Steering Committee;
- Request the Implementing Agency to improve communication with the High Commercial Court. It is highly recommended that common approach to the project implementation is agreed between the parties, roles are defined and clear mechanisms for collaboration are established; consider establishment of joint working groups;

- Request the Implementing Agency to speed up the activities;
- Recommend reassessing the ability to ensure the effectiveness of planned interventions by the date of submission of the Interim Progress Report.

ENTERPRISE RESTRUCTURING FACILITY, UKRAINE

The Project Manager is advised:

- Given the initial imbalance between the planned scope and duration of this project, coupled with delays occurred during the Inception Phase, to consider a time extension already at this early stage of the project. However, extending the project would involve also extending the 2000 Financing Memoranda that expires in December 2004.
- Acknowledging the design work done in the Inception phase to instruct the Contractor to amend the project planning documents to establish clear coherence between the LF, the OPO and the OOPP and to develop in the OOPP clear and time-bound sub-Results to be delivered gradually during the entire project life.
- To instruct the Contractor to present an updated and comprehensive dissemination programme, indicating not only channels and inputs, but also a thorough and concrete analysis of the target groups.
- To consider the possibility for the project to establish regular communication with such organisations as the Union of Industrialists, Chamber of Commerce and other business associations. These organisations can and should be instrumental in knowledge transfer and dissemination through their own channels. Depending on the possibilities, these organisations could take over part of the Beneficiary's functions, in case it proves inactive and unavailable and/or its central governmental functions are deemed incompatible with the character of the project's tasks.

APPLICATION OF A FOREIGN TRADE REGIME: STANDARDS, TECHNICAL REGULATIONS AND CONFORMITY ASSESSMENT IN UKRAINE

The Commission Services are recommended to consider as a matter of urgency a possibility to extend the deadline for Supply Contract signature.

The Project Manager is recommended to request the Contractor to refine the IR and LFM to bring in compliance LFM, Synopsis and OOPP and to develop time-bound OVI. An amendment related to withdrawal of assistance to the National Accreditation Agency should be agreed with the Ministry of Economy and European Integration.

It is also recommended to bring to the attention of the beneficiary the importance of adjusting their work planning to the visits of the project experts.

NGO DEVELOPMENT - KIEV AND SELECTED REGIONS

The Project Manager is advised to:

- Request the Contractor to improve the Logframe regarding the need for measurable OVIs.
- Require the Contractor to bring the scope of Activities in line with the project timeframe.
- Accelerate the procurement of equipment and start the micro-grants programme for NGOs.
- Continue controlling the measures to be undertaken concerning the permanent project office in Kiev.
- Ensure that the Contractor keeps potential sustainability issue permanently on the agenda.

ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT STANDARDS FOR ENTERPRISES

The inception phase has been successfully completed and the project entered into the implementation phase. The project established its presence on-site; cooperation has been established with the project beneficiaries and other stakeholders. Significant scope of the start-up activities has been carried out. Some project issues are still in need of clarification.

The Project Manager is recommended:

- To ask the Contractor to clarify the project logic, review definitions of the activities, results and purposes and to define clear assumptions and OVIs for each logical level to

avoid further misunderstanding when monitoring and assessing the project. It could be done through reviewing the project Logframe and project synopsis.

- To request the Contractor to clarify all pending issues concerning budget allocation and working arrangements. To reconsider Task 2 (legal issues) in view of re-focusing on more practical assistance for the introduction of a number of standards from the ISO 14000 family. This recommendation is already being realised.
- To discuss a possible assistance in the preparation / establishment of ISO 14000 certification/verification system in Ukraine in the framework of the project.
- To draw the Contractor's attention to the necessity to follow Tacis reporting guidelines in respect of provision of the required planned and/or utilised input information. This will allow regular assessment of the project efficiency.
- To encourage the Contractor and the Project Beneficiary to closely involve the MENR in the project implementation.
- To advise the Contractor to agree the equipment specification with the project beneficiaries and to start procurement procedures as soon as possible.

IMPROVEMENT OF SOLID DOMESTIC WASTE MANAGEMENT IN DONETSK OBLAST OF UKRAINE

The Project Manager (PM) is advised to:

- Initiate actions to formalise the reduced duration of the project (by means of Addendum to the Contract).
- Require the Contractor to bring the scope of activities in line with the reduced project timeframe and prepare disbursement schedule for the entire project.
- Advise the Contractor to prepare substantive analysis of planned human resources input, enabling results to be obtained on time and at reasonable cost.
- Instruct the Contractor to prepare final lists of the international and local experts and submit for approval to the PM.
- Instruct the Contractor to include a Logframe in the Inception Report and utilise it in the project management.
- Request the Contractor to produce Monthly reports, in order to follow the project progress more closely, taking into account the reduced timescale.

INTEGRATION AND DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME IN CRIMEA, NETWORK OF SME BUSINESS ADVICE AND TRAINING CENTRES

The Commission Services are advised to:

- Differentiate in future projects between clear-cut SME support orientation and development of profit-oriented business centres, since these two, though having some common features, require different approaches and expertise by all participants, including contractors.
- Include in future SME projects a condition about relevant financial support by the respective governments for the SME type of organisations.

JOINT RIVER MANAGEMENT PROGRAMME

The Project Manager is advised to:

- Analyse implementation of the previous monitoring recommendations and instruct the Contractor to introduce the Logical Framework Approach, with special regard to appropriate indicators, into the remaining project activities as much as possible/feasible at this stage. The project final report should analyse progress that the project will have achieved at all four intervention levels.
- Recommend the Contractor to follow proactively the current administrative changes at the Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources of Ukraine to avoid delays in the project activities as much as possible.
- Instruct the Contractor to make every effort to deliver the project equipment as soon as possible.
- Request the Contractor to intensify actions for enhancing sustainability of the project results. This is especially necessary for implementation of the recommendations of the project.

- Consider the possibility of a follow-up project aiming at improving joint water management activities on transboundary waters, particularly by developing river basin management plans, as a first step. This might include as a pilot area the Seversky Donets basin (and, possibly, the Tobol basin).

TRACECA CO-ORDINATION TEAM

An addendum to the contract was signed providing a two-month extension, and according to the Project Manager, another extension (or direct agreement) till November 2004 is planned. This decision is opportune and correct.

The Project Manager is recommended to

- consider positively this matter that will allow the establishment of a self-financing mechanism for the Permanent Secretariat and TRACECA activities by member states, and to further support Ukrainian beneficiary in the PETrA activities.
- request the Contractor to encourage the TRACECA Permanent Secretariat and the National Secretaries to set up a self-financing mechanism to secure sustainability of the project and the TRACECA programme as a whole.

EQUAL TO EQUAL. OUTREACH WORK AND HIV SUPPORT IN 3 REGIONS OF UKRAINE

The Project Manager is advised to request the Contractor to:

- Abide by the required administrative and financial procedures of project management, but ensure at the same time continuity of the project and fulfilment of the obligations as planned.
- Re-establish the communication with the NGO 'Blagodiynosti', in order to urgently consider and find mutually acceptable solutions to continue the project.
- Consider, among other options, to assign the role of mentor to Blagodiynosti and to transfer all other administrative issues related to the project management to Vkhod. Continue strengthening the sense of project ownership at the local POs, as well as consolidating their capacities in fundraising techniques.
- Formulate a joint follow-up Action Programme, which should promote sustainability of the project Results.
- Detail and specify the planned project Outputs/Results in a specific plan with concrete references to the respective Activities.
- Formulate appropriate OVs to each level of the intervention logic with special attention to the Outputs/Results. Those OVs must be specific, measurable, available, relevant and time bound. Improve quality of the administrative reports in line with the required standards.

DEVELOPMENT OF A STRATEGY TO HARMONISE STATE AND REGIONAL WASTE TREATMENT LEGAL BASIS WITH THE EU STANDARDS

The Project Manager is advised to:

- Request the Contractor to prepare, in close cooperation with the local POs and in line with the respective Tacis requirements, a detailed and time-bound Overall Plan of Operations as well as an Overall Output Performance Plan.
- Instruct the Contractor to speed up implementation of the planned project Activities, especially that of the key ones, with the respective delivery of the necessary Outputs and Results.
- Encourage a proactive attitude of the local POs towards their participation in the delivery of the main project Results.
- Request the Contractor to make everything possible to further consolidate partnership relations with the local POs.
- Request the Contractor to assist the local POs in identifying potential sources of financing for continuation of the Activities, started in this project. The EC Services are advised to:
- Ensure that design and resourcing of the future IBPP projects are in line with their immediate and wider objectives and the Tacis requirements, in general.

EDUCATION DEVELOPMENT IN ENVIRONMENTALLY SAFE ENERGETICS

The Project Manager is advised to:

- Continue controlling measures on the establishment of the demonstration centre of alternative power engineering at the Kharkiv University.
- Instruct the contractor to utilise the Risk/Assumption forecasts for project management by analysing them regularly and initiating measures accordingly.
- Request the Contractor to speed up consensus building with the project partner on the equipment specification for the demonstration centre to allow for starting the procurement procedure.
- Consider the Contractor's request for the project extension in time as a possibility to deliver good quality Results, aimed at dissemination of experience, programmes and materials to a wider audience, a core of the Tempus programme's new aims.

VETERINARY EDUCATION REFORMS IN KHARKOV, UKRAINE

The Commission Services are advised to:

- Demand clear specification of inputs by, responsibilities of and expected benefits for each party in future Tempus projects, where several partner institutions are involved.
- Demand time-bound and quantified specification of the OVI in the Logframe, which make the progress transparent and measurable as much as possible.
- Convey to the Government of Ukraine the necessity to simplify and streamline the existing rules on exemptions of tax and duties for EC technical assistance projects.
- Apply stricter content-wise requirements to the Progress Reports on Tempus projects.

COMBINED HEAT AND POWER (CHP) INSTALLATION IN FOOD INDUSTRY

The Project Manager is recommended to:

- Approve the project prolongation within the validity period of the Tacis Programme 1999 Financing Memorandum provided that the Contractor's formal request is duly justified and submitted; to request the Contractor to resolve an issue concerning the official registration of the pilot companies as the project recipients in order to avoid potential problems during equipment delivery and customs clearance;
- Encourage the Project Beneficiary to take a more active part in preparation and implementation of Phase 3;
- Advise the Contractor to involve international and local financing institutions in Phase 3.

HIV/AIDS PREVENTION AND AWARENESS PROGRAMME

The Project manager is recommended to:

- Request the Contractor to include the available measurable indicators in the LF matrix and to ensure that final version of the completion report contains up to date information;
- Support a small-scale BISTRO project for replication of the experience in other oblasts.

The Commission services are advised:

- to foresee a co-ordination mechanism in joint programmes if such are planned in future.