

**Value Chain Analysis for Development: providing evidence for better policies and operations in agricultural value chains**

**Brussels 18-19 January 2023**

# **The Interactions of Land Tenure and Agricultural Value Chain Development in Africa: A Synthesis from VCA4D Studies**

**John Morton and Ravinder Kumar, Natural Resources Institute, University of Greenwich**





# Question and issues

- **How are land tenure and land policy constraining or enabling the development of inclusive and sustainable value chains in Africa?**
- **Is the development of value chains in Africa (autonomously or through project interventions) affecting land access and secure tenure rights?**

**Land tenure defined here as: “the terms under which land and natural resources are held by individuals, households or social groups”**

## **Issues examined (non-exclusively)**

- **Large scale land acquisition (LSLA) either by foreign investors or domestic actors such as large landlords**
- **Women’s access to productive lands within households**
- **Issues raised by formal and semi-formal titling programmes**
- **Communal or open-access management of grazing lands**



# VCA4D materials

**A purposive sampling of VCA4D studies to represent domestic and export-oriented value chains in African sub-regions**

Sub-Region	Sahel	Coastal West Africa	East and Central Africa	Southern Africa
Export-Oriented VC.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Cameroon Cotton</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Sierra Leone Palm Oil</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Tanzania Coffee</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Eswatini Beef</li></ul>
Domestic VC		<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Ghana Sorghum</li><li>Côte d'Ivoire Cassava</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Burundi Milk</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Zambia Maize</li></ul>

- **VCS were not selected based on report conclusions on sustainability or inclusivity**
- **Studies varied greatly in their focus and level of detail on different land tenure issues**
- **An additional quantitative overview of social profiles of all 37 VCA4D studies**

# Findings: Customary Land Tenure



- **A majority or near majority of agricultural land in all 8 countries is governed under “modified customary tenure” (MCT)**
  - Partially codified under colonial and post-colonial governments and administered by government-recognised “traditional authorities”
- **MCT can be associated with limited smallholder power in negotiations with the private sector**
- **But does not necessarily act as a barrier to the development of sustainable VCs (domestic or export-oriented)**
  - Example of Tanzania coffee – 90% of production is from smallholders and c.95% of farms in key regions are held under MCT
- **Inclusion of land under MCT in a VC does not necessarily mean equity towards smallholders**
  - Cameroon cotton: lack of management strategies for smaller farmers
  - Burundi milk and Ghana sorghum: potential threats of land concentration

# Findings: Gender Inequality



- **Gender inequality in land access is reported in virtually all of the VCs**
- **Relating to both MCTs and to new titling initiatives**
- **In 78% of all VCA4D studies women have access to land that is not at all or only to a low degree equal to that of men**
  - Burundi milk: women have restricted inheritance rights compared to their brothers, no rights to inherit as widows, and may be subject to violence or expropriation. Titling is not improving this situation.
- **Predominance of women among producers in a VC does not imply equity of tenure**
  - Côte d'Ivoire cassava: 80% of producers are women, but women are only 21% of holders under customary tenure, fewer under other systems. There is an increasing trend for women to produce under one-year rental agreements

# Findings: Titling Initiatives and Rental Markets



- **Titling initiatives can convert customary land to full legal title, or an intermediate form with lower transaction costs (e.g. Burundi)**
- **These processes are being rolled out slowly and are subject to complaints**
  - In Zambia there are accusations of rent-seeking around the “Chief’s Certificates”
- **Rental markets for land are developing in several of the VCs**
  - Tanzania coffee: rented land is not used for the export commodity but may be used by coffee farmers for other crops
  - Cameroon cotton: rented land is associated with low social status or recent immigration, and yields and investment are lower
  - Côte d’Ivoire cassava: one-year rental provides an opportunity for female farmers, but does not facilitate development of the VC

# Findings: Land Acquisition by Commercial Actors



- **In the 37-study analysis, sub-questions relating to transparency, participation, equity compensation and justice around land acquisition attracted negative responses in a large majority of cases**
- **The eight VCs selected do not support a narrative of “land-grabbing”, with two exceptions**
  - Sierra Leone palm oil: 20% of cropped areas covered by leases (Freetown residents as well as foreign companies). Requirements for consultation have been circumvented
  - Côte d’Ivoire cassava: large-scale acquisition of land in the S/SE for other commodities has displaced cassava production to central and west-central regions, and development of rental markets for fallow land on larger farms
- **The Voluntary Guidelines on Responsible Governance of Tenure (VGGT) were unknown to stakeholders (Tanzania, Eswatini) or widely flouted (Sierra Leone, Côte d’Ivoire, Ghana)**

# Findings: Contrasting Impacts of VC Development on Land Access and Tenure Security



- **Eswatini, Tanzania and Ghana: no apparent impact**
- **Zambia: some shift to informal sale of land allocated under MCT, but attribution to the maize VC is uncertain**
- **Cameroon cotton: a highly organised VC is unable to influence land policy or increasing land conflict**
- **Burundi milk: land policy driven by fear of conflict and demographic factors more than by VC development, but concerns over livestock management have led to a Law on Zero-Grazing**
- **Sierra Leone palm oil: circumvention of acquisition procedures but also limited signs of private companies improving their community engagement and partnering with NGOs and international organisations**



# Implications for Land Policy and Governance



- **Profitable and inclusive VCs can be built on the basis of a range of tenure systems including MCT**
- **Titling initiatives are not a magic bullet and can increase conflict**
- **There is a need for legal frameworks for private leasing, especially in export-oriented VCs**
- **There is scope for specific innovations in land policy**
  - Multi-year rental contracts, support for export production on medium-scale holdings or group plots
- **These need to be tailored to specific contexts of VCs and have well-designed benefit-sharing and aggregation mechanisms**
- **Land acquisition in high-value VCs can have indirect effects on both geographical location and land access in staple food VCs which need monitoring**

# Implications for Land Policy and Governance (2)



- **There needs to be a concerted initiative to promote knowledge of and adherence to the VGGT**
- **Concerted efforts are needed to improve women's tenure security and decision-making power over land**

## Implications for VC Development Policy

- **Major stakeholders in VC governance (parastatals, private investors, apex farmer organisations) can and should engage in strengthening tenure institutions for sustainability, inclusivity and equity**
- **This may involve multi-stakeholder partnerships, including with government**
- **These can both coordinate policy and act as sources of innovation**



**Thank you  
for your  
attention!**

<https://europa.eu/capacity4dev/value-chain-analysis-for-development-vca4d-/events/conference-value-chain-analysis-development-providing-evidence-better-policies-and-operations>