

Annex 3 Assessment Fiches

1.A. BILATERAL PROJECTS

PROJ. CODE	BILATERAL PROJECT NAME (Single Country/National Projects)	REGION COUNTRY	Page
18792	<i>Support to Poverty Reduction Strategy through the development of human resources as a result of a modern and efficient vocational education and training system</i>	EU neighbourhood: ARMENIA	4
21066	<i>Support to the Continuation of the Reform of Vocational Education and Training (VET) sector</i>		
24345	<i>Eastern partnership integration and cooperation programme (EaPIC) – Neighbourhood East</i>		
4955	<i>Assistance to the Reform of the Technical and Vocational Education and Training System in the Arab Republic of Egypt</i>	EU neighbourhood: EGYPT	11
23386	<i>Technical and Vocational Education and Training Reform – Phase II (TVET II)</i>		
21067	<i>Support to the Vocational and Education Sector of Georgia</i>	EU neighbourhood: GEORGIA	16
20480	<i>Support to the Employment and Technical Vocational Education and Training (ETVET) reform</i>	EU neighbourhood: JORDAN	21
23419	<i>Strengthening the governance of the VET sector</i>	EU neighbourhood: MOLDOVA	26
4631	<i>Appui au développement de la formation professionnelle dans les secteurs du tourisme, du textile et des NTIC - Formation Professionnelle II.</i>	EU neighbourhood: MOROCCO	32
22582	<i>Projet d'appui au développement du secteur privé</i>	ACP- AFRICA: BENIN	37
14658	<i>CTVE/VTC Vocational Training Programme (BT/7004/001)</i>	ACP- AFRICA: BOTSWANA	44
16093	<i>Augmentation of Gaborone Technical College and Automotive Trades Technical College</i>	ACP- AFRICA: BOTSWANA	48
22182	<i>Programme d'appui à la formation professionnelle</i>	ACP-AFRICA:	52

		GABON	
14622	<i>Ecole Nationale des Arts et Métiers ENAM-III</i>	ACP- AFRICA: GUINEA	57
22049	<i>Programme d'appui à la formation professionnelle et à l'insertion des jeunes en Côte d'Ivoire</i>	ACP-AFRICA: IVORY COAST	61
14612	<i>Formation Professionnelle et technique NIGETECH-II</i>	ACP-AFRICA: NIGER	65
16963	<i>Appui à la formation professionnelle continue au Niger</i>	ACP-AFRICA: NIGER	70
19482	<i>Programme d'Appui à la Formation Professionnelle Continue (Phase II)</i>		
14901	<i>Programa de la Educación Técnica y Profesional (PROETP)</i>	ACP-CARIBE: DOMINI-CAN REPUBLIC	76
14864	<i>Guyana Training Agency</i>	ACP-CARIBE: GUYANA	83
17383	<i>Programme D'appui Budgétaire A La Formation Professionnelle</i>	ACP-PACIFIC: NEW CALEDONIA	88
14723	<i>Rural Training Centres Phase II (RTC II)</i>	ACP-PACIFIC: SOLOMON ISLANDS	91
16175	<i>Vanuatu Tourism Education and Training Project (VATET)</i>	ACP-PACIFIC: VANUATU	96
18135	<i>Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET)</i>	ASIA: BANGLADESH	100
5779	<i>The EU-China Managers Exchange and Training Programme (METP)</i>	ASIA: CHINA	105
19259	<i>Support to National Programme of Vocational Education Development</i>	ASIA: KAZAKHSTAN	112
22921	<i>Support to Technical and Vocational Education and Training</i>	ASIA: MONGOLIA	117
19952	<i>Support to the Technical and Vocational Education and Training Sector in Pakistan</i>	ASIA: PAKISTAN	122
21329	<i>Supporting TVET Reform in Pakistan (TVET II)</i>		
21952	<i>Annual Action Plan 2010 Argentina - Programa de Educación Media y Formación para el Trabajo para</i>	LATIN AMERICA:	127

	<i>Jóvenes II</i>	ARGENTINA	
16895	<i>APROLAB Apoyo a la Formación Profesional para la inserción laboral</i>	LATIN AMERICA: PERU	133
18363	<i>Apoyo a la Formación Profesional para la inserción laboral APROLAB-II</i>		
Sub-total:	32 projects	6 regions 24 countries	

1.B. INVESTING IN PEOPLE PROJECTS

PROJ. CODE	INVESTING IN PEOPLE PROJECT NAME	REGION: COUNTRY	Page
Targeted projects			
164787	<i>Monitoring and Assessing Progress on Decent Work (MAP)</i>	MULTIPLE: Bangladesh, Cambodia, Brazil, Indonesia, Philippines, Niger, Peru, , Ukraine, Zambia	141
164791	<i>Assessing and addressing the effects of trade on employment</i>	MULTIPLE: Bangladesh, Indonesia, Benin, Guatemala	145
215230	<i>Improving social protection and promoting employment</i>	MULTIPLE: Burkina Faso, Cambodia, Ethiopia, Honduras	149
220873	<i>Improving safety and health at work through a Decent Work agenda</i>	MULTIPLE: Rep. Moldova, Ukraine, Honduras, Nicaragua, Malawi and Zambia	153
2008: Call for Proposals: Education, Knowledge and Skills: Towards demand-driven Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) systems			
22632 1	<i>Sahel AgroFormation</i>	AFRICA: Mali, Niger	157
21171 9	<i>Amélioration des capacités de formation paramédicale au Maroc et au Mali, par l'appui à la création d'instituts de formation</i>	AFRICA: Maroc, Mali	161

	<i>paramédicale au sein du Croissant-Rouge marocain et de la Croix-Rouge malienne</i>		
21187 7	<i>Vocational Training and Sustainable Tourism</i>	MULTIPLE: Bolivia; Nicaragua, Morocco, Senegal; Gambia	165
21143 8	<i>Réseau Interrégional pour l'adaptation de la Formation technique professionnelle aux besoins de l'Artisanat (RIFA)</i>	MULTIPLE: Morocco (Maghreb), Ivory Coast, Benin, Brazil, Honduras, Guatemala, El Salvador	168
2009-2010: Call for Proposals: Developing TVET methodologies and services for the informal economy –			
23109 3	<i>Developing Vocational Training for the Informal Economy in Somalia (DVTIES)</i>	AFRICA: Somalia	173
23105 9	<i>Unblocking the Cocoa Value Chain through Informal and Formal Pathways to Learning in Eastern Sierra Leone</i>	AFRICA: Sierra Leone	176
23127 5	<i>Developing Vocational Training Methodologies and services for the Informal Economy.</i>	AFRICA: Uganda	180
23108 9	<i>Skill Development and Employment for the Informal Sector in Nepal</i>	ASIA: Nepal	183
23112 5	<i>Technical and Vocational Education and Training for Young People in the Informal Economy in Bangladesh</i>	ASIA: Bangladesh	188
23122 3	<i>Skills for Unemployed and Underemployed Labour (SkillFUL): Developing Technical and Vocational Education and Training Methodologies and Services for the Informal Economy for poverty reduction</i>	ASIA: Bangladesh	192
25408 4	<i>High Impact Tourism Training for Jobs & Income (HITT)</i>	MULTIPLE: Benin, Cambodia, Ghana, Mali, Mozambique, Nepal, Vietnam	198
25516 9	<i>Articulación del Sistema Nacional de Educación Técnica y Formación Profesional con las necesidades formativas de la economía informal en Nicaragua</i>	LATIN AMERICA: Nicaragua	203
23121	<i>Programme d'Appui au développement de la</i>	MULTIPLE: AFRICA	207

1	<i>Formation Par Apprentissage (PAFPA)</i>	Benin, Mauritania	
260814	<i>A shared bridge toward innovation: building up TVET demand driven services and networks for workers in the informal economy in Burundi and Ethiopia</i>	MULTIPLE: AFRICA Burundi, Ethiopia	211
255372	<i>Promoting marketable skills for the informal sector in Addis Ababa</i>	AFRICA: Ethiopia	214
231058	<i>Advancing Technical and Vocational Capacities for Employment and Enterprise Development in Sierra Leone</i>	AFRICA: Sierra Leone	217
254350	<i>Pour un accès et un maintien dans l'emploi des personnes sourdes et/ ou malentendantes en Afrique de l'Ouest</i>	MULTIPLE: AFRICA Togo, Burkina Faso, Niger	221
231190	<i>Renforcement d'un dispositif pédagogique et de services pour la formation technique et professionnelle dans le secteur informel artisanal de la menuiserie et de l'ameublement au Sénégal</i>	AFRICA: Senegal	225
SUB TOTAL	22 projects		

ARMENIA

Project titles: Support to Poverty Reduction Strategy through the development of human resources as a result of a modern and efficient vocational education and training system in Armenia, and

Continuation of Vocational Education and Training (VET) Reform and Development of an Employment Strategy

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: B
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: C
7. Sustainability: C
8. Added value of ETF: A

0. TVET at a Glance

The Armenian TVET system is divided into two different levels: preliminary (craftsmanship) and middle vocational education, as a result of a 2004 reform. It is under the policy and legal responsibility of the Ministry of Education and Science (MoES). In 2008, a tripartite VET Council and a National Centre for the Development of VET were established which aimed at supervising the TVET reform. The Ministry of Labour plays the role of intermediary between employers and VET providers. The State Employment Service Agency conducts LMIA and job placements. In 2012, vocational colleges under other ministries started to move under the auspices of the MoES.

The duration of preliminary education varies from 6 months to 3 years. Leading to the Craftsman qualification after 9 years of basic general education or 12 years of secondary general education (ISCED 3 compatible).

Middle vocational education lasts from 2 to 5 years and leads to a specialist qualification after 9 years of basic general education or 12 years of secondary general education (ISCED 5b compatible).

Both routes facilitate access to the labour market or continuing education towards a general secondary general (*matura*), with the possibility to pursue higher education.

Preliminary professional education is offered by 51 state institutions: 25 vocational craftsmanship schools, 20 middle technical colleges, 4 educational complexes and 1 university.

Middle level professional education is provided by 79 state institutions: 71 middle colleges, 5 universities, 2 educational complexes, the French-Armenian Vocational Training Centre, and 13 private middle colleges.

1. Identification CRIS decision number	18792, 21066 and 24345
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Area:	TP-TVET policy and systems TM -TVET access to target groups ST- Sectoral Training: LS- Active Labour Market policy and Measures: IE- Informal Economy IP
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	ENPI: (European Neighbourhood and Partnership Instrument): ENPI regulation (EC) N° 1638/2006 of 24 October 2006
c) By region	Geographical Zone (Country or region): ARMENIA
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: (2000-2012): Financing Agreement ENPI/2010/021-066 <i>Continuation of Vocational Education and Training (VET) Reform and Development of an Employment Strategy</i> (the 'Contract') ratified on 24 December 2010 and amended by Addendum N° 1 (concluded on 29 June 2011) and N° 2 (concluded on 14 February 2012). The amendments were as follows:

	<p>the entry into force of the Financing Agreement and end at 72 months after this date, i.e. on 28 December 2016, with the operational implementation phase ending on 28 December 2014. Status: Closed, Ongoing, Committed, Provisional: Ongoing</p>
3. Financial data	<p>Sector Budget Support (SBS) EUR 16 000 000 (CRIS 18792) EU Contribution: EUR 16 000 000 (15 000 000 of Sector Budget Support (SBS) and 1 000 000 in Technical Assistance (TA), National Contribution: none EUR 15 000 000 (CRIS 21066) and 6 000 000 (CRIS 24345). Total EUR 21 000 000 (Budget support: EUR 19 million; Complementary support: EUR 2 million)</p>
4. Outcome	<p>What were the goals of the project?</p> <p>The TACIS programme supported developments in the VET sector through a number of projects, starting with a short-term project (Support to the Development of a Strategy and Legal Framework for the Implementation of VET Reform) for preliminary policy-oriented work, and followed in early 2004 with a longer-term project (Support to the Development of an Integrated Vocational Education and Training System), which was completed in December 2006. The SPSP bridged the transition from the more traditional technical assistance of TACIS to the new ENP Action Plan (AP), approved in November 2006.</p> <p>The overall objective was to support the Government's Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) by increasing the quality of VET to make it more relevant to the needs of the labour market and of individuals, promoting the employability of the active population and business competitiveness. The subsequent programmes (21066 and 24345) were formulated as continuing and consolidating the VET reform and the country's efforts towards the 'activation policy', encouraging unemployed people to actively look for a job and further on to be actively engaged in various projects. The technical assistance component was reserved for support/capacity building as well as for a review/management of the programme.</p> <p>The main entry points as well as new elements of the programme are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Efficient and effective VET governance and empowerment (support the MoES in designing and implementing a relevant performance management system (including implementation plan and training programme); • Improved quality of the system, both initial and continuing; (refurbishment and delivery of new training equipment of 12 Regional VET Centres and of at least 5 preliminary (craftsmanship) VET colleges situated in border localities. Establishment of regional VET networks led by the Regional Multifunctional VET centres; • Harmonisation of education and training curricula to the needs of the labour market; review the existing VET qualifications structure and classifier to establish new VET qualifications framework; • Development and implementation of employment strategies both at national and regional level (establishing links with employers in order to have reliable labour market research in terms of quality and quantity; • Introduction of career guidance and job search capacities (Career guidance specialists of 12 VET centres trained with the use of methodology developed by the Youth Professional Orientation Centre of Ministry of Labour establishing mechanisms for graduate tracer studies, supporting graduates in their further professional promotion, etc.); • Availability of VET for the physically disabled people at least in 2 VET colleges as well as to design a plan for the adjustment of remaining institutions to the needs of youth with special needs; • Dissemination policy for education and employment; • Performance monitoring and accountability; • Recognition of all forms of learning by opening up qualifications systems and frameworks to learning taking place outside formal education and training institutions.
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
National Priority	
<p>PRSP I, adopted in 2003, indicates that reform of the VET system, including rehabilitation and strengthening of its offer, is the principal way to reduce the existing high rate of structural unemployment. PRSP I gave top priority to general education. The VET system underwent several</p>	

phases of reform. European Commission assistance (TACIS) revamped VET reform from 2003 onwards. The revised PRSP II, adopted in 2007, raised the priority of VET priority on the development agenda. At the time, one-fifth of the labour force was unemployed. Dual labour market: underemployment or low productive employment, inadequate skills among job seekers, shifts of large shares of the active population towards subsistence agriculture, coexisting with expanding sectors of the economy employing in real wages a more skilled labour force. The business climate discouraged the flexible use of labour. Vulnerable groups included families with many children, long-term unemployed, women returning to the labour market, people with disabilities, and people leaving in rural remote areas.

VET reform: policy, strategy, governance

Notwithstanding the efforts of the MoES since 2005, the legal framework requires further work to be completed and improved. The official documents of the sub-sector policy are:

- Law on Education in 1999;
- Strategy of Preliminary and Middle specialised VET, 2004 (including: continuity of pathways, skills provision according to personal capacities and to economy and labour market needs, quality of educational services, efficiency of expenditure, inclusion of various forms of VET into a single statutory framework, involvement of social partners, transparency and accreditation, lifelong learning);
- VET modernisation priorities paper and Action Plan (for period 2005-2008). Identifying problem areas in: 1) Inadequate opportunities for youth and adults in lifelong professional education and training; 2) Low quality of VET provision; 3) Weak organisational structures and partnerships; 4) Inefficient resource mobilisation, distribution and utilisation;
- VET law was drafted with Tacis support in 2003-2004 (adopted in July 2005) maintaining the fragmented administration of a number of VET establishments across different Ministries. The VET Law introduced quality assessment and quality assurance, a new school management body (College Board), a credit system and a social partnership;
- New VET Modernization Priority Paper and Action Plan (MPP AP) 2008-2010 adopted by the VET Task Force and endorsed by the MoES in 2007; indicates two key aims, (raising the quality and improving the effectiveness of primary and intermediate VET) and six modernisation priorities to: i) introduce competency-based VET standards; ii) modernise quality monitoring mechanisms; iii) create technical support and quality assurance infrastructures; iv) improve cost efficiency and educational outcomes; v) optimise VET financing; vi) build a national capacity for implementing and monitoring the VET modernisation process;
- Policy Concept on Adult Education (UNDP drafted) was adopted in 2006 reflecting awareness of society and the government regarding the reform towards a lifelong learning perspective; TVET remains low among the government's policy priority, although at national decision-making level the need for reforms is acknowledged
- The National Strategy and Action Plan for Employment has been elaborated by the Ministry of Labour and Social Issues in consultation with all the relevant stakeholders and was approved in 2009 and a National Employment Strategy and Action Plan 2013-2018, which includes objectives for the medium-term in the area of employment policy, was approved in 2012.

Management of the TVET system.

The VET sub-sector is under the responsibility of the Ministry of Education and Science (MoES). A quarter of public VET establishments are fragmented under line Ministries (Ministries of Agriculture, Health, Culture, Energy, Sports). No comprehensive performance management system has been developed for the sector that can provide necessary and reliable information for justified policy-making and revisions. The performance planning, monitoring, reporting and evaluation functions that are provided now in many cases represent undeveloped and fragmented activities that do not fully support the sector-wide policy needs.

Funding

Low level of public spending on education - in particular in VET. This has resulted in growing social inequity for access and attainment, as well as a declining quality of education. The state's annual VET budget only finances recurrent costs (salaries, energy, and scholarships) linked to education services provided to state-subsidised students. Expenditure for development (rehabilitation of buildings, modern training equipment, training of principals and teachers, new methodological literature, and

textbooks) are not included and schools finance their own improvements out of extra-budget revenues. In 2004-2006, the Government increased teachers' average salaries to raise education quality and teachers attendance.

Participation of key stakeholders

At present, social partnership and dialogue remain sporadic and informal at school level and are not institutionalised at policy-making level. A positive note is that in 2007, an inter-ministerial body (VET Task Force) was established with the participation of line Ministries and social partners' representatives.

Skills demand

The major challenge for public VET policy is the low attractiveness of VET pathways for the current generation of youths, a problem that many countries face likewise. In Armenia, a country with recognised traditions in artisanship and industry, this problem is explained partly by the profound degradation of VET establishments.

Labour markets

Lack of relevance of educational provision in line with labour market needs in the last decade accompanied with a lack of information for parents and students about the current modernisation efforts.

The Ministry of Labour and Social Issues (MLSI) is the intermediary between employers requiring skilled labour and the VET colleges providing the training. The employment law of 2006 focuses on Active Labour Market Policies. The State Employment Service Agency (51 SESAs or employment centres located in the regions) conducts labour market analyses and assists the unemployed to find jobs. In 2008, SESAs organised training for 1400 unemployed, out of a total number of 70 000 registered unemployed – thus reaching about 2% of the registered unemployed. Passive measures accounted for 3.2 000 000 000 AMD in 2009, and active measures for 232 million AMD).

Career guidance

Vocational guidance was non-existent till 2008, when the Government (WB loan), established a Youth Professional Orientation Centre under the MoLSI. The VET colleges provide no effective career guidance services; no mechanisms for gathering feedback from the graduates and employers are in place. Besides, the colleges do not provide the students with the necessary job search and job placement skills, thus reducing their employability.

4.2. Result of the project

- Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)

Starting from the early 2000s, the role of the MoES has significantly changed as a result of broad scale structural reforms within the government (adoption of the laws on state governance institutions, on state non-commercial organisations, on the civil service etc.). The role of the ministries has been more concentrated on policy development and implementation/ownership, rather than on direct service delivery, which has been delegated to organisations with arm's length management (for example VET colleges). The expected results are:

- Institutional capacity in policy formulation, performance monitoring (Annual report on MoES financial and non-financial performance, Internal audit function) and a single statutory framework for the whole VET system;
- Improved governance and management of VET institutions at national local and regional level;
- Technical support and quality assurance through the National Centre for VET Development (NCVETD);
- Competency based vocational education (National Classifier of Occupations);
- The National VET Council as a tripartite body of stable social partnership is established;
- New VET funding mechanisms including public-private partnership;
- Active employment measures and strategies, (job-creation for youth in particular for graduates of VET institutions);
- Occupational standards by economic sector and LMIAS (MoLSA).

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)

- 3 main broad criteria **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF**

- **Relevance: A**

The programme appears to be highly relevant. The objectives are consistent with beneficiaries' requirements, country needs, global priorities, partners' and Commission's policies. The programme is assessed as a relevant instrument of support for the socioeconomic development of the country. It is grounded on international and national development agendas, as well as in the national development framework for VET. The evolution from stand-alone projects to budget support responds to the evolution of the Commission's policy and country strategy.

The response to the national need of establishing and stabilising the VT system and institutions as well as improving the quality of the skills offer responded to the economic needs of the employers, the unemployed youth, the underemployed working in the informal economies and remote rural areas. It also responded to the social demand of increasing access to training for economically and socially disadvantaged groups as well as groups with special needs. The gender-balanced participation was addressed as a crosscutting issue. The relevance to the labour market needs was further strengthened through the inclusion of active labour market policies including Labour Market Information, Public Employment Services and Career guidance. Stakeholders and social partners participation to VET governance and planning was promoted through the establishment of the national tripartite platforms. The relevance of the programme to the local needs is increased by the decentralisation of the VT system. The training offer, the development of both vocational training and employment services, and people-to-people contact actions was developed taking EU training standards into consideration.

- **Effectiveness: B**

The Commission's actions achieved their planned objectives and positive results (real benefits to the selected beneficiaries and achievement of EU policies and strategies in Armenia) since 2003, through 'stand alone' technical assistance projects (TACIS), which were considered as having less impact at sector and national policy level, partly due to a lack of continuity and coherent long-term sector planning. The EU-Armenia Neighbourhood Action Plan adopted in November 2006 within the framework of the national reform programme, considered systemic development of the education and training in the perspective of far-reaching reforms. The EC-Armenia Country Strategy paper 2007-2013, considering poverty reduction, economic growth and the reduction of social inequality as the main priority area, promotes enhanced access to and quality of social services, including education and VET. The VET policy and strategy framework were adequate and consistent; the institutional and organisational capacity was adequate to accommodate the proposed EC assistance and meet the needs of reforms; and, finally, donor coordination by national authorities was strong in order to avoid duplication. The allocated expenditures for 2008 and 2009 (which includes EC budgetary support) reflected these policy objectives and supported their implementation.

Substantial financial resources were allocated for the improvement of 12 selected VET colleges (facilities and training equipment), for development of VET quality (competency-based standards, teaching and learning materials, methodological recommendations and manuals, administrators and teachers trainings, etc). The institutional capacities of the implementation organisations (the MoE VET department, the National VET Centre and the regional VET colleges) are continuously being addressed through capacity building measures embedded in the programme. There is also constant support provided through the TA component. In recent years, the national agencies have shown an increase in capacity to implement sector programmes. However, support on both national and local levels in terms of capacity building continues to be in demand.

- **Efficiency: B**

The Mid-Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) process for 2008-2010 marked the start of more strategic expenditure planning for the VET sub-sector: since 2008, the MTEF included performance-based programme budgeting to cover expenditures for VET reform programmes including those foreseen by the ENP AP 2007 conditionalities as well as by VET MPP AP for 2008-2010. The monitoring system for PRSP/MTEF/sector strategies was strengthened. Impact evaluation based on outcomes was developed. The MoES was one the pilot ministries introducing performance-based budgeting, with a system of financial and non-financial indicators.

The starting basis for performance measurement was the VET MPP and Action Plan 2008-2010 in the form of outputs presented on an annual perspective; they were used for the formulation of performance indicators, whose final utilisation depended on the availability of reliable, adequate and updated national statistical data.

In 2008, the non-tertiary VET system comprised: 28 schools of preliminary (craftsmanship) VET colleges, with an enrolment of 4.21 thousand students; 82 public middle VET colleges, with 28.98 thousand students; 24 private secondary VET colleges with 2.3 thousand students; 3 Universities providing secondary VET programmes (University Colleges). Craftsmanship education offers more than 30 vocational profiles and the middle VET schools offer approximately 185 vocational profiles, out of a total of 257 inserted in the Classifier, as reviewed in the last three years.

- **Coherence: B**

This programme is coherent with the sector policy support programmes funded under TACIS AP 2006, ENP AP2007 and builds, completes and consolidates the activities implemented during the period 2007-2009 promoting the reform and modernisation of the vocational education and training (VET) sub-sector by the Ministry of Education and Sciences (MoEs). This programme promotes the institutional capacity to steer and monitor the reform process – addressing existing objectives as well as embarking on new aspects of the reform programme - as well as linking it with budgeting and resource management.

- **Quality of the Design: B**

Given the characteristic of the intervention and the instrument, the formulation support to the national objective of vocational education for a qualified labour force and competitive environment are clearly structured and integrate reference to subjects including working conditions, health, environmental protection and safety at work and gender issues.

- **Impact: C**

The overall TACIS interventions responded to the needs identified, however, they were mainly governed by a 'top-down' approach, characterised by a large number of 'stand alone' technical assistance projects, often achieving good results at the project level but with less impact at the sector and national policy levels.

The VET reform initiated under TACIS had a limited impact on the capacity of the Government to implement the key measures of the VET MPP (adopted in 2004) due to financial and human resource limitations. International cooperation could cover only part of the technical topics and policy issues prompted by the reforms initiated. The capacity (financial, staffing, monitoring mechanisms) of MoES remained inadequate for policy development and performance monitoring. Opportunities to learn from international best practices remained limited, national institutional capacity to deal with the reform items (competence-based learning, qualifications frameworks, quality assurance, teachers' development, innovative learning methods and dynamic social partnerships) required further investment. Many of the aforementioned limitations were overcome throughout 2007-2008 with the assistance of EC budget support and its TA component (e.g. functions of the VET Department were revised, National Centre for VET Development with service provision and methodological support functions was established). EU support will not be able to address the whole VT system.

- **Sustainability: C**

The programme entirely sets the basis for future sustainability. The government has increased national financing to the sector. A National Training Fund has been piloted and, on the supply side, the VET centres have independent boards which are improving their performance thanks to the EU provision of improved planning, financial management and M&E. The key governance institutions such as the National VET Council and the National VET Centre are also being strengthened.

- **Added value of ETF:**

The ETF supported the Armenian authorities to ensure progress in ongoing VET reforms, by providing learning opportunities at the policy and system levels, on structured and institutionalised social dialogue, modernised VET governance, and by developing a stronger labour market intelligence system as the basis for an improved qualifications system. Concept on Social Partnership (SP) in VET was drafted and a new tripartite approach to the social dialogue defined (National Council for VET Development with equal representation of 3 parties): Government, Employers and Trade Unions (national level) and College Governance Boards in each such institution with at least 30-40% of social partners' involvement (local level)

In 2012, the ETF implemented a project on CVET which contains a component on piloting the validation on non-formal and informal learning (VNFIL) and the results of this exercise should be further developed and disseminated with prospective to have an efficient VNFIL system in Armenia.

4.3. Beneficiaries

Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

The direct recipient of the programme are expected to be the MoES technical and financial departments dealing with TVET governance, the management of VET institutions at national local and regional level; the National Centre for VET Development (NCVETD) as the central quality assurance body; the members of the the National VET Council as a tripartite body of stable social partnership; entrepreneurs and managers of vocational training centres associated in the new VET funding mechanisms including public-private partnership; youth graduates from VET institutions; benefitting from higher relevance of TVET programmes defined in line with occupational standards set by economic sector: unemployed youth and vulnerable groups assisted through strengthened employment services and supported through active labour market policies and measures.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The PRSP I, adopted in 2003, recognises the role of VET in poverty reduction and economic development. It indicates that reform of the VET system in Armenia, including rehabilitation and strengthening of its offer, is the principal way to reduce the existing high rate of structural unemployment. The PRSP I gave top priority to general education that received considerable allocations, but the revised PRSP II, to be adopted in 2007, is raising the importance and priority of VET in the development agenda of the country. This opens new positive perspectives in terms of growth of state budget allocations for VET in 2008 and further, as announced by the sector Ministry and the MFE.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

Continuity of the support through different instruments. The stand-alone modality of early interventions consented to address the issues related to VET in depth and then progressively raised the awareness of the concerned institutions and stakeholders. The simultaneous support by other international and bilateral development partners was considered as capable of creating a critical mass of support that had impact in spite of very limited absorption capacity by national institutions. The budget support financing option proved effective because the foundations of institutional capacity to steer and govern the VET reform had already been laid down by the TACIS programme. The inclusion of VET in the global HRD priority under the PRSP I and II contributed to placing VET higher in the national priority agenda, as the increased allocation in the national budget further demonstrates.

7. Lessons learned

Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.

The evolution from stand-alone projects to systemic assistance. The strong accent on supply through budget support. The ETF support to national authorities and stakeholders ensuring continuity and providing a holistic vision to VET reform implementation, which embrace a wider range of elements than those directly addressed by the EU-funded projects.

The strengthening of training providers in parallel with the development of the VET legal and statutory framework, enabling policy-makers to validate and test on the delivery of the chosen policy options. The dialogue with key stakeholders, the establishment, and the decentralisation of the governance mechanism, the funding mechanism and the active participation of the employers and the end users (trainees) are the main elements for scalability.

The focus on the regions i.e. the quality of VET providers outside the capital for a better matching of regional/local labour markets as well as on adult education and training.

The strong component of labour market development and active employment measures.

In conclusion, with regards to the initial VET reform in the period 2004-2008, Armenia did develop a sub-sector policy and development strategy and began concrete measures to address the key objective, namely improvement of VET quality and better matching of the system's outputs with the needs of the economy and labour market, strengthening of social dialogue and improvement of the physical conditions of VET delivery.

8. Implementation partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

The main implementation partners are the Ministry of Education and Science, the Ministry of Labour

and Social Affairs, the Ministry of Finance, the Ministry of Economy as well as social partners. The PRSP is the major forum for dialogue and co-ordination of donors around the overarching socioeconomic development programmes of Armenia. After the adoption of the PRSP several donors, in particular UN organisations, DFID, USAID have aligned their country strategies within close co-ordination with the government.

The Sector Policy Support Programme in the area of VET reforms is complementary to the UNDP assistance programmes of other donors involved in PRSP implementation, as well as Public Financial Management (PFM) reforms. In particular, this component has been designed in close cooperation with UNDP currently implementing a 1.2 mln \$ project in four Armenian *marzes* (provinces) for the revision of curricula, rehabilitation of buildings and refurbishment of four colleges in the agriculture, industrial and tourism sectors. The World Bank has provided support for the training of 7000 subject specialists, coming from 55 craftsmanship colleges. GIZ funded a regional programme and a teachers' training project, focused on the introduction of participative methods. Other international NGOs develop studies and debates in the area of adult education (IIZ-DVV, Germany) and lobby for the elaboration of a high level framework for lifelong learning.

<p>9. Contacts:</p> <p>EU Delegation in Armenia</p>	<p>Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail</p>
<p>10. Sources, links and publications</p>	<p>Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)</p>
<p>FA. FA- Amendment 1. FA- Amendment 2. Explanatory note addendum 3.pdf. Identification fiche. TAP. AF. CSP 2007-13. NIP 2007. Note EUD-DEVCO. TRNP2011.pdf. http://www.unevoc.unesco.org/worldtvvetdatabase1.php?ct=ARM. WB CP_Armenia_reviewed.pdf. Justification for selection conditions. TVET formulation checklist.</p>	

EGYPT

Project title: Assistance to the Reform of the Technical and Vocational Education and Training System (TVET I) and Technical and vocational education and training reform – phase II (TVET II)

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: B
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: C
7. Sustainability: C
8. Added value of ETF: A

0. TVET at a Glance

The TVET system encompasses formal education under the Ministry of Education and its network of technical secondary schools (TSS), 8 post secondary regional technical colleges (TCs), and 47 middle technical institutes under the Ministry of Higher Education. Non-formal education is structured by sectors and responsibilities are scattered among many ministries, the most important being: the Ministry of Industry and Trade (MOIT) with the Productivity and Vocational Training Department's centres (PVTD VTCs), the Ministry of Manpower and Migration (MOMM) with its own network of vocational training centres (VTCs) and the Ministry of Housing (3 training centres). Sectoral ministries such as Social Affairs, Health, Agriculture or Military Construction directly manage their own VTCs. The Ministry of Tourism's skills development is implemented through 20 TSS and on on-the-job training schemes. Continuing training and retraining, including training for the unemployed, is implemented in the VTCs of MOMM and provides access to a very small percentage of the population. On-the-job training and traditional formal apprenticeships are run on a limited scale through the MOIT and MOMM through the provision of a Training Fund set up under the Labour Law of 2003. Informal skills development through traditional informal apprenticeships is widespread in the main craft sector, manufacturing and service microenterprises and agriculture off-farming occupations.

The Egyptian Government and the European Union cooperate under the auspices of the TVET Reform Programme which aims to strengthen the TVET system and adapt it to Egypt's economic development challenges.

1. Identification CRIS decision number	4955 and 23386
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Area:	TP-TVET policy and systems TM -TVET access to target groups ST- Sectoral Training
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	ENPI: (European Neighbourhood and Partnership Instrument)/MEDA Regulation
c) By region	Geographical Zone (Country or region): EGYPT
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: (2000-2012) TVET I Start date - planned: 30/06/2004 End date - planned 30/06/2011 Start date - actual 01/07/2005 End date - likely 30/09/2012 Status: ONGOING TVET II: Under negotiation
3. Financial data	Sector Budget Support (SBS)

TVET I: EUR 66 000 000, EU contribution EUR 33 000 000, Government of Egypt (GoE) EUR 33 000 000

TVETII: EUR 117 000 000, EU contribution: EUR 50 000 000, GoE: EUR 67 000 000

4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
<p>Phase I: the overall objective was to contribute to improve the competitiveness of enterprises on domestic and international markets. Specific objectives were to support the development of institutional capacities for the formulation and implementation of a national TVET reform policy. Specific objectives related to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Establishing Pilot Regional TVET Partnerships (ETPs)- decentralized and demand driven- including TVET providers and clusters of enterprises; • Improving the quality of pre-service and in-service vocational training by piloting the delivery of practical skills and competence aligned with national qualification standards; • Developing the national regulatory framework and institutions that supports the decentralised and demand driven delivery (mechanisms of cooperation between TVET institutions and local businesses and TVET reform building blocks like MIS and the national infrastructures for TVET reform). <p>At short and medium-term levels, the programme aimed at addressing immediate needs for labour within the existing TVET system, while in the long run, it supported the reorientation of TVET towards a student and demand-oriented system.</p> <p>Phase II, has aimed at improving the structure and the performance of the TVET system to better respond to youth employability; it has been formulated and not yet finalised. The expected results of Phase II are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • TVET system's coordination and leadership is improved through the capacity building of various existing and new institutions including the Ministry of Education co-ordination unit in all TVET governance activities; • A comprehensive strategic framework including a national TVET strategy and relevant legislation are endorsed and implementation started by key stakeholders building on the TVET I outputs and achievements; • An overall national qualification framework (NQF) for Egypt for all qualifications is designed and formally adopted by the government of Egypt, and piloted in the tourism sector in collaboration with the NAQAAE and/or other relevant institutions; • A comprehensive methodology for the setting up of an information system of the financing and expenditure of the TVET system is developed, implemented and outputs analysed; • A national strategy for improving the image and social perception of TVET is developed and the implementation of some activities has started. 	
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<p>National Priority After achieving macro-economic stabilisation (Economic Reform and Structural Adjustment Programme), the availability and quality of labour remains one of the key constraints. Reduction of unemployment through the creation of jobs (150 000 per year), raising exports and a modernisation of education. In June 2002, the Supreme Council for Human Resource Development adopted a policy statement on employment and TVET reform in Egypt. This acted as the framework for coordinated and complementary TVET interventions.</p> <p>VET reform: policy, strategy, governance The main issues to address at policy level were: several reform initiatives over the years, at central and local level, which were limited to separate segments and institutions of the TVET systems; lack of coordination within an agreed national framework; systematic decentralised alternative models for improved provision and delivery as well as a national TVET reform strategy for preparation, employment and lifelong development of a skilled workforce.</p> <p>Management of the TVET system The system is highly fragmented. An apex inter-ministerial body exists involving the social partners: the Supreme Council for Human Resources Development (SCHR). Its mandate is to initiate a national policy on developing manpower and training and to propose policies and reforms, but it has never been active.</p> <p>Quality of the system The absence of a flexible and quality response to the different qualification needs of the economic sub-</p>	

systems. Weak delivery by training institutions. The difficulty to express skills needs and training plans by employers. The lack of national standardised qualifications. Problems in the quality and relevance of the TVET provision; difficult transition to employment, in particular for girls and women.

Funding

Inappropriate mechanisms for effective and efficient governance and financing of the TVET system.

Participation of key stakeholders

Employers and Business Associations of formal and informal economies and Trade Unions never actively participated in the governance of the system and just ensured a formal participation at the many bodies that the fragmented system has established over the years.

Skills demand

Low skilled labour is abundant. Skilled and high skilled and middle/high level management are scarce.

Skills supply

Poor quality and relevance of the TVET system. In-service training and retraining for private providers. 2 000 000 in Secondary Technical Schools, 250 000 at post-secondary non-university higher education institutions. Several hundred thousand in VTCs belonging to numerous ministries.

Labour markets

In the formal economy, recruitment practices in the private sector are based on networks, advertisement in the public sector, while public enterprises recruit workers with vocational and technical certifications from vocational guidance bodies. A manpower and skills forecasting oriented approach to the management of labour demand, supply and needs and surpluses is not in place.

TVET stigma

Second choice, for those entering in Technical Schools having failed general education. VTCs students are those who failed to enter Technical Education. TVET vicious circle of quantitative expansion, deterioration of quality and decreasing relevance.

4.2. Result of the project

- Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)

Phase I expected results were:

- Development of decentralised and demand driven TVET institutions through Pilot Regional TVET Partnerships (ETPs) including TVET providers, clusters of enterprises;
- Improved quality of TVET delivery (alternative ways and models for practical skills and competence development in coherence with national qualification standards development, pre service and in-service training);
- Development of national regulatory and support institutions for a decentralised and demand-driven TVET system (cooperation between TVET institutions and local businesses and development of TVET building blocks like TVET MIS, national support infrastructures for TVET reform).

Expected results of Phase II, if finalised, would be:

- TVET system's coordination and leadership improved through the capacity building of various existing and new institutions including the Ministry of Education coordination unit in TVET governance;
- A comprehensive strategic framework including a national TVET strategy and relevant legislation endorsed and implementation started by key stakeholders building on the TVET I outputs;
- A national qualifications framework (NQF) for all qualifications designed and formally adopted by the GoE and piloted in the tourism sector in collaboration with the national quality authority (NAQA);
- A methodology for TVET financing and expenditure information system developed, implemented and outputs analysed;
- A strategy for improving the image and social perception of TVET is developed and implemented.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)

- 3 main broad criteria **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF**

Relevance: A

The programme appears to be highly relevant by complementing the national effort towards a reform of the TVET system. National funding matches the EC contribution by same percentage. The private and

public employers are associated in the governance, management and delivery components of the project while the absence of the Business Associations of the informal economy places a question mark given its size and importance in the Egyptian economy. The relevance of the training offer is ensured by the employers' participation through the sectoral partnerships with VT providers. The project mainly addressed the economic demand leaving the social demand aside, in Phase I. Issues of inclusion and equity are indirectly addressed by increasing the offer of pre-service training for youth unemployed. No special attention is focused on marginalised groups and women.

Effectiveness: B

Effective on components 1 and 2, not on component 3. The planned ETPs were operational as full legal entities in cooperation with the relevant Industry Chambers; training packages and curricula were developed and delivered; interest for the ETPs' training services among private and public enterprises was reported as high; VT Schools upgraded, tutors and trainers trained; pilot of alternance education/training implemented; training councils of Industry, Tourism, Construction sectors established; Centres of Competence, achieved. The TVET reform systemic development and the institutional policy platform for the new system did not progress as planned (Structural problem of the over fragmented Egyptian TVET system and unclear division of responsibilities among ministries and other state bodies).

Phase II elects the Technical Secondary Schools of the Ministry of Education as the main beneficiary, complementing the action of the current EU Education sector policy support programme (EUR 140 000 000), which supports the Ministry of Education on the implementation of the National Strategy for Reforming Pre-University Education (although with a bigger emphasis on general education). The MoE being the main beneficiary and coordinator of TVET II helps also to more closely integrate the ongoing and future support to both general education and TVET.

Efficiency: B

The components 1 *Development of decentralised, demand-driven TVET institutions through the establishment of 12 ETPs, Public Private Partnerships (PPP)* and 2 *Improvement of the quality of TVET delivery by developing and providing demand-oriented practical skills training in the framework of the partnerships* were implemented according to plans as the flow of financial resources demonstrated (ROM). Component 3: *Development of national regulatory and support institutions for a de-centralised and demand-driven TVET system*, based on the experience drawn from the ETPs experience did not. Co-financing by the GoE and the partners was timely. The Ministry of Trade and Industry was a strong partner and its involvement in implementation regular. Implementation of activities was on schedule at 13/04/11 (EUR 23.2 000 000 spent, out of the total EC contribution of EUR 33 000 000). The expected outputs were delivered according to plans, based on a well developed log frame and set of indicators. An extension of 15 months was requested and approved mainly to facilitate the achievement and adoption of the TVET Reform Master Plan.

Coherence: A

Phase I was funded under the National Indicative Programme for 2002-2004 and based on a Financing Agreement (FA) signed between the European Commission and the Government of Egypt on 29 April 2003, with both parties providing co-financing of EUR 33 000 000 each over the total project's duration of 6 years. Phase II is in line with the EU's Foreign Affairs and Security Policy: *A new response to a changing Neighbourhood* and pillar III of the National Indicative Programme.

Quality of the Design: B

High quality with some flaws: the informal business associations related to the informal economy were not sufficiently involved, hence cutting out a huge potential market for the ETP training offers. In light of the assumptions that did not materialise, the quality of the design was not fully accurate.

Impact: C

The ETPs were established and piloted in respective sectors to be financially viable by generating income through their services, including sector needs analyses, development of occupational standards, development of learning content and materials for the TVET sector and pre and in-service training. The GoE seemed prepared to contribute funds to the ETPs in the coming five to ten years while financial viability through remunerated services to private enterprises had not yet been achieved. On the policy side, the protracted inactivity of the Supreme Council for Human Resources Development (SCHRd) is considered the main reason for the low impact of component 3. The PMU considered alternative options for reactivating the SCHRd or finding other policy platforms for endorsement, including bringing TVET

policy reform to the Prime Minister's Cabinet.

On the quality side, the enduring need for enhancement and recognition of the vocational professions by a national occupational qualification body to extend recognised standards, job recognition and prestige to the vocational professions has not been satisfied by the National Authority for Quality Assurance and Accreditation in Education (NAQAAE). This is the body with which the NQF process had been initiated by the EU and other development partners. The project had to supplement the lack of structural coordination, by establishing accreditation units within each of the ETPs with the support of internationally training accreditation bodies. These efforts, inherently of high quality, proved unsuccessful when coordination among national authorities was required to turn proposals into policies and implementation.

Sustainability: C

Low sustainability. ETPs, technically functioning well, are not financially viable and depend on national funding for offering training that employers are not prepared to entirely pay for - particularly on the job insertion of unemployed youths undergoing pre-service training offered by the ETPs-VTCs partnerships. The GoE did not approve the TVET reform master plan and never empowered the SCHR to implement it. The monitoring report recommends to entrust the PMU to implement the reform under the control of the SCHR. A TVET Phase II is considered necessary for the implementation of the TVET Master Plan developed under TVET 1 'otherwise TVET1 experience will be lost'. Moreover for the ETPs to become sustainable i.e. capable of depending not only on public funding but also on the private sector's skills demand, require more support.

Phase II's starting point is expected to be the TVET Reform Master Plan including the ETPs and also the PMU that could become the TA of a National TVET Agency, thanks to their high skills, experience and know-how. If the private sectors (formal and informal) demand for highly skilled manpower is not expressed the sustainability of the programme will be at risk in spite of the inherent quality of the design and the efficiency and effectiveness of the projects activities' implementation,. In Egypt, cheap labour remains the main factor of competitiveness of a predominantly informal economy, and this happens for cultural reasons but also because of the predominant low quality of many Egyptian products do not require highly skilled manpower. The preliminary analysis should be questioned. The Arab Spring's related events and the volatility of the institutional counterparts have aggravated the situation. The exclusion of the Trade Unions by the ETPs in Phase I (because of their nature as an offshoot of the party in power as well as of the Public Employment Services of the Ministry of Manpower and Migration (Labour)) was not a strategic choice made by the project.

Added value of ETF: A

The ETF participated in all phases of analysis, identification and formulation of both projects. It contributed to strengthening some aspects of the TVET system directly impacting on the project e.g. Career Guidance and the NQF. It also steered the formulation of Phase II towards the core problem of the Egyptian TVE system which is quality of Technical Education and the transition from school to work.

4.3. Beneficiaries

Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

Ministry of Industry in Phase I Ministry of Education in Phase II

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The project was funded under the National Indicative Programme for 2002-2004 and based on a Financing Agreement signed between the European Commission and the Government of Egypt on 29 April 2003, with both parties providing co-financing of EUR 33 000 000 over a total of six years. The Overall objective is to enhance the competitiveness of Egyptian enterprises by serving labour market needs. The Project's purpose is to support the development of human and institutional capacities for the formulation and implementation of a national TVET reform policy. The project design is based on a needs' assessment carried out in 2001 and 2002 by the European Training Foundation upon a request formulated by the EC. A participatory and bottom-up strategy was applied. The project introduces Enterprise-TVET Partnerships (ETPs), which identify and implement demand-driven training activities and provide the learning platform for wider TVET reform policy at the national level.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

The ETPs, sectoral partnerships (12) between associations of businesses and training providers from

<p>many Ministries and institutions. The increased offer of skills in demand by the sectors and the enhanced quality of the providers. The incremental approach of the TVET strategy (TVET master plan) and the introduction of elements of reform (MIS, Quality, qualifications). The involvement of the National Authority for Quality Assurance and Accreditation in Education (NAQAAE) and the link with the NQF. The assumptions of a political will to unify the system did not materialise.</p>	
<p>7. Lessons learned</p>	<p>Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.</p>
<p>The need to pilot, assess and mainstream successful 'pilots' in the system should be identified from the beginning. If the partnership and active involvement of the private sector is pivotal to the success of TVET system reforms, no key stakeholder or social partner should be programmatically excluded. When institutional fragmentation and a lack of leadership in the governance of the TVET sector has been indicated as a key problem for decades - but never addressed with a firm policy decision - it evidently cannot be overcome by piloting components (on the basis of the inherent quality of the project results only) that address future scaling up and mainstreaming. Options to consider were to concentrate support on the players with a critical mass that could ignite a positive effect, e.g. Ministry of Education. The stock of decent work in the country is limited. The country is a net exporter of semi-skilled workers. The strong accent on the transition to employment of Phase II should have been the starting point of Phase I.</p>	
<p>8. Implementation partners</p>	<p>Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.</p>
<p>The main partners for implementation were the Ministry of Trade and Industry (MoTI) as the beneficiary, and the ETPs. Local TVET Committees, Supreme Council for Human Resource Development, Ministry of Manpower and Migration, Ministry of State for Foreign Affairs (Three Ministry Committee). The Ministry of Education is the main beneficiary for Phase II. Germany - GIZ, Italy, France - AFD, UK - the British Council and the Development Partners Group (DPG) for the sub-sector of education and skills development, which is co-chaired by the EU Delegation.</p>	
<p>9. Contacts:</p>	<p>Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail</p>
<p>Ministry of Trade and Industry (MoTI), EU Delegation, Cairo</p>	
<p>10. Sources, links and publications</p>	<p>Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)</p>
<p>Financial Agreement Phase I and II 3 ROM (phase 2) November 2009 Country Strategy Paper 2007-13 Action Fiche. http://www.unevoc.unesco.org/worldtvtdatabase1.php?ct=EGY</p>	

GEORGIA

Project title: Support to the Vocational and Education Sector of Georgia (SPSP)

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: A
3. Efficiency: B
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of Design: A
6. Impact: ND
7. Sustainability: B
8. Added value of ETF: A

0. TVET at a Glance

Georgia undertook comprehensive education reforms soon after the 2003 Rose Revolution, building on the ambition for a system based on credibility and quality that would be compatible with internationally accepted standards and concepts. Georgia joined the Bologna process in 2005 and initiated VET reforms in 2007 within a context of highly-motivated stakeholder involvement. A schematic diagram of the current structure of the education system is presented in Annex 7 of this report for the purposes of clarification.

Vocational education and training: Key gains from VET reforms since 2010

Since the adoption of the 2007 VET law and the 2009-2012 VET strategy, much has changed in the VET system: the substantially amended 2010 VET Law; adoption of the comprehensive National Qualifications Framework (NQF); implementation of the education quality assurance framework and the establishment of multi-stakeholder governance (NVETC). These structural elements have given the VET system a new shape and dynamic, moving it closer to the envisioned responsiveness to market demand, diversity and autonomy of providers and drawing a growing share of private sector providers into alignment with common quality assurance criteria.

This setting is based on a combination of centralisation (the binding legal and regulatory framework) and autonomy (initiative and autonomy devolved to providers). VET programmes are now designed at provider level. This situation ensures a degree of flexibility for authorised entities, all of which must undergo annual self-assessments; it also means that programmes are obliged to comply with the legal framework, learning outcomes and credits laid out in the relevant occupational standards.

Between the adoption of the NQF in December 2010 and June 2012, Georgia adopted 247 occupational standards for qualifications under the five-level framework vocational qualifications. All occupational standards are published in the online registry managed by the National Centre for Educational Quality Enhancement (NCEQE, 2012b).

A qualitative revision of the first generation of occupational standards (2010-2011) was initiated in 2012 with the approval of MES and NCEQE. Working groups of relevant national stakeholders (supported by international expertise) began action in 2012 on these issues including training in curriculum design and pilot schemes for curriculum reform in selected occupations of the industry and service sectors. Work to introduce competence-based assessment will start in 2013.

The quality assurance framework for VET providers came into force in 2011. The practically universal coverage achieved by the public and private formal VET system is commendable, and the lessons from this initial implementation period can now be applied to future endeavours. A challenging phase is expected with the authorisation process for public VET providers announced for 2013. One of the pitfalls of the system is the high cost of the authorisation process for providers¹ - an element that is likely to limit the diversity of the VET programmes on offer.

The education system of Georgia was reformed in 2004, 2007, 2010 (Source: <http://eqe.ge/eng/education>).

1. Identification	21067 (CRIS ENPI/2009/021-067)
CRIS decision number	11330&1110 Education
2. Classification:	

¹ GEL 800 per programme and per level.

a) By Sectors / Thematic Are	TP-TVET policy and systems:
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	ENPI: (European Neighbourhood and Partnership Instrument) Sector Policy Support Programme (SPSP): Financing Modality: 1. Sector Budget Support (SBS)
c) By region	ENPI: GEORGIA
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: 2009. Presentation of Identification Fiche at Quality Support Group (QSG): 1st quarter/2009 Period: 2009-2013. The operational duration of the programme is set at 48 months as from signature of the Financing Agreement (3rd December 2009) Status: Ongoing (end 03/12/2013)
3. Financial data	
<p>Total cost EUR 19 000 000</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Total EC amount (+ % of indicative programme) (centralised management) EUR 17 000 000 - Project mode (centralised, complementary (Technical Assistance-TA) EUR 2 000 000 <p>Budget Line/ EDF A or B Envelope: 19.080103 Method of implementation: Centralised management</p>	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
<p>The VET strategy (2009-2012) is based on three major objectives:</p> <p>1. Increasing access to VET and supporting professional development of individuals: 1.1 Fund VET programmes for students at VET centres; 1.2 Eliminate dead-ends in VET; 1.3 Increase accessibility and involvement of the population; 1.4 Establish mechanisms for the recognition of prior learning.</p> <p>2. Ensuring quality in VET: 2.1 Develop institutional, infrastructure and human resources at VET institutions; 2.2 Develop social partnership mechanisms to enhance the labour market relevance of VET; 2.3 Develop National Qualifications Framework and occupational standards; 2.4 Develop and improve market- and student-oriented VET curricula; 2.5 Establish VET quality control and quality assurance mechanisms.</p> <p>3. Establishing participatory governance, management and an effective and equitable funding model in VET: 3.1 Develop social partnership at all levels of VET governance and management; 3.2 Effective and equitable funding of the VET system.</p> <p>The overarching goal was formulated around the domestic and global dimensions of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Providing internal and international markets with a competitive workforce; • Continuous advancement towards harmonisation of Georgian VET system into a common European and international educational space; • Supporting the self-fulfilment of an individual; • Supporting the social welfare of an individual. 	
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<p>The <i>Baseline Analysis of vocational education and training (VET) sector development</i>, the analysis of legal and policy documents, reports of researches and surveys, statistical data, as well as other quantitative information gathered by the Ministry of Education and Science (MES) and the National Professional Agency (NPA) in 2007 and 2008 indicated the reform needs of the VET system. The key stakeholders in the government, VET providers, social partners and donors focused the advantages for sizeable cooperation with the EU through a SPSP. By letter of early November 2008, the MES officially reiterated interest to benefit of this SPSP to support implementation of the government's strategy to develop the sub-sector of VET.</p> <p>The aim of the project is to strengthen the sustainable implementation of the policy reform, by providing 'room' for sharing best practices already available in Georgia and the elaboration of implementation action plans based on a participatory approach. The policy matrix of the agreement summarises the policy conditions, including sector-wide and sector specific conditions. The sector-wide conditions relate to the overarching framework for VET sector management, while the sector specific ones relate to reforms along the three pillars of: a) sector governance and social partnerships; b)</p>	

quality of VET and its relevance for the labour market; c) participation in VET.

4.2. Result of the project

- Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)

Most of the important gains of the VET reform were built-upon and tested from 2010 onwards, most importantly: the substantially amended 2010 VET Law; adoption of a comprehensive National Qualifications Framework (NQF); implementation of the education quality assurance framework, and; establishment of multi-stakeholder governance (NVETC). These structural elements have given the VET system a new shape and dynamic, moving it closer to the envisioned responsiveness to market demand, diversity and autonomy of providers and drawing a growing share of private sector providers into alignment with common quality assurance criteria.

The setting is based on a combination of centralisation (the binding legal and regulatory framework) and autonomy (initiative and autonomy devolved to providers). VET programmes are now designed at provider level. This situation ensures a degree of flexibility for authorised entities, all of which must undergo annual self-assessment? It also means that programmes are obliged to comply with the legal framework and learning outcomes and credits are laid out in the relevant occupational standards.

Between the adoption of the five-level NQF in December 2010 and June 2012, Georgia adopted 247 occupational standards all published in the online registry managed by the National Centre for Educational Quality Enhancement (NCEQE, 2012b). A qualitative revision of the first generation of occupational standards (2010-2011), initiated in 2012 improved the formulation of learning outcomes and the relevance of qualification levels with the contribution of the employers and VET providers and the international experts. This review of occupational standards was followed by the revision of the VET curricula and, in the longer term, student assessment processes. Working groups of relevant national stakeholders supported by international expertise began curriculum development in 2012 including training on curriculum design and pilot schemes for curriculum reform in selected occupations of the industry and service sectors. The authorities plan to officially introduce the new curriculum template and guidelines and a competence-based assessment in 2013.

The VET providers quality assurance framework came into force in 2011. The VET system reached almost universal coverage. Accreditation and authorisation for public VET providers was announced for 2013.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)

- 3 main broad criteria **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF**

- **Relevance: A**

The programme appears to be highly relevant. The objectives are consistent with the beneficiaries' requirements, country needs, global priorities, partners' and the EC's policies. The programme is assessed as a relevant instrument of support for the socioeconomic development of the country. It is grounded in the international and national development agenda as well as in the national development framework for VET.

- **Effectiveness: A**

The EC actions achieved their planned objectives and gave way to positive results.

- **Efficiency: B**

In the absence of any monitoring or evaluation report, it is not possible to establish the programme's efficiency; however, the first result (occupational standards, etc. focus on good efficiency).

- **Coherence: A**

This programme is coherent with the sector policy support programmes funded under ENPI AP 2009, and promote the reform and modernisation of the vocational education and training (VET) sub-sector by the Ministry of Education and Sciences (MoEs). The programme is fully in line with EC policy in Georgia, as expressed in the European Union-Georgia Action Plan under the ENP signed in November 2006. The Action Plan places particular emphasis on the area of education, training and youth.

- **Quality of the Design: A**

The framework for cooperation is wide, as it addresses system reform, relevance for labour market

needs, social partnership, policy dialogue with EU and convergence. Under 4.7. People-to-people contacts, the ENP Action Plan foresees, amongst others, the reform and modernisation of the education and training systems within the framework of Georgian plans towards convergence with EU standards and practices, in particular:

- Ensuring access for all to high quality education by providing sufficient funding, setting up quality assurance services, reforming education and training systems, including vocational education and training and fostering lifelong learning, in particular through implementation of a national education reform strategy;
- Strengthening the adaptation of higher and vocational education to the future demands of the labour market by increasing the involvement of social partners and stakeholders from civil society;
- Continue and enhance a policy dialogue between EU and Georgian authorities in the field of education and training.

- **Impact: ND**

In the absence of any monitoring or evaluation report, it is not possible to establish the project's impact.

- **Sustainability: B**

The programme does set the basis for future sustainability.

- **Added value of ETF: A**

The identification fiche is based on the findings of the *Baseline Analysis of vocational education and training (VET) sector development*, drafted in 2008 with assistance from the ETF at the request of Delegation of the European Union.

4.3. Beneficiaries

Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

MoES leads and owns the elaboration of the VET strategy – strength of the process.

VET stakeholders' community, represented by employers and trade unions' associations.

Association of VET centres.

NCEQE.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The Government of Georgia (GoG) started reforms in the Vocational Education and Training (VET) sector in 2005-2007. At the end of 2009, the EU and the GoG signed the Financing Agreement aimed at supporting the VET Sector in Georgia through a sector policy support programme (SPSP) with the objective to enhance credibility and attractiveness of the VET system. For the 2009-2012 period, the SPSP has a budget of EUR 19 000 000, composed of EUR 17 000 000 disbursed as budget support and EUR 2 000 000 as Technical Assistance.

The SPSP assists the MES (and the mixed commission that is established to supervise and monitor the strategy) along the three lines of the national 'VET Strategy'. The SPSP also assists the MES in fine-tuning and consolidating the Action Plan underlying the VET strategy and developing specific technical areas (such as the qualifications system). The SPSP programme will particularly focus on the strategy outcomes that address:

- Increased access to VET by youth and adults;
- Relevance and quality of qualifications to better respond to demands of various sectors of the economy, incl. formal and informal, and to local development needs;
- Autonomy of VET centres, incl. enhanced management capacity, better partnerships with relevant stakeholders/enterprises and transparent mechanisms for performance-based management;
- Governance of the system, in particular to ensure coherence and efficiency within a setting with growing private sector participation in provision; sector performance monitoring system, incl. indicators system and capacity to manage labour market studies and information analysis;
- Better participation of key stakeholders (enterprises, providers, experts, communities of users) in VET policy dialogue, as well as in monitoring and in analysis of the VET sector progress against market and skills' needs trends.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

MES leads and owns the elaboration of the VET strategy. The programme will also address the wider

VET stakeholder community, represented by employers and trade union associations. It will also address the new association of VET centres, aiming to improve the mechanisms and forms of policy consultation, as well as their active and motivated participation in the implementation of the VET strategy at national and local levels.

The National Center for Educational Quality Enhancement (NCEQE) cooperates with the European Commission within the framework of the Sector Policy Support Programme (SPSP) in Vocational Education. NCEQE is actively involved in the implementation of activities within the framework of the SPSP (improved management of vocational colleges, quality assurance, qualifications system, curriculum development, occupational standards). NCEQE also participates in the provision of information to the EU monitoring mission and a Review Team.

The preparation of the large EC Sector Policy Support Programme in VET (EU SPSP VET) (EU, 2011)², initiated in 2008, provided great impetus to the VET strategy development process; this element was considered a key policy condition for EC commitment to this SPSP. The public consultation of the draft VET strategy and the development of the EC VET SPSP VET in parallel contributed to formulating important objectives such as credibility of the VET system anchored in reinforced participatory governance.

7. Lessons learned

Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.

The lessons learned from the previous Budget Support Programmes (EC FSP 1996-2006; PFM SPSP ENP AP 2007) have shown that Georgia qualifies for budget support and that the system is understood by the Government. However, experience shows that conditionality needs to be well negotiated, in order to ensure not only relevance, but also ownership by the programme recipients; this is a premise for the successful implementation and impact on sector development.

The implementation of the reformed VET policy framework has also highlighted critical aspects mainly linked to the specificity of VET policy, which needs to embrace both shorter-term issues such as employment and longer-term human resource development perspectives. The balance between these two aspects is never easy to manage, but lifelong learning-based VET has the capacity to form a bridge.

The involvement of social partners and the general business sector in VET policy remains weaker and less systemic than expected, despite the establishment of NVETC and state-driven sector committees and the adoption of the social partnership agreement in 2011. Certification and qualifications are not yet an important requisite in recruitment and human resources management in private businesses.

There is a major schism between the government's desire for VET to form a rapid path to employment and the current limited permeability of learning pathways and portability of outcomes of VET across education and training experiences — limitations largely due to the separation of VET pathways from general education under the 2007 VET law.

The reformed VET system features barriers to progression at key points of the lifelong learning continuum. These are from VET level III to VET level IV, or from VET level V to first cycle higher education in a way that credits accumulated in VET cannot be counted towards education progression. At this stage of the reform process, the new learning outcomes paradigm laid down in the NQF has yet to be reinforced and quality assured, and increased dialogue and exchange is needed between the various sections of the NQF before trust will be fully established.

The government is seeking solutions to this multiple dead-end problem, ideally aiming to address systemic issues in a systemic manner. One possible solution lies in redesigning post-compulsory education VET programmes for youth (ISCED-2) to offer easy access, free-of-charge combination with secondary general education.

8. Implementation partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

The main implementation partners are the MES that exercise the function of leading the elaboration of the VET strategy, the VET stakeholders' represented by employers and trade unions' associations, the VET suppliers including the private providers through the Association of VET centres that are expected to benefit from the new accreditation and registration system.

9. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail
Vice Prime Minister Government of Georgia	
10. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)
<p>NIP-DEC21067_1.pdf: European Neighbourhood and Partnership Instrument. Georgia. National Indicative Programme 2007-2010.</p> <p>-IF-DEC21067_3.doc Identification Fiche For Sector Policy Support Programme.</p> <p>-FA-DEC21067_4.doc: Financial Agreement (FA).</p> <p>-FA-DEC21067_5.pdf- Annex I - General Conditions Title I - Project/Programme Financing.</p> <p>af-aap2009_Georgia.docx: Action Fiche Georgia - ENPI AAP 2009.</p> <p>-ENPI_CSP-DEC21067_2.pdf: European Commission. European Neighbourhood and Partnership Instrument Georgia Country Strategy Paper. 2007-2013.</p> <p>33_Technical and Administrative Provisions (TAP). Torino Process 2012. Georgia.</p> <p>http://ec.europa.eu/europeaid/where/neighbourhood/country-cooperation/georgia/georgia_en.htm</p> <p>21067_25.pdf Assessment of the Institutional Capacity of the NCEQE and MoES VET division to Implement the TA Grant Scheme project.</p> <p>NIP-DEC21067_1.pdf: European Neighbourhood and Partnership Instrument. Georgia. National Indicative Programme 2011-2013.</p>	

JORDAN

Project title: Support to the Employment and Technical Vocational Education and Training (ETVET) Reform in Jordan

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: ND
3. Efficiency: ND
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of Design: A
6. Impact: ND
7. Sustainability: B
8. Added value of ETF: A

0. TVET at a Glance

Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) in Jordan consists of three main public segments that deal mainly with initial training: 1. Technical education and training as offered by community colleges (grades 13-14) under the aegis of Al-Balqa Applied University (BAU); 2. Secondary vocational education (grades 11-12) as part of upper secondary education under the Ministry of Education (MoE); 3. Non-formal and formal vocational training as delivered by the VTC (Vocational Training Corporation). The Ministry of Labour, supported by the TVET Council, is the main body in charge of coordination, policy-making and overall supervision of the TVET system. The TVET Council was established as the main governing body in charge of TVET policies and strategies. TVET in Jordan also has two non-public aspects: 1. Private, or non-government, training provision consisting mainly of private community colleges, for-profit, non-formal training and some training sponsored by NGOs; 2. Enterprise-based training.

1. Identification CRIS decision number	20480
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Area:	TP-TVET policy and system (1a) ST-Sectoral Training (1c) LS- ALMPs and measures (1d)
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	ENPI: (European Neighbourhood and Partnership Instrument)
c) By region	Geographical Zone (Country or region): JORDAN
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: (2000-2012) 2009 Status: Closed, On going, Committed, Provisional: ONGOING
3. Financial data	
EUR 35 000 000. EUR 29 000 000 budget support (SPSP) and EUR 6 000 000 complementary support (EUR 5 000 000 TA). Beneficiary and other contributions: 0	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
<p>The overall objective of the EC 4-year employment and technical vocational education and training (ETVET) sector programme is to support reform in order to improve the relevance, efficiency, equity, as well as institutional and financial sustainability of the Jordanian E-TVET system in the long term. The specific objectives are to enhance employment and labour market effectiveness as well as to enhance the overall quality of the TVET system.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To support the capacity of Ministry of Labour (MoL) in its new mandate to promote employment by: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i) Reinforcing the capacity of MoL to manage and implement an employment and labour market strategy, ii) Improving efficiency of job search and labour matching services, iii) Develop an adequate career guidance and counselling strategy and services, and iv) Enhancing capabilities in providing Labour Market and Human Resources Information systems and their use in planning, decision-making and Research & Development (R&D) in E-TVET; • To enhance the overall quality of the TVET system with a dual approach (systemic and operational) by: i) Supporting the development of the future TVET Centre of Accreditation and Certification, ii) 	

Support the design and implementation of a national qualification framework, iii) Support the development of decentralised sectoral training centres;

- The **modality** will be a Sector Policy Support Programme (SPSP) in the form of Sector Budget Support (SBS) addressing the main aspects of the reform.

4. 1. Objective (problem statement)

- What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?

Employment challenge: The 2006-2015 Jordan National Agenda identifies employment as a top priority and points out, among the main issues, the population dynamic (% of working age population in the coming 10 years) and the rate of economy growth not being sufficient to absorb the annual inflow of job seekers.

TVET System: Fragmented E-TVET sector with three different ministries running separate systems and different reform projects with little coordination. The role of ETVET Council is acknowledged while its capacity is considered as low. The coordinating role of the Ministry of Labour is at risk. ETVET reforms have proceeded intermittently. They started in 2007 as an off-shot of the National Agenda. The Ministry of Labour had the role of coordinating the three ministries (Education, Labour and Higher Education) other agencies (Vocational Training Corporation, TVET Council-Secretariat and Fund) public and private sector employers and social partners.

VET reform: policy, strategy, governance: A strategy was drafted, focusing on new structures for TVET coordination, a legal and regulatory framework for educational bodies and councils, private sector involvement in management, quality and delivery, decentralization and Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E) improvement. It was not translated into an action plan with timeframes, targets and indicators and mid-term expenditure frameworks.

Management of the TVET system: The Ministry of Labour began its own restructuring to support ETVET reform from 2007 onwards. The reform lost momentum until a broader employment strategy was launched in 2010. The policy-making function was entrusted to the ETVET Council under the Chairmanship of the Ministry of Labour.

Quality of the system: The vocational training system suffers from poor performance, a lack of private sector participation and has weak linkages with the labour market. The quality assurance functions (Quality control and Certification Agency and the Centre for Accreditation and the Quality Assurance) were formally established but are not fully operational. The system is supply driven with no career guidance and continuing training, with social partners that are not capable of improving policies and delivery and with financial resources that are inadequately aligned with the set targets.

Funding: There was a five-fold public expenditure increase from 2008 to 2009-2013. The private sector contributions to the ETVET fund (1% of companies' profits for training) have been expected to decrease due to the impact of the global crisis. Within the available resources, distortions of benefits given by some training programmes, and concerns about the sustainability of specific interventions (e.g. Army-run construction sector training project) were flagged in the financial analysis of the reform. The need to reinforce financial programming and management capacities of all stakeholders was assessed. With EC support, the ETVET council developed the MTEF 2010-2012, with the involvement of all reform actors under the Ministry of Finance (General Budget Department) to correct the matching of resources to the real needs from a results-oriented financial management perspective.

Participation of key stakeholders: Insufficient and unstructured participation of the private sector.

Skills demand: Public authorities and providers do not utilise a labour market information system.

Labour Markets: The majority of workers in the labour market (about 1.5 000 000) are in the services sector, (more than 70%) followed by industry (14%), construction (6%) and agriculture (3%). The public sector employs a third of the labour force while enterprises with up to four workers (94% of the total enterprises) employ half of the labour force. The remainder is concentrated in the informal economy, which has increased with a high participation of foreign labour. In the pre-global crisis robust growth period, new jobs were created mostly at the highest and lowest ends of the occupational spectrum, whereas mid-level occupations saw little or negative growth. Unemployment of educated youth and women remained high, indicating a mismatch between the needs of the labour market and the provision of skills. Among the indicated factors: a creation of jobs away from where workers live; trends of employers to employ non-Jordanian workers (lower expectations and costs and higher productivity); the fragmentation and inefficiency of job placement agencies.

4.2. Result of the project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)
<p>Expected results were:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Effective E-TVET Sector Governance, planning and result oriented budgeting are enhanced; 2. Employment Services are improved; 3. Effective and performance based funding of initial and continuing training is established; 4. Labour market driven quality of TVET delivery system is enhanced; 5. Role of the Private Sector in the planning, implementation and other aspects of E-TVET reform is enhanced and systematically ensured; 6. Status of Jordan E-TVET is adapted to regional and international environment and challenges. 	
Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 3 main broad criteria Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency 5 additional criteria: Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Relevance: A <p>The project is highly relevant in relation to EC development and cooperation policies, national policies and priorities and the assessment of stakeholders and final beneficiaries' needs and analyses. At the concept level, relevance is found in the articulation of the projects through interlinked active and passive labour market measures such as restructured vocational training, employment and labour market institutional settings, targeted employment programmes and social protection measures, which when mobilised, tackle unemployment. The project is relevant for all the main institutions concerned with the institutional level of ETVET (E-TVET Council, the Higher Council for Human Resources Development and the National Centre for Human Resources Development), the 3 ministries, the Agency for Quality Control and Certification and the Social Security Corporation (SSC). The project also targets management and governance levels, such as the E-TVET fund, Al-Balqa applied university, private training providers, Ministry of Social Development, Ministry of Planning and International Cooperation (MOPIC) and the Ministry of Finance, employers and workers' organisations. Relevance to the needs of the trainees is ensured through the upgrading of career guidance and orientation for all levels of training. Responses to the skills' requirements of employers are matched with the modernisation of VT centres to deliver training for promising key economic and employment sectors in Jordan: water, pharmaceuticals and renewable energy. The latter is in full synergy with a parallel EC project on energy.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Effectiveness: ND <p>In the absence of monitoring and mid-term evaluation reports, it is possible to comment on the effectiveness indicators built into the project's design. The release of funds is linked to six reform benchmarks and performance indicators:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ETVET strategy and action plans, including timeframe, targets, indicators and clear costing are developed and implemented (Reinforcement of the capacities of the ETVET and HRD councils' secretariats, MOL, Agency for Quality Control, and Labour market and HRD decision support systems; operationalisation of the Economic and Social Council, functioning of tripartite committee and creation of sector committees to strengthen social dialogue and matching of market needs; Higher Council for Human Resources Development operational and HRD Strategy updated); Measures to increase the participation of Jordanian women in the formal economy (increased national Gross Enrolment Rate (GER) of children in kindergarten as incentive for women with children to work); Development of LMIS through sector surveys and HRD plans with social partner participation and that of other stakeholders (establishment and functioning of at least 3 training centres of excellence in key development sectors for the country - water and environment, pharmaceuticals, renewable and alternative energies); Extension of the coverage of employment, career guidance and training services up to the 38 districts (expansion and upgrade of the network of local employment offices - equipment and training of staff- to provide better employment and career guidance and counselling services in collaboration with VTCs, MoE schools, municipalities, community colleges); Social Security Law implemented (maternity and unemployment funds and social security coverage 	

<p>of all workers by 2011);</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Operational accreditation system of the TVET institutions (Quality Control and Certification Agency and development of qualification frameworks and curricula for pilot sectors (tourism, water, pharmaceuticals, renewable and alternative energies, ICTs, manufacturing, agriculture, etc.) as inputs for a national qualifications framework). 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Efficiency: ND <p>The level of efficiency of the implementation could not be assessed on the basis of the available documentation and the status of implementation.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Coherence: A <p>High coherence with the EU-Jordan Action Plan, EC Strategy Paper and National Indicative Programmes as well as with the 2005-2015 National Agenda.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Quality of the Design: A <p>The quality of the design is considered as high. Identified objectives place a strong focus of EC support on the matching of labour demand and supply and on boosting the modernisation of employment services, LMI and the identification of labour demands across key economic sectors (water, pharmaceuticals and renewable energy), TNA and delivery of quality training in given localities.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Impact: ND <p>The level of impact of the implementation could not be assessed on the basis of the available documentation and the status of implementation.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Sustainability: B <p>The main elements of sustainability are found in structured consultation during the formulation phase where all stakeholders confirmed the economic and social validity and necessity of the programme, including training delivery in two crucial environmental sectors (water and renewable energy). Strong TA is indispensable during the first phase to help the consolidation of staff and know-how within the Ministry of Labour who has led the reform.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Added value of ETF: A <p>ETF carried out a first pre-feasibility mission (3 framework contract consultants and 2 European Training Foundation (ETF) experts) in 2007 and an identification mission in September 2008. ETF has supported the initial steps of the reform with specific projects (TVET indicators development, support to social partners HRD units, gender studies, NQF, etc.).</p>	
4.3. Beneficiaries	Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?
MoL, MoE, MoHESR (higher Education, Science and Research), E-TVET Council, Secretariat and Fund, Quality Control and Certification Agency, Employers and Workers' organisations.	
5. Synopsis	Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.
The aim of the programme will be to upgrade the national labour and employment strategy on the basis of the National Agenda's orientations. Special attention will be paid to demand-oriented reform of the TVET system. The demand-driven upgrading of vocational training and secondary vocational education is a key component in (a) a comprehensive and effective labour market policy that can improve the employability of job-seekers, and (b) in promoting general competitiveness and social cohesion. Information and counselling for job seekers and intermediation between labour supply and demand must be strengthened to ensure the overall efficiency and effectiveness of labour market inclusion services, including vocational training. This is in line with the mandate of the Ministry of Labour and with European employment strategy including active labour market policies namely, which the ENP aims to mainstream in partner countries.	
6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?
Integration of employment, active and passive labour market measures with VT and skills development and secondary technical education in the ETVET reform. Decentralisation of ALMPs and training offers.	
7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.
The restructuring of vocational training and employment, the labour market's institutional settings and	

the launching of targeted employment programmes were considered decisive to drastically reversing the unemployment challenge. The feedback on experience with budget support reports that some of the line Ministries prefer the project approach, because it allows them to directly receive the funds whilst the new paradigm has required, in some cases, a long time to become fully understood. Occasionally in the past, wrong baselines in the financial agreements have created difficulties when assessing the performance of the programme. With the programme supporting the Education Reform (SBS operation), the EC was able to introduce the notion of MTEF to achieve a better allocation of inter-institutional resources and better planning over the medium term in line with the projections of the Ministry of Finance. This experience proved useful with the MoE - an important stakeholder in the ETVET Council. The implementation of the MTEF and Results Oriented Budgeting (ROB) is expected to relate ETVET strategy and plans to resource allocation and results monitoring. Critical analyses of past experiences also point out the importance of ensuring local ownership, mutual agreement on the reforms and realism of what can be achieved within a given timeframe. The need to strengthen the link between the planning of the disbursement of tranches and the public financial management cycle is another lesson learned. Coordination amongst different stakeholders can be difficult and this will be a challenge for the reform.

8. Implementation partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

A number of donors are supporting the sector under the coordination of the ETVET secretariat - creating synergies with the EC programme. These are namely: namely CIDA with the 'Best' Projects (6 millio CAD)) supporting the ETVET Council secretariat and the ETVET fund's change in procedures and management); the World Bank with its *Employer Driven Skills Development Project* (USD 7 500 000 loan focusing mainly on Development Coordination Unit (DCU), secretariat and VTC management restructuring and private sector participation); USAID (SABEQ project to support the first phase of MOL local offices, and SIYAHA II for development of the tourism sector with more than USD 27 000 000 till 2013); JICA and KOIKA (on Pilot Centres); ILO supporting the employment strategy and new social security scheme (maternity leave, employment benefits) and GIZ with a Public-Private Partnership (PPP) programme. Some Member States have undertaken related sector interventions such as Denmark (on promoting women's access to the labour market) and others have indicated interest in supporting the sector (UK, Netherlands, France and Italy).

9. Contacts:

Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail

EU Delegation in Jordan.

10. Sources, links and publications

Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)

Identification and Action Fiches.

Financing Agreement.

NIP 2007 and 2001.

Jordan-EU Action Plan.

SPSP formulation checklist.

Strategy Paper 2007-13.

<http://www.unevoc.unesco.org/worldtvvetdatabase1.php?ct=JOR>.

MOLDOVA

Project title: Strengthening the governance of the Vocational Education Training (VET) sector

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: ND
3. Efficiency: ND
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: ND
7. Sustainability: B
8. Added value of ETF: A

0. TVET at a Glance

Vocational education and training is a component of the educational system of Moldova. Its aim is to train the labour force for all branches of the national economy. Prior to the educational reform in the country, vocational education and training followed the Soviet Union system. Until 1990, it functioned as a single system where state policy and strategy were highly centralised. Vocational education and training was organised across 115 vocational education and training schools for 64 000 students, including those in Transdnistria. Every vocational education and training school then was attached to the respective specialised ministry and to the economic enterprises of the latter

Currently, initial vocational education and training falls under the responsibility of the Ministry of Education. The early grades of primary school involve education and training in simple work with painting, arts and handicrafts. In the lower secondary schools, students have - apart from academic and art subjects - technical lessons and practical training in school workshops.

Secondary vocational education provides pre-service training for a trade (profession) as well as lifelong learning and requalification training for skilled workers and the unemployed.

Colleges provide secondary, professional education. Holders of baccalaureate diplomas, school or gymnasium certificates can be enrolled in colleges following an admission's examination. Day-time studies last two-three years. The duration of part-time studies is a further year.

Higher education is delivered by higher education institutions: universities, academies and institutes.

In spite of efforts made, some crafts in secondary vocational education in rural areas are still unattractive for secondary general education graduates. Therefore, at the beginning of the 2009/2010 school year, 13 400 pupils were enrolled in secondary vocational education institutions - a decrease by 12.6% compared to the previous school year. The majority of pupils (81%), mostly from rural settlements (73.8%), were enrolled based on gymnastics education courses.

The secondary vocational and specialised secondary education consists of 23 craft schools, 49 vocational schools, 2 vocational high schools and 49 colleges. The evolution of enrolment in secondary vocational education institutions in 1990-2005 denotes a decrease in the number of pupils enrolled. Thus, the number of pupils enrolled in 2006 was 30% less compared to that of 1990. Although the share of secondary school graduates, who were continuing their education in secondary vocational education, was relatively maintained at the same level (approximately 70%) during those years, the number of pupils enrolled in vocational schools was dropping.

The modernisation of the educational system of the Republic of Moldova will ensure sustainable human development by providing equitable and non-discriminatory access to quality education at all education levels for all children, including those from vulnerable families, those with special educational needs and representatives of ethnic minorities. This is the objective of the 2011-2015 Education Strategy.

1. Identification	ENPI/2012/023419, 23419
CRIS decision number	DAC-code 11330
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Are	Sector: Vocational training TP-TVET policy and systems
b) By Instrument	ENPI: (European Neighbourhood and Partnership Instrument)

(Fund/budget line)	
c) By region	ENPI (SOUTH CAUCASUS); REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: 2012. Status: On going Signed: (Head of Delegation): Dirk Schuebel Date: 14.09.2011 Presentation of Identification Fiche at oQSG 10/2011 Programme Start Date 01/2013 4-years technical assistance project.
3. Financial data	
Total EC amount (+ % of indicative programme): EUR 5 000 000 (5,3% of IP) Aid modality/method/method of implementation: Project approach – direct centralised management	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
Overall objective: to improve the governance of the VET system in Moldova by reforming the VET institutions network and enhancing the quality of the learning processes and learning outcomes in line with labour market demands. The specific objectives are to build and have institutional arrangements in place that will underpin the effective governance of the national VET system. They are: 1. To assist the Government in implementing the <u>structural reform in VET</u> and to improve the <u>social dialogue</u> by establishing five or more Sector Committees in the most important economic sectors. 2. To develop a framework for quality assurance and quality management in VET, as well as to improve the quality of the learning processes and learning outcomes in the five selected sectors. 3. To strengthen the capacities of the key stakeholders involved in the upcoming VET Budget Support Programme and to assist them in the implementation, monitoring and evaluation of Budget Support. 4. To raise the awareness of VET professionals and the general public on the newly reformed VET system.	
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<p>VET is a component of the Moldovan educational system, which aims at training the labour force at all levels of the national economy. Until 1990, the VET sector functioned as a single highly centralised system organised across 115 VET schools for 64 000 students. The recent reform initiated by the Ministry of Education, along with other ministries, is aimed at making VET viable and competitive in responding to the actual and perceived labour needs for a market economy. However, the number of VET institutions has not changed dramatically in the past few years and there are 70 secondary VET schools and 22 post-secondary VET colleges in Moldova. These have an average capacity of 400 places. Out of 21 128 students learning 85 professions, 92.60% of students benefit from public scholarships, 2.27% pay tuition fees, 3.86% study in penitentiary institutions and 0.67% in private schools. Out of 13 238 graduates in 2010, 45.50% are employed in public institutions, 1.25% work for private companies and 53.25% are unemployed or are pursuing their studies. The latter percentage confirms that the Moldovan VET system fails to prepare youths for employment and meet labour market requirements.</p> <p>Out of 2234 personnel working in VET schools, 231 (10.34%) are administrative staff, 502 (22.47%) teach general subjects, 313 (14.01%) teach professional subjects, 1065 (47.67%) are foremen-instructors, and 123 (5.51%) are teachers on social disciplines. The average age of the teaching staff is 52 years old and around 45% of them have no higher and psycho-pedagogical education. The student to teacher ratio is 9.5, which creates negative pressure on salary reform decisions; this is an additional factor contributing to the supply-driven orientation of education.</p> <p>The last 'Barometer of Professions' of the National Employment Agency³ enlists occupations and clusters them according to demand: rising, stable, or decreasing demand in the labour market. A comparison with the specialities offered by VET schools highlights the existing mismatch between skill supply and demand.</p> <p>As the student population has decreased threefold since 1990, some institutions are confronted with problem of a lack of students and a lack of funds for maintaining massive infrastructure. Combined with</p>	

³ Prognostic of the labor market 2011 available on www.anofm.md/Alte

the problem of out-dated equipment, a lack of demanded occupations and relevant curricula, this undermines the development of professional education. Furthermore, the funding of VET schools does not take into account performance indicators. Allocation of funds for VET schools is unconditional, without taking into account any performance/quality indicators. Along with formal education, continuing training (CVT) provision does not meet needs for re-skilling and re-qualifying employed and unemployed workers, according to the same source. The explanation of the shortage of skills is: decreased interest for enrolment and completion in vocational education; emigration of skilled working age people and increasing numbers of unskilled young people entering the labour market. The latter group is composed of teenagers that have completed basic education at a maximum and hence have no qualifications.

The main obstacles towards a responsive and flexible system comprise:

- VET-related legislation in the Republic of Moldova generally lacks a lifelong learning perspective and few active measures are taken to ensure progression and continuity, different entry points, non-formal and informal education, easy access and diversification of learning styles and approaches. Work-based learning is not envisaged as an option for legally recognised certifications; VET governance is characterised by the concentration of policy processes and implementation functions within the Ministry of Education. The staff endowment of the Ministry is below the necessary capacity. Intermediary bodies have been created over the years but they are not operating effectively. Instead, there is ample room for re-designing the attribution of functions (e.g. strategic, quality assurance, implementation and data updating) between the Ministry and intermediate level institutions; The VET institutional network is very big and inefficient and comprises 74 institutions with an average capacity of 400 places. Taking into account the fact that the student population has decreased threefold since 1990, some institutions are confronted with the problem of a lack of students and a lack of funds for maintaining the massive infrastructure. Combined with the problem of out-dated equipment, old personnel, lack of demanded specialities and relevant curricula, the whole VET institution system (the way it operates today) creates impediments for the development of professional education;
- While VET stakeholders demonstrate a comprehensive understanding of what a modern VET system should entail, their role in the system's governance is not anticipated, as aforementioned. Social dialogue, notably between the Government and the employers and employees is not part of the planning, implementation and regular improvement process of the VET system.

Making VET more responsive - hence reducing the skills' quantitative and qualitative gaps - will be a long-term process. In order to start this long-term policy programme, it is necessary to agree on the approach and methodology, and to lay down the institutional arrangements at ministerial and intermediary levels. Capacity should be in place to progressively take up the functions that are currently not performed; this would be necessary to initiate the overhaul of the VET system. .

The focus of the technical assistance project is therefore on governance. In 2010, the Torino Process highlighted the policy priorities of the Moldovan VET system, in view of improving its quality: governance was the first priority identified, lifelong learning second and financing was third.

4.2. Result of the project

- Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)

The specific objectives will be achieved as follows:

- Mapping of the VET institutional network, whose results will be used by the Government for reorganising the VET system within a potential Budget Support Programme (from 2013 or 2014);
- Strengthened capacity of the VET Department of Ministry of Education and of the Republican Centre for VET Development;
- Strengthened capacity of the National Employment Agency to develop accurate and comprehensive Labour Force Forecasts;
- The Ministry of Education and representatives of employers and employees (social partners) formulate a clear vision and realistic implementation strategy of the VET sector; this is lifelong-focused and responsive to the skills demand of the national labour market and to the country's social demands, which will be reflected in a NQF in line with the methodology set out in the European Qualifications framework;
- A roadmap for quality assurance and management is agreed by the Ministry of Education;

- A roadmap for certification, validation and recognition of qualifications is agreed by the Ministry of Education;
- A methodology for the external assessment of graduates' professional competences and levels of qualification is developed and implemented;
- An increased number of social partners and the Republican Centre for VET Development are able to develop and manage the update of occupational standards (guidelines and format for occupational standards with respective roles exist);
- The Republican Centre for VET Development and the social partners build upon the occupational standards to produce national guidelines for developing and managing outcome-based qualifications, fitting into a NQF;
- Occupational and educational standards agreed and approved by the Ministry of Education, upon which the VET institutions could develop their curricula;
- Social partners of at least 5 sectors organise themselves in sector committees to analyse skills' demands, to voice them and to take up their role in the governance of the VET sector (two exist in 2011, in agro-food and construction);
- The monitoring and evaluation system developed by the Centre for VET Development in order to follow the trends and performances of the VET system.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)

- 3 main broad criteria **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF**

- **Relevance: B**

The project is relevant because it assists the Government in developing the Moldovan VET system, to enable it to provide the required, competitive human resources for the labour market. The project will focus on governance of the VET system. How VET is structured and how VET functions influences its capacity to be responsive to the demands for skills that come from the labour market. At present, the mechanisms that allow responsiveness, quality improvements and lifelong learning are not fully developed.

- **Effectiveness: No Data**

At present, it is doubtful as to whether the VET sector has the necessary capacity to absorb a budget support programme effectively. First of all, the sector lacks an official strategy targeting priority objectives and expected results for the forthcoming period. Despite the 2011-2015 Consolidated Strategy for Education Development⁴ (the consolidated strategy), which has a specific chapter (No. 6.5) covering VET issues, this is more of a policy paper than a sector strategy itself and is not sufficient to demonstrate the Government's financial and political commitment to reforming the VET sector. This concern was shared with the current Minister of Education - Mihail Sleahitichi - who is confident that after approval of the new Education Code by the Parliament, the consolidated strategy will be adjusted and approved by the Government.

Additionally, the VET Department of the Ministry of Education and the Republican Centre for VET Development need intensive capacity building at this stage, in order to effectively absorb the available funds. These are among the key objectives of the proposed technical assistance project. .

- **Efficiency: No Data**

- **Coherence: A**

The proposed project is consistent with the key policy and strategic documents of the Government of the Republic of Moldova⁵, as well as with the legal framework regulating the bilateral cooperation between the EU and Moldova⁶.

- **Quality of the Design: B**

⁴ Approved by the Minister of Education on 29/11/2010 and available on <http://www.edu.gov.md/files/unsorted/Strategia%20consolidata%20de%20dezvoltare%20a%20invatamintului%20pentru%20anii%202011-2015.pdf>

⁵ Including the National Development Strategy 2008-2011, the Activity Programme of the Government of the Republic of Moldova 2011-2014, the draft Strategy 'Moldova 2020', the Consolidated Strategy and Action Plan for Education 2011-2015, the draft Education Code, and the report 'Rethink Moldova' from 24/03/2010.

⁶ The National Indicative Programme 2011-2013 (priority area 2, sub-priority area 2.3 – Labour Market Reform and Education), the EU – Moldova Action Plan, and the current negotiations of the EU – Moldova Association Agreement.

The identification process was performed by the European Training Foundation in cooperation with the EU Delegation to Moldova and encompassed careful analysis of the sector, based on data and on assessments made by the main stakeholders themselves. During several missions, meetings were held with the Ministry of Education, the Ministry of Labour, Social Protection and Family, the National Employment Agency (ANOFM), the Employers' and Employees' organisations, the Republican Centre for VET Development, VET schools' directors and teachers, companies and their HR managers. The quality of the design is satisfactory as it is focused on the identified challenges.

- **Impact: No Data**

- **Sustainability: B**

- Ownership will represent the single most important factor for future sustainability. The Government's positions and policy statements, together with the fact that assistance for VET development was indicated among the top priorities for EC assistance, testify that the ownership is strong;
- This technical assistance project alone can in no way cater for the range of needs in the VET sector. However, the project shall contribute to capacity building. Later on, when strengthened capacities are in place, it would be possible to consider a potential Budget Support Programme supported from the budget of the 2013 National Action Programme (NAP). If and when a Budget Support Programme on VET (BSP-VET) is approved, the proposed project will assist the key stakeholders, in particular the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Labour, Social Protection and Family, in the implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the BSP-VET.

- **Added value of ETF –A**

ETF - in close collaboration with Moldovan institutions and experts – has extensively analysed VET and human capital development more broadly between 2009 and 2011. The analyses have been carried out in the context of the priorities identified by the 2008-2011 National Development Strategy in which human resources were to be further developed for purposes of both social development and economic growth.

4.3. Beneficiaries

Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

- VET department of Ministry of Education;
- National Employment Agency;
- VET professionals and the general public on the new reformed VET system;
- Social partners of at least 5 sectors.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

VET governance is characterised by the concentration of policy processes and implementation functions within the Ministry of Education, which is understaffed. Several intermediary bodies have been created, but are not operating effectively. Instead, there is ample room for re-designing the attribution of functions between the Ministry and intermediate level institutions.

While VET stakeholders proved a comprehensive understanding of what a modern VET system should entail, social dialogue is not part of the planning, implementation and regular improvement of the VET system. Though the involvement of the demand side is rather challenging, the initial efforts and progress in this direction will be made through Sector Committees in the most important economic spheres.

Quality in VET is a critical issue to tackle in order to meet the skills' demands and overcome shortage and inadequacy in the labour market. The system is not fit-for-purpose, in terms of ensuring excellence and taking the users' needs and requirements into account.

New sector policies are outlined in the draft Education Code, under discussion since 2010, which envisages new innovations, including the involvement of social partners, work-based learning and the promotion of public-private partnerships. The conditions for such new governance should in the meantime be established.

Quality is, broadly speaking, the most important issue to tackle for vocational education and training to meet the skills' demands and overcome the shortages and inadequacies of the labour market.

In its current design state, the system is not set-up to follow a 'quality' approach, in terms of ensuring excellence and taking users' needs and demands into account. The involvement of the demand side at the planning stage, as well as in implementation, is not envisaged in the VET system at present; mechanisms for flexibility and adaptation to new or changing jobs and skills are not in place.

6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to “scalability”? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?
<p>The reform of the VET system in the Republic of Moldova is a long-term endeavour that will require sustained commitment on the part of the Government as well as external assistance. The VET sector is among the top priorities of the Moldovan Government. The overall objective of the project is to make the governance of the VET sector effective. The proposed 4 year Technical Assistance project is intended to directly contribute to the above. Its specific objective is to build and have in place the institutional arrangements that will underpin the effective governance of the VET national system.</p> <p>Structural reform objectives:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mapping of the VET institutions network; strengthen the institutional framework and capacity at central management level of VET Department of Ministry of Education and Republican Centre for VET Development; create structures for ensuring social dialogue; sector Committees for the most important economic spheres. <p>Quality enhancement objectives:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop a system of VET qualifications within a NQF; strengthen the quality assurance of education and training in VET; develop a mechanism for certification, validation and recognition of qualifications; • Develop a system of performance management for VET. 	
7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.
<p>A number of donors including Liechtenstein Development Service (LED), the Swedish International Development Agency (SIDA), the Austrian Development Agency (ADA) and Swiss Development Cooperation (SDC) in particular, have been supporting the VET sector, recognising the need for deep and comprehensive reform. The same conclusion was reached by the TAIEX mission undertaken on 4-8 July 2011, which identified the following intervention areas: curriculum design and development, teacher training, institutional capacity building, the provision of equipment, a national qualifications framework and a quality assurance system. The proposed project will target the most part of these recommendations.</p> <p>The ETF, in close collaboration with Moldovan institutions and experts have extensively analysed VET and human capital development more broadly between 2009 and 2011. Analyses have been carried out in the context of the priorities identified by the 2008-2011 National Development Strategy, in which human resources were to be further developed for purposes of both social development and economic growth.</p> <p><u>One general lesson was that Human Capital Development has to be supported by different policies together: formal education and training, non-formal and informal learning are matters for education, social, labour market, economic and regional policies.</u></p> <p>Regarding VET more specifically, the governance of the system was not conducive to such interplay of governmental and non-state actors. The divide between the skills requested and those ‘supplied’ by education and training was acute. In addition to governance, lifelong learning and VET financing are the key challenges that will be addressed by the project.</p>	
8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
Ministry of Education	
9. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail
EU Delegation in Moldova	
10. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)
<p>AAP-DEC23419_Annex 3 – Annual Action Programme 2012 for the Republic of Moldova. -IF-DEC23419_2 Standalone Project Identification Fiche. 2011-2015 Consolidated Strategy for Education Development. Government of the Republic of Moldova. Ministry of Education.</p>	

MOROCCO

Project title: *Appui au développement de la formation professionnelle dans les secteurs du tourisme, du textile et des NTIC - Formation Professionnelle II*

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: B
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of Design: A
6. Impact: B
7. Sustainability: C
8. Added value of ETF: A

0. TVET at a Glance

The TVET system in Morocco was restructured in 2004 and embraces pre-school, two cycles of compulsory education and secondary general and technical education, higher education and scientific research under the Ministry of National Education, Higher eEducation, Cadre Training and Scientific Research. Vocational training falls under the responsibility of the Ministry of Employment and Vocational Training that also incorporates the OFPPT (*l'Office de la formation professionnelle et de la promotion du travail*) that manages the public VT system, and the ANAPEC (*l'Agence nationale de promotion de l'emploi et des compétences*). The later implements - in addition to labour market intermediation for graduate youths - Active Labour Market Policies and programmes such as (*Idmage, Moukawqalti* and *'Formation-Reconversion'*). The training of adults is considered as an integral part of the national education and vocational training offer. The Moroccan system of initial vocational training is characterised by the presence of multiple public and private stakeholders within a structured regulatory framework. The management of continuing vocational training suffers from the absence of a legal framework, with inefficient management of special training contracts and the lack of control of the recipient firms.

1. Identification CRIS decision number	4631
2. Classification:	
e) By Sectors / Thematic Are	ST- Sectoral Training (1c) LS- Active Labour Market policy and Measures (1d)
f) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	ENPI: (European Neighbourhood and Partnership Instrument)
g) By region	Geographical Zone (Country or region): MOROCCO
h) By Period and Status	Decision year: (2000-2012): 2002-2008. Status: Formally CLOSED in 2011
3. Financial data	

EU contribution: EUR 50 000 000.

National Contribution: EUR 15 559 000.

4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
-------------------	-------------------------------------

The **overall objective** is to contribute to improving the competitiveness of Moroccan enterprises in the three key sectors: tourism, textiles and new information and communication technologies. This took place in the perspective of a preferential agreement with the EU and of the national sectoral development strategies, by improving the quality of production and management of competences (and professionals) and increasing the relevance of the adopted sectoral strategy.

The specific objectives for each of the three sectors were to:

- Support the emergence of sectors' enterprises' skills needs and ensure ownership by professional associations and the enterprises themselves;
- Develop labour market analysis and information for the skill needs of the sectors;
- Increase the public VT training offer through the restructuring and consolidation of existing public and private providers, developing alternance and continuing training and apprenticeships, in the framework of the NQF and the Competency-based Training approach (CBT).

<p>4. 1. Objective (problem statement)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<p>Employment challenge: shortage of skilled resources and low competitiveness of the enterprises in the three sectors.</p> <p>Management of the TVET system: The degree of coordination between the two main actors (Department of Vocational Training of the Ministry and OFPPT) and the governance and management of the public VT system was considered unsatisfactory.</p> <p>Quality of the system: The vocational training offer for the three sectors was considered insufficient in terms of the inherent quality of the programmes, the rigidity of the offer, low participation of private training providers and relevance to labour market information. The quality assurance functions (Quality control and Certification Agency and the Centre for Accreditation and the Quality Assurance) were formally established but not fully operational. The system is supply driven with no career guidance and continuing training, with social partners unable to improve policies and delivery and with inadequate financial resources to set targets.</p> <p>Participation of key stakeholders: The national employers association – the CGEM - and the sectoral associations and professional confederations need to be actively involved in the development of a training response relevant to the skill needs of the three sectors.</p> <p>Skills demand: The capacity of the employers of the three sectors to express their training needs is considered as low.</p> <p>Skills supply: The capacity of the public sector to provide relevant training is low and access to training by private training providers and enterprises (alternance, continuing training and apprenticeship schemes) is not sufficient to implement the sectoral strategies. Curricula, programmes and courses offered at the different certification levels were considered as not being immediately relevant to the skills needs of the three sectors.</p>	
<p>4.2. Result of the project</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)
<p>Expected results:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Increase the capacity to collect and analyse the skills needs of the three sectors as a basis to design and deliver sectoral strategies and skills responses (support enterprises in expressing skills needs, LMI, areas and structures of the tourism sector, existing information on textiles and application areas of ICT); 2. Improve relevance, effectiveness and access of the VT system in response to the skills demand expressed by the three sectors (quality and capacity of the training offer, private training offer for the 3 sectors, apprenticeships for textiles and tourism and continuing training and project management training for the ICT sector). <p>Achieved results:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. About 70 private training providers in the three sectors benefitted from the project's assistance; 2. Eight training centres were built and equipped, are operational and offer relevant training; 3. Three ITC training centres for enrolled thousands of trainees on training programmes requested by enterprises; 4. 13 textile centres were upgraded and equipped; 5. About 50 new CBT training programmes were developed with the participation of enterprises; 6. More than 1000 trainers trained on the new programmes and on the CBT training methodology; 7. On the Labour market, 500 enterprises were assisted in managing HRM utilising the REC (<i>référentiels emplois-compétences</i>) and the REM (<i>répertoires emplois – métiers</i>) prepared along international standards and offering a model that could be expanded into all the sectors of the economy; 	
<p>Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3 main broad criteria Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency • 5 additional criteria: Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF
<p>Relevance: A</p>	

The project is relevant in relation to EC development and cooperation policies, national policies and priorities and the assessment of the stakeholders and final beneficiaries' needs and analyses. At the design level, relevance is found in: the management set-up of the project including an inter-sectoral Steering Committee; Sectoral Monitoring Committees; working groups on TA contracts; an action-training component for HRD within the enterprises; the response to the economic demand of three specific sectors; the involvement of employers' national and sectoral associations and of the professional federations; the involvement of the OFPPT and the targeting of training providers (public and private). The project is relevant for all the main national institutions and sectoral/professional institutions. Relevance to the needs of the trainees is ensured through an increase in the quality of the training offer and the increased access by pre-service, alternance, continuing and apprenticeship training.

Effectiveness: B

The project proved effective in relation to beneficiary enterprises in the three sectors that finally established their own training units to improve productivity. The ROM indicated that, already in 2008, commitments of funds were close to the total amount. The system's occupational and skill standards and tools foundations (REM and REC) were adopted by the Training Department of the Ministry of Labour and the OFPPT. The project partners (training institutions, trainers and trade unions, employers and enterprises, sector professionals) had access to services, tools and materials that they contributed to developing; they utilised and monitored training programmes and trained workers. The large TA component was decisive in the first phase in consolidating staffing and know-how within the Ministry of Labour and the OFPPT which had - respectively - the responsibility for the leadership and implementation of the initiative.

Efficiency: B

Project implementation was considered as highly efficient. It ended in March 2010 after having implemented more than 90.26% of the planned activities. The TA activities started according to plan and, with the exception of the construction works (the national contribution), the planned costs were respected. In general, the project made positive progress except for the new buildings that were only made available after October 2008. Training of Trainer (TOT) contracts were processed and professionals and entrepreneurs positively received guidance for the training programmes which were finalised by 2009. Equipment was all delivered but not fully installed. Issues concerned the obsolescence of the material for the ITC component. The staff of the 11 new training centres were recruited and trained. The OFPPT recruited new trainers (expensive due to the shortage of quality trainers). The participation of the different target groups encountered some difficulties and delays, but the quantitative and qualitative results justified the effort, particularly in terms of changes in mentality. Awareness raising and communication activities by the VT General Secretariat and the Project Support Unit (PSU) and the partners proved effective by generating a change of mentality towards Skills Development in enterprises. Concrete cooperation was developed with the CIDA project on Competency Based Training in the same three sectors. The OFPPT extended CBT to all the training centres involved by the project.

Coherence: A

High coherence with, the National Charter ; the National Pact for Industrial Emergence; the Emergency Plan of the Ministry of National Education and Higher Education and the contingency plan entitled *NAJAH* (success) 2009-12; the Emergency Plan for employment and vocational training 2008-12 by the Department of Vocational Training.

Quality of the Design: A

The quality of the design is considered high in terms of: overall project approach focusing on the continuity with previous EU support provided to Vocational training schools, and sectors (agriculture, handicraft and Industry), mostly with by the project MEDA 1; workoplan for the implementation of the expected outputs; process from the sector baseline studies to the development of competency units corresponding to the identified qualifications and to the design of CB training programmes..

Impact: B

The project was strongly oriented towards meeting the skill needs of companies and matching supply and demand for training and upgrading of public and private sector training providers. In this context, its strength lies in its 'participatory' approach, its role as a platform for discussion and coordination between public institutions and private companies, coordination with other sectoral programmes and

projects and the management of the outcome.

Professional and business associations have been systematically involved in the pilot program on issues related to human resources management, have supported the concept and implementation by recognising the qualification of their human resources as a priority. The dialogue between business associations and training institutions (not considered frequent in Morocco) proved essential in the exchange of information, options, and synergies.

The difficulties encountered in institutional relationships, the complexity in the development and implementation of more than 50 contracts, were offset by the results and the positive assessment of the direct beneficiaries of the project activities, including business and training centres. Moroccan institutions have declared their satisfaction with the success of this action at several public events dedicated to vocational training.

Sustainability: C

The main elements of sustainability are to be found in the involvement of the VT institutions (Ministry of Labour, line ministries, OFPPT, public training centres for the three sectors). They are also to be found in the structured consultations that took place during the formulation phase where all stakeholders confirmed the economic and social validity and necessity of the programme and in a training offer which was relevant for three growing sectors of the economy. The dependence on international assistance (through the Project Support Unit (PSU)) did not enable the building of the full capacity of the local institutions to govern and manage the training. The available resources appeared to be limited against the requirements of the established programme.

Added value of ETF: N/A

4.3. Beneficiaries	Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?
Ministry of Labour, line ministries, national and sectoral organisations of employers and professional associations, trade unions, public and private training providers, employers and workers in the three selected sectors and youth job seekers.	

5. Synopsis	Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.
--------------------	--

The project addressed the skills needs of three growing economic sectors (Textile Tourism and ICT) by:

- Contributing to the emergence of skills needs and sectoral consolidation and ownership by the associations and enterprises level (economic dimension);
- Developing the management of human resources in the enterprises and the identification of skill needs;
- Reorienting the public and private competency based training offer to the needs of economic sectors: construction (for tourism and ICT) and redevelopment (for textiles),
- Increasing capacity and quality of the public and private training suppliers, in relation to the identified demand;
- Developing training in alternance, work-place training and apprenticeship schemes, as well as the training of trainers and the tutoring/mentoring capacity of the enterprises.

6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?
-----------------------------------	---

A solid public-private partnership and a joint management and operational guidance by the private sector and institutions, which built on the results of previous actions and programmes (FP MEDA Programme I).

An effective dialogue between business, professional associations and private/public training providers that produced many positive effects such as: better analysis of labour market information, skill needs assessment mechanisms and a relevant training offer in the three sectors.

An improved image of VT, thanks to the commitment of dynamic and strategic enterprises with an innovative profile and to the restructuring and construction of new facilities, the provision of equipment and training programmes, identification and achievement of synergies with other programmes in the area of training and development of the private sector.

The adoption of VT quality elements such as standard occupations and skills standards for the three addressed sectors: REM and REC adopted by the Training Department of the Ministry of Labour.

7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.
<p>The focus on sectors enabled the achievement of a positive outcome and specific results that, in projects focusing on overall reform, are usually trickled down through small pilot components. The sector actors, systematically involved from guidance to management, product development and implementation, seemed to be able to grasp the Skills Development advantages in a more direct way than from the traditional top-down TVET reform approach.</p> <p>The participation of national resources on the hard components of the project (construction and refurbishing of public VTCs) is a strong element of sustainability which was possible thanks to the presence of a national priority and development policy framework, the internal coordination of the concerned institutions and the determination and commitments made by the concerned productive sectors.</p> <p>The dependence of national and local institutions on the international assistance, as embodied in the Project Support Unit, was defined as strong in the <i>Note de clôture technique et financière</i> and was partly anticipated in the monitoring reports. This was going to be inevitable considering the magnitude, complexity and scope of the project. The inherent weaknesses of public administrations to implement projects was overcome in the same way as in more structured contexts (i.e. the experiences of actions co-financed by Structural Funds in EU Member States).</p>	
8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
<p>Direct Beneficiaries: Ministry of Vocational Training, Tourism, Industry (textiles) and ICT, 24 training establishments (eight new centres for Tourism, three for ICT and 13 existing ones for textiles), the professional associations of the three sectors, the private training providers and the HRD firms. Workers, job seekers and apprentices. Target groups are the professional associations and federations, managers and trainers of the public and private VT providers, enterprise tutors, directors of enterprises and HRD firms. Executing agency: OFPPT. There are two, co-existing levels of donors' coordination in Morocco: that of the Commission and the Member States, possibly in concert with the EIB and that of the donor group (the World Bank, the International Finance corporation (IFC), the UNDP, USAID, the ADB, the IDB, the Commission, EU Member States, Canada and Japan).</p>	
9. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail EU Delegation in Morocco.
10. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)
<p>Financing Agreement. NIP 2007 and 2011. CSP 2007-13/ Strategy Paper 2007-13. ROMs 2005 and 2008. FER 2011. POG and POP. Final Report by the executing agency. Final report by independent evaluators.</p>	

BENIN

Project title: **Projet d'appui au développement du secteur privé (PADSP)**

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: No Data
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: No Data
7. Sustainability: No Data
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

Le Bénin s'est efforcé de rendre la formation professionnelle plus adaptée aux besoins des jeunes et de l'économie informelle.

Le Bénin a récemment réformé sa politique de formation professionnelle pour régler l'enseignement technique et professionnel (Enseignement technique et professionnel (ETFP)) à la demande de travail dans les zones urbaines. Cette réforme a développé une formation pratique sous la forme de deux programmes d'apprentissage (apprentissage dual) qui alterne formation théorique avec stages pratiques.

Un certificat de qualification professionnelle (certificat de qualification professionnelle (CQP)) est attribué après 600 heures de formation dans un centre de formation (un jour par semaine pour le programme d'apprentissage de trois ans) et dans une entreprise ou un atelier artisanal (pour cinq jours par semaine).

En 2006, un premier lot de 292 apprentis ont reçu le CQP. À pleine capacité, la réforme devrait fournir 3000 CQP par an. Neuf métiers sont ou seront proposées: maçonnerie, électricité, plomberie, préparation de surface, la mécanique du cycle, la menuiserie, la réfrigération et la climatisation, les semis et les vêtements et la coiffure. La réforme permettra également de créer un certificat de qualification professionnelle (Certificat de qualification de métier (CQM)) pour reconnaître les compétences artisanales. La demande de ce certificat est estimé à un total de 15000 candidats.

Le système éducatif: de façon générale, la formation technique et professionnelle actuelle ne répond pas aux besoins de l'économie nationale. Il est trop orientée vers la délivrance de diplômes permettant la poursuite des études, et très peu vers des formations qualifiantes permettant d'aborder le marché de l'emploi avec des chances d'insertion. On note aussi un déséquilibre entre la structure de l'économie nationale et l'appareil éducatif ; en effet 5% de l'effectif des élèves de l'enseignement technique et de la formation professionnelle évoluent dans les établissements agricoles alors que les activités agricoles et connexes occupent plus de 70% de la population active.

Le Bénin présente la caractéristique d'être un pays qui possède une des économies les plus informelles de l'Afrique subsaharienne et qui développe dans le même temps une des approches les plus structurées de la formation professionnelle des apprentis et artisans installés au coeur de cette économie. Cette situation apparemment paradoxale montre qu'il n'y a pas de relation de cause à effet entre l'état de l'économie et l'état de structuration de la formation professionnelle. Elle met, au contraire, en évidence que les interactions qui existent entre l'univers de la production de biens et de services et celui de la production de compétences et de qualifications sont complexes et dépendent d'un certain nombre de facteurs qu'il est important d'identifier si l'on veut dynamiser le secteur informel à partir d'une politique et d'une pratique appropriées de formation initiale et continue.

Pour lever toutes ces contraintes et dysfonctionnements et favoriser une croissance forte, rapide et durable au Bénin, le renforcement de l'Enseignement Technique et de la Formation Professionnelle doit faire partie des domaines d'intervention prioritaires de l'Etat Béninois. Les axes de ce renforcement peuvent être:

- Le renforcement en équipements des établissements de l'enseignement technique et de la formation professionnelle : évaluer le fonctionnement de ces établissements dans le but de mettre à leur disposition des équipements plus adaptés aux besoins du marché de l'emploi et en nombre

suffisant;

- Le recrutement et le renforcement de la qualification professionnelle des formateurs : évaluer les prestations des enseignants et des formateurs et mettre au point un plan de formation permanent de qualification à leur intention. Il faut faire l'effort dans le domaine du recrutement afin de doter les structures de formation en formateurs suivant leurs besoins;
- L'actualisation et le renforcement des programmes de formation ainsi que des méthodes pédagogiques : évaluer l'adéquation des programmes et méthodes pédagogiques actuelles en tenant compte des besoins du marché. A partir des résultats obtenus, des réformes doivent être entreprises et mises en œuvre. Aussi, de nouvelles filières de formation porteuses adaptées aux besoins de la société devront être créées avec comme objectif l'adéquation entre la formation et l'emploi. Cette actualisation des programmes de formation actuels doit aussi aboutir à la professionnalisation des formations initiales afin de permettre aux formés d'être plus compétitifs sur le marché du travail;
- La modernisation de l'apprentissage traditionnelle par la création des Centres de Métiers dans toutes les régions en tenant compte de leur potentialités économiques : identifier les métiers à développer dans ces régions, créer les Centres de métiers correspondants, les équiper afin qu'ils soient des structures de formation et de production. Ces centres permettront aussi aux artisans de la région de faire des prestations sur des équipements qu'ils ne possèdent pas contre paiement d'un montant fixé par les structures de gestion du centre. Les formateurs à utiliser dans les centres devront être des professionnels ayant des expériences de pratiques professionnelles avérées dans leur domaine. Un accompagnement pour l'insertion des finissants doit être mis en place dans ces centres ;
- La mise en place d'un système de validation des acquis professionnels: elle se fera au profit des maîtres artisans et de tout professionnel ayant une expérience professionnelle reconnue afin que ces derniers soient valorisés dans la pratique de leur métier. Cette reconnaissance des acquis qui passera par la délivrance d'un parchemin permettra d'ailleurs aux maîtres artisans d'être valorisés et de s'impliquer davantage dans le dispositif d'apprentissage dual ;
- L'élargissement de l'apprentissage dual à d'autres corps de métiers et à d'autres régions: évaluer ce dispositif, faire ressortir ces forces et faiblesses afin d'identifier les solutions idoines pour sa pérennité et ceci dans tous les corps de métiers. Mettre en place dans les Centres de Formation Professionnelle des structures d'accompagnement pour l'insertion des jeunes après leur formation en collaboration avec les associations professionnelles et le Conseil National du Patronat Béninois;
- Le renforcement des formations agricoles : évaluer les structures de formation existantes ainsi que les formations actuelles en tenant compte de la nouvelle politique agricole. A partir des résultats obtenus :
 - Revoir les programmes et méthodes pédagogiques actuelles ;
 - Elaborer les programmes de formation pour les formations inexistantes et les mettre en œuvre ;
 - Equiper les structures de formations existantes et en construire d'autres ;
 - Recruter les formateurs et mettre en place une politique de formation permanente de ces formateurs ;
 - Concevoir et mettre en œuvre un dispositif de formation au profit des ouvriers et des exploitants agricoles.
 - Concevoir et mettre en œuvre un dispositif d'accompagnement des finissants pour leur installation.

La prise en compte de ces axes de renforcement de l'Enseignement Technique et de la Formation Professionnelle par le gouvernement béninois permettra à coup sûr une croissance forte et rapide de l'économie du Bénin pour un développement humain durable. Les actions prioritaires à privilégier pour que l'ETFP puisse jouer son rôle quantitatif et qualitatif dans le développement économique du pays sont :

- La professionnalisation des formations initiales existantes et des nouvelles filières porteuses créées en tenant compte de l'adéquation formation et besoin du marché de l'emploi;
- La modernisation de l'apprentissage traditionnelle par la création des structures de formation d'apprentis et de production au profit des non-scolarisés et déscolarisés précoces en tenant compte des potentialités économiques de chaque région;

- La mise en place d'un dispositif d'orientation des élèves de formation au CAP et en situation d'échec vers les niveaux de formation au CQP;
- La mise en place d'un dispositif de formation permanente au profit des ouvriers et des exploitants agricoles.

Ces actions prioritaires permettront à l'ETFP de former des ressources humaines de qualité qui prendront en compte tous les enfants (non-scolarisés, déscolarisés précoces, scolarisés) afin de conduire le Bénin vers une croissance rapide, forte et durable. A cet effet, Il est souhaitable que le GEFOP prenne les thèmes comme la professionnalisation des formations de l'ETFP, les dispositifs de formation au profit des ouvriers et exploitants agricoles, la pérennisation de l'apprentissage dual comme thèmes de travail pour les prochains séminaires.

1. Identification CRIS decision number	22582 - Cris N°: 2010/022-582 Code CAD: 32 130 Développement des PME 32 130 / 32 161 Agro-industries
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Are	TP-TVET policy and systems: ST- Sectoral Training LS- Active Labour Market policy and Measures IS: Informal sector.
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	EDF
c) By region	African, Caribbean and Pacific (9 ACP BEN 016) BÉNIN
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: 2010 -actual Signed 30 mars 2012. Period: 30/03/2012-30/03/2020. 96 months Status: On going
3. Financial data	Total: EUR 16 040 000 (only EUR 1 150 000 for TVET) UE Contribution (FED): EUR 15 000 000 imputés au Programme Indicatif National (PIN) dans le cadre de l'Accord de partenariat ACP-UE révisé. l'Agence Française de Développement (AFD): EUR 1 040 000
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project? L'évaluation du Projet d'Appui au Secteur Privé (PASP) de l'UE (2006-2009) a mis en exergue l'impact positif de certaines activités qui mérite d'être consolidé. L'appui ciblé du PASP aux entreprises et à l'administration sur une problématique clairement identifiée dans une filière spécifique comme l'amélioration de la qualité sanitaire des produits de pêche (crevettes), a permis des effets d'entraînement ou de relance de ce secteur d'activité économique. Cependant le fort appui à des organisations professionnelles nationales a peu touché les opérateurs économiques à la base, les activités restant centralisées sur Cotonou. Par ailleurs, les opérateurs économiques ont regretté que la formation professionnelle soit peu abordée par le PASP. Le développement de la formation continue et la question de la valorisation des métiers est encore à développer au Bénin. Il ressort de ces enseignements, la nécessité de cibler les appuis autour d'actions concrètes, de les concentrer sur quelques secteurs et de toucher plus directement les acteurs économiques via des activités décentralisées. Sur la base des diagnostics sectoriels, des priorités identifiées par le gouvernement, des concertations avec les parties prenantes et des actions complémentaires menées, il apparaît opportun de cibler l'appui du projet sur les secteurs agroalimentaire (ananas, halieutique, karité, ...), bois/ameublement et tourisme. L'objectif global du programme est de contribuer à la diversification de l'économie, au renforcement de la croissance économique et à la réduction de la pauvreté. L'objectif spécifique du programme est d'améliorer la compétitivité et de la qualité, la sécurité des produits agroalimentaires et autres produits.
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?

L'économie béninoise est peu diversifiée et caractérisée par : i) une forte dépendance vis-à-vis d'une filière cotonnière en crise et d'un commerce de réexportation vers le Nigéria dépendant de sa situation économique et politique; ii) **une prépondérance du secteur informel qui emploie 95% des actifs et concentre 97% du capital** investi dans le pays. Le secteur primaire reste un secteur majeur dans l'économie béninoise (36% du Produit Intérieur Brut (PIB) réel en 2008) mais les performances du secteur agricole et des industries agroalimentaires sont faibles et instables. Le secteur secondaire est peu développé au Bénin où l'industrie de transformation ne génère que 14 % du PIB réel (2008) **dont les trois quarts sont réalisés par le secteur informel**. Le secteur tertiaire, largement informel également, crée près de la moitié de la richesse du pays (49 % du PIB réel en 2008).

L'amélioration de la productivité et de la compétitivité du secteur privé béninois constitue une condition indispensable au renforcement de la croissance économique et à la réduction de la pauvreté. Pour faire du Bénin un pays émergent d'ici 2025, le gouvernement s'est engagé depuis 2006 dans une démarche de dynamisation de pôles de croissance et de développement. Cette vision, reprise dans les Orientations Stratégiques de Développement (2006-2011) a été opérationnalisée dans la lettre de politique de développement du secteur privé de juin 2006 et la Stratégie de Croissance pour la Réduction de la Pauvreté (SCRP) -2010-2015. La SCRP fonde l'accélération de la croissance économique (1er axe stratégique) sur la dynamisation du secteur privé et la diversification de l'économie. Elle se fera notamment à travers (i) la dynamisation des cinq pôles de croissance et de développement identifiés sur le long terme - coton, textile - agro-alimentaire - tourisme, culture, artisanat - BTP et matériaux de FR 2 FR construction incluant le bois - transport, logistique et commerce ; (ii) la mécanisation et la modernisation de l'agriculture.

Le gouvernement souhaite également développer des filières émergentes prioritaires. Cette approche est confirmée dans les stratégies sectorielles telles que la lettre de politique de développement du secteur privé, le Plan Stratégique de Relance du Secteur Agricole et le plan opérationnel national du Programme Accord de Partenariat (APE) pour le Développement.

Dans ce contexte, des appuis à des filières ciblées ont été identifiés avec notamment les filières karité et ananas pour lequel le Bénin a un fort potentiel mais où la qualité, la transformation et la mise en marché des produits doivent être améliorées. Le renforcement de l'intégration régionale et l'amélioration de la participation du Bénin au commerce international sont des enjeux majeurs. La mise en place de l'APE entre l'Union Européenne et les ACP ainsi que du Tarif Extérieur Commun CEDEAO va modifier l'environnement commercial du pays. Elle induit la nécessité de développer les structures de production et d'améliorer la qualité des produits.

L'accès des produits béninois aux marchés régionaux et internationaux est limité notamment par les dysfonctionnements du système de contrôle sanitaire qui, de plus ne permet pas de protéger le consommateur béninois. Aussi le Ministère chargé de l'Agriculture prévoit-il la mise en place d'une Autorité Béninoise de Sécurité Alimentaire des Aliments (ABSSA) et d'un Laboratoire de Contrôle de la Sécurité Sanitaire des Aliments (LCSSA).

En outre, le gouvernement a adopté en juin 2009 des recommandations au niveau institutionnel, fiscal et juridique en vue d'améliorer le climat des affaires au Bénin, 170ème au classement mondial "Doing Business" (2011). La réforme de l'administration publique attendue depuis 1994, l'atomisation des structures de promotion économique et la multiplicité des ministères sectoriels de tutelle peu coordonnés ralentissent leur mise en oeuvre effective. Les problèmes identifiés auxquels font face les Très Petites, Petites et Moyennes Entreprises (TPE/PME) au Bénin concernent : i) des lacunes dans la gestion, la qualité des produits/services et dans le respect des normes qui limitent l'accès de leurs produits aux marchés nationaux, régionaux ou internationaux; ii) un niveau faible de qualification de leur main d'oeuvre; iii) des difficultés à définir leurs besoins, à identifier et contacter des prestataires de services, des fournisseurs d'équipements ou des clients ; iv) un accès limité aux financements du fait des difficultés à élaborer leur demande de financement mais également en raison d'une offre de financement non adaptée aux besoins des TPE/PME des secteurs productifs; v) une faiblesse des structures de représentation de ces entreprises qui offrent peu de services à leurs membres et ont une capacité limitée à dialoguer avec le gouvernement sur des questions cruciales (gouvernance, fiscalité, APE et autres grandes contraintes du climat des affaires) ou sur des questions réglementaires.

4.2. Result of the project

- Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)

Pour l'atteindre le projet s'appuie sur **quatre composantes** issues des résultats listés au Cadre Logique en appendice.

- **Amélioration de la qualité sanitaire et phytosanitaire des produits** Résultat 1 : La sécurité sanitaire et phytosanitaire des produits alimentaires et agro alimentaires est renforcée ;
- **Renforcement du dialogue public/privé.** Résultat 2 : Des dialogues public/privé efficaces contribuent à l'amélioration durable du climat des affaires et des conditions d'exercice des entreprises ;
- **Appui aux secteurs productifs** Résultat 3 : La productivité, qualité, adaptation aux marchés national, régional et international de services et produits notamment agro alimentaires (karité et ananas) sont améliorés; Résultat 4: L'accès des produits agro alimentaires aux marchés est facilité Résultat 5 : *La formation professionnelle et les compétences des entreprises sont améliorées ;*
- **Appui à la méso-finance** Résultat 6 : L'accès au financement des entreprises est amélioré.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)

- 3 main broad criteria **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF**

- **Relevance -B**

Les diagnostics de chacune des associations étaient une étape préliminaire au lancement des activités du projet et leur pertinence ne fait aucun doute. Les réunions de coordination de la DCE avec les autres bailleurs de fonds (coopérations bilatérales, missions conjointes comme celle de la SFI) ont permis de « situer » le PASP pour éviter toutes duplications des actions.

- **Effectiveness - B**

Appropriation du projet par les bénéficiaires (4 sur 5)

- **Efficiency - No Data**

- **Coherence -A**

Le projet s'inscrit dans les actions définies dans le Document de Stratégie Pays et le Programme Indicatif National définissant la coopération Union Européenne/Bénin pour la période 2009-2013 (10ème FED) dans le domaine de la compétitivité et de la cohésion sociale.

- **Quality of the Design - B**

Les objectifs (globaux et spécifiques) assignés au projet correspondaient bien à la situation du secteur privé au Bénin et n'ont pas eu de remises en cause.

- **Impact - No Data**

Succès indéniable du plaidoyer (composante 2) dans le domaine de la fiscalité.

- **Sustainability - No Data**

- **Added value of ETF - NA**

4.3. Beneficiaries

Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

République du Bénin, représentée par l'Ordonnateur National

- Au niveau du secteur public, différents ministères sont impliqués dans le développement du secteur privé dont certains seront impliqués dans les actions du programme : (i) des Petites et Moyennes Entreprises et de la Promotion du Secteur Privé, (ii) du Commerce , (iii) de l'Industrie, (iii) de l'Economie et des Finances, (iv) du Tourisme et de l'Artisanat, (v) de la Micro finance, (vi) de la Prospective du Développement et de l'Evaluation des Politiques Publiques, (vii) de l'Agriculture, de l'Elevage et de la Pêche, (viii) de la formation professionnelle, et (ix) le Conseil Présidentiel de l'Investissement de la Présidence;
- Certains organismes directement appuyés par les actions du programme seront aussi parties prenantes du Programme : (i) Autorité Béninoise de Sécurité Alimentaire des Aliments (ABSSA), Laboratoire de Contrôle de la Sécurité Sanitaire des Aliments (LCSSA) ainsi que les services et laboratoires chargés du contrôle sanitaire et phytosanitaire pour la composante 1 ; (ii) les Comités et plateformes de dialogue public-privé ainsi que les services ministériels qui bénéficieront des accompagnements suite à ces dialogues appuyés par la composante 2 ; (iii) les établissements bancaires qui auront une convention avec l'Agence Française de Développement dans le cadre de l'appui à la méso-finance (composante 4) ;
- Du côté du secteur privé, les parties prenantes sont : (i) les principales organisations professionnelles nationales avec le Conseil National du Patronat Béninois (CNPB) et le Conseil des

- Investisseurs privés au Bénin (CIPB); (ii) la Chambre de Commerce et d'Industrie du Bénin (CCIB); (iii) la Chambre Nationale d'Agriculture; (iv) les organisations professionnelles nationales et intermédiaires qui seront directement impliquées dans les actions des différentes composantes ;
- Les bénéficiaires finaux seront les entreprises de toute taille qui seront renforcées ou verront leurs produits et leurs conditions d'exercice améliorées grâce aux différentes activités et composantes, ainsi que les groupements de producteurs, de femmes et de transformateurs qui bénéficieront des appuis aux filières agroalimentaires.

Ce sont cinq organismes privés ou semi publics qui ont été choisis pour être les bénéficiaires, mais aussi les partenaires, du PASP :

- La Chambre de Commerce et d'Industrie du Bénin (CCIB) ;
- Le Conseil National du Patronat du Bénin (CNPB) ;
- Le Conseil des Investisseurs Privés du Bénin (CIPB) ;
- L'Association de Développement des Exportateurs (ADEx) et ;
- L'Association des Femmes d'Affaires et Chefs d'Entreprises du Bénin (AFACEB).

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

Le programme d'appui au développement du secteur privé du Bénin financé par le 10^{ème} FED a pour but d'accompagner le gouvernement dans la mise en œuvre de l'axe 1 de sa Stratégie de Croissance pour la Réduction de la Pauvreté qui vise l'accélération de la croissance via la dynamisation du secteur privé et la diversification de l'économie.

L'objectif global du programme est de contribuer à la diversification de l'économie, à l'intensification de la croissance économique et à la réduction de la pauvreté. Pour cela, le programme vise tout d'abord à appuyer institutionnellement le Bénin à améliorer son système de contrôle sanitaire et phytosanitaire des produits agricoles et agro-alimentaires. Le programme comprend ensuite un volet de renforcement du dialogue public/privé permettant de lever certaines contraintes relatives au climat des affaires et aux conditions de développement du secteur privé. Enfin, au niveau micro-économique, le programme mène des activités de terrain ciblées sur quelques secteurs à fort potentiel de croissance - agroalimentaire, bois/ameublement et tourisme - visant à développer les entreprises et à faciliter leur accès aux marchés locaux, régionaux et internationaux en améliorant la qualité de leurs produits et services.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

Le projet s'inscrit dans les actions définies dans le Document de Stratégie Pays et le Programme Indicatif National définissant la coopération Union Européenne/Bénin pour la période 2009-2013 (10^{ème} FED) dans le domaine de la compétitivité et de la cohésion sociale. Elles concernent notamment (i) l'amélioration du dialogue public-privé en vue de promouvoir l'investissement productif et la diversification de la production, (ii) le renforcement du dispositif de contrôle qualité (hygiène, traçabilité, ...) et (iii) la formation professionnelle.

En améliorant la compétitivité des entreprises et en développant le secteur privé. Dans un pays comme le Bénin, où la structure industrielle est faible et où le secteur informel est largement prédominant, l'approche prise par les concepteurs du projet de ne pas travailler en direct avec les entreprises mais de s'adresser à des structures intermédiaires semble le choix le plus judicieux. Quelques grandes lignes peuvent être tracées :

- L'appui devra prendre en compte un appui institutionnel, condition sine qua non pour permettre l'expansion du secteur privé;
- La création et/ou le développement de plateformes de concertation secteur privé/secteur public doit être maintenu;
- L'appui au secteur privé sur le plan du principe devrait se faire par filières pour concentrer les ressources et fixer des objectifs concrets quantifiables et vérifiables;
- **La formation est l'une des composantes essentielles à prendre en considération dans les activités de chaque composante;**
- Le projet devrait être établi pour une durée de quatre à cinq ans;
- La cellule de gestion du projet se doit d'être autonome et de disposer des ressources suffisantes à

son fonctionnement;

- L'identification des actions doit prendre en compte les activités couvertes par les autres bailleurs de fonds en particulier le programme MCA de la coopération nord américaine et le programme PROCCI de la Banque Mondiale.

7. Lessons learned

Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.

L'évaluation du Projet d'Appui au Secteur Privé (PASP) de l'UE (2006-2009) a mis en exergue l'impact positif de certaines activités qui méritent d'être consolidés. L'appui du PASP aux plaidoyers public/ privé sur la question de la fiscalité a montré que l'ensemble des acteurs du secteur privé peuvent se mobiliser sur des thématiques cibles et mener un dialogue avec le gouvernement permettant d'orienter les actions publiques. L'appui ciblé du PASP aux entreprises et à l'administration sur une problématique clairement identifiée dans une filière spécifique comme l'amélioration de la qualité sanitaire des produits de pêche (crevettes), a permis des effets d'entraînement ou de relance de ce secteur d'activité économique.

Cependant, l'évaluation du PASP montre que le fort appui à des organisations professionnelles nationales a peu touché les opérateurs économiques à la base, les activités restant centralisées sur Cotonou. Par ailleurs, les opérateurs économiques ont regretté que la formation professionnelle soit peu abordée par le PASP. Le développement de la formation continue et la question de la valorisation des métiers est encore à développer au Bénin.

Il ressort de ces enseignements, la nécessité de cibler les appuis autour d'actions concrètes, de les concentrer sur quelques secteurs et de toucher plus directement les acteurs économiques via des activités décentralisées. Sur la base des diagnostics sectoriels, des priorités identifiées par le gouvernement, des concertations avec les parties prenantes et des actions complémentaires menées, il apparaît opportun de cibler l'appui du projet sur les secteurs agro- alimentaire (ananas, halieutique, karité...), bois/ameublement et tourisme.

Les besoins du secteur privé au Bénin sont tels actuellement qu'un nouveau programme s'avère utile pour tirer profit des actions déjà entreprises par le PASP et en complément des programmes des autres bailleurs.

8. Implementation partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

Gestion décentralisée partielle Gestion conjointe avec le Centre pour le Développement de l'Entreprise (CDE)

Gestion centralisée indirecte. Les tâches consistant à mettre en œuvre, superviser, contrôler et assurer la gestion contractuelle et financière ont été déléguées par la Commission européenne :

- A la Coopération Technique Belge (CTB/BTC) - Agence de coopération du Royaume de Belgique - pour la composante n°1 "Amélioration de la qualité sanitaire et phytosanitaire des produits" à travers une convention de délégation ;
- **A l'Agence Française de Développement (AFD) - agence de coopération de la République française - pour les composantes n°2 "Renforcement du dialogue public/privé", n°3 "Appui aux secteurs productifs" et n°4 "Appui à la Méso finance" à travers deux conventions de délégation.**

Le programme de la Banque Mondiale « Competitiveness and Integrated Growth Opportunity Project » (CIGOP) pour un montant de 25 millions de dollars, initié en avril 2008 et qui devrait se terminer en mars 2014, a pour vocation une aide aux opérateurs économiques centrée sur : le développement de l'esprit entrepreneurial et de l'entreprise, l'accession aux marchés, la facilitation du commerce, la promotion des investissements, l'amélioration du climat des affaires, le renforcement des capacités, l'amélioration de la compétitivité des entreprises et l'appui financier. L'aide bilatérale pour sa part est peu présente dans le domaine du développement économique, seule la Belgique intervient réellement pour le financement des PME et l'appui à la micro finance, et jusqu'en 2008, dans le secteur de la formation pour l'amélioration de la gestion et de la compétitivité des entreprises.

Les Nations Unies par l'intermédiaire de la CNUCED et du PNUD ont pour leur part financé sporadiquement des études d'analyse stratégique liées au commerce, à l'industrie et à la promotion de l'investissement étranger (IED). Pour éviter tout risque de duplication des actions entre bailleurs des réunions de concertation sont instaurées et une coordination étroite est mise en place pour des actions

ciblées. C'est ce que font la Banque Mondiale et le MCA pour deux de leurs composantes, ainsi que la Banque avec le Programme d'Appui à la Croissance Rurale (PACER).

9. Contacts:

Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail

Ministre béninoise de l'Economie et des Finances, Mme Mathys Adidjatou
Délégation Ce FERRET Elisabeth E-mail elisabeth.ferret@ec.europa.eu Téléphone: 21312617

**10. Sources,
links and publications**

Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)

-AF-22582_1 Fiche action pour la République du Bénin.
CSP-22582_4.pdf Country strategy paper 2008-2013.
-FA-22582_5.doc AVENANT N°1 A la Convention de Financement n°BJ/FED/22582.
-IF-22582_2.pdf Fiche D'identification Pour Une Approche De Projet.
-S-22582_3.pdf Plan Operationnel National du Programme Ape pour le Developpement.
Rapport Evaluation Finale PASP 2009.pdf Rapport Evaluation PASP.
Annexes 1-7. Rapport Evaluation PASP.
Autres documents:
ToR <http://www.landell-mills.com/images/news/A423-043-TOR.pdf>.
<http://www.oecd.org/development/povertyreduction/43280323.pdf>.

BOTSWANA

Project title: Francistown College of Technical and Vocational Education (CTVE)

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: B
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of the Design: B
6. Impact: B
7. Sustainability: C
8. Added Value of ETF: N/A

0. TVET at a Glance

TVET in Botswana has evolved over the past two decades in three distinct phases:

The pre-RNPE/NAPVET phase was characterised by the lack of a unified TVET policy, low coordination and a lack of standardised vocational qualifications, curricula and qualified trainers. Botswana's Brigades were initially set up as productive (secondary) educational groups, before progressing to productive training in Vocational Training Centres (VTCs). In the 1970s, they attracted considerable donor support and state subsidies. In 2005 there were a total of 39 Brigades with an enrolment rate of 27% out of approximately 28000 learners. The policy basis included the Apprenticeship and Industrial Training Act (MoL) and the Education Act (MoE). The Apprenticeship Act institutionalised employer-based training with support from GIZ and was modelled on the German apprenticeship system (two years of institution-based training, two further years of on-the-job training and 13-week blocks of training at VTCs (later renamed Technical Colleges). This scheme, established in 1987, was offered through the Directorate of Apprenticeship and Industrial Training (under the Ministry of Labour). The Madirelo Training and Testing Centre (MTTC) under the MoL carried out the assessment of trainees and offered three levels of certification which served both the Brigades and the Apprenticeship scheme: Trade Test C, Trade Test B and the National Craft Certificate.

The NAPVET phase (1994-2010) started with the Revised National Policy on Education (RNPE) of 1994 and the subsequent National Policy on Vocational Education and Training (NAPVET) of 1997. By consolidating TVET under the Directorate of Vocational Education and Training (DVET) of the MoE, the integration of various types of TVET into a single system endowed TVET with a new status as an alternative means of education, comparable to academic education in that it provided opportunities for further education. The Vocational Training Act (1998) replaced the Apprenticeship Act and established the Botswana Training Authority (BOTA) as a coordinating authority responsible for monitoring the skills-related needs of the economy and for developing a comprehensive system of vocational qualifications, including registration, accreditation and the monitoring of public and private training institutions (284 registered training providers and 209 accredited in 2010).

The Tertiary Education Council or TEC (Tertiary Education Act, 1999) regulated most programmes at Diploma level and above, including those with technical and vocational orientation. Apprenticeships were reviewed in 1999 after the size of the industrial base in Botswana was found to be too small to support the apprenticeship model (less than 2% of the total school leaver cohort in 2001). VTCs were reconceived as Technical Colleges for the provision of pre-employment technical training or the Botswana Technical Education Programme (BTEP) as well as the theoretical components of the National Trade Tests (NTT) and the National Craft Certificate (NCC). Underutilisation of the VTCs due to a lack of uptake of apprenticeships was one of the reasons for broadening the mandate of the institutions in a context in which technical colleges 'typically received 100 applications for each training place' (UNESCO, 2002), thereby negatively affecting the accessibility of the system. The BTEP programme offered through the DVET started in 2001 and was funded by the EC with the assistance of the Scottish Qualifications Authority. The BTEP had 4 levels (Foundation, Intermediate, Advanced Certificate and Diploma) and provided classroom-based pre-employment training and work placement. Overlap between the courses offered through the BTEP, TTT and NCC has been observed. Since 2002, BOTA has been developing the Botswana National Vocational Qualifications Framework (BNVQF) with a

view to rationalising the provision of TVET over 3 levels, (corresponding in broad terms with the three levels of the TTT, NCC and the first three levels of the BTEP): L1 Foundation Certificate, L2 Intermediate Certificate and L3 Certificate. The BNQF also tried to harmonise qualifications offered at Brigades and the MTTC, at Technical Colleges (TTT, NCC and BTEP) and by private providers (mostly City and Guilds and Pitman qualifications). Technical and vocational qualifications above certificate level (BTEP Diplomas, Diplomas in Engineering, Diplomas in Agriculture or Associate Degrees and Limkokwing University since 2007) are not included in the BNQF. In the context of the BNQF and SADC Regional Qualifications Framework (SADC Education and Training Protocol of 1997), the new phase may see the merging of the BOTA and the Tertiary Education Council following the relocation of vocational skills development to the Ministry of Education (renamed the Ministry of Education and Skills Development (MoESD)). Human Resources Development Advisory Council has been formed and the implementation of the HRD Strategy is expected to lead to the establishment of an umbrella organisation - the Human Resources Development Council (HRDC) - flanked by the NCQF Unit and the Botswana Examination Council (BEC). It is expected that this integrated approach to human resources development will not only increase the supply of qualified Batswana into the economy, but will also ensure relevance of training through direct linkages with industry and Labour Market Information and Analysis System (LMIAS).

1. Identification (CRIS decision number):	14658
2. Classification	
a) By Sector/Thematic Area:	TP –TVET policy and systems TM –TVET access to target groups ST – Sectoral Training
b) By Instrument (fund/budget line):	8 th EDF/
c) By region:	Geographical Zone (Country or region): African, Caribbean and Pacific (ACP): BOTSWANA
d) By period and status:	Decision year 2006. Status: CLOSED
3. Financial data	
Total EC amount (+ % of indicative programme): This EUR 31 200 000 project is co-financed by the European Development Fund (EDF) (EUR 15 000 000) and the Government of Botswana (GoB) (EUR 16.2 000 000).	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
The project is designed to provide technical assistance to the College of Technical and Vocational Education (CTVE) to address the challenges specified in the Vision 2016 that states: 'Botswana must set the highest possible standards for vocational and technical training as well as for academic excellence.' Thus, the project aims to generate/increase the accessibility and quality of the TVET system by assisting management and staff at the CTVE to provide quality learning through vocational and technical programmes - particularly the BETP. This will be achieved through improving the capacity of teachers and managers with the overall objective of improving standards of living for school leavers and the unemployed (poverty alleviation).	
4.1 Objective (statement of the problem)	What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
The diversification of the economy from the diamond and mining industry (set as a development objective by the GoB) required increased and improved skills that existing VET and TVET systems were unable to provide. The TVET system was limited in terms of enrolment capacity, the quality of teaching and curricula and relevance to the needs of the labour market. The eight Technical Colleges and the 39 Brigades and VTCs also suffered from an inability to attract custom, thus perpetuating the paradox of a system suffering simultaneous underutilisation of capacity and low accessibility. The numerous problems associated with this underutilisation were attributed to the lack of qualified trainers, the lack of accessibility of higher education and the quality of the programmes on offer (NCC and TTT).	

<p>4.2 Result of the project</p>	<p>Please describe the results achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention).</p>
<p>The expected results were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To address the challenge put forward in the Botswana Vision 2016; • To establish close links between institutions and the labour market in Francistown and nationally, through the outreach centres, to help bridge the gap between the world of learning and the world of work; • To develop the CVET into a centre of excellence for the development and delivery of eLearning and distance learning for vocational lecturers and teacher trainers; • To assist the management and staff at the CTVE to provide quality learning through vocational and technical programmes by improving the competencies of the teachers and managers; • To assist staff at the CTVE to develop the required skills and competences to create and use up-to-date pedagogic materials that provide the opportunity for blended learning and open and distance modalities in the teacher training programmes on offer as well as the Botswana Technical Education Programme (BTEP); • To provide necessary equipment and material and undertake the refurbishment of the premises of the FTC. 	
<p>Grading: Overall analysis carried out against 8 criteria (to be applied flexibly)</p>	<p>3 main broad criteria: Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency 5 additional criteria: Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added Value of ETF</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevance: B <p>The project's main goals and all implemented actions were considered relevant to both institutional and labour market requirements. The Inception Report confirmed the relevance of the project to the needs identified by the national authorities in the framework of the NAPVET phase. In light of the reported underutilisation of the FTC following EC assistance, the relevance of the EC project seems to have come under discussion. However, national authorities (such as the MoESD) confirmed that the results should be considered on a long-term basis given that the new infrastructures (not fully utilised under the training currently offered), open up possibilities for other donor interventions (as is happening with the new GIZ 2015-20 programme) and the involvement of industries (e.g. the partnership with the Chamber of Mines).</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Effectiveness: B <p>In terms of the creation of high-level infrastructures, the effectiveness of the intervention can be considered high. However, the introduction of the BETP and the possibility of piloting its development up to the second of the proposed four levels of certification originally foreseen, along with the limited number of trainers and teachers available to develop curricula, material and courses raise doubts as to the actual effectiveness of the EC assistance provided.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Efficiency: B <p>The Mid-term evaluation report indicates that the project was efficient in terms of economic input, timeframe of activities and expected results.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Coherence: B <p>EC assistance was coherent with the TVET system's ongoing development at the time of the project's implementation. The effect of the newly introduced structures and processes (in terms of organisation, budget and M&E) corresponds with what was foreseen in the design of the project, although more support than initially planned has been required.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of the Design: C <p>The project design was only partially satisfactory. The assumption of the full availability of trainers did not materialise, as instructors were mostly drained by the new industries that emerged after the diversification of the economy. The extension of incentive schemes to private TVET providers in the form of individual student allowances were not approved within the expected time. The risk mitigation strategy based on a phased implementation of the different levels of the BTEP proved partially effective.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Impact: B <p>An analysis of the project documentation leads to controversial views of impact. The quality and volume of rehabilitation and infrastructure works at the FTC and the views of the MoESD regarding the long-term effects of the programme support the impression of a positive impact. However, the ROM</p>	

and subsequent analyses focus on the underutilisation of top-class premises and infrastructures and on the introduction of an inherently qualitative programme (BTEP) that placed additional stress on an already fragmented training programme, forcing training institutions already affected by a scarcity of qualified trainers to adopt a staff-intensive approach that never ultimately reached the certification levels originally foreseen (i.e. up to Diploma) to meet skills-related needs and to increase the attractiveness of the TVET system.

- **Sustainability: C**

While the FTC premises are now used also to host programmes offered by other donors, their full utilisation by the intended beneficiaries was never truly possible. The recent decision by the national authority to recruit trainers from neighbouring countries seems to demonstrate that inherent sustainability was not fully ensured.

- **Added Value of ETF: N/A**

4.3 Beneficiaries

Who benefited/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

The direct beneficiaries of the project are: the Department of Vocational Education and Training (DVET) under the Ministry of Education (MoE); Involved Outreach Centres; and the College of Technical and Vocational Education in Francistown (CTVE).

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The project was designed to assist the Francistown CTVE to address the challenge specified in the Vision 2016 and stating that: "*Botswana must set the highest possible standards for vocational and technical training as well as for academic excellence*". According to this national vision, the project should assist management and staff at the CTVE to provide quality learning through vocational and technical programmes, to be achieved through improving the capacities of both teachers and managers. In addition to this, the project will assist staff at CTVE to develop the skills and competence required to prepare and use up-to-date pedagogic materials that provide opportunities for blended learning and open/distance modalities within the teacher training programmes and the Botswana Technical Education Programmes (BTEPs) currently on offer.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to project "scalability"? What was the specific approach to capacity development that led to policy impact/ changes?

The most important and innovative aspect of the project is its potential for synergy with local and national industries and other donors.

7. Lessons learnt

Please include any lessons-learnt (regardless of whether these were envisaged at project inception).

Beneficiaries, national authorities, development partners and the EU Delegation D share the view that the facilities built and rehabilitated through the EC's support have not only already proven their relevance but constitute an enabling condition for the next steps of TVET reform to successfully take place. The support to the increased quality of the TVET system through the provision of technical assistance and capacity building on i) the introduction and development of a training model; ii) curricula, material; iii) training of trainers; iv) training of managers; v) quality assurance (Management Information System and QA procedures) and vi) blended training (distance, classroom and on-the-job) is a critical point. The main lesson to be learnt is that providing support to a TVET system that is undergoing a long-term reform by concentrating solely on delivery aspects brings about the risk of achieving low impact and relevance.

8. Implementing Partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

Implementing partners, apart from implementing consulting consortia, are also the direct recipient: the Department of Vocational Education and Training (DVET) in the Ministry of Education (MoE); Involved Outreach Centres; and the College of Technical and Vocational Education in Francistown (CTVE).

The then GTZ introduced the NCC and GIZ, since 2004, has been involved in a Technical Assistance programme for selected Technical Colleges on Curriculum Development, advice on TVET and lecturing on specific subjects. The new programme (2015-2020) will continue, on a co-funding basis, to

introduce a demand-oriented, dual training model based on the diamond value chain (ToT, training of students, Quality Assurance and equipment/materials) in partnership with the Chamber of Mines. The CTVE will be utilised for other economic sectors such as hospitality, tourism and travel, in addition to the traditional subjects of mechanics, electricity and heavy plant machinery. UNESCO includes Botswana among the Better Education for Africa's Rise (BEAR) sectoral programmes in selected countries of the Southern African Development Community (SADC) region through public-private partnerships, thereby working towards improving the knowledge base and capacity of TVET systems to develop evidence-based TVET policies, the building blocks of TVET systems (governance, labour market, content, institution-building, legislation and finance) and data for use in sound decision-making and country-specific reform initiatives.

9. Contacts

Provide contact details for further information, including telephone and e-mail.

- Mogotsa M. Kewagamang, Deputy Permanent Secretary for TVET;
- Peter Choto Mosetsana, Department of Technical and Vocational Education and Training, MoESD;
- EU Delegation to BoGaborone.

10. Sources, links & publications

Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs).

- Project documents from DEVCO (FA, LFM, monitoring reports);
- The draft assessment fiches produced by the experts (Task II stocktaking, mapping and assessment);
- Country Strategy Papers (CSPs) for 2002 and 2008;
- MTR (8th EDF);
- MTR of NDP 10;
- EU Country-Level Evaluation 2009;
- TVET Situational Analysis 2012;
- NDP 10;
- Final Report 2013: Education and Training Strategic Sector Plan (ETSSP): TVET Sub-Sector;
- Rider HRD Sector Policy;
- TAP HRD Sector Policy Support Programme (SPSP);
- ETSSP Roadmap;
- National Policy on Qualification and Quality Assurance;
- MoU signed between the MoESD and the Chamber of Mines;
- BOTA Annual Report 2011-2012;
- UNESCO BEAR Project;
- <http://www.unevoc.unesco.org/worldtvtdatabase1.php?ct=BWA>.

BOTSWANA

Project title: Expansion of Gaborone Technical College and Automotive Trades Technical College

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: B
4. Coherence: D
5. Quality of the Design: C
6. Impact: C
7. Sustainability: C
8. Added Value of ETF: N/A

0. TVET at a Glance

TVET in Botswana has evolved over the past two decades in three distinct phases:

The pre-RNPE/NAPVET phase was characterised by the lack of a unified TVET policy, low coordination and a lack of standardised vocational qualifications, curricula and qualified trainers. Botswana's Brigades were initially set up as productive (secondary) educational groups, before progressing to productive training in Vocational Training Centres (VTCs). In the 1970s, they attracted considerable donor support and state subsidies. In 2005 there were a total of 39 Brigades with an enrolment rate of 27% out of approximately 28000 learners. The policy basis included the Apprenticeship and Industrial Training Act (MoL) and the Education Act (MoE). The Apprenticeship Act institutionalised employer-based training with support from GIZ and was modelled on the German apprenticeship system (two years of institution-based training, two further years of on-the-job training and 13-week blocks of training at VTCs (later renamed Technical Colleges). This scheme, established in 1987, was offered through the Directorate of Apprenticeship and Industrial Training (under the Ministry of Labour). The Madirelo Training and Testing Centre (MTTC) under the MoL carried out the assessment of trainees and offered three levels of certification which served both the Brigades and the Apprenticeship scheme: Trade Test C, Trade Test B and the National Craft Certificate.

The NAPVET phase (1994-2010) started with the Revised National Policy on Education (RNPE) of 1994 and the subsequent National Policy on Vocational Education and Training (NAPVET) of 1997. By consolidating TVET under the Directorate of Vocational Education and Training (DVET) of the MoE, the integration of various types of TVET into a single system endowed TVET with a new status as an alternative means of education, comparable to academic education in that it provided opportunities for further education. The Vocational Training Act (1998) replaced the Apprenticeship Act and established the Botswana Training Authority (BOTA) as a coordinating authority responsible for monitoring the skills-related needs of the economy and for developing a comprehensive system of vocational qualifications, including registration, accreditation and the monitoring of public and private training institutions (284 registered training providers and 209 accredited in 2010).

The Tertiary Education Council or TEC (Tertiary Education Act, 1999) regulated most programmes at Diploma level and above, including those with technical and vocational orientation. Apprenticeships were reviewed in 1999 after the size of the industrial base in Botswana was found to be too small to support the apprenticeship model (less than 2% of the total school leaver cohort in 2001). VTCs were reconceived as Technical Colleges for the provision of pre-employment technical training or the Botswana Technical Education Programme (BTEP) as well as the theoretical components of the National Trade Tests (NTT) and the National Craft Certificate (NCC). Underutilisation of the VTCs due to a lack of uptake of apprenticeships was one of the reasons for broadening the mandate of the institutions in a context in which technical colleges 'typically received 100 applications for each training place' (UNESCO, 2002), thereby negatively affecting the accessibility of the system. The BTEP programme offered through the DVET started in 2001 and was funded by the EC with the assistance of the Scottish Qualifications Authority. The BTEP had 4 levels (Foundation, Intermediate, Advanced Certificate and Diploma) and provided classroom-based pre-employment training and work placement. Overlap between the courses offered through the BTEP, NTT and NCC has been observed. Since 2002, BOTA has been developing the Botswana National Vocational Qualifications Framework (BNVQF) with a

view to rationalising the provision of TVET over 3 levels, (corresponding in broad terms with the three levels of the TTT, NCC and the first three levels of the BTEP): L1 Foundation Certificate, L2 Intermediate Certificate and L3 Certificate. The BNQF also tried to harmonise qualifications offered at Brigades and the MTTC, at Technical Colleges (TTT, NCC and BTEP) and by private providers (mostly City and Guilds and Pitman qualifications). Technical and vocational qualifications above certificate level (BTEP Diplomas, Diplomas in Engineering, Diplomas in Agriculture or Associate Degrees and Limkokwing University since 2007) are not included in the BNQF. In the context of the BNQF and SADC Regional Qualifications Framework (SADC Education and Training Protocol of 1997), the new phase may see the merging of the BOTA and the Tertiary Education Council following the relocation of vocational skills development to the Ministry of Education (renamed the Ministry of Education and Skills Development (MoESD)). Human Resources Development Advisory Council has been formed and the implementation of the HRD Strategy is expected to lead to the establishment of an umbrella organisation - the Human Resources Development Council (HRDC) - flanked by the NCQF Unit and the Botswana Examination Council (BEC). It is expected that this integrated approach to human resources development will not only increase the supply of qualified Batswana into the economy, but will also ensure relevance of training through direct linkages with industry and Labour Market Information and Analysis System (LMIAS).

1. Identification (CRIS decision number):	16093
2. Classification	
a) By Sector/Thematic Area:	TP – TVET policy and systems TM – TVET access to target groups
b) By Instrument (fund/budget line):	8 th EDF
c) By region:	African, Caribbean and Pacific (ACP): BOTSWANA
d) By period and status:	Decision year 2003 . Status: CLOSED
3. Financial data	
Total EC amount: EUR 3 364 359 +/- 48% of indicative programme Total Contribution from the beneficiary: EUR 3 717 469 +/- 52% Primary commitment (EC funding): EUR 3 880 000 Secondary commitment (funds contracted of EC contribution): EUR 3 717 469 Other funding (government and/or other donors): EUR 3 920 000 Total budget of operation: EUR 7 800 000 Total EC funds disbursed: EUR 3 364 359	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
The main identified objective was to build the capacity of the Gaborone and Automotive Trades Technical Colleges (GTC/ATTC). This is considered a fundamental venture according to sectoral requirements and Government plans covering the period up until 2016.	
4.1 Objective (statement of the problem)	What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
The most important problem identified was the reduced capacity of the GTC to provide skills relevant to the needs of the labour market.	
4.2 Result of the project	Please describe the results achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention).
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Expansion of the capacity of the GTC through the improvement and restructuring of premises, equipment, material and programmes; 2. Increased accessibility of students; enhanced attractiveness of the training programmes and improved placement of students; 3. Increased responsiveness of the training provided to the needs of industries and services. 	
Grading: Overall analysis carried out against 8 criteria (to be applied flexibly)	3 main broad criteria: Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency 5 additional criteria: Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added Value of ETF

- **Relevance: B**

The EU intervention appears relevant to the national policy of increasing the accessibility, attractiveness and quality of TVET in order that it may meet the needs of economic sectors, supported by the national policy of diversification of the economy from the diamond chain and mining industry.

- **Effectiveness: B**

The target was a 100% increase in enrolment at the GTC. In 2006, enrolment was as high as 975 students (with an excellent 64% of females). In 2010 enrolment, was down to 431 (with a less encouraging 49% of females). This represents a 29% occupancy rate against an institutional capacity of 1500. In 2006, the Auto Trades Technical College (ATTC) campus had 645 enrolled students; however, by 2009, enrolment was as low as 363. Following the merging of the ATTC with the Department of Science and Engineering of the University of Botswana, the resulting Botswana College of Engineering and Technology (BCET) has confirmed 903 enrolments, representing 60% of its operational capacity. These figures should be interpreted against a background of declining BTEP enrolments. Nationwide, these amounted to 920 in 2006 with a peak of 1607 in 2008; however today there are 1045 BTEP students enrolled which represents a decline of 35% in two years. The drop in the number of registrations is due to 4 factors, namely: (i) construction works; (ii) lack of knowledge of the BTEP curriculum among students and employers; (iii) low appreciation of the excessive time required to achieve the four foreseen levels of certification (from foundation to diploma); and (iv) sub-optimal management capacity at both DVET and College levels.

- **Efficiency: B**

Most outputs were delivered. The GTC now has extra wings for both Science & Technology and Hospitality & Tourism and a hostel facility for students with special learning needs has also been constructed. A massive multi-purpose hall and gymnasium are also close to being finished at the GTC. The ATTC workshops have been upgraded and the ATTC campus enlarged with a copy of the multi-purpose hall at the GTC and a restaurant that is twice the size of the original. The buildings and classrooms are of relatively good quality and aside from some missing roof tiles and some air conditioning leaks, the premises look very attractive and conducive to learning. However, the design stage took over three years and construction accumulated a delay of 12 months. The handover date of construction deliverables was delayed accordingly. Result Area 6, 'soft' deliverables, 'included effective curriculum development and BTEP implementation across the seven colleges nationwide'. On the positive side, the DVET has been very rigorous in setting-up the curriculum development process; however, this was not sufficiently responsive to employers' needs. Substantial variability exists in relation to knowledge of flexible learning among the Principal Technical Education Officers (PTEOs) at the DVET. The Quality Assurance Authority (QAA) followed-up the operational delivery of courses, although the Steering Committee did not entirely utilise the logical framework's Objectively Verifiable Indicators (OVIs) as a guide to implementation.

- **Coherence: D**

While the design of the project is coherent with the identified needs and goals to be achieved, the absence of internal monitoring, together with project management that did not use the Project Cycle Management tools as required, meant that coherence was not present and that project activities were not entirely linked to the planning of resources and execution.

- **Quality of the Design: C**

The proposal is considered by the RoM as 'solid in its argumentation', 'market-orientated' and 'derived from a study conducted in advance by the Botswana Confederation of Commerce, Industry and Manpower' (BOCCIM 1994).

It is also indicated that a series of 'sectorally, nationally and internationally inspired policies' was integrated into the project during the design phase, although it is unclear whether these policies are related to the main identified goal or if they simply relate to the nature of the project (capacity building, construction and generation). The underutilisation of the new infrastructures and the low accessibility of the training programmes on offer is the result of incorrect assumptions concerning the availability of trainers and the time required for the piloting of the BTEP up to the Advanced Certification and Diploma levels (levels 3 and 4) that did finally materialise. Finally, the risk mitigation strategy proved insufficient to cope with difficulties that quickly became evident.

- **Impact: C**

The results achieved by the project are far from what was initially planned and expected. The employability of BTEP graduates is only 50%, while Hospitality and Tourism graduates have only a 28% chance of being employed; as few as 33% of Hospitality Operations graduates are hired. These percentages fall far below the expected thresholds, especially given the currently high labour market demand for these types of profiles. Lastly the number of students is 'extremely low and approaches 1% of the general population', when 'the OVI target is 5%'.

• **Sustainability: C**

The inherent quality of the infrastructures and of the BTEP programme did not result in the expected increase in enrolment and placement of students. Indeed, the BTEP seemed only to introduce stress into an already weak TVET system. The BTEP, a CBT programme based on four levels of certification (while the current TVET Law, the Botswana NVQF and the entire delivery system was working on three levels of certification), could not be fully supported by the EC project in terms of the provision of sufficient technical assistance to develop curricula, courses, material and ToT for the four certification levels foreseen under the BTEP.

• **Added Value of ETF: NA**

4.3 Beneficiaries

Who benefited/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

Direct beneficiaries are the trainees and training centres themselves (Gaborone Technical College and Automotive Trades Technical College) that: (a) improved their quality; (b) improved their curricula (thus improving the quality of training); (c) improved trainee potential to find employment; (d) improved their technical resources and infrastructures.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The project was designed and implemented to improve the quality of VET and TVET education in Botswana, fine-tuning the system in accordance with the main features of the British TVET system and the Council for Technical and Vocational Education and Training (COTVET) Act. In the case of the 'Tourism and Hospitality' sector, the project aimed to facilitate a 'Flexible human resource supply, responsive to changes in the labour market' as well as generating a 'quality skilled workforce to produce goods that are competitive in the local and global market'.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to project "scalability"? What was the specific approach to capacity development that led to policy impact/ changes?

According to the RoM, three key elements of failure are as follows:

- The Steering Committee (SC) does not use the LFM or OVIs to monitor progress;
- Overall Project Overall leadership is weak; and
- OVIs are not practical and should be redefined so that they become an effective management tool.

7. Lessons learnt

Please include any lessons learnt (regardless of whether these were envisaged at project inception).

Regarding the national authorities, the correct implementation of the BTEP would have required almost double the actual number of training staff at the training institutions, in a context that was already suffering from an acute shortage of teachers and trainers. As a result, the effectiveness and impact of the BTEP could never be entirely appreciated as the programme was never piloted according to plan. The lesson to be learnt is that addressing a very specific aspect of a comprehensive TVET reform (the delivery side), without a comprehensive analysis of i) the likely impact on the external and internal efficiency of the system and ii) of the funding mechanism can lead to the partial accomplishment of objectives and to hampered results, irrespective of the efficiency of implementation. EC intervention in support of TVET reform should thus be built on a holistic view of the reform processes and avoid supply-driven approaches, independently of the degree of immediate appreciation by the national beneficiaries.

8. Implementing Partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

The direct beneficiaries (who are also the implementing partners) are: the Department of Vocational Education and Training (DVET) in the Ministry of Education (MoE), Involved Outreach Centres, and the Gaborone Technical College and Automotive Trades Technical College.

9. Contacts	Provide contact details for further information, including telephone and e-mail.
Gaborone Technical College (enquires@gtc.ce.ac.bw). EU Delegation to Botswana.	
10.Sources, links & publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs).
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project documents from DEVCO (FA, LFM, monitoring reports); • Country Strategy Papers (CSPs) for 2002 and 2008; • MTR (8th EDF); • MTR of NDP 10; • EU Country-Level Evaluation 2009; • TVET Situational Analysis 2012; • NDP 10; • Final Report 2013: Education and Training Strategic Sector Plan (ETSSP): TVET Sub-Sector. • Rider HRD Sector Policy; • TAP HRD Sector Policy Support Programme (SPSP); • ETSSP Road Map; • National Policy on Qualification and Quality Assurance; • MoU signed between the MoESD and the Chamber of Mines; • BOTA Annual Report, 2011-2012; • GTC Brochure; • http://www.unevoc.unesco.org/worldtvtdatabase1.php?ct=BWA. 	

GABON

Project title: Programme d'appui à la formation professionnelle

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: No Data
3. Efficiency: No Data
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: No Data
7. Sustainability: No Data
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

Le Gabon a opté pour la scolarisation universelle depuis les années 60, l'accès au système éducatif se caractérise par un taux de scolarisation très élevé dans le primaire et par une parité entre filles et garçons. L'enseignement primaire, secondaire et supérieur est gratuit mais les livres et les fournitures sont payants.

Cependant, la qualité de l'enseignement s'est fortement dégradée ces dix dernières années du fait du manque d'enseignants qualifiés au primaire, d'un déficit d'enseignants spécialisés dans les matières scientifiques et techniques, et de l'obsolescence, voire de l'absence de matériels et d'équipements didactiques (laboratoires de sciences et ateliers). Les écoles en zone urbaine souffrent de sureffectifs et celles en zone rurale n'ont pas toujours d'enseignants. Sur 1000 élèves entrant au cours préparatoire, seulement 11% terminent le cycle sans redoublement.

L'école gabonaise reste également marquée par le modèle prédominant d'un enseignement général et théorique. Elle affiche un profond déséquilibre entre les filières du secondaire : l'enseignement général compte 92% des effectifs et l'enseignement technique et professionnel seulement 8%. C'est en profonde contradiction avec les besoins de l'économie. En rapport avec cette préoccupation fondamentale, une convention de financement entre le Gabon et l'Union Européenne a été signée au titre du 9eFED pour le renforcement de l'enseignement professionnel.

1. Identification	22182
CRIS decision number	Single Country / National Project
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Are	TP-TVET policy and systems:
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI: geographic programmes Approach project
c) By region	African, Caribbean and Pacific (ACP). Afrique centrale Gabon
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: 2012 Start/Duration: 2011-2014 Status: Ongoing
3. Financial data	
Total EC amount (+ % of indicative programme): EUR 5 200 000 (100%) EUR 5 200 000 (soit 13,3% de l'enveloppe A du PIN)	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
Objectif global du programme: Améliorer la situation de l'emploi et la compétitivité des entreprises gabonaises par une refonte du secteur de l'enseignement technique et formation professionnelle.	
Sous-Objectif 1: Moderniser et adapter l'offre de formation professionnelle (demand-driven) et améliorer la gouvernance du secteur.	
Sous-Objectif 2: Mettre en oeuvre un dispositif de formation géré et financé paritairement.	
Sous-Objectif 3: Renforcer les dispositifs d'orientation et de suivi des bénéficiaires de la formation professionnelle.	

4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<p>Le pilotage du secteur de l'éducation est défaillant et se traduit par un niveau d'efficacité interne et externe insuffisant doublé d'un taux d'efficience très faible. Le système éducatif souffre, par conséquent, d'une perte de crédibilité auprès des parents d'élèves et des opérateurs économiques (formation professionnelle). Le sureffectif dans les établissements et le manque de formation des enseignants, fragilisent les perspectives d'amélioration de la qualité de l'enseignement. Une redéfinition générale des priorités éducatives se traduisant par une importance accrue donnée à l'orientation des élèves et aux capacités d'accueil dans les cycles de l'enseignement général, technique et professionnel, devrait permettre de répondre aux carences actuelles.</p> <p>Afin de renforcer les actions déjà menées par le 8ème et 9ème FED, le 10ème FED cible son appui selon deux axes majeurs : l'éducation de base et l'enseignement technique / formation professionnelle. En ce qui concerne l'enseignement technique et la formation professionnelle, ils ne sont pas en mesure de répondre aux attentes des candidats de plus en plus nombreux chaque année.</p> <p>Les structures et l'offre pédagogique de l'Agence Nationale pour la Formation et le Perfectionnement Professionnel sont insuffisantes. Bien que le marché de l'emploi soit restreint, les entreprises ne parviennent pas à recruter de la main d'œuvre qualifiée. 60% des jeunes qui sont en quête d'un emploi n'ont pas atteint le premier cycle du secondaire. Ils ne peuvent espérer intégrer des filières professionnelles qui, par manque de capacités, ne sont en mesure d'accepter que 10% des candidats. Pour contribuer à briser l'a priori qui consiste à ne valoriser que les filières généralistes et pour que les services responsables de l'orientation puissent mieux aiguiller les publics scolaires vers des filières techniques et professionnelles, les appuis de la CE devraient contribuer à l'amélioration quantitative et qualitative de l'offre technique et professionnelle.</p> <p>Les sureffectifs du primaire doivent être combattus, entre autres, par l'orientation des élèves de 14 ans vers des formations qualifiantes. A ce titre, et en fonction des résultats obtenus dans le cadre des actions menées par le 9ème FED, l'appui aux Ecoles Pratiques d'Insertion et de Développement (EPID) devrait être poursuivi. L'enseignement technique à plus haut niveau (collèges professionnels et lycées techniques) répondant au besoin de main d'œuvre spécialisée, devrait contribuer à atténuer le poids des jeunes dans les statistiques du chômage (42% des chômeurs sont âgés de moins de 25 ans selon une enquête sur la perception de la pauvreté menée en 2004).</p> <p>La démarche paritaire revitalisée par le 9ème FED et regroupant les opérateurs économiques ou représentants de branches professionnelles, l'Etat et les organismes de formation (publics ou privés), devrait être encouragée, la formation devant répondre à un besoin exprimé par l'économie nationale et ne devant pas être une fin en soi. Conditions de viabilité</p> <p>Les aspects techniques et institutionnels essentiels liés au mode de gestion du cycle des projets pour le secteur de l'éducation-formation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • La mise en place d'un dialogue et d'un partenariat entre les pouvoirs publics et les opérateurs économiques se traduisant par des actions communes en matière de formation et d'emploi; • L'accroissement des budgets publics consacrés à la généralisation du préscolaire, à l'amélioration du primaire et au développement des filières techniques et professionnelle. 	
4.2. Result of the project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)
<p>Transversalement, le principal résultat escompté est le renforcement de l'appropriation et de la participation des acteurs impliqués dans le dispositif afin qu'à l'issue d'AFIP.</p> <p>Résultat de l'axe 1: La nouvelle logique d'intervention basée sur les besoins par bassin d'emploi identifié, en partenariat avec le secteur productif, est introduite dans le mécanisme de soutien à la formation par alternance et démontre son potentiel.</p> <p>Résultat de l'axe 2: La capacité des centres de formation partenaires pour l'insertion des jeunes au marché du travail est durablement renforcée.</p> <p>Résultat de l'axe 3: Les mécanismes et les outils d'encadrement, de régulation, de concertation et de suivi du dispositif de formation et d'insertion professionnelle sont renforcés aux niveaux macro et méso.</p> <p>Résultat de l'axe 4: Les possibilités offertes par le dispositif de formation par alternance et son accès sont facilités, vulgarisés et valorisés auprès des différents acteurs concernés et des populations cibles.</p>	

<p>Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3 main broad criteria Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency • 5 additional criteria: Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevance-B <p>Très pertinent parce que le projet appui les principales mesures de politique sectorielle à prendre par le gouvernement comme contribution à la mise en œuvre de la stratégie de réponse dans ce secteur, sont les suivantes :</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Mise en place d'un cadre d'harmonisation de l'aide extérieure dans les ministères chargés de l'éducation et de la formation. 2) Développement d'un plan sectoriel «Éducation/Formation» concrétisant la lettre de politique sectorielle adoptée en Conseil des ministres en août 2005. 3) Mise en place d'un suivi rigoureux du plan d'action pour l'enseignement technique et professionnel, élaboré et validé par le ministère compétent en la matière et intégrant l'apport des bailleurs de fonds dans leur stratégie. 4) Redynamisation de la cellule de suivi des OMD au ministère de l'éducation nationale. Cet engagement implique la tenue régulière de statistiques du ministère, notamment grâce à la carte scolaire saisie localement par les inspections déléguées d'académie. 5) Mise en place d'un dialogue et d'un partenariat entre les pouvoirs publics et les opérateurs économiques se traduisant par des actions communes en matière de formation et d'emploi. 6) Accroissement des budgets publics consacrés à la généralisation du préscolaire, à l'amélioration du primaire et au développement des filières techniques et professionnelles. 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Effectiveness- No data 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Efficiency- No data 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Coherence- B <p>Le projet est cohérent avec la stratégie de l'UE, pour la période 2008 – 2013 couverte par le 10ème FED, que vise la réduction de la pauvreté dans le cadre d'un développement économique et humain durables et s'appuie d'abord, sur les piliers de la stratégie nationale de croissance et de réduction de la pauvreté, définis par le Gabon dans son DSCR.</p> <p>Deuxième secteur de concentration: Education et formation.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of the Design-B <p>Le projet AFIP (Appui à la formation et à l'insertion professionnelle) s'inscrit dans une logique de pérennisation de l'introduction de la formation par alternance dans le système d'éducation technique et de formation professionnelle au Gabon, réalisé avec l'appui du projet Appui à la formation professionnelle (AFOP) (2007-2011). Tandis que le projet AFOP avait appuyé les capacités des centres publics de formation professionnelle (CFPP), le projet AFIP s'inscrit dans une logique de « bassins d'emploi » et de « partenariat public-privé »: il s'agit de renforcer les capacités des centres de formation ciblés, aussi bien publics que privés, afin de favoriser la compétition et la performance, et de développer une offre de formation courte et qualifiante par alternance, dans le cadre d'un partenariat public-privé systématisé répondant à une logique d'insertion professionnelle des jeunes en situation précaire.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Impact- No data <p>No data received for assessing the criteria.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sustainability- No data <p>No data received for assessing the issue.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Added value of ETF: N/A 	
<p>4.3. Beneficiaries</p>	<p>Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?</p>
<p>Bénéficiaires directs: Le Ministère technique responsable, maitre d'œuvre du projet, les centres de formation publics et privés, et les organisations professionnelles représentatives du secteur privé (notamment la CPG).</p>	
<p>Bénéficiaires finaux: Les jeunes de 16-25 ans, avec une attention particulière portée aux femmes et aux handicapés, en difficulté car déscolarisés, ou diplômés sans emploi, justifiant d'une situation précaire, lesquels bénéficieront des formations et de l'insertion au monde professionnel. Les entreprises gabonaises qui bénéficieront de main d'œuvre dûment formée.</p>	

<p>5. Synopsis</p>	<p>Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.</p>
<p>Le Programme annuel d'action (PAA) 2012, quant à lui, inclut un projet d'Appui à la formation professionnelle (5 200 000 EUR), qui vise à améliorer la situation de l'emploi au Gabon et la compétitivité des entreprises gabonaises dans une logique d'adéquation formation/emploi. Le projet AFIP (Appui à la formation et à l'insertion professionnelle) s'inscrit dans une logique de pérennisation de l'introduction de la formation par alternance dans le système d'éducation technique et de formation professionnelle au Gabon, réalisé avec l'appui du projet Appui à la formation professionnelle (AFOP) (2007-2011). Tandis que le projet AFOP avait appuyé les capacités des centres publics de formation professionnelle (CFPP), le projet AFIP s'inscrit dans une logique de « bassins d'emploi » et de « partenariat public-privé »: il s'agit de renforcer les capacités des centres de formation ciblés, aussi bien publics que privés, afin de favoriser la compétition et la performance, et de développer une offre de formation courte et qualifiante par alternance, dans le cadre d'un partenariat public-privé systématisé répondant à une logique d'insertion professionnelle des jeunes en situation précaire.</p>	
<p>6. Key elements of success</p>	<p>What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?</p>
<p>Les elements de success sont lies au Programme Indicatif National. Spécifiquement pour l'enseignement technique et professionnel : l'appui à l'orientation des publics scolaires vers l'enseignement technique et professionnel et à la valorisation de ces filières (par exemple les filières forestières, BTP, agricoles, dans la poursuite d'interventions antérieures et en synergie avec le secteur de concentration portant sur les infrastructures/entretien routier et le secteur hors concentration sur l'environnement. Les capacités d'accueil, d'encadrement et d'enseignement devront être adaptées en conséquence. La finalité de toute formation devant être l'emploi, toute démarche dans ce secteur devra faire l'objet d'une concertation avec les opérateurs économiques qui expriment leurs besoins en termes quantitatifs (effectifs) et qualitatifs (référentiels métiers). La structuration des branches professionnelles devra également être appuyée dans le but d'affiner l'expression des besoins des employeurs et de garantir des compétences sectorielles aux candidats élèves. L'enseignement technique et professionnel devra couvrir les cinq niveaux de formation tout en dépendant du niveau de l'offre d'emploi déterminé par la croissance économique du pays.</p> <p>The activities (Chronogramme 2011-2014) and the relationship with the PIN 2008-2013 are:</p> <p>Composante 1 / Gouvernance : A1 – Mise en Œuvre et opérationnalisation Architecture Nationale et restructuration METFP.</p> <p>Composante 2 / Outils de formation: A1 – Référentiels GPEC/APC; A2- Identification/Sélection opérateurs de formation/CFPP; A3- Equipments pédagogiques/techniques/Formation de formateurs; A4- Formation filières/suivi évaluation.</p> <p>Composante 3 / Dispositifs innovants-sensibilisation: A1- Dispositif de préprofessionnalisation; A2- Orientation-Sensibilisation (liaison avec Ministère Education nationale).</p>	
<p>7. Lessons learned</p>	<p>Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.</p>
<p>Le projet "Appui à la formation et l'insertion professionnelle" (AFIP) s'inscrit en prolongement de l'approche pilote engagée au cours du projet Appui à la formation professionnelle (AFOP) (2007-2011). Il convient de souligner: (i) la grande satisfaction des jeunes ayant bénéficié des formations par alternance; (ii) l'évolution notable des pratiques d'ingénierie, de formation et de partenariat avec le milieu professionnel; et (iii) la prise en compte du nouveau dispositif de formation par alternance dans les textes organiques du ministère technique en charge et dans les projets de textes régissant l'apprentissage au Gabon.</p> <p>Ainsi, le projet d'Appui à la formation professionnelle (AFOP) a mis en place avec succès un nouveau dispositif de formation professionnelle par alternance au Gabon dont la caractéristique originale est de viser une population jeune en difficulté, tout en favorisant leur insertion professionnelle grâce à la mise en place d'une relation de partenariat avec le milieu professionnel. Néanmoins l'évaluation à mi-parcours de ce dernier a souligné la nécessité: (i) de renforcer le partenariat avec le secteur productif, afin que les formations répondent aux besoins réels du marché du travail et ainsi facilitent l'insertion,</p>	

qui demeurait le talon d'Achille d'AFOP; (ii) d'intégrer, dans le mécanisme d'appui, les centres de formation privés, eu égard à leur proportion, dans le système de formation professionnelle du pays (60 instituts et centres privés agréés contre 10 centres publics); et (iii) de renforcer le système de suivi de l'insertion des jeunes, qui est l'objectif final de la formation professionnelle. Par ailleurs, ce nouveau dispositif par alternance reste fragile du fait de son originalité et de la difficulté à ancrer durablement, au sein du ministère technique en charge, les nouvelles pratiques introduites avec la formation alternée et le partenariat avec le milieu professionnel.

L'identification, l'instruction, la mise en oeuvre, l'évaluation et le suivi des projets et des programmes de développement nécessitent de faire appel à des experts spécialisés. Les consultations d'experts contribuent à augmenter l'efficacité des interventions de l'UE dans les différents secteurs de développement.

Dans le cadre de la mise en oeuvre des projets et programmes, il est par ailleurs souvent nécessaire d'assurer une meilleure appropriation, d'augmenter les échanges et l'information auprès des parties concernées, et de renforcer les capacités des fonctionnaires des ministères techniques et des acteurs non étatiques. En outre, on note parfois **un manque de visibilité des actions communes mises en oeuvre par le Gouvernement de la République gabonaise et l'Union européenne** et/ou une connaissance insuffisante des valeurs et des principes qui sous-tendent l'Accord de Cotonou parmi les acteurs-clé du développement et au sein de la population e en général.

Les leçons tirées de la mise en oeuvre des PIN des 9e et 10e FED sont:

- La nécessité d'assurer une identification et une programmation approfondie des projets/programmes afin d'en assurer l'intégration efficace dans les stratégies et les politiques sectorielles développées lors de l'élaboration de la stratégie de réduction de la pauvreté;
- La nécessité de compter sur des services d'assistance technique pour couvrir les étapes clés de la gestion du cycle de projet, notamment au niveau de l'identification et de la formulation des projets/programmes. Il est indispensable de concevoir un certain nombre de projets à partir d'études de faisabilité afin de garantir par la suite leur pertinence et leur efficacité. Les faiblesses institutionnelles et organisationnelles identifiées dans le pays motivent également un appui conséquent pour encadrer et accompagner la mise en oeuvre de la coopération de l'Union européenne;
- L'importance d'assurer, par la formation, l'organisation de séminaires et d'ateliers, et la participation à des conférences, une connaissance suffisante des procédures et des politiques de l'UE et des dernières évolutions des thématiques du développement durable.

8. Implementation partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

Le Ministère de l'Enseignement Technique et de la Formation Professionnelle (METFP)

9. Contacts:

Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail

Cellule d'appui à l'Ordonnateur national.

10. Sources, links and publications

Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)

FA Liste de contrôles.

PPM.

Cadre logique

Document de Stratégie de l'UE, pour la période 2008 – 2013 PROGRAMME INDICATIF NATIONAL. République Gabonaise-Communauté européenne.

GUINEA

Project title: *Ecole Nationale des Arts et Métiers (ENAM III)*

Promotion of the National VET School

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: C
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of the Design: B
6. Impact: B
7. Sustainability: C
8. Added Value of ETF: N/A

0. TVET at a Glance

TVET includes initial vocational training undergone by youths prior to entering the labour market, to the continuous vocational training of adults in employment (or during periods when they are economically inactive), and to cooperative forms of training (whereby the training period is divided between the school/training centre and the place of business). Initial training in TVET primarily corresponds to technical and vocational education provided at conventional formal training facilities, this form of TVET being the best organised and the most structured. It generally comes under the auspices of the Ministry of Education or under those of other ministries in accordance with their thematic linkage.

Two types of non-formal or informal training can be identified from surveys conducted in different African countries: i) traditional learning and ii) various forms of on-the-job learning or self-training.

Traditional learning is developed mainly in the sub-Saharan countries of West Africa. In traditional learning, two systems coexist:

The coastal-type learning system (Benin, Togo, etc.), is highly structured and standardised. This is a vocational training mode that is delivered at a very precise moment in time, consisting of a phase in the life of the individual at the end of schooling and the start of productive life. The second is the Sahelian-type learning system (Guinea, Burkina Faso, Mali, Niger, etc.), which is more flexible and more 'open'. There is no specific point of entry into this type of learning, which can occur at any point in an individual's life. This does not constitute a phase and cannot be mistaken for the institutionalised learning typical of the coastal type. At the same time, an individual can decide to leave without any precise achievements being made. Neither system guarantees entry into professional life. In addition, relationships between learners and their bosses seem less 'standardised'; in other words, they are less subject to the social norms that govern relationships between individuals in all sectors of life (and not just at work).

1. Identification (CRIS decision number):	14622 8 ACP GUI 12
2. Classification	
a) By Sector/Thematic Area:	TM –TVET access to target groups ST
b) By Instrument (fund/budget line):	8 th EDF
c) By region:	Africa, Caribbean and Pacific (ACP): Western Africa GUINEA
d) By period and status:	Decision year: 10/02/00 (4 addenda) Period: 16/12/01- 31/12/04 Status: CLOSED
3. Financial data	

Total EC amount: (% of indicative programme): EUR 2 231 382.47 (93.95% of EUR 2 375 000)

Primary commitment (project budget): EUR 2 170 000

Secondary commitment (funds contracted): EUR 1 021 754

4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
<p>To provide and reorganise (according to country needs) an educative, legislative and operational framework (based on systemic reform and civil structure creation) in a satisfactory way for TVET in Guinea.</p> <p>The project supported ENAM in the following areas:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Upgrading technical and pedagogical work levels in order to respond more closely to the labour market demands; • Strengthening its institutional organisation and capacity; • Further development of ENAM and opening up of new perspectives; • Promotion of ENAM's financial autonomy. 	
4.1 Objective (statement of the problem)	What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<p>The Government of Guinea intends to reform the country's technical and vocational education system. The <i>Ecole Nationale des Arts et Métiers</i> (ENAM), which has been supported technically and financially by the European Commission since 1989, is serving as an experiment and pilot institution. Employment trends require employees with competitive and up-to-date skills. The existing system was unable to respond satisfactorily (i.e. in a timely and 'curricular' way) to the requirements of the employment market or to meet the training needs of civil society.</p> <p>The Republic of Guinea suffers from a significant shortage of skilled work. The Government has initiated a reform of the Technical Education and Vocational Training System with the aim of ensuring the adequacy of training with the requirements of the labor market. A statement on the National Technical Education policy and Vocational Training was adopted on 28 January 1994. The Ministry of Technical Education and Training was created in July 1996 in order to focus on developing professional skills.</p> <p>The National School of Arts and Trades (ENAM) occupies a privileged place in the Technical Education system and Vocational Training in Guinea. It has the support of several donors. The EC has been providing technical and financial assistance since 1989 that has continued through the ENAM Phase I and II projects that have enabled the creation of networks and the development of training technicians in the fields of Electromechanics, Auto Diesel Mechanics and General Maintenance Mechanics.</p>	
4.2 Result of the project	Please describe the results achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention).
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Establishment of an additional course for construction engineers: rehabilitation of buildings, procurement, curriculum development, training of instructors; • Adapting existing courses to new technological developments and to the economic environment; • Refurbishing of training equipment; • Establishment of a HRD plan for instructors of ENAM; • Reactivation of relationships with companies and establishment of new contacts; • Drawing-up of proposals for training modules relevant to local companies, in order to contribute to ENAM's financial sustainability; • Setting-up internet access and providing corresponding staff training; • Improvement of the purchasing procedures of technical literature and magazines. 	
Grading: Overall analysis carried out against 8 criteria (to be applied flexibly)	3 main broad criteria: Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency 5 additional criteria: Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added Value of ETF
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevance: B <p>The objectives of the ENAM III are relevant and responsive to the need to ensure the adequacy of TVET with the requirements of the labour market. The project is a continuation of two previous projects funded by the EC in favour of the ENAM. It provides for the establishment of a new industry - that of civil engineering - as well as a consolidation of existing technical and pedagogical improvement over streams and positioning the ENAM autonomously in its economic environment. Schooling on all sectors lasts three years and prepares for a Higher National Diploma.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Effectiveness: B <p>The beneficiaries of the project are: i) the ENAM trainers and leaders who receive training and refresher level ii) students in the first class of Civil Engineering as well as all students of school who</p>	

receive the rebate in educational level of teachers iii) people in the labour market and Guinean society as a whole. All indications point that by the end of the ENAM project, benefits began to be felt among all beneficiaries and the results related to the first and second specific objective (creation of new industry and consolidation of existing channels) were being achieved. Despite the lack of educational resources, most of the schoolteachers took part in the upgrading programmes. A high level of communication was maintained with all beneficiaries and the project strengthened links both with the private sector and the political and institutional level of responsibility.

However, it is not yet clear whether the results related to the third specific objective - the positioning of the ENAM in the economic environment - were accomplished for the ROM, indicated this aspect as the main challenge for the ENAM III.

The development of education in the new sector programmes was carried out based upon a Situation Analysis of Labour. As part of the educational and institutional development effort, the project took significant steps to opening the regional dimension of the ENAM and improving the quality of education particularly through the upgrading of . trainers in the respective technical subject matters.

- **Efficiency: C**

The Mid-Term Evaluation (MTE) report indicates that the project is efficient in terms of basic evaluation principles (economic input, timeframe of activities and expected results). The final assembly of the project took place in January 2001 with the inauguration of the Technical Assistance (TA), which began six months later than foreseen in the Financing Agreement. The contract for the first TA was terminated when it became clear that the project was not able to stay on site during the 36 months of the project. An amendment to the FA was signed on 19/05/00 to facilitate the late arrival of the TA; however, the 36-month duration for the implementation of the TA would run until 31/05/03.

A second amendment was signed in 26/02/2002 to allow for redevelopment costs and an increase in the budget ceiling; however, this did not resolve the anomaly of the TA contract against the planned implementation deadline in the FA (10% more funds).

On the other hand, the project suffered from the late receipt of the first contribution to the Guinean Work Programme (DP). This situation was exacerbated by the ambiguity of the legislation that did not specify the specific conditions relating to the operating budget. The rehabilitation of classrooms was completed in July 2002. The new line of Civil Engineering was established and 54 students from the first class (with 11 girls) attended lessons in one of three options (Building, Surveying, Public Works). The third amendment was signed in 09/07/2002 (new deadline 31/12/2004). The last amendment was signed in 20/12/2002.

- **Coherence: B**

For several years, the Government of the Republic of Guinea had been trying to address the shortage of skilled labour in the country through a reform of TVET. Despite deficiencies in human, material and financial resources, the ENAM has maintained a reputation as a TVET centre of excellence.

- **Quality of the Design: B**

The project design is based on three aspects: technical, educational and institutional. The project has a logical framework in which some elements were not clearly presented. The means and activities were relevant and valid but the results were identical to the specific objectives and no clear assumptions and risks were indicated.

- **Impact: B**

According to the ROM of 11/03/2003 it was difficult to measure the impact of the intervention on the entire TVET sub-sector. The training seminars for trainers/leaders achieved good results. Teachers were more able to plan their lessons and use technical transfers of knowledge and know-how. Quality impact could have been improved if the project could have intensified its analysis of the needs of the labour market - mainly focused on deficiencies in key actors and private sector employers.

- **Sustainability: D**

The project clearly reflected the perception of local needs and was enthusiastically embraced by the beneficiaries. The technical and financial sustainability of the achievements were correctly integrated as part of the main goals of the project. However, it is clear that the political and administrative environment was not favorable to the effective pursuit of the reform of the sector and therefore to the financial empowerment and equipping of the ENAM. An assessment of the institutional capacity of the Ministry of Education conducted in March 2001 by Africa Management Consult highlighted serious

<p>deficiencies in management capacity, human, material and financial resources. At the time, there was no strategy outlining the approach that the <i>Ministère de l'Enseignement Technique et Formation Professionnelle</i> (METFP) would undertake to ensure the success of the reform and ongoing collaboration with donors. In such circumstances, the viability of the project depended on the capabilities of the ENAM III to position itself on the TVET market with public and private companies.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Added Value of ETF: N/A 	
4.3 Beneficiaries	Who benefited/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?
<p>The direct beneficiaries of this project were the Guinean people and the Ministry of Education. Direct beneficiaries were entrepreneurs, craftspeople, local businesses and local industries.</p>	
5. Synopsis	Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.
<p>The ENAM III project was a continuation of two previous projects funded by the EC, reflecting the need to strengthen existing industries and diversify the skills through the creation of a new industry - that of civil engineering. ENAM III also addressed the need to position the ENAM autonomously in its economic environment. The project design was based on three aspects: professional, educational and institutional.</p> <p>The Client was the Secretary of State for Cooperation and the supervisor was the Minister of Technical Education and Vocational Training.</p> <p>The principal activities were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The creation of a civil engineering industry; • The consolidation of existing channels; • The positioning of the ENAM in its economic and disciplinary environment. 	
6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to project "scalability"? What was the specific approach to capacity development that led to policy impact/ changes?
<p>The development of education in the new sector programmes was carried out based on a Situation Analysis of Labour. As part of the educational and institutional aspects, the project took significant steps to open up the regional dimension of the ENAM and improve the quality of education. Several trainers had the opportunity to develop their respective specialties.</p>	
7. Lessons learnt	Please include any lessons learnt (regardless of whether these were envisaged at project inception).
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Co-Directors should review and set realistic targets for the necessary degree of involvement with companies to consolidate the results achieved through the three ENAM components and to enable them to forecast the potential viability of the financial and equipment needs beyond the lifespan of the project. Similarly, it is important that they strive to strengthen and consolidate their relationship with the National Office of Training and Professional Development to ensure sound dialogue on the requirements of the labour market and promote ENAM as a service provider; • The METFP must monitor the progress of the project. At a time when major donors withdrew from the area, it was all the more urgent for it to develop a clear strategy for the reform of the TVET sub-sector where the ENAM should have played a pivotal role. 	
8. Implementing Partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
<p>This was a bilateral project implemented by the government <i>Ministère de l'Enseignement Technique et Formation Professionnelle</i> of the Republic of Guinea.</p>	
9. Contacts	Provide contact details for further information, including telephone and e-mail.
<p>EU Delegation in Guinea; EC DG Development and Cooperation, Brussels. <i>Ordonnateur national Guinée</i> (Ministry of Planning and Cooperation).</p>	
10. Sources, links & publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs).
<p>Convention de Financement. Cadre logique d'intervention.</p>	

SYNTHESE DE PROJET.

Monitoring Report. Task Manager/Delegation Advisor Response Sheet. Date: 09/04/02.

Rapport De Monitoring Guinee - Gin- École Nationale Des Arts Et Métiers -ENAM III. MR-00626.01 - 09/04/02. Date: 11/03/03.

Rapport De Monitoring Guinee - Gin- École Nationale Des Arts Et Métiers -ENAM III. MR-00626.01 - 09/04/02. Décembre 2004.

8ème Rapport Périodique du Chef de Mission. RAPPORT FINAL République de Guinée. Assistance technique au Projet. ENAM Phase III du 8ème FED.

http://www.gopa.de/index.php?id=13&type=98&tx_bdoproprefs_pi1%5Bpointer%5D=31&tx_bdoproprefs_pi1%5Buid%5D=496.

http://www.afribone.net.gn/metfp/projets_metfp.php.

IVORY COAST

Project title: *Programme d'appui à la formation professionnelle et à l'insertion des jeunes en Côte d'Ivoire*

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: No Data
3. Efficiency: No Data
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of Design: C
6. Impact: No Data
7. Sustainability: No Data
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

The Department of Technical Education was established in 1959 under the first government of the Republic of Ivory Coast with a mission to train managers, technicians and skilled workers that the country needed to ensure the recognition of its nascent industries and to promote the development of rural areas. In 1970, the Department became the Ministry of Technical Education and Vocational Training (METFP) and its mission was extended to provide technical and professional skills to students and unemployed people. This period allowed the training sector to grow both quantitatively and qualitatively.

In 1991, a TVET reform process started with the aim of building a system comprising formal, non-formal TVET and continuing education under a unified authority. The Technical education subsector together with the vocational training one, have been attached to one supervisory ministry after another, a situation that has not been conducive to the formulation and implementation of a coherent policy of human-resources development.

The METFP has undergone many changes: twice given the status of a full-fledged ministry; twice broken up, with its internal departments scattered amongst other ministries; restored to ministerial status in 1996, but stripped of the *grandes écoles*, which remained under the Higher Education Ministry, and with specialised training centres falling under the remit of other technical ministries. The ministry progressively lost its distinct identity and its coherence; internal and external efficiency declined, as a result instability and the diversity of decision-making centres. With the formation of the first government under the Second Republic, in October 2000, the Ministry disappeared once again, with its competencies redistributed to the Ministries of Education, Youth, and Employment and Vocational Training. The division of responsibility for the sector across these three ministries has led to coordination problems concerning the coordination of tasks and activities and has held back the design of a coherent and integrated sectoral policy.

Since 2007, however, there has been a ministry specifically responsible for technical education and vocational training and several institutions under the authority of the Ministry, such as: a technical and pedagogical engineering structure: the National Agency for Vocational Training (AGEFOP) Engineering Professional Training of the State Office responsible for prospecting, analysing training needs and implementing training projects; a training of trainers institution: the National Pedagogical Institute of Technical and Vocational Education (IPNETP); a structure for training programme development: the Ivorian Centre for the Development of Vocational Training (CIDFOR), responsible for developing vocational training, using information tools and documentation; the Centre for the Promotion of New Technologies of Information and Communication (CPNTIC); the fund for vocational training development (*Fonds de développement de la formation professionnelle* - (FDFP)) which manages the apprenticeship tax (0.5% of the total wage bill) and the additional tax for continuous vocational training (1.5%), levied through compulsory contributions as well as any other TVET funding, M&E and in-service training; the *Agence d'Etudes et de Promotion de l'Emploi* (AGEPE), is the public employment service that also undertakes observatory and training promotion functions; the National Solidarity Fund for the promotion of young entrepreneurs.

The regulatory framework includes: the Decree N° 2007-Organization of the METFP; the *Plan National de Développement du secteur Éducation / Formation -1998-2010* (PNDEF); the *Plan d'Actions à Moyen*

Terme du Secteur de l'Education/Formation - 2012-2014 (PAMT) and the Note de cadrage pour le développement de l'Enseignement Technique et de la Formation Professionnelle en Côte d'Ivoire 2010-2020. The main TVET actors remain fragmented across more than 15 institutions, bodies and agencies. Formal TVET is under the responsibility of the Ministry of Education as the principal TVET provider in the country, the Ministry of Higher Education and Research and Ministry of Technical Education and Professional Training. Non-formal training and skills is addressed by other ministries, the main being the Ministry of Agriculture and Animal resources, the Ministry of Women and Family and support and the Ministry of Public Health and the Ministry of Sports.

70 vocational training institutions exist under the METFP and include: 59 public training establishments including 10 Mobile Units (UM) for skills training and three (3) application and Production Workshops (AAP) for the training of artisans and 333 registered and accredited private training institutions and private firms delivering training. Private schools enrol more than the half of the student population. The Ivory Coast Chamber of Commerce plays a relevant role in connecting employers with jobseekers and also determining skill needs in accordance with market requirements.

1. Identification (CRIS decision number):	22049 Single Country/National Project
2. Classification	
e) By Sector/Thematic Area:	TP-TVET policy and systems TM -TVET access to target groups LS- Active Labour Market policy and Measures
f) By Instrument (fund/budget line):	DCI: geographic programmes 10 ^o EFD Approach Project
g) By region:	African, Caribbean and Pacific (ACP) Côte d'Ivoire/ Ivory Coast
h) By period and status:	2011-2018. Signed: 23/11/2011 Status: Ongoing
3. Financial data	
Total EC amount (+ % of indicative programme): EUR 25 000 000 (100% EU)	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
The overall objective is to contribute to the social cohesion and socioeconomic integration of young people in Ivory Coast. The specific objective is and support the METFP to implement the TVET reform to enable the TVET system to return to regular operational capacity by upgrading trainers and infrastructures, forming public-private partnerships to develop courses for trades that respond to the needs of the labour market and a flexible skills offer for the youths threatened by marginalisation and exclusion.	
4.1 Objective (statement of the problem)	What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
After a preparatory phase whereby the main elements of a comprehensive reform of the education sector were conceived (<i>Rapport d'Etat 2009 sur le système éducatif national (RESEN)</i>) with the support of the international development partners, the Government of Ivory Coast had an imperative to restructure TVET in light of a very compelling economic and social demand for strong training from unemployed youths and adult professionals.	
Against an aggregate demand of about 400 000 new students per year, the system caters for less than 20% because of a very limited enrolment capacity; obsolete and degraded infrastructures; out-dated curricula and programmes not relevant to the needs and the technologies of industries and businesses; the low quality of trainers and teachers. As a result, the METFP estimates that less than 20% of TVET students find a job in their trades following graduation. The access problem whereby less than 10% of students enrolled in education attend TVET is exacerbated by the uneven distribution of training establishments in the country's two main cities. This is also accompanied by a lack of maintenance of the existing public vocational training schools and the limited outreach capacity towards informal/traditional apprenticeship systems.	
Acute problems affect the quality of the system, well beyond trainers and curricula. Equipment,	

programmes, courses, instructional material and eventually standardisation and certification are all elements that need to be recomposed within a coherent quality assurance system. The participation of social partners in the governance of the TVET system is also very poor. Finally, the system is not adequately funded, as the national resources earmarked for TVET are less than 7% of the total budget for education.

4.2 Result of the project	Please describe the results achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention).
----------------------------------	---

Expected results:

- The METFP has started to implement the Strategy for Education, and the training and operational plan of the TVET reform;
- The planning and management capacities of METFP are built (equipment, training, technical assistance);
- Curricula, budgeting, Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF), national standard classification of occupations, defined;
- The new programme to upgrade methodological and technical skills of trainers is implemented, teachers are trainers and provide quality education through:
 - TOT Policy and programmes especially in the trades taught in the schools to be rehabilitated, developed by IPNETFP;
 - Overall capacities of the IPNETFP strengthened;
- 12 schools are renovated, equipped and functional and maintenance capacity is reinforced;
- Skills training programmes for the agricultural sector, the informal sector and accelerated training programmes for disadvantaged youth and those excluded from general education, developed through:
- Support to the platform for training services (PFS) and the Scholl-Enterprise partnership and public and private training providers.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against 8 criteria (to be applied flexibly)	3 main broad criteria: Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency 5 additional criteria: Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added Value of ETF
---	---

- **Relevance: B**

The project is part of a package of European Union measures adopted on 20 July 2011, comprising five programmes representing a contribution of EUR 125 000 000. These programmes were intended to support the areas of vocational training, health, transportation, public financial management and the strengthening of civil society organisations. The support to TVET is relevant in relation to the cross-cutting impacts on employment, reintegration into normal life of youth ex-combatants, the competitiveness of the economy and the rehabilitation of areas devastated by the civil war.

- **Effectiveness: B**

In the absence of any monitoring or evaluation report, it is not possible to establish if and to what extent the project is effective. On the basis of the design, it is possible to anticipate that the beneficiaries have been selected for respective mandates that are coherent with the actions proposed by the project. UNIDO, as the implementing agency, is a reputable, specialised agency of the UN system that offers high guarantees for implementation. It contributed to the identification phase and is already supporting the METFP well with technical assistance on TVET. At the time of identification, it was explained that a structured participation of the social partners and a systematic involvement of the employers would be necessary for the effectiveness of youth job insertion.

- **Efficiency: C**

In the absence of any monitoring or evaluation report, it is not possible to establish if and to what extent the project is efficient.

- **Coherence: B**

The project is coherent with the: *Reforme de l'enseignement technique et de la formation professionnelle* ; *Plan Operationnel de la Réforme de l'ETFP* and the METFP's *Note de cadrage pour le développement de l'Enseignement Technique et de la Formation Professionnelle en Côte d'Ivoire 2010-2020*, the RESEN, the PRSP, the UNDAF and the main development partners' initiatives.

- **Quality of the Design: B**

The quality of the design is satisfactory. It is the result of a long preparatory period characterised by an accurate joint analysis between the EU, UNIDO, the WB, the AFD and other development partners.

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Impact: B In the absence of any monitoring or evaluation report, it is not possible to establish if and to what extent the project is having a measurable impact on the TVET system. 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sustainability: D In the absence of any monitoring or evaluation report, it is not possible to establish if and to what extent the project is sustainable. At the time of identification, it was explained that adequate financial resources stabilised in the state budget would be crucial for sustainability. 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Added Value of ETF: N/A 	
4.3 Beneficiaries	Who benefited/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?
<p>Ministry of Technical Education and Vocational Training. National Agency for Vocational Training (AGEFOP). National Pedagogical Institute of Technical and Vocational Education (IPNETP). Ivorian Centre for the Development of Vocational Training (CIDFOR). Centre for the Promotion of New Technologies of Information and Communication (CPNTIC). Public Establishments: Technical Schools (LT) Vocational High Schools (LP), eleven (11) Centres for Trade Development (CPM) thirty-five (35) Vocational Training Centres (CFP). Response structures in rural areas: Mobile Units (UM) for skills training, and three (3) Workshops and Production Application (AAP). The communities in which vocational training centres are located. The Chambers of Commerce, Agriculture and Industries, the General Confederation of Industries, the SME Federation and the Chambers of Artisans, for the employers side.</p>	
5. Synopsis	Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.
<p>Ivory Coast has undertaken a major reform in the education/training sector, and specifically with regards to the Technical Education and Vocational Training system. The programme supports the main aspects of the reform to achieve a system of vocational and technical training that is accessible to all and that fits the needs of the national economy. The project consist of six main components including the piloting and implementation of the governance of the TVET system, from strategy to financing; quality of training offer and a system of communication linking the key stakeholders; access through rehabilitation and equipping of training infrastructures; job insertion promotion of youth skilled through a programme of short courses in different sectors of the formal and informal economy. The expected duration is 5 years. Gender equality on access to TVET and environmental impacts are mainstreamed into all activities. A strong partnership with the private sector is also informing all the reform project components. The implementation has been assigned to the United Nations Industrial Development Organization.</p>	
6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to project "scalability"? What was the specific approach to capacity development that led to policy impact/ changes?
<p>The elements of success are inferred from the project's design. Hence, they are expected but have not yet been achieved. Key to the implementation of this reform are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The partnership with the private sector through 'structured professional branches' expected to participate in the develop of governance through the competences of key staff in the different institutions and bodies; • The development of alternative funding schemes. 	
7. Lessons learnt	Please include any lessons learnt (regardless of whether these were envisaged at project inception).
<p>TVET is a new intervention area for European Commission cooperation in Ivory Coast; it was chosen for the cross-cutting character of the expected impacts of a properly reformed sector. The needs for support are vast and the time for ensuring sustainable changes will go beyond the project's life span. The decision to concentrate pilot actions and resources on a limited number of separate TVET elements seems to be wise and in relation with effectiveness.</p>	
8. Implementing Partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

Ministère de l'Enseignement Technique et de la Formation Professionnelle. Major and visible donors are dealing with educational and TVET issues are UNIDO, AfD and World Bank, support the reform of the national education system; Japan, Islamic Development Bank, the Arab Bank for Economic Development in Africa (BADEA) and the Saudi development Fund support the rehabilitation of Vocational Training Centres. WB, UNDP, EC and AFD support youth in job insertion schemes. Other important donors are the UNIDO and UNDP.

9. Contacts

Provide contact details for further information, including telephone and e-mail.

*Ministre de l'Economie et Finances.
 Ordonnateur National, Abidjan.*

10.Sources, links & publications

Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs).

Financial Agreement (FA) Convention de financement.
 Identification Fiche (IF).
 Studies: *Note de cadrage pour le développement de l'Enseignement Technique et de la Formation Professionnelle en Côte d'Ivoire 2010-2020.*
Plan opérationnel de la réforme de LÉTFP 2010.
 LES MATINALES DU GOUVERNEMENT: «Quel système d'Enseignement Technique et de Formation Professionnelle en Côte d'Ivoire dans la perspective de construction d'un pays émergent à l'horizon 2020" Exposé Liminaire du Ministre a l'occasion de la Matinale de la Communication Gouvernementale" (Lundi 27 Février 2012).
 UNDAF- United Nations Development Assistance Framework 2013-10-07.
 PRSP – Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper 2009.
[http://www.gouv.ci/grands_dossiers_1.php?recordID=30.](http://www.gouv.ci/grands_dossiers_1.php?recordID=30)

NIGER

Project title: Formation Professionnelle et technique NIGETECH-II

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: C
3. Efficiency: C
4. Coherence: B
5. Impact: C
6. Sustainability: C
7. Quality of Design: C
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

In Niger, TVET is fragmented and reproduces an imported educational model offering standardised training. The TVET system is shaped around the Ministry of Education and Research responsible for the component of the formal education system, the Ministry of Vocational and Technical Education (MFPT) and the National Office of Vocational Training (ONAFOP) that manages *the Fonds d'Appui à la Formation Professionnelle Continue et à l'Apprentissage* (FAFPCA) fund for non-formal VT. The TVET delivery structure includes a network of 18 Community VT Centres (CFDC), the centre of the national federation of farmers (CNOP) and other small training centres established by municipalities. TVET funding comes from government budget allocations, the budgets of local authorities and donors (international institutions and bilateral partners), student fees and Non-Governmental Organisations.

1. Identification Cris decision number	14612
2. Classification: a) By Sectors / Thematic Area:	TP-TVET policy and systems (1a) TM -TVET access to target groups (1b):
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	EDF 8 th programme
c) By region	Geographical programmes: ACP- Africa NIGER
d) By Period and Status	Signed February 2000 Status: closed

3. Financial data

EU contribution: EUR 7 000 000

National contribution: N/A

4. Outcome

What were the goals of the project?

As a follow-up of the *NIGETECH 1* (1995-2000) Programme, the *NIGETECH 2* (2000-2004) project aims to increase the income of artisans, apprentices and micro-entrepreneurs and to facilitate the insertion of candidate micro entrepreneurs in income generating activities (target groups), by reinforcing the institutional set-up and financial sustainability of VT (policy), providing qualifications through flexible modular training, enlarging the geographic coverage of demand driven VT to the whole country (system).

The overall objective of the programme is to improve the training offer, quantity and quality at national level.

The specific objective is to i) develop VT responding to the demand of the beneficiaries and labour market needs and ii) development and implementation of a national VT policy.

4. 1. Objective (problem statement)

- What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?

The evaluation of *NIGETECH 1* recommended ensuring the continuity of the training model and the institutional arrangements to support it, by enlarging its coverage to the whole country, embedding it in the national VT policy and increasing its financial sustainability and viability.

The demand for skills is quantified among a potential target population of 1.7 million (0.6 artisans and

1.1 unemployed from 21 - 35 years of age). The legal framework, the VT strategy (governance, financing, management of training institutions, quality and efficiency of delivery) are indicated as the priority to be addressed.

The financial and economic analysis carried out on *NIGETECH 1* indicates that the demand for training exists, (not quantified by sector) and that former beneficiaries enjoyed a substantive increase of income as a result of it (not quantified). The analysis concludes that the model of response to the skills demand introduced with *NIGETECH 1* would only be viable with the financial contribution of owners and apprentices.

The issues on the supply side mostly concern the extension of training programmes to the whole country and the viability of establishing and ensuring the continuity of a management structure for the programme (*Antenne*).

Regarding policy management. The weakness of the governance structures. At the time of the project's formulation, the Office for VT (ONAFOP) and the Fund (*Fonds National pour l'Apprentissage, l'Enseignement Technique, la Formation et le Perfectionnement Professionnels*), as defined by article. 62-63 of the Law n° 98-12, 1998, (*Loi d'orientation sur la politique éducative et la FP*), were yet to be established and committed to by the Government. The designated authority (*Direction Nationale du Ministère de l'Education charge de la FP* (DETFP)) was expected to prepare the regulations of the public body and the management of the Fund. The model needs to be coherent with the national the TVET policy that is under preparation.

Regarding the management of this new component of the national TVET system. The institutionalisation of the *NIGETECH* type of training (modular and flexible) requires a dedicated and decentralised management structure (programme Antenna) to supervise the implementation of the type of VT offered by *NIGETECH II*; its financing mechanism is to be established.

Regarding stakeholder participation in governance and funding. The absence of a consultative mechanism for stakeholders' active participation in a funding mechanism proposing a contribution from 10 to 30% of training fees by the beneficiaries (artisans and apprentices) increases the risk of low participation in training and contributions - particularly in rural or non secure areas.

Regarding training institutions. It is not specified whether the public and private training providers are equipped to deliver the modular and flexible offer. It is assumed that under the previous programme they have acquired this capacity to respond to critical socio-educational situations of young people and adults. Level of investment by VT providers to be able to offer the *NIGETECH*-type of modular and flexible training is not defined as assumptions and risk analyses indicate

Regarding Labour Markets. A mechanism of regular assessment of the skills in demand by the labour markets - by productive sectors - is not mentioned as being operational.

Regarding training programmes.

Assessment of the technology and working conditions in the sectors of the formal and informal economy are not provided or referred to.

4.2. Result of the project

- Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)

Project's expected results:

- The Office and the Fund of the programme (mandate, composition, functions and operational capacity of the Office are reinforced and the Fund's funding and co-funding capacity established [*formation initiale, continue et formation initiale professionnalisante*] governance ensured by institutions and stakeholders);
- The Antenna of the *NIGETECH II* programme;
- 300 apprentices under apprenticeship schemes with artisans;
- 600 participants ready to become junior entrepreneurs;
- 10000 artisans trained in 500 *Journées d'information technologique*;
- 1000 unemployed (graduate, non-graduate, non-qualified) under VT or skills development (*formation professionnalisante*) and job insertion programmes;
- Five *NIGETECH* Documentation Centres transferred to new structures that are accessible to artisans;
- TVET public and private providers have repository for training modules, official supervision by the Office in charge of VT policy and Fund, more autonomy on income generation;

- 100 Trainers from NIGETECH qualified and upgraded to train modules (*perfectionnement, spécialisation, apprentissage renforcé et formation initiale professionnalisante*) and recognised. Status and qualification of trainers of public VT is reviewed;
- The TVET system is better defined in concept, management, knowledge repository and operational guidelines.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria

- 3 main broad criteria **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF, Quality of the Design**

• **Relevance: A**

The full utilisation of the training offer by the project, an assessment of the declared growing demand of training by employers (artisans) and workers (apprentices), the increasing of income as a result of skills acquisition and the evaluation of the *NIGETECH 1* are all elements that confirm the relevance of the project to national needs. The intervention is enshrined in law, although the policy and legal framework to support the *NIGETECH* VT model are not yet established.

National co-funding is concentrated on direct support to the delivery component. The confirmation of the availability of the beneficiaries to contribute to the costs of training is a clear pointer of relevance. Links with employers (artisans) is ensured by participation on the board of the Office and the Fund.

The training offer by NIGETECH is flexible to meet the needs of both parties - owners and apprentices. The technical and entrepreneurial component supports labour mobility among enterprises and towards self-employment. The

The training offer by NIGETECH is flexible to meet the needs of both parties - owners and apprentices. The technical and entrepreneurial component supports labour mobility among enterprises and towards self-employment. The training programmes target the needs of the informal economy.

The modular training offer is built to provide the economically and socially disadvantaged with a chance of entering and completing training; costs are met by the Fund, in order to handle potential conflicts between economic and social needs. The gender component is not explicitly mentioned.

• **Effectiveness: C**

The technical quality of the products to support the achievement of the expected results of the Project was validated under *NIGETECH 1*. The level of participation of employers and apprentices in the cost of training accounts for the success of the programme. The extent to which success factors can be replicated is quantified in terms of a better and more flexible offer. The effectiveness of the mechanism for policy formulation, institutional and management capacity at various levels is related to the establishment/strengthening of the DETFP and the ONAFOP in charge of the integration of this training model within existing policy.

The effectiveness of the various institutions in placing graduates in training-related employment depends on the training component at the workplace. The capacity of the system to attract and retain qualified administrators and instructors in the five selected regions is related to the establishment of the Fund that supplies the financial resources. The incentives built in to improve the quality of output from the system are foreseen in terms of strengthening the supply side through the training of trainers and an enlarged offer of programmes, courses and material already validated, as well as through the financial participation of users and end-users of the training services. The capacity of the project to achieve its planned objectives and provide real benefits to the selected beneficiaries is not clear in terms of risk analysis and the risk mitigation strategies proposed in the document.

• **Efficiency: C**

The project was expected to last 3 years. In the absence of monitoring and evaluation reports (not available) it is not possible to establish the efficiency in terms of:

- Implementation of the planned interventions in the given timeframe, expansion, maximisation and improvement of outputs within the available resources;
- Actual cost of producing the present levels of output in line with budget (reduced or minimised);
- Increased access (by trainers handling more trainees per workshop, or use of more individualised instruction or increased utilization of factories' equipment);
- Consolidation of institutions (economies of scale in TVET);
- Reduction of the length of training and to what extent;

- Training suppliers, more efficient in cutting costs or to raise output?

- **Coherence: B**

The project is coherent within the Commission's development programme for Niger, as it is an extension of *NIGETECH*. The national Policy for VT requires the institutionalisation of the *NIGETECH* model and its integration in the Vocational Training System. The implementation of the Technical Assistance component by the ILO ensures coherence with interventions by the UN system. The project is funded under the EDF and the Lome IV convention.

- **Impact: C**

The 2003 evaluation remarked that, though the technical training was good, the graduates faced problems when they entered their professions and thus recommended that there be courses on business management to complement vocational training. MSE owners' perceptions of the contribution to the Fund as a government intervention aimed at increasing tax revenues from the small business sector, was overcome through literacy courses for informal sector SME owners prior to the ILO Start and Improve Your Business (SIYB). The Government adopted new legislation on apprenticeship training and lifelong learning in 2006. The implementation of the new legislation started with a tripartite forum gathering all concerned stakeholders. The long-term effect of the Project can only be deduced from the background analysis of the subsequent EC projects in Niger: *Appui à la Formation Professionnelle Continue* under the IX EDF signed in 2005. *NIGETECH 2* ended in December 2004 and increased the qualifications of more than 30 000 individuals. It was perceived as having increased the productivity of SMEs and their competitiveness on national and regional markets by strengthening the skills of artisans, apprentices and new entrepreneurs. Finally it established a pool of 400 qualified trainers - mostly artisans available from all over the country - training material and equipment.

- **Sustainability: C**

The key elements of sustainability are: the project embedding its achievements in the national legal and regulatory framework (although under evolution); the institutional management capacity at central and decentralised level as well as the economic and financial viability of the Fund. The Fund's financial mechanisms are based on a substantive contribution from the national budget to be integrated by the entrepreneurs and the apprentices. Another aspect for which sustainability is not immediately forthcoming is the development of national qualifications for trainers and the training for qualifications related to the national occupations; the extension of the geographical coverage and the inclusion of disadvantaged groups.

Quality of the design: C

On the basis of the provided documentation, the FA document is not completed by a Project Planning Matrix. The quality of the analysis and the formulation of the project document is not high.

Added value of ETF: NA

4.3. Beneficiaries

Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

Direct recipients: Ministry of Planning: administration. Ministry of Education.

Final beneficiaries: artisans, apprentices and micro-entrepreneurs and to facilitate the insertion of candidate micro entrepreneurs in income generating activities.

Technical counterpart: DEFTP, ONAFOP.

Implementing partner: ILO.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

NIGETECH II is a follow-up and extension of *NIGETECH* under the 7th EDF programme (1995-99). The two components are: policy development and quality, access and relevance of TVET delivery. It operates in 5 selected regions. The direct recipients are the VT institutions and providers. The final beneficiaries are SMEs (artisans), apprentices, young entrepreneurs and unemployed qualified and non-qualified youths. The ILO manages the Project Management Unit (UAT). The Project was implemented over three years. The total cost was EUR 7 000 000.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

The flexibility and diversification of the training offer, the strengthening of training providers, the concertation with key stakeholders, the establishment and the decentralisation of the governance

mechanism, the funding mechanism and the active participation of the users (enterprises) and end users (trainees) are the main elements for scalability.	
7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.
<p>The elements of evaluation collected from different sources indicate the innovative character of the design that promotes the development of an institutional framework, which should embed and stabilise the new offer of training. The implementation of the training activities, which are both diversified and flexible, reaches a vast array of target groups. Proceeding in parallel with the development of the VT institutions, this introduces an experimental and institutional-oriented learning approach that appears to be a powerful incentive to reforming the system. Nevertheless, in order to balance the risk of the different progress rates of institutions and providers, preconditions and milestones in the project's design could have been introduced. In this respect, the integration of the VT policy in national HD and socioeconomic policies should run in parallel with the strengthening of the demand (involvement of the employers as direct beneficiaries of the training programmes and contributors) and the supply side (strengthening of the VT providers). The programme raises systemic questions concerning the institutional capacity related to the management of its geographical extension, the capacity of public and private providers to implement the new programmes, the extension to the main sectors of the formal and informal economies and the financial viability of the funding mechanism and the building of a system of training services (LMI, career guidance, business development services and access to financial resources for the self employment component).</p> <p>The validity of the context analysis, the relevance to the national development agenda, the level of priority of Skills Development within the national development policy, the allocation of national resources and the assessment of the VT supply and demand carried out under <i>NIGETECH 1</i> might have required an update; however, the provided documents did not show this.</p>	
8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ministry of Planning. Ministry of National Education, the DETFP (<i>Direction Nationale du Ministère de l'Éducation charge de la FP</i>) the ONAFOP and the Fund (<i>Fonds National pour l'Apprentissage, l'Enseignement Technique, la Formation et le Perfectionnement Professionnels</i>); • The EC funded the 'Systèmes ruraux et micro entreprises d'artisanat SYRENE' project from August 2003 –August 2006 to create greater opportunities for women and men to secure decent employment and income; • The International Labour Organization (<i>Le travail des enfants au Niger 2000-2007</i>); • <i>Agence Française de Développement (AFD)</i>; • <i>La Coopération Luxembourgeoise</i>. 	
9. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail
Ministry of Vocational and Technical Education (MFPT), Delegation of the EU in Niger	
10. Documentation DEVCO Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)
Financial Agreement. MR 02/04.	

NIGER

Project title: *Appui à la Formation Professionnelle Continue et à l'apprentissage I et II*

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: C
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: B
7. Sustainability: B
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

In Niger, TVET is fragmented and reproduces an imported educational model offering standardised training. The TVET system is shaped around the Ministry of Education and Research responsible for the component of the formal education system, the Ministry of Vocational and Technical Education (MFPT) and the National Office of Vocational Training (ONAFOP) that manages *the Fonds d'Appui à la Formation Professionnelle Continue et à l'Apprentissage* (FAFPCA) fund for non-formal VT. The TVET delivery structure includes a network of 18 Community VT Centres (CFDC), the centre of the national federation of farmers (CNOP) and other small training centres established by municipalities. TVET funding comes from government budget allocations, the budgets of local authorities and donors (international institutions and bilateral partners), student fees and Non-Governmental Organisations.

1. Identification CRIS decision number	16963 and 19482
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Are	TP-TVET policy and systems (1a) TM-TVET access to target groups (1b) ST Sectoral training (1c) IE Informal Economy IP (1e)
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	EDF 9 th programme
c) By region	Geographical Zone (Country or region): République du Niger
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: (2000-2012) Signed April 2005 Status: Closed, On going, Committed, Provisional: CLOSED
3. Financial data	

Phase I EUR 5 654 960
EU Contribution: EUR 5 531 900
National Contribution: EUR 123 060
Phase 2: EUR 1 999 540
EU Contribution: EUR 1 999 540
National Contribution: 0

4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
<p>The <i>Programme d'appui à la formation professionnelle et à l'apprentissage</i> (PFPCA) in Niger is a follow up of the <i>NIGETECH 1</i> (1995-2000) Programme and 2 (2000-2004) and consisted of two phases: phase 1 - 2005-2007 and phase 2 - 2008-2010. Its overall scope is to contribute to poverty reduction through the improvement of professional qualifications for job insertion of youths and for the productivity of the artisans.</p> <p>The specific objectives were to i) develop and put in place an organisational and institutional framework of Vocational Training (<i>continue et en alternance</i>), ii) maintain and further develop quality vocational training and apprenticeship programmes that match the needs of the beneficiary in an increasingly sustainable manner.</p>	

<p>4. 1. Objective (problem statement)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<p>The national priority of enhancing the quality of human resources for economic development and the fight against poverty was confirmed. The socioeconomic context continued to be marked by a predominance of agriculture, agro-pastoralism, an underdeveloped crafts (artisanship) sector and a modern sector dominated by mining and quarrying. Relative political instability characterised the institutional context and impacted upon the institutional framework of technical education and vocational training.</p> <p>Regarding VT policy, strategy, governance A VT legal framework was defined and supported by <i>NIGETECH 1</i> and the Government, but a NTVET strategy, sectoral and an action plan (the operational side) were not developed under the project. The vocational training system suffered from a lack of overall strategic management. Economic priorities and the sectoral demand of companies were not sufficiently taken into account and the TVET system at large remained supply driven.</p> <p>Regarding management of this new component of the national TVET system The management, programming and research capacity of the Ministry's Directorates of VT and Apprenticeships and of Planning and Research was assessed as weak. The financial viability of the Fund (FAFPCA) persisted in being uncertain, as well as the financial management capacity of the staff and the level of participation of the key stakeholders on the board (of the Fund) where they were underrepresented.</p> <p>Regarding participation of key stakeholders The national platform for social dialogue on TVET was not operational and the involvement of main stakeholders in bodies such as the <i>Conseil Supérieur de l'Enseignement et de la Formation Professionnelle et Technique</i> (COSEFPT), though formally established in 2009, remained nominal. The National Federation of Artisans of Niger (FNAN) has become a player in PFPCA; it is organised as a regional network and a FNAN training committee was established at each regional federation level. The FNAN actively participated in implementation.</p> <p>Regarding the management of the training programmes and the training providers The need to stabilise the management of the flexible training offer developed under <i>NIGETECH 1</i> and <i>2</i>, led to the supporting of an operator in order to become reliable and efficient for the implementation of the training activities of the programme. The main operator for the implementation of the training was the <i>NIGETECH</i> NGO, established in 2004. A higher diversification of training suppliers was a problem that was identified during the project's analysis.</p> <p>Regarding the demand The demand for training assessed at the time of <i>NIGETECH</i> was still largely unsatisfied due to the fact that the previous action only involved a pilot sample of target groups.</p> <p>Regarding Labour Markets The programme did not set up a centralised skills assessment mechanism of demand in the labour markets, by productive sectors. Involvement of the National Employment Agency (ANPE) was confined to the steering committee. The National Federation of Artisans was expected to play an active role in the collection and analysis of labour market information and skill needs.</p> <p>Regarding training programmes Assessment of the technology and working conditions in the sectors of the formal and informal economy are not provided or referred to.</p>	
<p>4.2. Result of the project</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)
<p>Training (<i>continue et en alternance</i>) was set up, ii) the Fund (<i>Fond d'Appui à la Formation Professionnelle et à l'Apprentissage FAFPCA</i>) that supports the training is performing and is recognised iii) and a specific policy for Apprenticeships has been developed.</p> <p>On the VT policy and regulatory framework:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The creation of a VT department in the Ministry in charge of training (<i>Ministère de la Formation Professionnelle et Technique</i>.(2005); • A sectoral VT policy document adopted by the Government (2006); • The Fund for Continuous Training and Apprenticeship (FAFPCA, former ONAFOP) was established in 	

- 2007 as well as its rules and regulations (2008 and 2009);
- Laws and regulations governing apprenticeships (2007);
- The *Conseil Supérieur de l'Enseignement et de la Formation Professionnelle et Technique* (COSEFPT), was established in 2009;
- A National Tripartite Forum on VT and Apprenticeship was established.

On training delivery:

- The NGO *Nigetech*, (established in 2004 before the end of the *Nigetech* project) saw 100% of its costs supported by EC projects till the end of 2006; it remains in a context of fragility and has not fully developed its own entrepreneurial capacity;
- The NGO *Nigetech*, as the main training operator in phase 1 (85% share), developed a regional network of antennae and expertise. Other public and private providers have proved capable of implementing programmes for artisans and apprentices;
- Participants were trained on *formation continue and formation initiale professionnalisante* modules (16800 expected), apprentices were trained (expected 2520), artisans were upgraded (expected 10800 trained over 500 *jours d'information technologiques*), the unemployed (graduate, non-graduate, non-qualified) enrolled on VT (*formation professionnalisante*) and job insertion schemes (expected 1000). Five *NIGETECH* Documentation Centres have been transferred to new structures that are accessible to artisans, Public and private TVET providers have a repository for training modules, approved by the Office in charge of VT policy and Fund, more autonomy on income generation. Trainers from *NIGETECH* were qualified and their skills upgraded to train on modules (*perfectionnement, spécialisation, apprentissage renforcé et formation initiale professionnalisante*) and their qualification recognised (expected 100). The status and qualification of public VT trainers was reviewed;
- The FPCA system can count on a network of training providers, mostly consisting of the NGO *Nigetech*; it can also count on other private and private operators to be formally accredited by the FAFPCA.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)

- 3 main broad criteria **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF**

• **Relevance: A**

The programme is a relevant instrument of support for the socioeconomic development of the country (independent evaluation of 2011). All the main stakeholders have been fully involved in its design, formulation, implementation and monitoring and evaluation. The response to the growing demand of training by employers (artisans) and workers (apprentices), has been provided in continuity with the logic and the components of the projects *NIGETECH 1* and *2*, and has been considered as relevant to needs.

The increasing of artisans' incomes as a result of skills acquisition and the improvement of the quality of job insertion of trained apprentices that were indicated by the feasibility study undertaken by the ILO at the end of 2003 and throughout the project is confirmed as a general perception - but is not quantified.

The response to the national requirement to stabilise the VT system was the development of the legal and institutional framework, sectoral policy and funding mechanism.

Stakeholder participation was promoted through the establishment of the National Tripartite Forum and the involvement of the National Federation of Artisans as stakeholders of VT governance, through their participation in the board of the Office and the Fund as well as being training providers and direct recipients of support.

The *NIGETECH* training model has been stabilised because its flexibility meets the needs of both parties: artisans and apprentices. The technical and entrepreneurial component supports labour mobility among enterprises and encourages self-employment. The training programmes target the needs of the informal economy.

The modular training offer is built to provide the economically and socially disadvantaged a chance of entering and completing training; their costs are met by the Fund to handle potential conflicts between economic and social needs. The gender component is not explicitly mentioned.

The relevance of the programme to local needs is increased by the decentralisation of the VT system.

- **Effectiveness: B**

Data from the monitoring and internal evaluation system of the project, quality of the reporting by the ILO PMU, accessibility to the technical knowledge produced within the project, were all considered as not being immediately accessible or of expected quality by the external evaluator.

The technical quality of the training products developed under *NIGETECH 1* and *2*, further validated through 10 pilot programmes, has been maintained in both Phases. Participation in training has been quantitatively lower than that set forth by the Objectively Verifiable Indicators of the LogFrame (ROM 2009). The effectiveness of the project is more apparent in terms of its contribution and participation to the evolution of the Vocational Training and apprenticeship system (the establishment of the Ministry for VT and the sectoral policy); in the strengthening of the VT actors (Ministry, Fund, public and private providers); in the participation of the National Federation of the Artisans in VT governance, and a regional framework of Training Committees; the transformation of the ONAFOP into the new Fund and the competences of artisans and the basis of a modernised apprenticeship system.

The level of participation of employers and apprentices in the cost of training has not met expectations and has impacted upon the success of the programme. The Fund, in the presence of a regular funding mechanism which incorporates the state contribution with the contribution of the the employers and apprentices, is capable of managing and implementing training programmes throughout the country. The mechanism for policy formulation, institutional and management capacity at various levels is in place and further strengthened with the participation of the National Federation of Artisans and a tripartite platform of VT and Apprenticeship governance.

A pool of qualified administrators and instructors was set up and they are now available among both public and private providers, including the NGO - *Nigetech*. The incentives built in to improve the quality of outputs (training of trainers and enlarged offer of programmes, courses, material and equipment) have targeted almost exclusively the *Nigetech* NGO. The capacity of the project to achieve planned objectives and provide real benefits to the selected beneficiaries was more apparent on the qualitative rather than on the quantitative side, which was not foreseen in the risk analysis as a risk mitigation strategy. The effectiveness of the various institutions in placing graduates in training-related employment is supported by the workplace training component and the institutional involvement of the Public Employment Services (ANPE). The increase of artisans' productivity and income as well as the quality of jobs for apprentices is perceived as real but could not be quantified.

- **Efficiency: C**

The expected products were all delivered in accordance with the approved work plans. The project proved capable of adapting to the increasing request of the decentralisation of operations. The PMU lacked a methodology for the preliminary organisational analysis of the beneficiaries (Ministry, FAFPCA, FNAN, NGO *Nigetech*). The annual action plans which, although validated by the ILO, appeared like a 'point by point' declination of the Logframe and did not sufficiently into account the development of the beneficiaries' structures. The evaluation remarked that the quantitative indicators relating to the training delivery were not met. It also underlined the absence of accounting data concerning component 1, of institutional strengthening and it revealed a lengthy process of feedback and validation between the PMU and the headquarter services of the implementing partner.

- **Coherence: A**

The Commission's support to the development of VT and apprenticeship in Niger has followed a coherent course throughout *NIGETECH 1* and *2* and phases 1 and 2 of the current project. The VT system required a national policy, the institutionalisation of a strong national operator for the management of training programmes - NGO *Nigetech*; it also required a clear funding mechanism and incorporation within the Vocational Training System. The continuity of the ILO's Technical Assistance throughout the project PMU ensured internal coherence in terms of management practices and modalities as well as external coherence in terms of tripartite and social dialogue in the VT system's governance.

- **Quality of the Design: B**

The programme design is an extension of *NIGETECH* projects 1 and 2; it therefore concentrates on the institutional framework that strengthens the central position of the Fund (FAFPCA), on the support to continuous VT and apprenticeships for the enterprises of the craft sector (artisans). The creation of the the NGO *Nigetech* (and especially its entrepreneurial development) were a cornerstone of the programme's design. The quality of the formulation documentation is satisfactory.

• **Impact: B**

The evaluation of the training actions under component 2 revealed that the VT mechanism was open to the participation of other operators; the apprenticeship was reinforced but not the alternance training. The capacity of FAFPCA to launch calls for proposals and contract training actions was set up; the Regional Apprenticeship Committees attracted a pool of regional actors. Under the implementation of Phase 2, it has not been possible to build a structured link between supply and demand. The strengthening of training providers other than NGO *Nigetech*, in terms of operational capacity, materials and equipment was not entirely achieved.

Regarding the beneficiaries, though universally perceived as needed and useful, the increase of artisan productivity and income and the quality of job insertion by the apprentices could not be quantified. The 2003 evaluation remarked that although the technical training was good, graduates faced problems when they entered their profession and thus recommended that there be courses on business management to complement vocational training.

MSE owners' perceptions of their contribution to the Fund as a government intervention to increase tax revenues from the small business sector was overcome through the participation of the National Federation of Artisans in the VT mechanism, the Fund, the National Tripartite Forum and the delivery of training programmes in the regions.

The Government adopted new legislation on apprenticeship training and lifelong learning in 2006 and foresaw its implementation under the supervision of a Tripartite Forum bringing together all concerned stakeholders.

• **Sustainability: B**

The NGO *Nigetech* was established in late 2004 (before the end of the project *NIGETECH*) and provided up to 85% of the training under Phase 1, but had to be financially supported (100% of its costs) by the project till the end of 2006. Support included capacity building and technical assistance on cost accounting and financial management.

The key elements of sustainability are identified as the embedding of the Project in a final legal framework, developed with the support of the three EC interventions in Niger. Other elements of sustainability identified at the end of the programme are: institutional management capacity at central and decentralised level; the economic and financial viability of the Fund's financial mechanisms based on a substantive contribution from the national budget to be incorporated by the entrepreneurs and the apprentices; the development of national qualifications for trainers and qualifications related to national occupations for the trainees; the extension of the project's geographical coverage; the presence of more public and private training providers and the participation of social partners in the VT system, from policy-making to delivery and funding and the inclusion of disadvantaged groups.

• **Added value of ETF: N/A**

4.3. Beneficiaries Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

Direct recipients: Ministry of Planning: administration. Ministry of VT (MFPT), the Fund (FAFPCA), National Federation of Artisans (FNAN) the NGO - *Nigetech* as an implementing body.

Final beneficiaries: artisans, apprentices and micro-entrepreneurs and to facilitate the insertion of candidate micro-entrepreneurs into income generating activities.

Implementing partner for Component 1: ILO.

Implementing partner for the Component 2: the NGO - *Nigetech*.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The *Programme d'appui à la formation professionnelle et à l'apprentissage* (PFPCA) in Niger started in April 2005, and closed in June 2010. Funded under the 9th EDF, it is an extension of the projects *NIGETECH 1* (1995-2000) and *NIGETECH 2* (2000-2004). The 'owner' of the programme was the Ministry of Economy and Finance and the EDF National Authorising Officer; the technical counterpart was the Ministry in charge of training. The general architecture of the programme was, for both phases, built on two components: C1, 'institutional' implemented by the ILO (direct contribution agreement) to support the actors (Ministry FAFPCA, FNAN NGO-NIGETECH) and the institutional embedding of the VT mechanism; C2 'operational' implementation, the Fund (FAFPCA ex-ONAFOP) to support continuous VT and apprenticeships for the priority target populations.

The Budget of EUR 7 000 000 was divided between Phase 1 (80%) and Phase 2 (20%) to support a progressive autonomy of the VT and apprenticeship FPC and learning in Niger.

<p>6. Key elements of success</p>	<p>What were the critical elements that contributed to “scalability”? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?</p>
<p>The flexibility and diversification of the training offer; the strengthening of training providers; the dialogue with key stakeholders; the establishment and the decentralisation of the governance mechanism; the funding mechanism and the active participation of the users (enterprises) and end users (trainees) are the main elements for scalability.</p>	
<p>7. Lessons learned</p>	<p>Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.</p>
<p>The EC’s intervention, phased through <i>NIGETCH 1</i> and <i>2</i> and <i>Appui</i> Phases 1 and 2 has achieved the introduction of a training model; the stabilisation of the legal and policy framework; a system for VT and Apprenticeships; a funding mechanism; an active participation of stakeholders and beneficiaries; reaching out to disadvantaged groups (economic and social demand); elements of internal quality and efficiency of delivery and governance and financing. The existence of an institutional framework, the role of the Ministry that took over the Pilot Actions, the capacity and role of the Fund, the presence of private and public providers within a decentralised context of governance and delivery indicates that future support should consider: the national programme of Skills Development as part of the national HD policy, aiming at a coherent system related to employment and integrated within the socioeconomic policy of the country.</p> <p>The Skills Development system should include technical education, continuous vocational training, training at workplaces (in alternance and through apprenticeship), addressing the productive sectors of the formal and informal economies, supporting job insertion and transition to work and promoting the inclusion of vulnerable groups – from a holistic perspective.</p> <p>New areas of intervention could certainly target specific aspects of the system, from the analysis of labour markets, skills forecasting by sectors, the structured participation of the social partners and key stakeholders, the regional decentralisation of the system in terms of governance, resources, delivery and public-private partnerships of VT providers and MSMEs.</p> <p>On the financial mechanism, further support could stabilise the contribution to the Fund (fiscal levy) and allocation of national resources for accredited training providers. Technical cooperation on TVET in Niger would be more effective if it would target specific aspects, within the coherent national framework the previous projects have contributed to establishing; this would be achieved in coordination with other donors and development partners, under the supervision of national TVET authorities determined to implement a national strategy encompassing priorities and intervention areas that require national and international resources.</p>	
<p>8. Implementation partners</p>	<p>Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.</p>
<p>Ministry of Planning. Ministry of National Education, the DETFP (<i>Direction Nationale du Ministère de l’Education charge de la FP</i>) the ONAFOP and the Fund (<i>Fonds National pour l’Apprentissage, l’Enseignement Technique, la Formation et le Perfectionnement Professionnels</i>).</p> <p>The EC funded the project <i>Systèmes ruraux et micro entreprises d’artisanat SYRENE</i> Aug. 2003 Aug. 2006 to create greater opportunities for women and men to secure decent employment and income. The International Labour Organization (<i>Le travail des enfants au Niger 2000-2007</i>).</p> <p><i>Agence Francaise de Developpement (AFD).</i> <i>La Coopération Luxembourgeoise.</i></p>	
<p>9. Contacts:</p>	<p>Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail</p> <p>Ministries of Economy and Finance, <i>Ministère de la Formation Professionnelle et Technique</i>, FNAN, EU Delegation to Niger in Niamey.</p>
<p>10. Sources, links and publications</p>	<p>Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)</p>

Financing Agreement Phase 1.
ILO Evaluation Summary November 2011.
Financial Agreement Phase 2.
ROM phase 2 November 2009.
Final Evaluations: 2005-7 and 2008-10.

DOMINICAN REPUBLIC

Project title: Supporting Development of Technical and Professional Education (TPE) *Apoyo al Desarrollo de la Educación Técnico Profesional en la República Dominicana (ProETP)*

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: C
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: B
7. Sustainability: C
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

The Dominican education system is composed of the following: The Ministry of Education (*SEE Secretaría de Estado de Educación*) (General Education Law 66-97); the Ministry of Higher Education, Science and Technology (*Secretaría de Estado de Educación Superior, Ciencia y Tecnología*) (Law 139-01); the National Institute of Professional and Technical Training (*Instituto Nacional de Formación Técnico Profesional*) (Law 116-80).

The Dominican education system comprises pre-primary, primary, secondary and university levels. Secondary learning lasts four years and is intended for the 14-18 age cohort. Access to this level requires the completion of primary education. According to the General Education Law, secondary education is free, but not compulsory. It is designed to deliver the tools to strengthen and deepen knowledge, values, aptitudes, and vocational interests acquired in primary education and provide access to higher learning as well as to further training for the labour market. Secondary education offers general education courses to ensure that all students have access to comprehensive education. It is composed of two cycles - each lasting two years. The first cycle offers general and compulsory education, while the second has three strands: general, vocational/technical, arts, each offering different options within a flexible curriculum that facilitates transition from one mode to another. Arts and vocational/technical education provide a range of options.

Vocational-technical education, as its name indicates, prepares students for entry into qualified professions at the secondary level or for social or productive activities. Vocational/technical education attempts to prepare students for qualified professions at the secondary level or for social or productive activities and focuses on the main sectors of the Dominican economy, which consists of industry, agriculture, and services. It provides two options: one post-basic which lasts a year, called 'Basic Technician', and the principal one, which is the Technical Baccaalaureate, of two years programme. The institutions providing such education are usually called polytechnic institutes.

Professional/Technical Education is on average taught over two years and includes modular training, combined with general education and training for employability and entrepreneurial culture or IT. It is taught in schools and lyceums called polytechnics. The Vocational Education medium has experienced modest quantitative growth in recent years. Compared with other countries, in the Dominican Republic, the technical secondary enrollment ratio is low, because only 9% corresponds to the Professional Technical Education mode (Technical Baccaalaureat) with respect to the total enrollment of the second level. The focus on vocational-technical professions greatly helps the economy, which is based on the service sector. By offering training and education to bolster specific jobs, the Dominican people can enhance their pool of workers and focus on attracting investors and jobs that their people are prepared for. The Higher Technician level is taught in schools with a Higher Institute category. Some universities offer undergraduate programmes. The National Council for Higher Education regulates the universities.

Along with the education levels described above, the Dominican education system has two sub-systems: special needs, and adult education. Special needs education is designed to provide children with special needs or physical disabilities with the necessary level of specialisation. Adult education covers literacy and primary programmes as well as secondary education over a four-year period, along

with professional training. In addition, vocational/work-related education is part of the sub-system of adult learning and provides educational opportunities to those interested in developing skills that will lead them into the labour market.

The National Institute of Professional and Technical Training (INFOTEP) has the task of training human resources for national production as well as professional and technical training and entrepreneurial advice. This is an autonomous, self-funding entity that offers non-profit services by a group of private and public training entities of which INFOTEP and the Operative Systems Centres (COS) are a part.

1. Identification	Cris decision number: 14901 (2000/014-901: DEC1- 14901) 11330 - Vocational training. 8 ACP DO 019 Project approach. Project managed by the Delegation (devolved)
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Are	TP-TVET policy and systems
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	8 ^o EDF - European Development Fund
c) By region	ACP: Caribbean DOMINICAN REPUBLIC
d) By Period and Status	Start Date planned: 01/07/2001 – Actual: 08/03/2002 End date planned: 2007. Actual: 08/03/2008 Status: Closed
3. Financial data	Primary commitment EUR 14 950 000.00. Secondary commitment EUR 13 526 479.00. Other funds EUR 2 634 000.00. Total budget EUR 17 584 000.00 Total EC disbursed amount (2009) EUR 13 286 055 (75.5% of total) Final: 13 406 482.27
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project? The overall objective is to contribute to the economic and social development of the Dominican Republic by increasing productivity and technological change, which in turn will forge the conditions for promoting competitiveness, investment and employment. In the scope of the 'General Law on Education' and the corresponding 'Plan for the Development of Education', the project's purpose is to improve capacity in Technical and Professional Education (TPE) in conformity with the market and social demands, through the enhancement of relevance and ownership, access and equity, quality and efficiency The <u>core elements</u> of the project are: 1) TPE needs to conform to the country's economic development and the requirements of the economic and social agents; school-business links must be reinforced; 2) education curricula and facilities need to be flexible to adapt to technological changes; 3) a more efficient management and response to demand will be achieved by decentralising capacity and empowering the management of the polytechnic centres; 4) more even access to TPE centres and to specialisation should be achieved, particularly for women; 5) progress should
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<p>Education reform is a priority of the Dominican Republic in response to globalisation and the demands of the knowledge society. With the decline of traditional economic sectors such as sugar and mining, the rise of tourism, entry into the World Trade Organisation (1995) and the Central American Free Trade Agreement (CAFTA), there is recognition that education is crucial to the sustainable development of the country. Education reforms, training and human resource development are integral parts of a market economy. The Dominican Republic has made progress in all these areas since reforms began in the 1990s. The challenge for the State Secretariat for Education (SEE), the State Secretariat for Higher Education, Science and Technology (SEECyT) and the National Institute for Technical-Vocational Training (INFOTEP) has been to promote and support changes that meet the needs of both the new economy and society and the interests of all young people and adults, in the face of a shortage of financial and human resources.</p> <p>The economically active population in the Dominican Republic is mostly composed of unqualified</p>	

workers in the services and factory sectors. The labour force of the Dominican Republic is not only unqualified, but also undereducated. About 8% have no schooling whatsoever while more than 70% have some primary and secondary education; even fewer have completed higher education. Of the 70% that has some level of education, the highest level of unemployment concerned those who only had primary school education; the average was 46.1% for men and 42.5% for women. During 2000-2004, about 83.9% of men employed were working in various jobs. The breakdown of that group appeared as follows: factory workers and artisans (20.7%), non-qualified workers (19.1%), qualified agricultural workers and farmers (14.9%), machine operators (14.8%), and service providers (14.4%). Women on the other hand were employed at a rate of approximately 64.6%, with the breakdown as follows: services sector (27.9%), non-qualified workers (23.1%), or office clerks (13.6%). A non-qualified worker is one that has no or little training and/or qualifications for their position. The women working in the service sector were employed as sales personnel, beauticians, waitresses and domestic personnel. From such a percentage and breakdown of the work force, it is apparent that women continue to enter into fields of work that are regarded as 'women's work', while men take on jobs that are seen as 'tougher'. Nonetheless, the number of women working in managerial positions and professional jobs has increased from 2.6% to 2.8% for the former and from 8.6% to 9.9% for the latter. For their male counterparts, the change has been negative with men decreasing from 3% to 2.8% in managerial and administrative posts and from 4.6% to 4.7% for professional positions.

To better understand the potential for each sector, it is important to realise that during 2000-2004, 69.5% of all male workers were involved in agriculture and cattle-breeding, whereas 15.3% of males were involved in other services. 78.6% of all female employees worked in other services: work in manufacturing, wholesale and the retail trade.

Such figures imply that a large level of work takes place in sectors where education (post secondary education), can be seen as unnecessary (especially for men). It comes as no surprise that such a large portion of the Dominican Republic's labor force has only primary and some secondary education (70%). Reviews of national education policies explain that for the 2000-2004 period, the majority of workers had completed their primary education (51.8% of men and 38,2% of women). The the highest levels of unemployment affect males and females with primary schooling only, standing at 46.1% and 42.5% respectively. A comparison by gender reveals that the number of educated females is higher than that of males, both at secondary and tertiary levels. It would seem that despite initially being less educated than their male counterparts, women have made gains in education and the workforce and are moving towards more professional mobility.

In 2000, the illiteracy rate was 22%, coverage of the Basic education was 84%, the repetition rate of courses was 16% and 10% were dropouts. Technical and Professional Education (ETP) made up 7.8% of all enrollments (27 656 of 381 751 in 1998-99). The lack of a coherent policy with ETP left a very dependent structure that was bureaucratic, centralised and inefficient with limited budgetary resources, lacking trained personnel and obsolete equipment. Much of the polytechnics lacked adequate infrastructure and teachers had not updated the training and education programmes that were largely outdated and not in line with labour market needs.

The ETP system was outdated and did not respond to the social and business demands of the moment. The Dominican economy was facing severe limitations to remain competitive in the global market. One such limitation was the lack of trained human resources. Professional Technical Education (PTE) was based on weak institutional structures and highly centralised; it did not have a coherent strategy or sufficient financial resources, trained personnel and technical equipment. ETP also kept little contact with its 'customers' - employers - to identify the needs of the private sector and take this into account in the identification of new professional profiles and the development of curricula. All this was reflected in a low level of education and a bad reputation among students and employers. The ETP graduates encountered difficulties in finding jobs, despite economic growth.

4.2. Result of the project

- Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)

The programme takes a comprehensive approach to developing and consolidating the reform of the ETP Formal Education Medium, which is reflected in the four pillars of the programme:

1. Institutional strengthening of the appropriate government authority, the Directorate General of

Technical Education (DGETP);

2. Advising the development of a Strategy for Technical and Vocational Education;

3. Support for the introduction of new curricula and revision of existing ETP curricula;

4. Counseling, training and equipment for a group of schools in the ETP selected by the programme.

The crosscutting approach of these pillars links up with the private sector, both at the level of the Direction General of TPE (DGETP), as well as that of the technical schools.

PRO-ETP prompted a major renovation of teaching and provided a more positive image of the ETP. The DGTEP was considerably fortified, but the lack of autonomy and adequate resources, bureaucratic and institutional context, limited their ability to carry out a comprehensive reform of the ETP. In particular, the DGTEP failed to extend teaching and monitor changes promoted by PRO-ETP (i.e. the EBC and specialty competency framework modernised and approved) or to manage their results in terms of human resources (initial and continuous training, motivation of teachers). The lack of teacher training was well addressed by the project, but the fact that it only applied to certain centers and some specialties of Professional and Technical Education, did not enable the project to achieve its goals.

Actual results for ProETP became clear once the project ended. The curriculum reform resulted in the *Ordinance 2'2010* with new high schools adopting a competency-based approach. The centres were provided with improved equipment and ETP was endowed with an attractive image.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)

- 3 main broad criteria **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF**

• **Relevance: A**

The programme was highly relevant and pertinent to the country's needs. The Dominican economy has grown in recent years at an average rate close to double digits; however, a large informal sector has remained, high rates of unemployment - particularly among the young population - and a relative lack of competitiveness has caused, among other factors, deficiencies in human resource qualifications. The Technical and Professional Education system lacked a coherent development strategy, the campuses had inadequate infrastructure, teachers had not updated their training and academic programmes were outdated and not adjusted to the needs of the labour market. The ETP sub-system's students represent less than 10% of total students.

• **Effectiveness: B**

The activities were aimed at the identified beneficiaries, impacting significantly on the four outcomes, but the specific objective of reforming the ETP to achieve better adaptation to social and market demands was only partially successful. Nevertheless, the programme led the way to improvements. As a pilot, the programme was meant to be tested only in a small proportion of the centers and transform the entire sector.

• **Efficiency: C**

The programme's start was delayed by more than six months; subsequently, it could not be completed on schedule and thus required an addendum that extended the project's duration and increased the original budget by EUR 1.7 000 000. The Management Technical Unit (UTG) consisted of eight people including four technicians and four administrative staff. However, due to unforeseen factors, delays were encountered as infrastructure works became more expensive (+30%).

Investments in workshop equipment and some infrastructure were not entirely suitable. Some equipments were very expensive and others were underutilised. Many infrastructure construction defects were confronted such as cracks and leaks that damaged equipment and facilities acquired by the programme.

• **Coherence: A**

ProETP is coherent with with General Education Law 66-97, the Strategic Education Development Plan of the Dominican Republic for 2003-2012 (EFA Framework for Action) and the Millennium Development Goals.

Among the ten key policies formulated, there is coherence with: promoting the reform, the strengthening and expansion of secondary and adult education in order to foster values of citizenship and to prepare students for their entry into the workplace or into higher education; giving priority to the training of highly-qualified human resources and promoting professional development and the preservation of the teaching staff; periodically reviewing the curricula to meet the needs of the social,

political and economic development of the Dominican Republic and international education standards.

- **Quality of the Design: B**

The Logical Framework was well constructed and had a rational and logical structure. However, the overall objective was very ambitious in terms of the second result, which was the decentralization of the General Directorate of Technical Education (DGETP). This objective exceeded the capacity of the programme itself, since it was only possible by modifying the Education Act through a process in Congress. The performance indicators and specific objectives were objectively verifiable, but the general objective was not formulated in a measurable way. For the baseline, there were too many assumptions and some of them were wrong and did not correspond to the programme's external factors.

- **Impact: B**

The general objective of contributing to economic and social development of the Dominican Republic, to increase productivity and technological changes was very ambitious and beyond the scope of the programme. In addition, the project's closure did not have an exit strategy or a plan of continuity and consolidation of the process, which weakened and downplayed impact. Students from ETP system establishments benefited from the programme and received a better education; however, it constituted a limited effort to make an impact upon a national productive sector. An important contribution of the programme in other educational sectors was the **introduction of the concept of Competency-Based Education (EBC)**, which was taken and incorporated into the Ten-Year Education Plan, in Higher Education and the INFOTEP. The support for the introduction of new curricula and the revision of existing ETP curricula led to the *Ordenanza 02'2010*.

- **Sustainability: C**

The project contributed to certain policy issues in a sustainable way but maintenance problems threatened the viability of some investments. The programme worked with 12 out of 70 existing establishments, yet achieved major changes and met ETP reform needs. Today it is recognised that the sector can and must be different from the experience of the programme. The DGETP and technical and administrative staff of the polytechnics selected have an acute awareness of the need for change and reform. Others who did not benefit but were aware of the results of the programme are also aware of the need for change. The factors that constrain the continuity and expansion of the actions are limiting the level of economic and operational dependence of the ETP system on the administrative structure of the Ministry of Education. In addition, a factor that threatens sustainability is the absence of policies for purchased equipment maintenance, which can lead to damage and render it obsolete quickly. In addition, some of the equipment inputs or parts were very expensive and hard to find in the region.

- **Added value of ETF** – N/A

4.3. Beneficiaries Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

Ministry of Education.

Centres of technical professional education. Students, teachers, society at large.

INFOTEP.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The macroeconomic equilibrium and the favourable economic cycle in the Dominican Republic revealed vulnerable to external fluctuations, changes in internal policies and relatively low competitiveness of the economy. The driving forces of economic growth - tourism, construction, telecommunications and manufacturing in Free-Trade Zones - started to be faced with severe constraints for sustaining competitiveness. Low levels of productivity and added value productions are due, among others, to the absence of skilled manpower and of a technological productive environment.

Technical and Professional Education (TPE in English, ETP in Spanish) in the Dominican Republic was very weak and over-centralised, lacking a coherent policy and strategies, resources, managerial capacity, skilled staff and all sorts of equipment. Furthermore, formal TPE has little or no links with the employers and workers organisations, for the definition and planning of curricula and career development. All this is reflected in low standards of training and a poor image of TPE amongst students and employers. TPE graduates have difficulty in finding jobs, even in a fast growth cycle..The National Indicative Programme of the 8th EDF provided support to the reform and democratisation of the education system and the reinforcement of competitiveness. In view of the stated problems, the

project was identified with the aim of assisting the Dominican Government to improve capacity in Technical and Professional Education (TPE). The main features of the project concept were:

- TPE needs to conform to the country's development process and the requirements of the economic and social agents; school-business links must be reinforced;
- Education curricula and facilities need to be flexible to adapt to technological changes;
- A more efficient management and response to demand will be achieved by decentralising capacity and empowering the management of the polytechnic centres;
- More even access to TPE centres and to specialisation should be achieved, particularly for women;
- Progress should be made in promoting employment, training for self-employment and the follow-up of graduates.

Project execution during 5 years included two interdependent phases entailing compliance with the reform purposes, Government commitments and project intermediary results. The overall budget of the project was EUR 15 384 000 of which the EDF is to contribute EUR 13 250 000 and the Government of the Dominican Republic EUR 2 134 000.

The problems in capacity of the formal system of technical professional education were clearly diagnosed by the PRO-ETP. This five-year project, which began in 2002 and ended in early 2007, provided Technical Assistance and support to strengthening the formal technical-professional system. It worked in close coordination with and supported the Technical and Professional General Directorate (DGTEP) of the Ministry of Education. The major components of the programme are to define a new strategy for the development of technical professional education; transform the curriculum; improve equipment in workshops and laboratories; train teachers; strengthen the basic institutions and the various technical professional centres throughout the country and to strengthen links with the productive sector and society in general. The EC-funded PRO-ETP project focused on updating the curriculum for selected middle-level technical-professional programmes. The outcomes were the *Ordenanza 2'2010* establishing 32 new curricula.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

The holistic approach (development of the Strategy of Education to strengthen and support DGTEP selected centers) is the main strength of the project's design. However, bureaucracy and administration of the Dominican DGTEP and its dependency on the Ministry of Education hindered its success. The shortage of Technical Assistance reduced the project's impact.

The selected centers established much closer links between the formal education system and professional technical and regional employers (INFOTEP). The project was, despite its limitations, a pilot in the modernisation and reform of ETP in the country.

The PRO-ETP project was also in the process of developing a National Qualifications Framework (NQF) drawing upon models from other countries. Such a framework could provide an important means to strengthen communication between employers and the education system as well as to raise expectations regarding the competencies that students must have for both employment and further education. The OECD study team did not determine (at the time of the review) the level of commitment within the SEE to sustain the initiatives of the PRO-ETP project after its completion in 2007. In particular, drawing on the work of this project, the Dominican Republic could:

- Develop a NQF, to provide guidance for the whole education system and not only technical and professional education;
- Strengthen the links between formal technical and professional education and both employers and the informal training capacity of INFOTEP;
- Use the pilot centres as a model for strengthening regional coordination between formal technical professional education, INFOTEP and regional employers and economic development;

Strengthen national coordination, especially between INFOTEP, Ministry of Education (SEE) and the Ministry of Higher Education Science and Technology (SEECyT). Nowhere in the Country Background Report or in the priority statements of the Government is there a mention of the need for a closer relationship between these units in a coordinated effort to strengthen the country's capacity to meet changing labour market needs.

7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.
<p>The logical framework was clear but too ambitious for the project. In particular, result 2 (R2) as part of 'reform and decentralisation of the General Directorate of Technical Education (DGETP)' fell outside the scope of the project, which consequently reduced the ability and success of R1 on 'definition of the strategy and policy for Technical Education (ETP)' for lack of a legal and administrative framework and adequate resources.</p> <p>Such projects require a diagnosis of PTSD needs and competencies to update and to harmonise the demand for skilled resources for the business sector with the offer of study and training centers. This must constitute the baseline upon which development support is grounded; this was not done with PRO-ETP.</p> <p>It was necessary to develop an integrated strategy for the ETP that was agreed upon with all stakeholders (including those outside the SEE such as as INFOTEP and SEESCYT), for the design and implementation of the most appropriate institutional context; their coordination was necessary to develop a strategy, work plan and schools budget conversion of general education in polytechnics. Ensure that programmes and projects that include the procurement of equipment with EDF financing contain maintenance policies to ensure the sustainability of the equipment purchased.</p>	
8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
Ministry of Education Technical and Professional General Directorate (DGETP).	
9. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail
<p>Technical and Professional General Directorate (DGETP) - Mercedes María Matríllé Lajara. Calle Club Rotará esq. Luís F. García. Ensanche La Fé Santo Domingo, República Dominicana. Tel. 809.565-4007; info@dgetp.edu.do http://www.dgetp.edu.do/</p>	
10. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)
<p>Documentation provided by DEVCO:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Financial Agreement 24/07/2000; • MR-01332.01 - 27/05/05; • Synthesis; • Results Oriented Monitoring, ongoing 18/05/2007; • Results Oriented Monitoring, expost 19/06/2009; • 14901_Rep_dom_ROM_1_2_3.doc (2nd tranche). <p>Other documentation: Curriculum provided by the DETP of the Dominican Republic. Reviews of National Policies for Education - Dominican Republic, OECD, 2008. - http://www.oecd.org/edu/school/reviewsofnationalpoliciesforeducation-dominicanrepublic.htm/ - Educational Reform in the Dominican Republic. Washington And Lee University. Grace Andrews 4/18/2009.</p>	

GUYANA
Project title: Guyana Training Agency

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: B
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: B
7. Sustainability: D
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance.

The two main public bodies in charge of TVET in Guyana are the Ministry of Education (Department for Technical and Vocational Education and Training) and the Ministry of Labour (Board of Industrial Training (BIT)).

The TVET institutions are committed to offering education and training to youths and adults in technical, commercial and scientific fields relevant to the needs of the national economy.

In addition, the TVET institutions have a responsibility to collaborate with industry and commerce in the planning of programmes, which will facilitate the acquisition of appropriate knowledge, skills, attitudes and values necessary for the development of individuals and the nation.

The TVET Bill was promulgated in Parliament on 22nd July 2004. The passage of the legislation was seen as a major policy initiative that would pave the way for the restructuring and further development of the system. The objective was to modernise the system and improve the quality of the delivery of the various TVET programmes that are offered at the post-secondary institutions and the pre-vocational education system.

The Ministry of Education is also implementing new competency-based modularised curricula at the post-secondary institutions for the training of craftsman (Level Two competency).

At the secondary level, there is also the introduction of the Basic Certificate Competency Programme (BCCP), which is aimed at introducing basic labour competencies into the secondary school curricula for form 4 or grade ten students who would be certified at Level One competency.

National Vocational Qualifications are ensured in close collaboration with the TVET institutions under the Ministry of Education. Where apprenticeship schemes do not have the facilities for adequate classroom delivery, apprentices attend the TVET institutions on a part time basis, as part of the preparation for the Guyana Technical Education Examination (GTEE). The latter is considered as a National Vocational Qualification (NVQ). The GTEE is administered by an independent entity within the Ministry of Education.

Within TVET institutions, students undergo periodic internal examinations and practical/laboratory tests.

For apprenticeship schemes, occupational standards agreed on between the BIT and industry are utilised for the periodic assessment of apprentices and include written and practical tests.

1. Identification	14864
Cris decision number	Project Number: 8 ACP GUA 8
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Area	Sector/Subsector: 11330 – Vocational Training LS- Active Labour Market policy and Measures
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DEVCO. DCI: Single Country/National Project 8 th EDF resources
c) By region	African, Caribbean and Pacific (ACP-CARIBBEAN) GUYANA
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: 2000 Status: Closed Financing Agreement signed: 30/06/00. Start date: 31/12/00. End date – planned /likely: 31/07/2014. Ongoing

3. Financial data	
EDF Primary commitment (project budget): EUR 1 795 000 (EC 1 328 342.72) 74% of total Secondary Commitment (funds contracted): EUR 1 076 000	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
<p>Overall Objective: Restore and improve the productive capacity of Guyana Project purpose: Competence of workforce enhanced Objectives of the Guyana Training Agency All training is demand-oriented, with the demand originating in the Guyanese productive sector or services. Training will be conducted in enterprises, except when more efficient otherwise. The Training Agency must:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Identify those companies with particular capacity to house training in a specific area and establish all contractual arrangements for course provision; • Support the process by designing or procuring course contents and providing instructor upgrading, together with training materials and equipment, if necessary; monitor and evaluate the courses and organise examinations, certification and accreditation; • Assist the companies in the formulation of their training needs and carry out training needs analysis, to complement the demand expressed by the companies; • Be a lean institution, capable of designing and organising flexible, ad hoc training in such timing as to be compatible with the companies' production requirements; • Work with a pool of external resource persons, which will actually carry out the training activities. 	
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/ programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<p>The Government of Guyana (GoG) was implementing a structural adjustment programme focusing on a reduction of the state's role in economic activity, the rehabilitation of national infrastructure and enhancement of the regulatory framework within which the private sector operates. Major reforms pursued in this last area refer to the revision of the Companies' Act, the financial and banking sector, the public sector, and the fiscal regime.</p> <p>Improvement in quality of production is a <i>sine qua non</i> condition for competitiveness in the international market. For the development of efficient private enterprises, able to compete on domestic and international markets, other factors and training in particular are decisive, in addition to an enabling policy and legal environment.</p> <p>The private sector organisations in Guyana identified a lack of skilled human resources as one of the most crucial factors hindering improvement of the country's productive capacity, which is still insufficiently addressed by GoG or donor activities.</p> <p>The Technical/Vocational training sector in Guyana is characterised by a lack of capacity to produce skilled workers adapted to the needs of modern production units. The existing public institutions are ill equipped and badly staffed; delivering training based on outdated curricula are seen as little more than poor alternative options for school drop-outs. A few proprietor-training schemes are run by large corporations, such as the Gyusuco training facility, but they only cater for their own needs. The GoG's education policy encourages the involvement of the private sector in technical and vocational training. In order to address these problems the Guyana Training Agency project was developed. Its main component is the creation of a Training Agency, which will identify and enable training companies, facilitate qualification of instructional personnel; design courses based on identified needs and improve in-house training facilities at plants, industries and commercial outfits.</p>	
4.2. Result of the project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)
<p>Between 1996 and 1998, the EC supported the establishment of a Private Sector Centre to provide information and advice for small and medium enterprises. The Centre was well planned and well resourced. It employed an expatriate Technical Assistant and two well-qualified professional Guyanese nationals. The Centre was used by many small enterprises in Guyana. By 2003, there was little sign that the Private Sector Centre ever existed. The resource centre had not been updated; the expatriate TA left Guyana and the two Guyanese professional staff emigrated. The fate of the Centre should provide a stimulus for the PSC and its four training institutions to consider their longer term sustainability through a process of greater collaboration and possible integration. The Monitoring</p>	

Reportss report attempted to show that integration is both possible and desirable. The creation of a physical training facility was seen as the first stage of bringing PSC training organisations closer together to achieve synergy and economies of scale in their work, and in so doing, enhancing their chances of sustainability. The task of bringing Consultative Association of Guyanese Industry (CAGI) (or at least its management training work) into the Technical Service Unit fold is an important one. The motivation and will of the PSC in doing so will be a positive indication of its capacity to deal more generally with the fragmented nature of private sector representation in Guyana.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria

- 3 main broad criteria **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF**

• **Relevance: B**

The project is well designed and the purpose and objective of delivering demand-driven and company-based training is very relevant. The original assumption that Guyana will have a positive economical and political climate has failed and the existing depressed economic environment is a challenge. There is a relatively low level of readiness to invest in staff upgrading. The GTA appears to be well geared towards applying an innovative approach to a changing economic environment and thereby meet the decreasing response from the companies.

The GTA was a fully established training institution integrated in the PSC. The nature of the training institute as a Private Sector Institution with contributing companies as members has ensured a strong sentiment of ownership. Activities were demand-driven and the needs are derived and described through client contact.

A board of directors, composed of 3 private sector members and 2 Government of Guyana representatives, heads the Agency. A national director seconded by an international project coordinator manages the GTA. A number of national employees are being trained in the Agency; from a managerial and technical perspective, the national staff will eventually be able to manage the Agency. There was a strong commitment in GTA to decrease its dependence on donor support and it is foreseen that a certain level of financial sustainability can be achieved. Some contribution from the Government and/or the private sector was necessary. Demand-driven technical training is expensive and even with the expected number of contributing members and training fees, the Agency will not be able to fully cover its training as well as its running costs. The level of financial sustainability will also be highly dependent on the number of contributing members in the GTA, which again is dependent on the general economic situation.

• **Effectiveness: B**

After a difficult start, the project was effective with a professional set-up, where a close and outgoing relationship with the companies created a positive attitude towards the GTA and its training strategy. The demand-driven approach was based on dialogue between the GTA and the companies. The competency-based training was designed following a training needs assessment. Companies were involved in describing and prioritising their individual training needs and in most cases the training took place at their premises. The involved companies saw the training as a useful and necessary input. The individuals involved in the training improved their status and competencies in their companies. GTA was effective in training local instructors, who besides improving their professional careers, could be a useful resource for other projects/institutions. The GTA project contributed to general competence strengthening in the private sector and it is expected that it could serve as a model for existing public training institutions.

• **Efficiency: B**

The project had a difficult start-up and project implementation was delayed due to both poor preparation and the late arrival of the Technical Assistance and delays in the physical set-up and recruitment of national staff for the Agency; the inputs were able to create the expected progress and to ensure a professional management component; only in January this year was the project fully staffed and equipped and ready to start up. A full-time National Director with an International Project Coordinator as a counterpart managed the project. The project has performed efficiently and started a number of activities. The strategy of providing training based on individual needs assessments produced a number of encouraging results. National Instructors were upgraded. The close relationship

with the Private Sector Commission (PSC) combined with an outgoing implementation strategy managed to create an efficient, competent and flexible training agency. The project monitored activities by means of a well-designed evaluation system, which - once fully implemented - was a source of useful data. A membership system was introduced; so far only a limited number of companies have enrolled and the project is actively trying to persuade more parties to participate.

- **Coherence: B**

The Guyana Training Agency Representatives of the Guyanese private sector identified the lack of skilled human resources as the second most important factor hindering the improvement of the country's productive capacity, the first one being the cost of and access to capital. Most technicians employed by private and public enterprises require an upgrading of their skills. The quality of student output from the existing training institutions is poor. In addition, migration drains the country of its scarce human resources.

- **Quality of the Design: B**

The project's logframe (LFM), revised in December 2001, is a well-prepared document and serves as a good management tool. There is an acknowledged need for improving production efficiency and the GTA is meeting needs by offering a flexible and well-designed training environment.

- **Impact: B**

The involved companies acknowledge the impact of focused, individual-designed training. The GTA successfully conducted a number of company training needs assessments in selected areas. The involved companies were satisfied with the training and it is expected that results will have a positive impact on employee performance and production. The involved companies could confirm a positive trend. The general low level of readiness to invest in training and upgrading presented a risk for the project and it was difficult to persuade new companies to enroll as members. In general, the private sector is well organised and coordinated. Training activities took place on several levels - public or private.

- **Sustainability: D**

Central to the challenge of sustainability is the position of the GTA. The GTA is perceived as an organisation that has solved many technical and entrepreneurial challenges since its inception in May 2001. The talent and ability that has been brought to bear in these areas now needs to focus on the business challenges faced by the organisation. There is a degree of urgency concerning this need. The EU Delegation required a work programme from GTA indicating how it intended to reduce its dependency on EU funding. Continued support for GTA between April and December 2004 was conditional upon GTA addressing this issue. Agreeing to produce a business plan examining the issue of sustainability and integrating some of the ideas above would seem to be a minimum requirement in meeting EU expectations in this regard.

- **Added value of ETF: N/A**

4.3. Beneficiaries Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

The direct beneficiaries were the companies involved in the training courses and their staff (companies more competitive). In addition, workers who participated in the courses could expect wage increases and better employment opportunities. The existing training institutions chosen as training providers for specific fields benefitted from the provision of equipment, the upgrading of instructors and Technical Assistance.

5. Synopsis Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The Guyana Training Agency (GTA) was established in 2001 to meet the needs of employees in both the private and public sector. It conducts a range of technical, vocational and management training based upon competency-based approaches. GTA is managed by a Board of 11 members and has eight staff. Technical Assistance is provided through the GIZ. Financial support is provided from the European Development Fund with a total commitment of EUR 1 795 000. EC support comes to an end in April 2014.

The GTA was established under the Private Sector Commission (PSC) as a special training facility in the area of technical and vocational skills development. The aim of the Agency was to assist both public and private companies in their efforts to improve the quality of their technical staff.

The Mission of GTA: 'To contribute to the restoration and improvement of the productive capacity of

Guyana’.

- To update the Technical and Vocational skills and knowledge of the Guyanese workforce;
- To provide ‘Training of Trainers’ and/or upgrade the skills and knowledge of Instructors;
- To provide training sites with equipment and consumable materials, where necessary;
- To provide Assessment, Certification and Accreditation for all participants in training.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to “scalability”? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

GTA is characterised by the following distinctive approach to its work:

- **It is proactive and demand driven.** Companies in Guyana have been quick to recognise the labour and management challenges that they have but have been slow to act. GTA has a proactive approach that stimulates its partners to action. Its popularity with clients is that its programmes are demand driven. The competency approach that it uses give it the capacity to train in a wide range of activities, enabling it to make a specific responses to specialised training needs;
- **It is analytical.** One reason why Guyanese companies have been slow to act in response to labour productivity and management challenges is because they are uncertain of how to proceed. They often do not know what action is required. A GTA intervention commences with a training needs analysis, providing insight into training required and how it can be best delivered, and the impact that it will have on the bottom line;
- **GTA work is competence-based.** Competence-based training breaks a complex task down into a series of discrete sub-tasks, which can be individually identified and observed. The training process centres on assisting the trainee to master each discrete sub-task, until a competence has been developed in the higher order and more complex task. This approach also allows an objective assessment to be made of a worker’s capacity to perform to any given standard in the workplace, and facilitate certification of untrained workers based upon an analysis of skill levels acquired through experience;
- **Credibility.** GTA has developed a high level of credibility with the private sector. This was reflected in the mid-term evaluation, which concluded that the project has a positive impact on the overall objective to restore and improve the productive capacity of Guyana. It held 33 training programmes during 2003 and certified 270 individuals;
- **GTA needs a strategy to drive its mission.** The GTA’s mission is to contribute to the restoration of the productive capacity of Guyana’s workforce. It has many of the technical tools and capacities to do this, but requires a long-term business plan to articulate its strategy to drive its mission. This strategy will also need to address the issue of the GTA’s sustainability. Little work seems to have been undertaken as of yet to address the business issues that challenge the GTA;
- **GTA has developed very close links with the Linden Economic Advancement Programme (LEAP).** LEAP is Government of Guyana Programme in partnership with the European Union to encourage the economic diversification of Region 10 of Demerara. Twelve million Euros will be invested over a period of seven years. GTA has provided training directly for LEAP, and continues to play a major part in developing LEAP’s capacity to deliver on its development mandate. The planned closure of GTA in April 2004 will present considerable challenges for LEAP, and the EU should give consideration to extending GTA’s mandate until the end of 2004 to allow GTA to deliver a full programme of capacity building for LEAP;
- **Businesses Challenges for GTA.** GTA has met much technical success but it needs to match its achievements in the training arena by transforming itself from an EC project into a sustainable business.

7. Lessons learned

Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.

The training activities promoted by the Agency will offer a quick response to companies’ needs, based on specific requirements when introducing new production equipment or techniques. It also provides for the training of trainers.

GTA is perceived as a strong and robust organisation in a technical sense and one, which has quickly developed credibility with the private sector thorough a proactive and customer-driven approach. It is however financially vulnerable. It too needs access to a physical training facility that matches the quality of the training that it delivers and that has the potential to help it reduce its operating costs.

8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
Government and Private Sector Centre (PSC). Other donor provided support to the Private sector Commission, like the multi-donor initiative led by CIDA that also involves the United Kingdom's Department for International Development (DFID), which is expected to end by 2015.	
9. Contacts	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail
EU Delegation Advisor: Helena Laakso. Project Authority: Private Sector Commission (PSC). The Guyana Training Agency Klaus Sodemann. GTZ. Stevenagestr. 4a, 55218 Ingelheim, Germany. phone 00355 4 227912 email sodemann@gmx.de .	
10. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)
-FA-DEC14864_1.pdf Financing agreement. PS -DEC14864 PROJECT SYNOPSIS. -MR-DEC14864_3.pdf MONITORING REPORT - GUY- GUYANA TRAINING AGENCY. MR-00238.02 - 26/06/02. -PPM-DEC14864_2.pdf Project planning matrix. GUYANA NATIONAL REPORT ON TECHNICAL AND VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING (TVET) A contribution to the regional discussion on reforming TVET institutions and accreditation systems for improved skills and enhanced employability in Caribbean labour markets. Department For International Development. Private Sector Commission of Guyana: Training as an Investment: Feasibility Study for a Unified Private Sector Training Centre. Whitetree Associates Bristol, UK December 2003 http://www.psc.org.gy/press/reports/Training%20Facility%20Study.pdf . http://www.voced.edu.au/content/ngv42250 . Conference paper. http://www.unevoc.unesco.org/worldtvetdatabase1.php?ct=GUY .	

NEW CALEDONIA

Project title: Programme d'appui budgétaire à la formation professionnelle (2004-2007)

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: B
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of the Design: B
6. Impact: B
7. Sustainability: B
8. Added Value of ETF: N/A

0. TVET at a Glance

The education system in New Caledonia still mirrors that of the French colonial power and is compulsory and free for children aged 6 to 16. Primary schooling lasts for 5 years, during which time pupils acquire a firm foundation for their further education. The system comprises Primary, Middle (Lower Secondary), Secondary and Upper Secondary education. The mandatory education programme lasts for a further 4 years of middle school and culminates in a national examination. If they wish, students may complete their schooling at this point and enter the job market.

The VET College of New Caledonia offers over 35 skills training programmes that include diverse subjects such as business and technology, early childhood education and various trades. It is also possible to complete Level-1 programmes that facilitate entry into an apprenticeship.

1. Identification (CRIS decision number):	17383
2. Classification	
a) By Sector/Thematic Area:	TP – TVET policy and systems LS
b) By Instrument (fund/budget line):	9 th EDF- FED - European Development Fund 03 - Sector Budget Support
c) By region:	African, Caribbean and Pacific (ACP): NEW CALEDONIA
d) By period and status:	Decision year: 2003 Agreement: 29/07/2004 Period 29/07/2004- End 31/12/2010 Status: CLOSED
3. Financial data	
Total EC amount: (% of indicative programme): EUR 28 679 529.00 (94.92% of EUR 30 214 370)	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
The main outcome is: 'to reduce problems of rural-urban migration, unemployment, a deceleration in growth, and inequality between provinces and sub-regions.' as specified in the RoM. The overall objective is to answer to the needs of the New Caledonian economy by giving support to TVET, promoting access to training and reinforcing training for employment.	
4.1 Objective (statement of the problem)	What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
The country faces problems of rural-urban migration, unemployment, a slowdown in growth and inequality between provinces and sub-regions. Given the analysis of the age and the large number of young people entering the market, training is part of some urgency. Since the Noumea Accords, the Government of New Caledonia (GNC) has had a policy of rebalancing based on the establishment of a multi-year program of training activities, support and integration. After 5 years of development, GNC considered it important to engage in a functional reorganisation of Vocational Training (FP), which focuses on improving the quality of all stakeholders involved in efforts promoting the employability of people with some qualifications and work on the quality of services rendered. Nearly EUR 30,000,000 are allocated to vocational training by the GNC (and provinces), the state and the private sector (EUR	

10,000,000 annually).	
4.2 Result of the project	Please describe the results achieved by the above project/ programme (or policy intervention).
<p>The expected results of the project as expressed in the Technical and Administrative Provisions focus on increasing the capacity of the 'pre-service' training provided for the hospitality sector. This document also mentions the need to develop a better understanding of the (hospitality) market, as well as the establishment of a micro-credit line for use in improving tourism facilities.</p> <p>Two clear results were expected to be achieved by this project:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Training for the sector; 2. Employment of graduates. <p>According to the RoM reports: '<i>Si l'étendue des actions de formation entreprises est patente, l'impact sur le taux réel d'insertion professionnelle est encore assez faible</i>'. Therefore at this point, results have only been partially achieved.</p>	
Grading: Overall analysis carried out against 8 criteria (to be applied flexibly)	3 main broad criteria: Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency 5 additional criteria: Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added Value of ETF
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevance: B <p>The objectives and strategies of the Sector Programme for Vocational Training of New Caledonia are relevant. The 9th EDF Support Programme can be characterised as a programme approach, even if the terms still contain some aspects of a project approach. They are appropriate to the extent that they promote the MTEF as a tool for the planning of sectoral policy on the basis of a framework for sustainable, medium-term resources, ensuring greater predictability of resource constraints and priority orders. The sectoral approach was in line to be pushed further and improved under the 10th EDF Support Programme that was to be implemented in 2010.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Effectiveness: B <p>Effectiveness was addressed - though not entirely - in the course of the project implementation as specified in the RoM, which indicates that: '<i>Specific and global objectives were addressed, while the major vectors (meeting the needs of the New Caledonian economy and promoting access to training and training for employment) were partially met.</i>' (See the following text extracted from the RoM: '<i>Les objectifs spécifiques et globaux s'inscrivent surtout dans le temps. Les «axes majeurs» (Répondre aux besoins de l'économie calédonienne en donnant les moyens d'appui à la FPC, favoriser l'accès aux formations et former pour l'emploi) sont partiellement atteints. Au-delà des investissements structurels, les financements ont permis de conventionner pour plus de 3.000 stagiaires en moyenne chaque année. Les bénéficiaires reçoivent effectivement une formation et un suivi de meilleure qualité grâce au programme.</i>'</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Efficiency: B <p>Although not analysed in terms of the economic efficiency, the achieved results indicate a satisfactory level of efficiency, as specified in the RoM.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Coherence: B <p>In the medium and long term, the objectives of the Sector Programme are realistic and the NCG has made this a priority area for the forthcoming years (until 2025). The Sector Programme included three 'building blocks' that are: 1) a new strategy for the FP (Strategy CPD 2008-2012 - New Caledonia, Directorate of Vocational Training/WRC) 2) accompanied by a medium-term perspective developed in the PPPP (Performance Plan Public Policy presented to the EU Delegation on 07/05/2010), although annual budgets final agreement yet between CNG and EU acceptance of this modality as Framework Medium Term Expenditure and 3) a process of sectoral coordination, the latter of which being set up under the aegis of the WRC (Order No. 2008-5143 / CNG on the powers of the NC WRC)..</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of the Design: B <p>According to the RoM report, the project's design was responsive to country needs and, more importantly, remained so after the intervention: '<i>Les objectifs et les stratégies du Programme Sectoriel de Formation Professionnelle de la Nouvelle Calédonie sont toujours pertinents.</i>'</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Impact: B <p>According the ROM « <i>Si l'étendue des actions de formation entreprises est patente, l'impact sur le taux réel d'insertion professionnelle est encore assez faible</i> » But the impact is clear: "Le Programme</p>	

d'Appui contribue à l'atteinte de ces objectifs et a permis d'établir des passerelles, pour les jeunes demandeurs d'emploi et de formations qualifiantes, par les centres de formations mieux équipés, un accueil mieux organisé et un environnement plus propice à l'apprentissage. »

• **Sustainability: B**

The degree of ownership of the sector program by the local actors is considered as excellent. The institutional framework, even if it is too complicated in its current form, is viable and does not depend exclusively on the financial contributions of the EDF. The Support Programme is acknowledged for his contribution to the sustainability of earnings since the funds have helped to improve the performance and sustainability of training institutions. Finally, , through EDF, childcare facilities, equipment, skilled trainers, quality training content and diversification of training offer have ostensibly improved

• **Added Value of ETF: N/A**

4.3 Beneficiaries

Who benefited/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

Direct beneficiaries are: Industry, Agriculture, Crafts and Trades, local centres and training platforms.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The project is a budget support project for the VET and the TVET sector designed to support the new sector policy programme in New Caledonia.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to project "scalability"? What was the specific approach to capacity development that led to policy impact/ changes?

The Support Programme had the merit of encouraging the GNC to reform its budget planning, to encourage the flow of coordination and communication between social actors and to define a sufficient number of indicators and quality studies. The observations and recommendations of the EU have been taken very seriously. All stakeholders agree that the 9th EDF has forced the industry to organise, plan and improve the quality of trainers and training centers. The program has an open, ongoing and regular dialogue and encouraged the growing involvement of the private sector as an essential partner in training and inter- institutional framework between the training agencies. However, some partners regret what they consider as several months as lost in discussing the details of the programme document and 'heavy' EC procedures, whereas the the EU Delegation would have liked to be informed and invited more systematically. Identified key elements are, in the following order of relevance:

- a) Project appropriation and involvement by the beneficiary;
- b) Donor (EU Delegation) involvement (collaboration and supervision);
- c) Suitable organisational and administrative structure;
- d) Multi-annual programme elaboration and execution;
- e) A systematic working style.

7. Lessons learnt

Please include any lessons learnt (regardless of whether these were envisaged at project inception).

Partial monitoring of the sector is made, in particular by the Territorial Chamber of Accounts NC (CTC) and the Employment Observatory, qualifications, salaries and training (OEQSF) Institute of Skill Development (IDC) of New Caledonia.. There is some confusion as to the fields of mutual responsibilities of the WRC and the IDC. The existing monitoring system is not yet sufficiently reliable and adequate. The various documents and studies mention three major indicators (erosion rates, inclusion and certification) partially, without giving a precise idea of the state of affairs in relation to the outcomes and objectives. Following the national Consultation on Vocational Training (closed in September 2010), CNG has established a steering committee to define the accepted recommendations, actions to implement and schedule set-up. It should be noted that the Consultation retained the general report of the CTC and its recommendations and the SPD 2008-2010 10th EDF papers. According to the report of the Territorial Chamber of Accounts (CTC), the financing of training by the New Caledonia since 2004 has steadily increased (+ 93% between 2004 and 2008) to exceed 4 billion in Frans XFP 2008, contributions of equivalent EDF to 11% of the total.

The IDC should study, analyze and make proposals for educational inadequate cultural bridges between the Kanak culture and Western culture on employment. Consider the most appropriate evaluation methods such as group assessment instead of the traditional evaluation where young Melanesian tend not to perform well.

8. Implementing Partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
EU Delegation, beneficiary country, public administration (ministries, municipalities, etc.).	
9. Contacts	Provide contact details for further information, including telephone and e-mail
Focal point at EU Delegation: Yves Horayla. Focal point at EC Headquarters: Thierry Soyez.	
10.Sources, links & publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)
Financing Agreement. Amendment to Financial Agreement. June 2008. Results Oriented Monitoring Final. 03/10/2010. 30/01/2013 evaluation of the VATET project and the Country Strategy Paper. http://ec.europa.eu/europeaid/how/evaluation/evaluation_reports/reports/2011/1294_vol1_en.pdf . EVA 2007/GEO-ACP: Evaluation de la coopération de la Commission européenne avec les Pays et Territoires d’Outre-mer.	

SOLOMON ISLANDS

Project title: Rural Training Centres Phase II (RTC II)

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: B
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of the Design: B
6. Impact: C
7. Sustainability: C
8. Added Value of ETF: N/A

0. TVET at a Glance

The education system in the Solomon Islands comprises the National Ministry of Education and Human Resource Development (MEHRD), the Education Authorities, Schools and communities. MEHRD is responsible for management and administration in collaboration with the National Education Board (NEB) and Education Authorities (EAs). NEB provides advice on all matters concerning operations and development of the education system, and makes recommendations to the Minister on education policy and financing. The Provincial Education Authorities (PEAs) for each of the 9 provinces administer schools supported by the government budget and supervise the curricula adopted by the non-formal TVET providers. Church Education Authorities and the Honiara City Council Education Authority (VSA) are also involved in the governance of the system. Key education institutions are: Solomon Islands College of Higher Education (SICHE), Curriculum Development Centre (CDC) and the Teaching Services Commission (TSC).

The policy framework includes: the Education Act of 1996; the first Education Strategic Plan (ESP) of 2004-2006 focused on VET quality and relevance and gave priority to tertiary education for the vast majority of secondary students that were forced into a narrowly focused academic programme; the Education Sector Investment and Reform Programme (ESIRP) launched in 2004 by MEHRD with the support of the EU and the New Zealand Agency for International Development (NZAID); the 2005 'Education for Living', also called 'the TVET Policy' was provided the basis for TVET development by emphasising the need for practical skills training, that will enable young people to lead beneficial lives in their homes and communities, incorporating the teaching of practical subjects in the school system and skills training for out-of-school youth. It also included the Programme for the alignment of Formal and Non-Formal TVET and their integration into the Education System. The 2007-2015 ESP, the National 2007-2009 Education Action Plan (NEAP) and the second NEAP (2010-2012) all support training providers in offering a range of qualitative and relevant programmes through: i) innovation and the adoption of modern approaches to TVET; ii) re-alignment of the offer to better match individual needs and the economy's demands; iii) improvement in quality and iv) effective public-private partnerships and networking.

The main formal TVET provider is the Solomon Islands College of Higher Education (SICHE) that was established in 1984. It is governed, managed, and administered according to an Act of Parliament amended in 2008. Members of the SICHE Council are appointed by the Governor General upon the recommendations of the ministers of the Crown. The 2008 amendment responded to the need to diversify training to include the School of Tourism and Hospitality and the School of Humanities, Science & Media. The University of the South Pacific (USP) and different institutions run by Government, Church Organisations, other NGOs or the private sector, provide training at introductory and post-secondary levels. TVET is available in the provinces through Rural Training Centres (RTCs) controlled by the Churches and coordinated by the Solomon Islands Association of Rural Training Centres (SIARTC). The 34 RTCs are independent organisations provided with a high level of operational autonomy, and spread throughout the eight provinces of the Solomon Islands. The RTCs' Board of Directors is formed by representatives of the Communities and the principals are accountable to the respective Churches. They provide non-formal training (knowledge and practical skills for self-sufficiency, productivity and active citizenship) to young men and women within the rural

communities. Other institutions providing 'non-formal' TVET are the national and international NGOs and the Don Bosco Training Centre.

With regards to the delivery and quality of the TVET system, the NEAP indicates the upgrading of trainers' qualifications as the main priority for action along with the introduction of modularized and flexible training. Current TVET curricula are not centralised. Each RTC and/or non-formal TVET provider can develop its own curriculum, subject to the oversight by the PEAs. A flexible offer of modularised programmes is considered to better respond to the needs of local labour markets and communities. With regards to financing, NEAP and ESP 2015 set the increment of the state budget for TVET as a priority with particular reference to the issue of supporting non-formal TVET providers and institutions, in the perspective of increasing the integration between non-formal, formal TVET and tertiary education.

1. Identification (CRIS decision number):	14723
2. Classification	
a) By Sector/Thematic Area:	TM – TVET access to target groups ST – Sectoral Training
b) By Instrument (fund/budget line):	DCI: geographical programmes
c) By region:	Geographical programmes: African, Caribbean and Pacific (ACP): SOLOMON ISLANDS
d) By period and status:	Decision year 2000-Start date : 09/2000.. End date 06/2004, Status (Closed, On-going, Committed, Provisional): CLOSED
3. Financial data	
Total EC amount (+ % of indicative programme): Primary commitment (project budget): EUR 1 960 000; Secondary Commitment (funds contracted): EUR 1 797 365; funds Disbursed by the Commission: EUR 939 190.	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
The change expected as a result of the project's implementation was: ' <i>To minimise or solve the habitual situation in the Solomon Islands characterised [during the implementation period] by "political upheaval, economic chaos and a Government that lacks any funds, which particularly affects the health and education sectors in that it constrains the services they provide."</i> ' The RTC project (phase II) followed-up from an EC-funded project that had assisted the Rural Training Centres since 1993. Phase II was about consolidating the outcome of Phase I that had been evaluated as a positive endeavour. The expected changes concerned increased quality of the training programmes offered by the RTCs based on a new, comprehensive training curriculum; a strengthened management capacity of the centres and their umbrella organization (SIARTC) and an increase of self-employment of RTC graduates through a micro-credit scheme. The latter was not considered viable (due to ethnic conflicts and an economic crisis) during the inception phase of the project and was modified towards strengthening the capacity of the RTCs to provide grant-based support services for the placement of RTC graduates.	
4.1 Objective (statement of the problem)	What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
Access to the provision of relevant skills was limited by the absence of a policy and strategy to integrate the TVET sub-systems as well as by a structural weakness of the training providers in the country. System-wise, the situation was assessed in terms of lack of quality assurance mechanisms (NQF, occupational standards, competency-based programme), a variety of contents, the quality of skills training provision between training providers and unclear pathways between different TVET sub-systems. Moreover, access was rather limited for female students (about 38%), persons with disabilities and very poor youths. Access to non-formal TVET or Skills Development for vulnerable and marginalised groups had mostly been made possible through the existing network of rural training centres that had the capacity to absorb between 8 and 10% of school leavers, school drop-outs and youths living in rural areas. The EC had already provided assistance to the RTCs for more than 7 years, but additional support for both physical infrastructures (upgrading facilities, equipment and	

training material, the supply and construction of additional buildings) and human resources (training of principals and trainers, curriculum development, educational material and course development) was still considered necessary. Training and follow-up services to support the employment and self-employment of graduates beyond the local labour markets and communities could never be developed to a minimum operational level. Finally, more effective management and resource mobilisation capacity of the RTC principals and Board members had become crucial to find viable alternatives to enduring minimal government financial support to non-formal training providers. This situation had left the RTCs and their umbrella organization - SIARTC - entirely dependent on the contribution of the Church, local communities and donors.

4.2 Result of the project

Please describe the results achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention).

The expected results are:

- To improve the management and quality of training provided at RTC level;
- To improve the management training service provided by the SIARTC;
- To develop new curricula including basic education, technical skills and livelihood elements;
- The fourth output 'To develop a micro-credit scheme for RTC graduates' was changed into a grant-based support scheme for RTC graduates; in the aftermath of the crisis, the self-financing capacity of the RTCs was further reduced and the lack of employment opportunities made the planned micro-credit scheme for young RTC-graduate entrepreneurs impossible.

The project's main activities were:

- Implementation of training programmes for RTCs' staff to upgrade technical and teaching skills;
- Technical Assistance to strengthen the SIARTC;
- Curricula on technical trades, including maths, business development and agricultural management;
- Graduate support scheme through apprenticeships and small grants for RTC graduates;
- The project assumed that about 70% of the RTC graduates could be employed or self-employed.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against 8 criteria
(to be applied flexibly)

3 main broad criteria: **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added Value of ETF**

• **Relevance: B**

The project was relevant to the needs and problems of the direct recipients (RTCs, SIARTC) and final beneficiaries as well as to the objectives set forth in the ESP of the MEHRD.

• **Effectiveness: B**

The project faced major external constraints caused by the outbreaks of inter-ethnic conflicts, such as the destruction of RTC facilities, delayed procurement, financial problems of the RTCs, lack of support by local public administrations, and a general slowing down of operation in the post crisis period. The turnover of RTC counterparts (principals and trainers) reached almost 80% by the end of the project and placed a considerable burden on the provision of training material and the capacity to deliver training under the new curricula. The project deliverables were considered of good quality and the project's purpose and specific objectives were achieved.

• **Efficiency: B**

The project proved globally efficient in relation to workplans and budgets, although an extension had to be granted to complete the delivery of the curriculum development and training outputs. The quality of the project management was a decisive factor in the efficient implementation of the activities under the given circumstances.

• **Coherence: B**

The project design builds on experiences under RTC I and, as referred to in the RoM, is generally adequate. The extension from September 2003 to June 2004 was formulated in line with the Ministry's strategy and had provided support to the elaboration of the TVET strategy, plan and legal framework.

• **Quality of the Design: B**

The quality of the original project design was satisfactory. The adjustments were also relevant to the changed situation in the country and the TVET context. A new Log Frame was developed during the

project's mid-term review.	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Impact: C The impact on the TVET system was limited, primarily because of the small number of graduates that the RTCs can supply to the labour market in relation to the actual demand. External conditions of insecurity and political instability further limited the impact on the direct recipients and final beneficiaries (cancellation of the credit scheme, high rotation of the RTC staff, postponement of the public financing and institutionalisation of the RTC network within formal TVET). Tracer studies were conducted on a limited sample of 200 RTC graduates for the 1995-2000 period and could not identify a direct correlation between the received training and actual occupations. During the first two years, the project trained about 1700 students in 24 different subjects related to the economies of the communities and villages. Nevertheless, at the best of supply capacity, RTCs can only reach between 8 and 10% of the target group. Moreover, on a more strategic level, results from consultation with key stakeholders at the community level indicated the limits of the 'training good villagers' approach in reaching the target of providing a skilled labour force for urban and rural areas; a holistic approach was thus recommended involving public and private training providers and employers of the agro-forestry, fishery, industrial and commercial sectors. Finally, after the 2003 mid-term review, a new component provided by fostering the capacity of the MEHRD and its coordinating function; this was constrained to the last six months - too a short period for generating any long lasting impact. 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sustainability C Sustainability in relation to the capacity of the SIARTC and RTCs staff to plan, manage and monitor vocational training programmes was considered as satisfactory. The project funded almost 100% of the SIARTC staff, infrastructures and programmes. The transfer of this capacity to a wider array of training providers was not ensured, particularly in the absence of government policies, plans and resources to institutionalise the RTC's experience and capacity. The 2002-2004 MEHRD ESP, by making reference to the need of strengthening basic education and skills development for school leavers was expected to open up the possibility for the RTCs to enter into the envisaged structure of the national TVET system; however, this did not materialise by the end of the project. 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Added Value of ETF: N/A 	
4.3 Beneficiaries	Who benefited/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?
Direct recipients are the public authorities and local sector implementation partners (SIARTC and individual RTCs) that continued the implementation of the initial RTC project (of which this project is an extension). The final beneficiaries are the people of the villages and communities, basic education leavers and school drop-outs who were provided with an opportunity to access technical skills in demand by the local economies and community labour markets.	
5. Synopsis	Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.
The project focused its attention on the fine-tuning (through capacity building and reinforcement) of the beneficiary capacities already established through a previous EC-funded project, to provide services to the addressed sectors, as well as on alleviating the current political disruption that led to the economic paralysis of key sectors, including health and education. This is specified in the project synopsis document as follows: <i>'RTC II aims to consolidate the results of phase I following the positive outcome of the final evaluation and to contribute to economic development at village level through the provision of well-targeted and high-quality vocational training to young people and access to small-business credit. The implementation capacity and management of the Solomon Islands Association of Rural Training Centres (SIATRC) and of individual RTCs will also be strengthened.'</i>	
6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to project "scalability"? What was the specific approach to capacity development that led to policy impact/ changes?
The strengthened capacity of the direct recipients, the awareness raised among the national authorities on the need to link formal and non-formal TVET, the change of perspective about government financial contribution to the RTCs and the quality of the developed curricula are the main elements of success identified in this project.	
7. Lessons learnt	Please include any lessons learnt (regardless of whether these

	were envisaged at project inception).
	The main lessons learnt are that EC technical cooperation targeted a provider that could not ensure a sizeable impact on the TVET system, while a more systemic intervention supporting skills development (non-formal TVET) for the informal or the marginalised, in the perspective of an overall TVET reform, should have been developed. Access and quality are complex and demanding issues and cannot be tackled in isolation from the provision of national policy and strategy. The project demonstrated the limits of providing direct support to some elements outside of an institutional framework. Typically, Government financial support to RTCs was a precondition for their functioning as an effective provider for target groups that have little access to formal TVET. The quality assurance function of the apex organisation - SIARTC - found its main limitations in the absence of a link with the Ministry of Education's concerned departments (Curriculum Development, Inspection, Infrastructures). Hence, its strengthening was inherently positive but of limited effectiveness, income and sustainability.
8. Implementing Partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
	The implementing partners of the project were the Government in general (Ministry of Economy in particular) and its 3 directly involved ministries: health, agricultur, and education. In collaboration with the National Authorising Officer (NAO) and the Minister of Development Planning and Aid Coordination, the European Commission is running the 'SKILLS FOR LIFE Programme for the Integration of Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) Into the Formal and Non-Formal Education System in the Solomon Islands'. Australia has supported education in the Solomon Islands from the early 1980s. Current Australian support to the sector has been through: scholarships provision (Australian Dollar 3 000 000/year); a 2009Global Economic Crisis response initiative to increasing employment through school infrastructure development (Australian Dollar 1 000 000); a performance-linked aid incentive payment to the Ministry of Finance and Treasury (MOFT) for economic reforms that directed the funding (Australian Dollar 3 000 000) to the education budget to support the 'fee free' policy.
9. Contacts	Provide contact details for further information, including telephone and e-mail.
	EU Delegation to the Solomon Islands; DG DEVCO (Brussels).
10.Sources, links & publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs).
	No public documentation (or Internet URLs) proved available after in-depth research. Received documents for assessment were as follows: Documents received initially (used for first project assessment): RoM, Financing Agreement, Logical Framework, Monitoring Report; project synopsis. Documents received additionally (used for second project assessment): RoM; Project final report; Contractual Annex 24.

VANUATU

Project title: Tourism Education and Training Project (VATET)

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: C
3. Efficiency: B
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of the Design: C
6. Impact: C
7. Sustainability: D
8. Added Value of ETF: N/A

0. TVET at a Glance

An effective TVET system is in place in Vanuatu and has been substantially consolidated through assistance provided by AusAID over the last decade.

The Ministry of Education oversees all formal TVET programmes, while the Ministry of Youth Development controls non-formal TVET programmes. The Vanuatu Institute of Technology (VIT) develops and implements TVET policy for both formal (through the Ministry of Education) and non-formal TVET (through Ministry of Youth Development and Training). The Ministries of Education and Youth Development in turn produced Corporate Plans, which dictate the policy for TVET within the government agencies. Public financing for TVET (i.e. VIT) makes up 6% of the Ministry of Education's (MOE) budget.

The non-formal providers overseen by the Ministry of Youth Development and Training are mostly community-based organisations and private providers. This non-formal sector plays an important role in providing services to the majority rural population. The key governmental agency is the Vanuatu National Training Council (VNTC). It bears the responsibility of accrediting TVET courses and creating the National Qualifications Framework. The decentralisation of operations has also achieved through the establishment of Provincial Training Boards (PTBs) in all six provinces. The VNTC also controls quality, standards, and the certification of TVET courses. Other main skills providers are: the University of the South Pacific (USP), the Vanuatu Agricultural College, the Vanuatu Maritime College, the Vanuatu Institute of Teacher Education and Vanuatu Institute of Technology (VIT) which is credited with an important role in the development of the strategic plan and vision for TVET at both the local and national level. The provision of non-formal education and training in Vanuatu is the responsibility of Non-Government Organisations (NGOs) and the private sector. An extensive network of 36 Rural Training Centres (RTCs) exists that are run by churches and NGOs without government financial support.

The policy framework is abundant in plans for the TVET sector. The 2003-2010 TVET Masterplan: Skills for a Self-Reliant, Productive and Proud Vanuatu consists of the Vanuatu's Government's Priorities Action Agenda for 2006-15 that emphasises and recognises the relevance of education and training to the various sectors of the economy, and identifies as crucial the relationship between developing individual potential and national sustainable development. The 2004 Ministry of Education's policy was detailed in the 'Vision Vanuatu Education and Training 2004-2015'. Additionally, the Vanuatu Education Sector Strategy (VESS) goals for 2007-16 include expanding access to technical, tertiary and higher education and ensuring that the education system focuses on building the human resources. It also aims to improve learning, living and working opportunities, and enables young people to contribute to the productive sectors in both rural and urban areas. The Vanuatu Technical Vocational Education and Training Policy of 2010 identifies the key stakeholders in formal and non-formal education, the relationship between the two sub-systems and their regulating agencies.

The policy indicates the following priority areas for further development: the consolidation of pathways between TVET and higher education; the recognition of VET qualifications by both industry and educational institutions; the school-to-work transition; the strengthening of enrolment in TVET by streamlining and simplifying registration and accreditation procedures set by VNTC. Access to TVET is

limited by the location of institutions, gender unbalanced skills opportunities, barriers for people with disabilities and fees and charges for poorer families.	
1. Identification (CRIS decision number):	16175
2. Classification	
a) By Sector/Thematic Area:	ST – Sectoral Training IE – Informal Economy IP
b) By Instrument (fund/budget line):	DCI: geographical programmes
c) By region:	Geographical programmes: African, Caribbean and Pacific (ACP): VANUATU
d) By period and status:	Decision year (2000-2012): 2003 Status (Closed, On-going, Committed, Provisional): CLOSED
3. Financial data	
Total EC amount (+ % of indicative programme): EUR 2 398 000	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
The initial overall objective of the VATET project was 'to contribute to poverty reduction and to the sustainable development of the national economy by providing essential inputs to the vital tourism industry.' Moreover, the initial project goal is 'to improve capacities and services within the tourism and hospitality industry of Vanuatu to competitive standards.' The initial Logical Framework was found not realistic and was revised. After re-formulation, the revised project's purpose was 'to improve the capacity of the VIT, training providers and the VIBA to deliver quality manpower, standards and services for the tourism and hospitality industry in Vanuatu'.	
4.1 Objective (statement of the problem)	What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
The Government of the Republic of Vanuatu identified tourism as one of the key sectors for enhancing economic growth and prosperity, especially in rural areas: 'Tourism is one of the most promising economic sectors for Vanuatu's future development. It offers great potential as a source of foreign exchange as well as creating employment and fostering development of the outer islands.' Nevertheless, the growth of the tourism industry had been restricted by limited accessibility by air, a lack of skilled human resources, high prices and poor infrastructure in the outer islands. The increased demand for qualified and trained human resources at all levels could be satisfied only partially by the Vanuatu Institute of Technology that was the only provider of formal vocational training for the hospitality and tourism industry. Technical and financial assistance for the development of VIT training facilities were necessary to meet the needs of the tourism industry.	
4.2 Result of the project	Please describe the results achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention).

According to the Financing Agreement, the initial aim of the project is: 'to improve capacities and services within the tourism and hospitality industry of Vanuatu to competitive standards'. The expected results were:

- The construction of a special hospitality and tourism training facility at VIT;
- Increased capacity and quality of pre-service training for the tourism industry;
- Increased skills and standards of existing workers in the industry through in-service training, coordinated by a dedicated industry training unit at VIT;
- Increased commercial sustainability, better understanding of markets and improved products and services of businesses in small bungalows and tour operating sectors;
- Increased human resource capacity of the Vanuatu Tourism Office and targeted marketing programmes;
- The feasibility of introducing a micro-credit line for rural tourism operators.

The under-estimation of costs generated delays in procurement, exacerbated by a restricted supplier base that proposed excessive overhead costs. As the time frame set in the Logical Framework turned out to be unrealistic, the project's objective had to be reformulated as: 'to improve the capacity of VIT, training providers and VIBA to deliver quality manpower, standards and services for the tourism and hospitality industry in Vanuatu.'

The new expected results were:

- Increased pre-service and in-service training and skills delivered to an accredited standard;
- Increased knowledge base on products and markets in small operating sector;
- Improved marketing and promotional capacity in Vanuatu Tourism Office (VTO);
- Training Hospitality and Tourism infrastructure and facilities at VIT developed and operational.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against 8 criteria
(to be applied flexibly)

3 main broad criteria: **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added Value of ETF**

- **Relevance: A**

The project was highly relevant in relation to the skills needs of the tourism sector, the demand for the quality supply of basic training (both for pre-service entrants and for assisting existing employees to achieve a national certificate), more specialised skills and limited access to skills opportunities for the tourism sector. Examples of high project relevance were: the international quality standards employed in the construction component in a way that the training centre could meet the requirements to become a Centre of Excellence for the hospitality and tourism industry in the country and in the region; the establishments of partnerships with a number of overseas and regional hospitality and tourism training institutions.

- **Effectiveness: B**

The under-budgeting of the Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure Training Centre 'HTLTC' component affected the whole VATET project. The other 3 components could not start until the school itself was fully completed. Moreover, the other component suffered from the low initial involvement of the provincial authorities, which resulted in a lack of, or very little, support for the implementation of the programme.

- **Efficiency: C**

Under VATET, the cost of the construction of the School of Tourism was under estimated and in the end this activity consumed most of the funds. Once readjusted, the project proved efficient in the implementation of the 4 components.

- **Coherence: B**

Internal coherence was assessed at the time of the final evaluation and it was concluded that: 'This TVET input perfectly complemented the Vanuatu Tourism Education and Training (VATET) project intervention, although VATET was primarily focused on the Hospitality and Tourism department of the VIT in preparation of the new HTLTC. There has been close cooperation and coherence between these two inputs at all levels'. This project is highly coherent with the national TVET policy, with sector requirements and with government-identified needs. It is also coherent with other donors' interventions (mostly focused on the Australian system and in view of the further recognition of qualifications by Australian authorities).

- **Quality of the Design: C**

The initial design proved unrealistic. Initially the project design was too diverse and too ambitious,

taking into account the very limited financial resources. The project was adjusted and financial resources added a new timeframe for the implementation period. The new design of the project could partially address the needs initially assessed. The budget and time constraints due to the the unforeseeable delays brought the project back to an quasi-inception phase. The evaluators described the situation as: *'It is like throwing overboard one by one less important items to ensure the survival of the most important subject'* and recommended a follow-up project to ensure a real implementation phase to further sustain and strengthen what VATET could only develop.

• **Impact: C**

Under VATET, major changes and improvements were achieved in the Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure Training Centre infrastructures and on the delivery and the quality of the courses, during the 2006 academic year. Nevertheless, necessary decisions adopted to adjust the project implementation reduced the impact of the project. An example is given by the Training of Trainers programme initially planned for 3 provinces with the highest level of tourism activity (via TVET); this was subsequently enlarged with a fourth province. However, the cancellation of the support and mentoring activity left the trainers on their own, without the necessary guidance and without the necessary funds to further implement the programme that was subsequently added.

• **Sustainability: D**

Some of the necessary strategic decisions to cancel or limit project interventions jeopardised the sustainability of some of the results, especially in relation to the rural tourism training component. The sustainability could not be ensured to the extent that an extension of the project was necessary to complete the development or preparatory phase, thus leaving further implementation to a follow-up project. Hence the project was evaluated as neither realistic nor sustainable.

Added Value of ETF: Not applicable.

4.3 Beneficiaries

Who benefited/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

The beneficiaries of the project are industry, professionals, the unemployed and society in general.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The Vanuatu Tourism Education and Training Project (VATET) lasted 3.5 years. The Vanuatu Government identified Tourism as a priority sector for development and in need of more and better skills - to be provided through TVET. The response to the need of enhanced skills provision was identified in the development of training facilities and the reinforcement of the training development and delivery capacity of the Vanuatu Institute of Technology.

In this context the European Commission, at the request of the Vanuatu Government, agreed to provide technical and financial assistance to the formulation and implementation of the Vanuatu Tourism Education and Training Project as a response to the aforementioned identified needs. The main components were the construction and operation of a new Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure Training Centre, the development of a high-standard training programme and support to provinces to develop and implement tourism plans. These components were meant to provide more skilled human resources to a priority sector for sustainable development of the national economy and ultimately poverty reduction.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to project "scalability"? What was the specific approach to capacity development that led to policy impact/ changes?

The key elements of success were: project coordination and project management (during project implementation). As quoted in the report: 'While the project has been brought back to its three main components, the correct and timely strategic decisions made by project management have "saved" the project'. Other elements of success were the coordination with ongoing TVET reform, as well as ownership and involvement by the direct beneficiaries.

7. Lessons learnt

Please include any lessons learnt (regardless of whether these were envisaged at project inception).

The underestimation of the required budget for the construction of the new training centre influenced the entire project and its execution.

8. Implementing Partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

The Ministry of Education (MoE) acted as the implementing authority for the VATET project. The Vanuatu Institute of Technology (VIT) was the main beneficiary and authority involved in its execution. An important actor was Australian AID implement the Vanuatu Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) Sector Strengthening Programme supporting provincial economic development through establishing VTCs in the Sanma and Malampa provinces, with a specific focus on women, youths and persons with disabilities. In recent years, foreign aid agencies have made a significant impact on the provision of TVET in Vanuatu, introducing different approaches and new standards. The AusAID-managed Australia-Pacific Technical College (APTC) provides Australian Certificate-level vocational training in a wide range of areas (including metal-working, hospitality, tourism and the building trades). Another foreign-run TVET agency is the Institut de Technologie (INTV). The INTV offers courses in building, automotive trades, business studies, tourism, hospitality and the electrical trades. INTV is supported by the French Government and AusAID.

9. Contacts

Provide contact details for further information, including telephone and e-mail.

EU Delegation to Vanuatu.

10.Sources, links & publications

Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs).

Final Report; Country Strategy Paper (CSP); Financial Agreement.
 ADB, Technical-Vocational Skills Development in Vanuatu, Suva 2007.
 Australian AID, Vanuatu TVET Sector Strengthening Programme (Phase 2), Strategic Review 2010.
 ADB, *Skills Development for Inclusive and Sustainable Growth in Developing Asia-Pacific*, (McClean and others), Springer, New York, 2013.

BANGLADESH

Project title: Technical and Vocational Training (TVET) reform Bangladesh

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: A
3. Efficiency: B
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of Design: A
6. Impact: B
7. Sustainability: B
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

Education in Bangladesh has three major phases: primary, secondary and higher. Primary education starts at the age of six with a five-year cycle while secondary education lasts seven years with three sub-stages: junior secondary (3 years) for ages 11-13 (grades 7-8), secondary (2 years) for ages 14-15 (grades 9-10) and higher secondary (2 years) for ages 16-17 years (grades 11-12). Secondary education has three main streams: general, technical-vocational and *madrasha*. Formal technical vocational education starts after grade 8 with a two-year course in basic skills. This can be followed by certificate-level courses or Secondary School Certificate Vocational courses (SSC Voc), which also require completion of grade 8. Successful completers can progress to Higher Secondary Certificate (HSC) General, HSC Vocational or an Engineering diploma of 4 years' duration (grade 12 plus 2). Institutions that offer SSC Voc courses include 500 secondary schools run by the Ministry of Education (MoE), 49 technical secondary schools under the Directorate of Technical Education (DTE) with an additional 26 under construction, 12 technical training centres (run by the DTE) and approximately 14000 private training institutions. These are classified into four groups: (i) public, (ii) private (commercial), (iii) non-governmental organisations (NGO), and (iv) industry (managed by industrial associations and including on-the-job training). Formal TVET in Bangladesh consists of a choice of three programmes—basic, certificate, and diploma—with class (or grade) 8 completion a minimum entry qualification. Basic trade (basic skill standard certificate or national skills standard – Basic) is a 360-hour skills training course that focuses mainly on practical skills with some theory requiring class 8-level education. Various ministries manage the public institutions involved. The Directorate for Technical Education of the Ministry of Education (MoE) manages polytechnic and mono-technic institutes and technical schools and colleges; the Ministry of Labour manages technical training centres; the Ministry of Textiles manages vocational textile centres and the Ministry of Agriculture manages agricultural training institutes. In the case of industrial TVET, the majority of workers acquire their skills on the job. The majority (72%) of the firms have no training facilities and thus send their workers to external training organisations for upgrading as the need arises. Some employers' associations also have training establishments (centres of excellence) and NGOs also offer vocational education and training, while polytechnics under the DTE also offer post-secondary level diplomas. The formal TVET system has had minimal impact on the economy and on poverty reduction; of the total labour force in 2003, only 0.12% received technical training from the system.

1. Identification	DCI/ASIE/ 2006/ 18135
CRIS decision number	Technical and Vocational Training (TVET) reform Bangladesh
2. Classification:	
a) By Sector/Thematic Area	TP – TVET policy and systems: TM –TVET access to target groups: ST – Sectoral Training: LS – Active Labour Market policy and Measures: IE – Informal Economy IP:
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI: geographical programmes
c) By region)	Geographical programmes:

	Asia and Central Asia: BANGLADESH
d) By Period and Status	Decision year (2000-2012): 2006 ONGOING: (12/2007-12/2013) (with an 18 month extension through a rider to the contract, as it was planned initially to end by December 2012). Currently the EUD is negotiating with the ILO for a further 12 month extension months until the end of 2014.
3. Financial data	
	The total value of the project is EUR 16 000 000 comprising EU funding of EUR 14 000 000 (grant), ILO co-funding of EUR 1 000 000 and a contribution by the Government of Bangladesh of EUR 1,000,000 in kind.
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
	<p>The goals of the project are i) to contribute to the improvement of productivity in industry and services through better responding to skills-related needs; ii) to ensure the rapid development of national human capital and the improved employability of vocational education and training graduates; and iii) to enhance the labour market participation, social inclusion and empowerment of disadvantaged groups (low-literate youth, child labourers, women and rural communities).</p> <p>The specific objective of the project is to structure 'a market-orientated and flexible TVET system which responds to the demand for competitive skills of the modern sector as well as to the needs of youth and under-privileged groups'.</p> <p>In order to achieve the pursued main goals, the project is structured into five major components, articulated in a systemic approach that aims to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • C1: review and strengthen TVET policies/systems as well as legislation at central and decentralised level; • C2: enhance the flexibility, quality and relevance of TVET; • C3 strengthen TVET institutions through improved knowledge and skills of managers and teachers; • C4: improve skills development and enhance the productivity and competitiveness of key growth and export-orientated industries in both the formal industrial sector and the informal economies; • C5: increase access to TVET among underprivileged groups.
4.1. Objective (statement of the problem)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
	<p>The problems addressed comprised the structure and functioning of the TVET system, described at the time of project formulation as i) fragmented and lacking support by a policy and a consistent regulatory framework; ii) highly centralised; iii) organised in a traditional school-based way with a rigid and out-dated approach to curricula and vocational standards translating into courses of long duration; iv) irrelevant to the labour market (though this owed also to a general lack of labour market information); v) lacking any quality assurance mechanism and vi) further affected by an absence of qualified teachers and trainers. Such a system, with its rigidity and high barriers to entry, had little hope of serving the underprivileged (rural poor, child labourers, women, informal workers and the poorly educated). It provided no regulatory support to informal apprenticeships as the mechanism of skills production and transmission to the informal economy (which accounts for more than 70% of the country's economy) in the form of access to flexible training offered by public and private training institutions, formal certification, and the recognition of existing skills and informal learning.</p> <p>As a consequence of the above, mismatches between the knowledge and skills of TVET graduates and the needs of the labour market have increased and large groups of under-privileged youth and adults, who are part of the labour market and who represent the majority of the workforce operating in the export-orientated industries, continue to underperform or remain underemployed.</p>
4.2. Result of the project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Please describe the results achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention).
	<p>The project's expected results are:</p> <p>Result I: TVET policies, system and legislation reviewed and strengthened at central and decentralised levels</p> <p>Activities Set I: technical support to Government in drafting national policies; training of key</p>

stakeholders in legal and policy issues; organisational review and stakeholder consultations; development of model management structures and procedures based on research and model projects; establishment of a national TVET monitoring and information system.

Result II: Enhanced flexibility, quality and relevance of TVET

Activities Set II: development of a National Qualifications Framework; development or revision of skills standards in selected economic sectors; development of courses and curricula based on revised skills standards; introduction and enhancement of quality assurance mechanisms.

Result III: Strengthened TVET institutions through improved knowledge and skills of managers and teachers

Activities Set III: specific training and study tours for TVET managers; reform of TVET teacher training; capacity strengthening of NGOs and private TVET institutions.

Result IV: Improved skills development resulting in the enhanced productivity and competitiveness of key growth and export-orientated industries in both the formal industrial sector and the informal economies

Activities Set IV: raising demand for higher skills in the private sector; facilitate linkages between the training system and enterprises; introduce modern work practices, support learning at work.

Result V: Increased access to TVET among underprivileged groups

Activities Set V: strengthening of community-based training; provision of special access and training programmes to working children; support to apprenticeship models; introduction of an accreditation and recognition system for prior learning; provision of special access and training programmes for girls and women.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against 8 criteria (to be applied flexibly)

- 3 main broad criteria: **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability and Added value of ETF**

• **Relevance: A**

The project, as indicated by internal monitoring and reporting as well as by the evidence gathered over the course of the field visit undertaken by the experts, proves (so far) to be highly relevant to both the economic and social needs of the country. It is consistent with, and supportive of, the policy and programme framework within which the project is placed (the EC Country Strategy Paper and National Indicative Programme (CSP-NIP) and the development policy of the Government of Bangladesh). Problem analysis, intervention logic, and the logical framework matrix – including its objectively verifiable indicators (OVIs) of achievement – are also appropriate and consistent.

The analysis of strategic options, the implementation strategy, and management and coordination arrangements proved realistic in terms of i) choice and quantity of inputs (financial, human and administrative), ii) flexibility and responsiveness; and iii) adaptation to changes in context. The Logframe was adapted accordingly. Stakeholder participation in the management and implementation of the project, and the level of local ownership, appears to be high, although absorption and implementation capacities are not entirely ensured and some key project assumptions as regards government capacity to support implementation and to build on project achievements have proven to have been overly optimistic.

• **Effectiveness: B**

The project has achieved almost all the results expected under phase 1, in respect to the results of the five components':

- A national policy framework for demand-driven TVET implemented: A policy has been developed (pending approval);
- A system of modular and competency-based training and qualifications should be introduced through policy and organisational changes; Significant progress has been made, commensurate with project time elapsed. However the National Qualifications Framework is insufficiently impartial and is not linked with general and higher education;
- At least 20% of all Bangladesh Technical Education Board (BTEB)-affiliated courses should meet reformed quality assurance standards by the end of the project: While it is too early to assess this with confidence, there is a risk that the indicator is too ambitious;
- The share of female learners and disadvantaged groups attending BTEB-affiliated courses should more than double over five years; this indicator may prove over-ambitious. Good progress has

been made in creating access to TVET among disadvantaged groups under Component 5 although the indicator is ambiguous as to the percentage increase of the female participation (and would have been better disaggregated). The increasing female participation rates thus remain a challenge and stronger strategies may be needed;

- Employment rate of graduates from BTEB affiliated courses should increase by more than 50 % by the end of the project: Evidence of this is only likely to emerge post-project;
- Public-private partnerships in TVET should be established in at least four priority industry sectors by the end of the project: This has already been achieved and is recognised as a major project success.

- **Efficiency: B**

Some delays occurred at start-up. Nonetheless, what has been achieved compares well with what was planned and a number of unplanned outputs have arisen from activities, thus contributing to an increased multiplier effect. Project levels of expenditure appear to be fairly commensurate with elapsed and remaining time of project implementation although at the time of the MTR review, the project was not in a position to provide a detailed projection against budget lines with regard to further envisaged expenditure, risk of over- or under-spending and savings.

- **Coherence: A**

The project is fully coherent with EU policies on TVET, poverty reduction, gender, inclusion, equity, etc., thereby demonstrating the internal coherence of the reform (policy convergence and coordination mechanisms). The project is also externally coherent with EU TVET policy and acts as a strong and coherent response to EU equity policies in that it provides wide-ranging and equal access to the publicly-funded TVET system by expanding its capacity to enrol and bring courses closer to the beneficiaries, thus opening access to TVET for poor people.

- **Quality of the Design: A**

The project consists of two phases; the first of which is a two-year start-up phase (phase 1) which mainly shapes the framework for broader and increased support to each component. During this phase, in collaboration with all key stakeholders, further analysis and knowledge was generated on the TVET sub-system and its integration within the broader socio-economic policies and programmes in place to develop a realistic action agenda for phase 2, as well as to build the necessary capacity of stakeholders for such an agenda.

All aspects of the TVET system (legislation, management and organisation of TVET institutions, curriculum and course development, capacity building, awareness raising and direct cooperation with the private sector as well as targeted interventions for the underprivileged and women) are covered by the project.

- **Impact: B**

The impact of the project on its target groups (DTE, BTEB, BMET, public TVET institutions, polytechnics, private technical schools and centres, NGOs delivering non-certified, (very) short-term training) and on its final beneficiaries (employers' and workers' organisations, the underprivileged, regular TVET students and graduates) is considered to be high. The conceptual shift from qualification to competency-based training and assessment has left a permanent mark on the development of the TVET system in the country.

The project has respected the aid effectiveness principles of Government ownership, alignment, harmonisation, results orientation, and mutual accountability. Moreover, the project not only regularly interacts with other TVET-related projects and initiatives in order to avoid overlaps and contradictions, but it is also a recognised benchmark for other TVET interventions.

- **Sustainability: B**

The conceptual shift from qualification to competency-based training and assessment is now institutionalised and other donors currently committed to investing in TVET follow this line almost naturally. As a direct result of project achievements, the new available resources focusing on the different components initiated by the EC project ensure continuity and sustainability of the TVET reform process.

The emphasis on an experiential approach to the implementation of activities has promoted changes in knowledge, attitudes and behaviour among reform actors and key stakeholders in the TVET system. The project model produced good practices and changes that have proven both feasible and replicable, such that improvements in the skilling of a productive workforce are tangibly felt in a very

concrete manner. Business leaders, who understood the aim of the project – the creation of a skilled and productive workforce in a conducive workplace and regulatory environment – have contributed to the establishment of the tripartite sectoral TVET platforms, the ‘Industry Skills Councils’. In addition, the pilots and programme trials planned for the near future point to feasible options for scaling up.

- **Added value of ETF:** N/A

Not applicable.

4.3. Beneficiaries Who benefited/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

Beneficiaries of the project are: employers in nine selected economic sectors, TVET institutions, TVET students and trainees of formal and informal skills development subsystems, and vulnerable groups (child labourers, the rural population, low-literate youth and women). Direct recipients of support include the following institutions: the Ministry of Education (MoE); the Department of Technical Education (DTE), the National Skills Development Council; the Bangladesh Technical Education Board (BTEB); Public Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET); Polytechnics, NGOs delivering non-certified, (very) short-term training, and Private Technical Schools and Centres.

5. Synopsis Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The project is composed of 5 components, all of which address a legislative and structural reform of TVET systems, structures, organisation (decentralisation), responsiveness and quality in order to support the National Strategy for Accelerated Poverty Reduction. Decentralised policies are expected to be fine-tuned, drafted and implemented and the quality and adequacy of training assessed through the development of a National Qualifications Framework.

The project is articulated as follows:

Component 1: TVET policies, systems and legislation reviewed and strengthened at central and decentralised level;

Component 2: Enhanced flexibility, quality and relevance of TVET;

Component 3: Strengthened TVET institutions through improved knowledge and skills of managers and teachers;

Component 4: Improved skills development resulting in the enhanced productivity and competitiveness of key growth and export-orientated industries in the formal industrial sector;

Component 5: Increased access to TVET among underprivileged groups.

6. Key elements of success What were the critical elements that contributed to project “scalability”? What was the specific approach to capacity development that led to policy impact/changes?

The key elements of project success are as follows:

- The foundations of a new system that will require consolidation (the policy);
- Successful governance and coordination;
- The adoption of the NQF, skills standards, qualifications, CBT and a quality assurance mechanism;
- The involvement of 9 productive sectors through the ISC;
- The implementation of a competency-based training system;
- The presence of the informal sector programme;
- The commitment of key stakeholders and TVET reform actors;
- The effort to promote gender in terms of access to TVET as well as the combating of stereotypes;
- Communication and quality of the produced material;
- Interaction with other donors;
- The leading role of the EU as the driver of the reform;
- The clear vision and direction for future implementation of all elements of the TVET reform;
- The visibility strategy and the systematic dissemination of project products and results.

7. Lessons learnt Please include any lessons learnt (regardless of whether these were envisaged at project inception).

The project is ambitious and the time set at the beginning proved insufficient; hence an extension was necessary. A TVET reform is a medium- to long-term process; hence the project activities and results, even if universally achieved, do not ensure an immediate impact in terms of institutionalisation of all the proposed changes. A phase 2 project would thus be necessary to consolidate and accomplish the results of the current one for which assumptions and risk mitigation

on absorption capacity, institutional response and scaling up should be better formulated. The quality of design (consistent and flexible) as well as the high level of project management facilitate implementation but do not ensure impact and sustainability of the final results *per se*. An efficiently implemented TVET reform project attracts additional resources in the field of TVET and has a catalytic effect on other donors. The introduction of an NTVQF can establish stronger links between skills development and technical education if completed by a credit mechanism that determines the equivalence between formal TVET and non-formal and informal skills development. The involvement of the private sector is more effective if i) it is pursued throughout the entire process (from development of the regulatory framework to quality assurance, standardisation and harmonisation of qualifications, competency-based programmes, certification, assessment and delivery); and ii) it is structured through participatory platforms such as Industrial Skills Councils and sectoral Centres of Excellence. Increased access among vulnerable groups, though currently of a pilot nature, looks to be possible if a flexible offer, specifically adapted to the learning capacity and level of each target group, is developed.

8. Implementing partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
International Labour Organisation, Ministry of Education, Ministry of Labour, Ministry of Overseas Employment and Overseas Welfare.	
9. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including telephone and e-mail.
EU Delegation in Bangladesh, ILO office in Bangladesh.	
10. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs).
AFA FP-DEC18135_2.doc. TP-DEC18135_3.doc. CSP. LFM-DEC18135_1.doc. DEC18135_4.pdf Action fiche. Final Report – Bangladesh TVET Reform Project MT. National Skills Development Policy 2011. UNDAF 2012-15.	

CHINA

Project title: EU-China Managers' Exchange and Training Programme (METP)

Grading:

1. Relevance: C
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: D
4. Coherence: C
5. Quality of the Design: C
6. Impact: C
7. Sustainability: C
8. Added Value of ETF: N/A

0. TVET at a Glance

In China, vocational education and training takes place in four main contexts: lower secondary schools (now a very small sector), upper secondary vocational schools, tertiary education, through adult learning and enterprise training.

In China, nine years of full-time schooling, covering primary and lower secondary school, are compulsory, and are now nearly universal in their application. There are now a declining number of vocational lower secondary schools (with less than 1% of students enrolled); in urban areas, these schools are effectively disappearing, but they continue to have some roles in rural areas, providing basic skills in areas such as agriculture and handicrafts. One reason for their continued existence is that some parents from peasant families will not send their children to school unless they learn practical skills.

Following compulsory education, around three quarters of students (74%) go on to upper secondary education. A national exam determines entry - either a vocational or general track - with better results being necessary for the general track. In 2007, 43% of upper secondary students (adults excluded) were enrolled on vocational programmes. The objective of the government is 50%. Many parents and students aspire to tertiary education and therefore initially aim for general upper secondary education, where many students might expect to go on to tertiary education.

On the vocational track, students apply for different vocational schools and programmes in their province and are selected according to their results. They can also apply to enter good vocational schools in other provinces - very often in the developed eastern provinces (many such internal migrants want to stay in the region in which they studied following graduation, but cannot obtain local hukou (the long-established system for granting official residence status); they nevertheless tend to stay and work - possibly facing a number of labour market obstacles)).

Typically, schools are managed by the third tier of government - counties or cities. However, other bodies can also be responsible for schools; sometimes these are the provinces and sometimes government agencies that are not directly responsible for education, such as the agriculture bureau; sometimes different bodies are also within government at provincial level. Fees for upper secondary vocational schools are customary.

On completing vocational schooling, students receive a graduation certificate delivered by the Ministry of Education. Some of them can also obtain a vocational certificate (associated with a particular occupational skill) delivered by the Ministry of Labour and Human Resources upon passing a practical exam. Depending on the school and its level of cooperation with companies, students can also obtain firm-specific certificates during their studies, for example a 'Toyota' certificate.

The curriculum is divided into three parts - about one third for general academic skills defined nationally by the Ministry of Education, about one third defined nationally associated with a particular occupation, and finally about one third (also in the occupational field), determined locally according to local needs, sometimes at school level. There are 270 vocational specialities nationally grouped into thirteen branches as follows: 1. Agriculture and forestation; 2. Resource and environment; 3. Energy; 4. Civil works and hydraulic engineering; 5. Manufacture; 6. Transportation; 7. Information technology; 8. Medicine and health; 9. Business, trade and tourism; 10. Finance and economics; 11. Culture, arts and sports; 12. Social and public affairs; 13. Others.

Many students want to continue on from vocational schooling into tertiary education. In June each

year, there is a national examination for all students wishing to enter tertiary education; however, it appears that there is a limit in the proportion of vocational school graduates allowed to enter tertiary education through this route. There are other routes into tertiary education, so a much higher proportion of the cohort can end up in tertiary education by one route or another. Tertiary education has expanded dramatically in recent years; in 2007, there were nearly 19 million students enrolled on undergraduate and college specialised courses. Around 8 million students are enrolled in tertiary VET. Teachers in the vocational schools are either recruited directly as graduates or from industry. In most cases, schools will recruit teachers themselves. While some vocational teachers lack work experience, it is the policy of the national council for every teacher to return to industry regularly - spending two months every two years in industry. Many vocational teachers work part-time in industry and part-time in schools.

Many of the key relationships between the VET system and employers are locally negotiated. Some schools have extremely close relationships with employers. The 3rd or sometimes 4th year of vocational school consists of work placements with companies (while most vocational schools run 3 year programmes, some are 4 year schools. The extra year allows more academic learning during the whole period with often more workplace training). Consideration is being given to institutionalising the 3rd or 4th year as workplace training, and introducing incentives for firms to take on students.

At national level, the Ministry of Education sets guidelines for the curriculum; the responsibility for implementation lies with the provinces and sometimes the schools. While the capacity to implement the curriculum locally allows for such arrangements, it also inhibits the commitment of industry at national level to define key competences for particular occupations. Some particular challenges arise because of the transition from the planned to the market economy. Employer organisations were formerly part of the government but are now independent; however, they are relatively young organisations - an opportunity is therefore emerging for the VET system to engage with independent employer organisations.

A special 1.5% tax on employers supports continuous adult training, but employers are not available to support vocational schools. For initial training.

1. Identification (CRIS decision number):	5779 (ASIE/2004/005-779) EuropeAid/121709/C/SV/CN
2. Classification	
a) By Sector/Thematic Area:	TM - TVET access to target groups ST - Sectoral Training
b) By Instrument (fund/budget line):	DCI: geographical programmes - Asie
c) By Region:	Geographical programmes: Asia and Central Asia: CHINA
d) By period and status:	Decision year: 2004. Period: Implementation 15 July 2006 - 30 June 2011. Status: CLOSED
3. Financial data	
EUR 23 000 000 EUR (EUR 17 200 000 EC Contribution and EUR 5 800 000 Beneficiary Contribution).	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
The EU-China Managers Exchange and Training Programme (METP) was one of the major EU development assistance programmes in China in the field of human resource development. METP was the successor of the previous EU-China Junior Managers Training Programme (JMTP). The overall objective of METP was to support China's reform process and promote mutual understanding between China and the EU through the development of human resources. The specific purpose of the project was to meet the demand for EU-China cooperation in the profit and non-profit sectors towards improved management and intercultural exchange capacity in key sectors.	
4.1 Objective (statement of the problem)	What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
METP could not come at a better time to capitalise on the new trading reality. In 2004, the EU became	

China's largest trading partner and today, China is already the EU's second largest trading partner, rapidly catching up on the USA in trade flow terms.

In view of the growing integration of the world economic system, we are now witnessing the need and motivation for both China and the EU to understand and become familiar with each other's business practices:

- In China, the new generation of enterprises and organisations ranging from non-governmental organisations (NGOs) and small and medium enterprises (SMEs) to business federations, are interested in broadening the scope of their managerial expertise so as to build on the wide foundations of Chinese social and economic reforms. The METP aims at contributing to China's reform process through the transfer of know-how to key players in Chinese society;
- Meanwhile, the EU is developing a greater interest in the growth of an efficient, sustainable and prosperous China as increasing numbers of European companies are investing and branching out across the country. Therefore, the programme aims at enhancing the capacity of EU managers to act with confidence in the Chinese business environment and improving their capacity to succeed.

The METP is a joint response to these needs and interests coming from both sides and the commitment of the EU to support China's endeavours in improving the skills of managers from SMEs and NGOs in particular. At the highest level, the Chinese leadership is continuing to support China's economic liberalisation, giving increasing space to private interests and individual creative enterprise. The Programme supports these historic changes by offering sound experience and sensible advice from market-driven Europe to managerial staff setting off on routes that are undergoing intensive development in China.

4.2 Result of the project

Please describe the results achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention).

There were four components under METP: – Component 1: Training for Chinese Managers; Component 2: Capacity Building for Chinese Institutions; Component 3: Training for European Managers; and Component 4: Intercultural Capacity and Skills Development.

The key expected results were the following:

1. Management training to up to 248 Chinese managers delivered in 5 intakes during the life span of the project; key players able to contribute to China's reform process after having reached a level of management skills that enables them to use effectively their know-how gained through their exposure to the European society economy and business environment;
2. Training for these Chinese managers supported and facilitated in a timely fashion with up-to-date methodologies and with satisfactory arrangements and accommodation;
3. Suitable training modules for teaching management and business knowledge for these Chinese managers developed and regularly improved;
4. Introduction of these Chinese managers to European institutions; company and study visits to different EU Member States and other relevant activities successfully supported and implemented.

The METP Programme was eventually structured in 5 intakes, during which Chinese managers received management training at three leading European Business Schools (ESCP Europe MMU and Solvay) and followed internships in Europe. Under METP, 246 Chinese managers participated in the training and internships in Europe.

The organisation of the different intakes basically required the same spectrum and sequence of activities for each of them. Each Intake of the METP was structured around the following processes:

- Selection process under which ESCP Europe Consortium supported CCPIT and ETAT by sending two linguistic experts from MMU;
- Intercultural trainings and practical briefing in China for all selected Chinese and European managers –initially foreseen as two weeks of intercultural trainings and one week of practical briefing and reduced to two weeks in total for practical reasons. The ESCP - Europe Consortium supported CCPIT and ETAT for the practical briefing of Chinese managers on the programme in Europe by sending representatives of the consortium in China;
- Training of Chinese managers in Europe with a duration of seven weeks in total at three leading European Business Schools including companies and study visits;
- Internships with a duration of seven weeks each (maximum three internships for first four intakes and only two internships for fifth intake).

The three leading European Business Schools, in Manchester, Paris, and Brussels, implemented the

seven week training activities for Chinese managers and complemented the training by a tailor made programme of visits and subsequently conducted internships of up to 21 weeks in European companies/organisations. The Logistic Partners played a strong part in supporting managers during the entire programme and kept in touch with them on a regular basis. This guaranteed an efficient and smooth implementation of the internships.

The ESCP Europe Consortium strongly assisted ETAT with visa procedures and preparation of documentation for the participants' stay in Europe.

European managers received 7 months of Chinese language training at UIBE, the University of International Business and Economics in Beijing followed by 3 months of internships in China. The formal training for EU and CN managers was enriched by an attractive side programme of study visits, lectures and business related activities which aimed at giving an all-round preparation for doing business in a different culture to the managers.

At the start of each intake, all European and Chinese participants received a 2-week joint intercultural training session. The Programme also foresaw capacity building activities and a teacher exchange scheme for UIBE. All METP programme participants were expected to become actively involved in the EU China Managers Association (EUCMA) which shall provide a powerful business network platform for young European and Chinese professionals.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against 8 criteria
(to be applied flexibly)

3 main broad criteria: **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability and Added Value of ETF**

• **Relevance: C**

The programme was relevant to the promotion of mutual understanding between China and Europe and to increasing networking and business opportunities between the participants and their companies. The programme was marginally relevant to supporting reforms in China. The CCPIT, due to its networks and official mandate and the fact that it had managed the forerunner programme JMTP, was an appropriate body to implement the METP.

• **Effectiveness: B**

Until its completion, the METP trained 170 European managers and 250 Chinese managers in 5 training intakes, compared to a target of 400. They spent one semester at a European University to teach, study and undertake research. 12 different capacity building events for UIBE's administrative and management staff as well as the UIBE Chinese language teachers were organised.

- The networking of UIBE with European universities was not entirely established during the life of the programme did lead to a minimal tangible outputs. No structured network between the of UIBE with the three European universities could be realised;
- The Chinese language training in UIBE was generally rated as highly satisfactory. The business training in Europe was also considered very useful though it should have incorporated more practical elements taking into account the backgrounds of the Chinese participants;
- The intercultural training was identified by the participants as one of most important and useful aspects of METP.

• **Efficiency: D**

The start-up of the project was problematic due to disagreements between the various Project stakeholders. The situation was compounded by the coordination problems and conflict of interests caused by the three separate services contracts.

- The budget of the METP was very generous and three of the four components were over-budgeted. This resulted in the final saving of more than EUR 3 000 000 at the end of the implementation of METP, primarily from the incidental budget of the GOPA service contract;
- The total service fees of the three services providers were more than EUR 6 000 000, accounting for more than 45% of the total project budget used. Given the fact that only 7-week basic management courses were offered for 250 Chinese managers, and 7-month basic business Chinese courses were taught for 170 European managers, the fee costs appeared to be quite high;
- The logistical partners only played a limited role in the implementation of the planned activities. Their capacities, networks and relevant HRD experiences were not fully utilised by the METP;
- Given the fact there were three separate services contracts without reporting hierarchy amongst them, the overall efficiency of the coordination and implementation of METP activities was good, due to the efforts of the three services providers, the EU Delegation and the Chinese partners.

GOPA headquarters also provided sound backstopping to the METP's implementation.	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Coherence: C <p>In today's globalised world and with the EU being one of China's two largest export markets, both economies are increasingly interdependent. The EU and China cooperate closely on a wide range of economic and financial issues.</p> <p>In this respect, the programme is coherent with the EU's China Policy to encourage the integration of China in the world economy through bringing it fully into the world trading system and supporting the process of economic and social reform that is continuing in China.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of the Design: C <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The design of the logical framework needed to be improved. It lacked quantifiable targets thus making assessment of efficiency and effectiveness of performance difficult; • While Components 1 and 3 were well elaborated in the Financing Agreement, the descriptions of Components 2 and 4 needed to be more detailed. Lack of specifics translated into weak details in the overall and annual workplans on what needed to be undertaken for those two components; • The design of three separate service contracts and allotment of some duties to one contract, which could have 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Impact: C <p>Beyond the broad scope of the programme, specific European Union and Chinese human resource priorities were mutually addressed by the METP. The programme offered the opportunity to European SMEs to smoothen the way into business relations with China. As for China, the METP was preferentially targeting specifically young professionals from less developed Western, Central and North-Eastern regions to participate in the programme.</p> <p>The programme had a significant impact on lives and careers of the participating mid-level managers and entrepreneurs in China and Europe. The majority of European managers trained have either successfully established a business in China or continue working with China from Europe.</p> <p>Almost all of METP participants are now actively involved in the EUCMA (EU China Managers Association) which serves the purpose of a professional business network. EUCMA organises networking activities with other business related stakeholders and is actively promoting itself through the organising of diverse events.</p> <p>The longer-term impacts of the project will take time to be materialize and will take many shapes and forms. It is clear that networking, however informally, has been initiated amongst participants and will continue. In addition, the participants have substantially enhanced their abilities to do business in China and Europe. The resulting increase in SME development, SME cooperation and increased trade and greater intercultural exchanges will take time to develop.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sustainability: C <p>METP has developed an interesting business model to train European managers in China and Chinese managers in Europe. If financial resources can be secured, it would make the business model replicate easily; METP has developed some templates, textbooks, guidelines and best practices which can be reused in the future. Some Chinese institutions have adopted those materials for training purposes.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • UIBE faculty members trained under the teacher exchange programme are now teaching their students with increased knowledge and research skills learned from the European universities; • Sustainability of SME businesses involving Europe and China has enhanced because of the METP. Some METP managers are developing SMEs in China or are doing business with China or Europe; • EUCMA has been supported by METP for its activities in the last two years. However, the sustainability of EUCMA has a long way to go. It requires a strategic vision, dynamic leadership, open membership and a market-driven approach to move to the next level of its operation and success. 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Added Value of ETF: N/A 	
4.3 Beneficiaries	Who benefited/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?
A total of 412 participants graduated. Altogether more than 1300 applications were received. The gender ratio of the METP was: Chinese women 56%: men 44%; European women 34%: men 66%. 10 teachers of UIBE participated in a successful teacher exchange scheme.	
5. Synopsis	Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The EU-China Managers Exchange and Training Programme (METP), launched in July 2006, is a four-year intergovernmental cooperation project between the EU and China in the field of international trade. Built within the dynamic context of continuously developing relations between the EU and China, the programme will enhance business expertise by developing European and Chinese human resources.

The METP takes up the positive experience gained from the EU Junior Managers Training Programme (JMTP) which was implemented in China from 1999 to 2003. The JMTP provided language training for some 150 young European managers. The EU-China Managers Exchange and Training Programme (METP) provides support for exchange and training support to Chinese and European managers.

The programme intends to organise training and internships for 200 Chinese and 200 European managers in both China and Europe. The METP is a four-year intergovernmental project between the European Commission and the Government of the People's Republic of China.

The programme is implemented by the China Council for the Promotion of International Trade (CCPIT) in close consultation with the Ministry of Commerce on the Chinese side and the European Commission Delegation in China on the European side.

Total funding for the Programme over the four years was EUR 23 000 000, of which the contribution of the European Commission was EUR 17 200 000. The Chinese side provided financial contributions of EUR 3 450 000 euros and/or in-kind contributions to the counter value of EUR 2 350 000.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to project "scalability"? What was the specific approach to capacity development that led to policy impact/ changes?

Although METP had two fundamental design flaws – i.e. (1) three parallel but separate service contracts, and (2) the overlooking of European visa requirements for Chinese managers, the implementation of the METP was successful.

- Among the four components of METP, Components 1 and 4 were more successful than Components 2 and 3. Component 1 exceeded the training target by 25%, and Component 4 also exceeded expectations in terms of how it was able to teach different cultures and business practices. However, Component 3 was short of the training target by 15% while Component 2 was delayed in implementation and did not fully develop;
- One of the important features of the METP implementation was the close cooperation and coordination of the Chinese and European stakeholders (particularly EUD and MOFCOM/CCPIT, three services providers, the Project Director and ETAT Team Leader) in the planning and delivery of the METP activities;
- Another of METP's success factors was due partly to the external environment of the rapid economic growth in China and increased importance of China-EU economic and trade relations. Both China and the European Union attached great importance to the bilateral strategic partnerships and training Chinese and European managers who were familiar with the businesses and cultures of the other side;
- The budget of the METP was rather generous and the efficiency of the use of the project funds was a mixed picture. The three of the four components were overly budgeted, resulting in a low utilization rate (80%) of the project funds. The use of the four logistical partners in Europe for Component 1 has not been deemed as an efficient arrangement;
- The METP has gradually built-up its momentum from Intake 1 to Intake 5 and enjoyed an increasingly good reputation in China and Europe. However, the sustainability of the project is still questionable if the EU and China decide not to continue the support for such an important initiative. It is not clear at this moment that EUCMA can survive without the financial support of METP or other similar EU projects.

7. Lessons learnt

Please include any lessons learnt (regardless of whether these were envisaged at project inception).

- The design flaws of METP should be the first thing to avoid for the future programming of any development assistance projects. It cannot be imagined that the visa problem in Europe for Chinese managers was overlooked in the design process of this project. A single service contract with hierarchical reporting channels and coordination mechanisms among the services providers would be much more efficient and effective for implementation and could substantially reduce potential risks;

- The recruitment of the METP participants should be linked with the service contracts of the European and Chinese university consortia rather than with the GOPA contract. In that case, the university consortia would have more incentives to recruit more candidates for their respective training programmes. It could also potentially reduce the conflicts among the services providers. Of course, the quality of the selected participants should be maintained. If only one service contract was signed, the above problem would automatically disappear;
- It takes time to build good momentum and a high reputation of a project. As a result, it is important to conduct the publicity/visibility activities of the project from the very beginning of the implementation rather than waiting until Year 3 to hire a public relations firm to advertize the opportunities of METP in Europe;
- On the whole, the METP was considered an expensive project, given the associated costs and the numbers of the Chinese and European managers trained in the last four years. There could be some ways to reduce the project costs, for example, selecting European managers with basic Chinese language capacity in order to reduce the length of the Chinese language training, and reducing the European logistical partners for the project;
- It is interesting to note that a significant number of Europeans were based in China when they applied for the admission to the METP and they were basically familiar with the country and the cultures through working and residing in China. In that case, the Project added less value to their intercultural understanding than had it targeted to those with little exposure to China. Similarly, many Chinese participants had been abroad for business in Europe, and other Western countries. This has raised the effectiveness issue of the targeted participants;
- The Chinese business training at UIBE was improved after the mid-term review thanks to the recommendations from the evaluation team. There were three volumes of textbooks of Business Chinese compiled; and there were more interactive sessions, and a tutoring system in place where senior Chinese students provided one-to-one lessons for 10 hours per week. However, it came a bit late;
- The European business schools used the standard, off-the-shelf training materials for the Chinese participants in their management training courses. The schools did not customize the materials to meet the specific needs of the Chinese managers. The instructors did not have in-depth knowledge about the situation in China although they are very knowledgeable with academic topics and concepts and European situations and practices. If those concepts and European practices were taught in comparison with those in China, the impact would have been much greater. In that case, the training might eventually contribute to the reform process in China;
- Finally, it is important for the EU Delegation and the concerned Chinese authorities to clearly spell out the sources of financial commitments prior to the signing of the Financing Agreement. It should be clearly documented how much of the project would be funded by the Chinese side, what cost items would be financed by which institutions and in what forms (cash or in-kind) and where were the funding sources, etc. If possible, the Financing Agreement should make the counterpart financing legally binding.

8. Implementing Partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

Executing Authority: Ministry of Commerce (MOFCOM) of the PR China).

Representative AIDCO: ASIE/2004/005-779 Eduardo Barreto.

Representative EU Delegation: Alexandra Lehmann Universities and business schools.

Implementing Agency: China Council for the Promotion of International Trade (CCPIT) under the Supervision of the Executing Authority.

Implementing Body: Lot 1: EuropeAid/121708/C/SV/CN (GOPA).

Lot 2: EuropeAid/121709/C/SV/CN (UIBE Consortium).

Lot 3: EuropeAid/121710/C/SV/CN (ESCP-EAP Consortium).

9. Contacts

Provide contact details for further information, including telephone and e-mail.

Project Director: Mr. Xu Liang (Email: xuliang@ccpit.org).

ETAT (European Technical Assistance Team) Team Leader Mr. Stefan Hell (Email: stefan.hell@metp.net.cn).

METP Project Management Office.

Suite 604, Tower 12, Jianwai SOHO, 39 East 3rd Ring Road.
Chaoyang District, Beijing 100022, PR China.
Telephone: +86-10-58 69 25 81.

10.Sources, links & publications

Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs).

- DEC5779-1: Monitoring Report China - Cn -Eu-ChinaManagers Exchange And Training Programme31/10/2007;
- DEC5779-2: Monitoring Report Aidco/Delegation Response Sheet;
- DEC5779-3: Monitoring Report22/05/2008;
- DEC5779-4: Monitoring Report22/05/2008;
- DEC5779-5: RESPONSE SHEET – Results-Oriented Monitoring. RESPONSIBLE HQ / EC DELEGATION;
- DEC5779-6: Mid-Term Evaluation of EU-China METP. Contract Number no 2008/170-233;
- DEC5779-7: Framework Contract Europeaid/127054/C/SER/multi Lot 10. Specific Contract N° 2011/260193 with Transtec. Draft Final Report. Final Evaluation of the Eu-China Managers Exchange and Training Programme (METP);
- DEC5779-7: Impact Survey of the EU-China Managers Exchange and Training Programme (METP) from 2006 to 2011;
- Management: Progress Report – 1st Intake 01 April 2007 – 30 September 2007. Manag_Training_China_Interim 1, 2, 3, 4, 5.6.7 to 31 March 2011. Final Report 15 July 2006 – 30 June 2011 Financing Agreement N° ASIE/2004/5779. Service Contract N° Europe Aid/121710/C/SV/CN. Lyon 5 July 2011 (Manag_Training_Cina_finalrep.pdf);
- TA: Six-monthly Report (8 reports and final report). Submitted to the EC Delegation by the Team Leader of the European Technical Assistance Team.

<http://www.uibe.cn/om/english/gyxm.html>

http://eeas.europa.eu/delegations/china/documents/projects/110721_metp_en.pdf

www.metp.net.cn

www.eu-china-metp.eu

www.eucma.org

http://europe.chinadaily.com.cn/europe/2011-03/31/content_12256106.htm

Learning for Jobs: OECD Reviews of Vocational Education and Training – Options for China. 2010, Website www.oecd.org/edu/learningforjobs

<http://www.oecd.org/education/skills-beyond-school/45486493.pdf>

http://eeas.europa.eu/delegations/china/eu_china/political_relations/index_en.htm

KAZAKHSTAN

Project title: Support to the National Programme of Vocational Education Development

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: B
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of the Design: B
6. Impact: B
7. Sustainability: B
8. Added Value of ETF: N/A

0. TVET at a Glance

The TVET system is centralised. Matters related to objectives, content, methodologies and the organisation of vocational education and training are the responsibility of the national government while finance, maintenance, resources are under the remit of local executive authorities. The Ministry of Education and Science (MoES) is the central executive body in charge of managing the Kazakh educational system. The Department of Technical and Vocational Education is in charge of the TVET policy and development in line with the MoES 2004 statute. In 2011, the Prime Minister established the National Council for Vocational and Technical Education. The sectoral ministries, employer and branch representatives, regions, and local administrations are involved in this council. In addition, 16 regional councils, 14 sectoral councils, and 162 local and institutional councils were set up. A system of vertical VET quality management based on the council structure came into force at the beginning of 2011 with the national council reporting to the Prime Minister, under the coordination of an executive body affiliated to the Republican Scientific and Methodological Centre. The Republican Institute for Upgrading Qualifications of Administrative and Academic Staff in Education, various city-level institutions and six interregional centres manage the upgrading of teacher qualifications and retraining. The Altynsarin National Academy of Education is responsible for scientific provision. In 2012 Kasipkor Holding, the national joint stock company financed by the government and supported by both the public and private sector, was set up to study and implement global TVET best practices in the Kazakh system; to create a network of world-class colleges in partnership with leading educational institutions and businesses and to strengthen national and international TVET cooperation.

Since 2011, no distinction exists between initial and secondary TVET and the system is now called 'vocational and technical education' and all institutions are now referred to as 'colleges'. There are pathways between upper secondary general education and VET, and between VET and higher education, either directly or by progression from initial VET to secondary VET and thence to higher education. The number of TVET institutions increased by 49% in the past 10 years as a result of the growth of private colleges (79%, compared with a 15% increase in the number of public colleges. Retraining for unemployed is to be requested by or as part of entrepreneurship-promotion initiatives for self-employment. In-service training of educational institutions is often paid by the state or shared with the enterprises.

The Law on Education was adopted in 2007 and the underlying State Programme of Education Development 2020, focused on modernising VET and providing updated VET content and infrastructure. The law on "Amendments and additions" introduced the norms of social partnership and cooperative TVET provision based on corporate and shared responsibility between the state, enterprises and vocational schools. A legal framework exists for a certification system and the development of the NQF and professional standards. Also in 2011, amendments were made to the occupational framework in the Labour Code and to the Employment 2020 programme.

As the ETF's Torino Process report for Kazakhstan 2013 indicates, TVET legislation was amended in 2011 providing the legal framework for cooperative VET, social partnerships, company investment and active participation in VET reform by contributing to emerging VET structures and formats. In 2011 and 2012, a variety of developments can be observed simultaneously in different

contexts and levels. Three regional strands were identified (highly industrialised areas with large international and national companies and SMEs as subcontracted partners; areas mainly with SMEs; rural areas with a very low population density) and different TVET formats (full-time school, part-time school, dual system, cooperative VET and work-based learning partially identified for different VET fields and professions. The urgent need is to find new ways of organising VET, improving quality and coordinating these processes. The TVET system is financed with a share of 0.3% of GDP or 7.2% of the overall education budget and should gradually increase to reach the average percentage level of GDP of highly industrialised countries by 2020 (State Programme of Education Development for 2011-2020).

1. Identification (CRIS decision number): 19259	A title refers to a project or programme (executed either by a Government, a single agency project or a joint programme)..
2. Classification	
a) By Sector/Thematic Area:	TP – TVET policy and systems: LS – Active Labour Market policy and Measures:
b) By Instrument (fund/budget line):	DCI: geographical programmes DCI: thematic programmes (investing in people IiP) YES (but not IiP).
c) By region:	Geographical programmes: Asia and Central Asia: YES (Kazakhstan)
d) By period and status:	Decision year (2000-2012): 2007 Status: CLOSED
3. Financial data	
Planned amount (Primary commitment): EUR 19 000 000; Counterpart contribution: EUR 191 000; total Programme cost: EUR 19 191 000. No data were available regarding real/total disbursement to date.	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
As stated in the AF: <i>'The overall objective of the project will be to support the economic development and human capital potential of the cities and regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan by making vocational education and training more responsive to the needs of the labour market and improving access to qualifications'</i> . The specific objectives are to:	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Support the implementation of the National Programme of Vocational Education Development (NPVED) at national and regional level; 2. Support the development of national and regional stakeholders in VET (central and regional administrations, employer involvement platforms, quality assurance bodies, methodological institutes (curriculum development, educational management and teacher training) and schools, as defined in the National Programme of Vocational Education Development (NPVED); 3. Assist the Government of RK in setting up a National Qualifications Framework which will form a bridge between the labour market and VET (to establish mechanisms to continuously assess the labour market needs, their implications for qualifications, and how are these provided for by vocational education and training. Two economic sectors were chosen in consultation with the Government). 	
4.1 Objective (statement of the problem)	What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
The TVET system faces two major challenges: providing the youth bulge (50% of the population is under 29) with sufficient education, training and job opportunities to ensure prosperity and stability; adapting the education system to the needs of a globally integrated market economy, an open society and diverse regional economic conditions, hence to develop and implement an open TVET model of cooperation between education and business. At the time of the project design, the VET sector in Kazakhstan counted 320 vocational schools and 510 colleges, with a total of 550 000 students and 40 000 staff. It suffered from insufficient state funding, low quality of education and a lack of appropriate involvement of social partners and enterprises. The declining prestige of VET and the insufficient students' enrolment lead increasingly to a lack of qualified workers and skills shortages on the rapidly developing labour market. After the Presidential messages of 2005 and	

2006 emphasising the need for technical and agricultural professions, and the establishment of a VET system based on a public-private partnership to respond to the needs of the labour market, state funding increased by 15% and four new inter-regional training centres for the key industrial sectors were established. The government response materialised in the form of a National Programme of Vocational Education Development (NPVED) 2005-2010 to reform the sector. But the insufficient capacity in policy-making, the weakness or non-existence of VET institutions at regional or national level, and the absence of mechanisms to ensure that the VET system leads to qualifications required by the labour market prevented the transition from the current to a modern TVET system. From 2008, about USD 227 000 000 were allocated for TVET sector reform. As a consequence of the renewed political focus, a new separate VET department was established in MES and the number of the ministry's VET staff doubled.

4.2 Result of the project

Please describe the results achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention).

Due to the *ex-ante* nature of the received information, the assessor cannot duly assess the results achieved. The expected results of the project are:

- Direct support to overall NPVED implementation and to future planning in the VET sector provided (workshops of the VET working group established in the previous EU financed VET project, or a similar national strategic stakeholder body, to review VET reform progress; advice and recommendations to MES on NPVED implementation issues; in close coordination with other donors, support MES in preparing for a sector-wide programme in education.);
- Performance of key VET institutions in Kazakhstan (setting up a task force in each of the key national and regional institutions responsible for VET system management and administration, quality assurance, curriculum development and training of teachers and train; training, coaching and peer learning for working out institution development plans and their implementation; twinning arrangements with corresponding EU institutions; educational exchanges between Kazakh VET schools and governing bodies with their counterparts abroad);
- Foundations laid for Kazakhstan's National Qualifications Framework as a bridge between the labour market and VET (development and implementation of national NQF policy linked with NPVED by strategic advice on NQF structure, functions and mechanisms; NQF development in two sectors of economy by supporting developments from labour market analysis to identifying occupational profiles, vocational qualifications at different levels, learning outcomes, competence based curricula and learner assessment, including non-formal and informal learning).

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against 8 criteria
(to be applied flexibly)

3 main broad criteria: **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability and Added Value of ETF**

- **Relevance: A**

The *Support to the National Programme of Vocational Education Development – 2007/019-259* is a centralised management project that deals with the Vocational Education and Training sector and is fully in line with Kazakhstan's economic and social development needs. Kazakh governmental policies have put human resource issues at the top of the agenda, particularly the lack of middle-level qualifications to support the diversification of the economy. This alignment clearly demonstrates the relevance of the project to national Government priorities, as well to Commission policies.

- **Effectiveness: B**

In the absence of monitoring and final report documentation, the elements of design, the Torino process report for Kazakhstan and Central Asia, the evolution of the national policy framework and the main areas selected for support by the international development partners it is possible to consider the project as effective for the development of the TVET reform. The project ensured continuity and systematised Commission support to TVET provided through the TACIS programme and built the basis for subsequent support, particularly in relation to the capacity strengthening of the MoES, the partnership with the private sector and the introduction of the NQF.

- **Efficiency: B**

This assessment could only be made on ex-ante project design documentation received by the

assessor; thus, the assigned grading is subject to confirmation by final evaluations or ex-post documentation.

- **Coherence: B**

Under the new Development Cooperation Instrument (DCI), the overall priorities for Central Asia are to promote stability, to strengthen governance and transparency, to reduce poverty and to promote closer cooperation both within Central Asia and with the EU. In Kazakhstan, the DCI, as detailed in the Action Fiche, is intended to assist with the diversification of the country's economy and other related sectors.

This project is designed to support the development of an appropriately qualified workforce, which for middle-level qualifications implies the development of a relevant VET system. In summary, the EC is seen as a reliable partner to offer more systemic sectoral policy advice. A supplementary indicator of coherence is the fact that this project is in line with the overarching objective of the DCI to foster sustainable development. In addition the project shows external coherence with UN policies and specifically with the Millennium Development Goals.

- **Quality of the Design: B**

On the basis of the provided documentation, the project design (situation analysis, Log Frame and sequence of actions and selected recipients and beneficiaries) is satisfactory.

- **Impact: B**

While it was not possible to directly assess this criterion due to the (*ex-ante*) documentation received, given the evident alignment of the national context with the EU country and regional programme, on the basis of indirect sources and in light of the subsequent development of the TVET system, it is possible to observe that the project had a positive impact on the TVET reform process and on the direct beneficiaries. Impact on the labour market, the educational system, students, unemployed, teachers and social partners and Kazakh society as a whole could not be assessed.

- **Sustainability: B**

The project provides support to policy and system reform with a view to developing greater flexibility and better response to the market, which in turn requires the improvement and renovation of the current qualification framework. This criterion is mainly assessed as positive at design level, although national policies, programmes, structure and financing of the TVET system in the subsequent year confirm that the TVET system became structurally more solid and financially more viable.

- **Added Value of ETF: N/A**

Although the ETF is currently very active in the country, it did not have any direct role in relation to this project.

4.3 Beneficiaries

Who benefited/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

National level: Ministry of Education and Science (MES), Centre for confirmation and recognition of qualification, Institutes for VET curriculum development and teacher training; Ministry of Labour and Social Protection (MLSP); National Union of Entrepreneurs and Employers 'Atameken'; Chambers of Commerce and Industry and/or other employers' associations; Sectoral Trade Unions or their federations; NGOs involved in education and training. Regional level: Vocational schools; Enterprises; Trade Unions; Regional administrations; Regional centres for confirmation and recognition of qualification; Regional boards of VET school directors; Regional institutes for VET teacher training; Regional branches of *Atameken*; Chambers of Commerce and Industry and/or other employers' associations; Regional branches of sectoral Trade Unions or their federations and NGOs involved in education and training.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The general objective of this project is to support the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan and other competent national bodies to implement the State Programme for Education Development in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2011-2020 (PED) as well as supporting the implementation of the envisaged governmental plan (to be approved): *State Programme on the Acceleration of the Industrial-Innovative Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2010-2014*.

<p>6. Key elements of success</p>	<p>What were the critical elements that contributed to project “scalability”? What was the specific approach to capacity development that led to policy impact/changes?</p>
<p>It was not possible to assess this point based on the limited data received (the FA, Logical Framework, Action Fiches, and administrative notes such as ‘<i>Observations éventuelles: service des procédures écrites SG-A-2</i>’). From the general reports on TVET in Kazakhstan, it is possible to consider the introduction of the NQF and the strengthening of the policy making capacity of the VET Department and the establishment of dialogue platforms to facilitate a progressive involvement of the key stakeholders in the TVET reform process as the main elements of success of the project.</p>	
<p>7. Lessons learnt</p>	<p>Please include any lessons learnt (regardless of whether these were envisaged at project inception).</p>
<p>At the time of the design the project could learn from other TVET technical cooperation projects the limited impact of the pilot schools approach, indeed beneficial for the assisted schools, on majority of other schools, mainly for the difficulty experienced in horizontal dissemination and experience sharing and on the national policy level where hardly any pilot school experience has been reflected.</p> <p>The introduction of the NQF was also a way to overcome the many different VET curriculum development methodologies applied in numbers of donor projects, which often brought useful experience to the pilot schools and cooperating employers from their environment, but remained limited in scope and isolated from the system. The capacity of the TVET authorities to evaluate these experiments and mainstream was a priority issue.</p> <p>The project considered involving the regional level and needs as well as sectoral employers in institutionalised partnerships with the national TVET authorities. At the national policy level, the policy learning approach whereby international expertise change facilitates the development of policies and strategies by national stakeholders seemed to be strategically successful option.</p>	
<p>8. Implementing Partners</p>	<p>Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.</p>
<p>Implementing Partners were the National Government of Kazakhstan (by means of its line ministries) and the Eunida Association.</p> <p>An EU TACIS project supported TVET in early 2000. The project <i>VET linked to the development of SMEs in Kazakhstan</i> (EUR 900 000) finished in 2005. The projects: <i>Methodology and capacity for developing competence based VET curricula in Kazakhstan</i> (EUR 200000) and <i>Support to the development and monitoring of a quality assurance system for higher education in Kazakhstan</i> (EUR 647 500) both ended in 2007. The TACIS project under the 2006 AP, <i>Social Partnership in Vocational Education and Training (VET) Kazakhstan</i> was to be implemented in 2008-2009 (indicative maximum budget EUR 1 000 000) combining support to policy and capacity building. In 2011, the EU implemented a EUR 4 000 000 VET reform project to support the implementation of the State Programme of Education Development for 2011-20 and the State Programme for Accelerated Industrial-Innovative Development of Kazakhstan for 2010-14. The EU is also financing the VET Institutional Partnership Project, operated by the European Network of Implementing Development Agencies (EUNIDA) to support the Republican Scientific and Methodological Centre by setting up an institutional partnership under the umbrella of the French Ministry of Education.</p> <p>Among the other donors the Korean International Cooperation Agency provided assistance under the project <i>Implementing the system of independent quality assessment of vocational training, awarding and verifying qualifications in technical and service professions in Kazakhstan</i> (2006-2007). Norway implemented the project <i>Development of the system of vocational education and training for oil and gas sector 2006-2008</i> to modernise vocational training in the key industrial sector of the country. GIZ and InWent have also been implementing several VET school modernising projects during the last decade.</p> <p>The World Bank in 2007 supported the MoES to establish a Task Force and a stakeholder Steering Group to prepare the NPVED. Since 2011, the World Bank’s loan of US \$ 29.23 million funded a project to develop TVET professional standards and quality assurance; strengthen TVET governance, management and financing and the skills delivery capacity of TVET institutions.</p>	

9. Contacts	Provide contact details for further information, including telephone and e-mail.
EU Delegation in Kazakhstan; Eunida (www.eunida.eu).	
10.Sources, links & publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs).
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Logical framework;• Financing Agreements 1-5;• memorandum to the DCI committee covering the programming document for the Development Cooperation Instrument for Kazakhstan for 2007;• Project Action Fiches 1 and 2;• http://www.unevoc.unesco.org/worldtvtdatabase1.php?ct=KAZ;• ETF Torino Process Report 2012;• ETF Torino process Central Asia Report 2013.	

MONGOLIA

Project title: Support to Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) Programme-TAPS

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: ND
3. Efficiency: ND
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of Design: A
6. Impact: ND
7. Sustainability: B
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

The formal education system in Mongolia currently consists of kindergarten and preschool (up to age 7), primary education (4 years), lower secondary education (4 years), and upper secondary education (2 years). Since the 2005/06 school year, the Government extended the structure of the school education from grades 1–10 (4 years primary + 4 years lower secondary + 2 years upper secondary) to grades 1–11 (5+4+2) with the expectation of commencing a 12-year system (6+3+3) in 2008. Basic education (primary and lower secondary education) is compulsory and is funded by the state.

Secondary-Level Technical and Vocational Education and Training

In TVET institutions, aside from receiving vocational and technical training, students also study general secondary courses. There are only 35 such combined TVE and upper secondary institutions in Mongolia. According to the Statistical Yearbook published in 2007, the enrolment in these schools totals approximately 30 000.

The Ministry of Education, Culture and Science is responsible for TVE programmes at the secondary education level. Students graduating from the combined TVE and upper secondary school receive both a vocational certificate and an upper secondary certificate. Therefore, graduates from these schools can transfer to universities and colleges. The Ministry of Education, Culture and Science (MECS) is the central administrative body that formulates national educational policy and sets the standards for each level of formal education. MECS also administers general provisions on education matters, teacher training, curriculum development, and state examination procedures, and is responsible for the accreditation of higher education institutions. MECS is the sole public sector provider of technical and vocational education (TVE) for youths. MECS administers 43 higher education institutions and 42 TVE institutions. The latter institutions consist of (i) 22 vocational education and training centers; (ii) vocational training and production centers, which offer 2.5 years of combined professional and general education based on the former Soviet system, leading to a professional certificate and a secondary education certificate; and (iii) 14 branch schools and 6 technical colleges, which provide advanced training for higher level skills up to a professional diploma or bachelors degree.

The Primary and Secondary Education Law is the fundamental legal document demonstrating that the Government of Mongolia has undertaken a series of measures to address these issues through a revised 'Law of Mongolia on Vocational Education and Training' (2009), the establishment of a National Council for TVET, composed of private and public stakeholders (e.g. ministries, business intermediate organizations, universities) with responsibility for coordination and strategic policy orientation as well as the Agency for Vocational Education and Training (AVET) with responsibility for the implementation of the national TVET strategy.

An ambitious 'Action Plan for Implementing Technical and Vocational Education and Training' (2010-2013) formulated by the Agency for TVET indicates the main objective to successfully establish competency-based training in TVET institutions. The government has committed to match its reform ambitions in the sector by increasing the budget allocated to the sector (and to the AVET), which has doubled since 2008 and amounts to more than EUR 35 million in 2011.

1. Identification
 CRIS decision number

22921
DCI-ASIE/2011/022-921
 Single Country / National Project DAC-code **11330**

2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Are	TP-TVET policy and systems:
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI: geographic programmes Project approach – centralised (direct)
c) By region	Geographic programmes: Asia
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: 2011 30/05/2012-30/05/2019. 84 months: 60 - operational phase: 24 - final phase. Status: Ongoing
3. Financial data	
Total EC amount (+ % of indicative programme) EUR 7 000 000 (100%)	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
<p>The overall objective is to support the economic development and human capital potential of the Mongolian government and population by enabling key stakeholders to provide Technical and Vocational Education and Training in a way that is responsive to the needs of a rapidly changing labour market.</p> <p>The specific objective is to strengthen and consolidate the work of the Agency for Vocational Education and training (AVET) to establish and initiate:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An efficient, sustainable and demand driven TVET sector with attention to rural areas; • Appropriate quality assurance procedures for assessment and certification. 	
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<p>Mongolia's economy is expected to grow substantially throughout 2011-2013 as a result of the revenues from the mining sector. In parallel, there will be an increase in the demand for skilled labour and urgent need for the TVET sector to meet the requirements of a market-driven economy, particularly in the service sectors and the processing industry with emphasis on food production, infrastructure and construction.</p> <p>A labour market study produced by the main existing project in the sector, notably the US-funded Millennium Challenge Account (MCA), notes that the predominant occupations are found within agriculture, the second largest sector is trade with 12% of total employment, while the mining sector absorbs 2-3% of the labour force. Unemployment rates, particularly for youths are significantly high. Stakeholders recognise the lack of an adequately qualified and trained workforce and the need to develop a national human resource capacity to achieve Mongolia's goals of economic diversification and industrialisation. The provision of TVET is deemed to be insufficiently able to meet local market requirements and the equipment and professional expertise of the TVET system are outdated and limited. This often results in the import of skilled labour from China despite the high rate of unemployment of Mongolian youths.</p> <p>The proportion of TVET students has doubled since 2005, due to the government policy of granting a monthly allowance (approximately EUR 30) to students in order to subsidise what is considered a 'strategic' sector. However, the percentage of students at TVET schools that are enrolled after graduating the complete secondary education is only 30% of the total students in 2009-2010. It seems that most students see TVET schools as a way to complete secondary education before entering university, by taking advantage of the government monthly allowances. Furthermore, there is wide discrepancy between the level of training, the quality of qualifications achieved and the certification system in the various training centres/institutes (a total of 64 of which 44 are State run and 20 are private training institutions; 26 are located in Ulaanbaatar City and 38 in provinces).</p> <p>The MCA project (USD 46 million) is currently supporting the sector at different levels and will provide external technical and financial assistance until 2013 when all activities will be terminated and the unspent funds recovered. One could expect a major risk of systemic stand-off once this project ends, and the momentum of reform will need to be maintained to ensure the creation of a real competence-based TVET sector.</p>	

<p>4.2. Result of the project</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)
<p>The main expected results are as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Strengthened leadership capacities of the AVET and support to the National Council on Vocational Education and Training (NCVET) and Sector Councils to ensure an effective and coherent TVET modernisation process which is consistent with the reform agenda of Government of Mongolia, the alignment of donor funded projects and the inclusion of private investors; Strengthened capacities of TVET schools to meet the qualification requirements of an expanding and diversified labour market through the nation-wide implementation of competence-based programmes and quality assurance processes; Increased coverage of TVET best practices in the rural development sector and strengthened implementation capacities of TVET rural development programmes to benefit rural economies. 	
<p>Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 3 main broad criteria Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency 5 additional criteria: Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Relevance – A <p>A national strategy is currently being elaborated by the AVET, with the support of the MCA project. The alignment of the project with the Government’s strategic policy and roadmap will be the priority for the inception phase of the project, which will consider the possible additional contribution required for the adoption of a national TVET reform strategy.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Effectiveness – No Data. <p>In the absence of any monitoring or evaluation report, it is not possible to establish if and to what extent the project was effective; however, the activities will mainly involve technical assistance, training of trainers and curricula development which suggest effectiveness. At this stage, the indicative list of activities is the following:</p> <p>Provide technical assistance to AVET for the creation of problem-solving and strategic decision-making capacities in order to enhance and institutionalise private-public partnership at national, regional and sector level and TVET school level through:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Assistance to AVET to support the strengthening of the NCVET as the highest authority for coordination between TVET and employers, particularly for strategic discussion and decision-making through. Special emphasis should be given to achieve an appropriate financing of the TVET sector and the revenue-generating capacities from TVET schools; Assistance to AVET to foster improved donor coordination to ensure alignment by donor programmes to the Government of Mongolia’s strategic implementation plan for TVET, its specific objectives, milestones and indicators of results; Familiarisation of AVET personnel with regards to the EU (e.g. European Foundation for Quality Management) and other models to provide a framework for assessing and improving organisations at different stages of their development. <p>Support AVET or a relevant institution to set-up a leadership programme with the objective of creating a critical number of managers and TVET staff who are competent to manage and to promote a demand-led TVET system:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Identify, with stakeholders, priorities in leadership, management and private-public partnership that are related to issues for modernising the current TVET system and to develop pilot training modules; Implement training programmes for key staff members from the TVET agency, related institutions and principals from VET schools to improve the quality of management and cost effectiveness of TVET training institutions leading to a Professional Development Award qualification and link, if possible, to a reward structure; Assess the training programme for replication by AVET or an outsourced training agency. <p>Conditions for enrollment of AVET and other government staff into the leadership programme should be agreed during the implementation phase and included in the overall work plan. The commitment to work in the TVET sector in Mongolia for a defined period after completion of the programme should be ensured.</p>	

Strengthening the quality assurance system to ensure uniformity of acceptance of qualifications provided, with emphasis on the fine-tuning and implementation of the proposed **National Vocational Qualifications Framework (NVQF)** through:

- Capacity building and technical assistance to enable AVET to initiate and establish its operational and administrative short-term and long-term responsibilities with regard to the validation of qualifications, accreditation of providers and assessment groups, the external quality assurance of assessments leading to issuance of qualifications and to appeal procedures;
- Technical Assistance to AVET to support to the design/review process of the implementation roadmap for a National Qualifications Framework and implementation strategy with regards to the incorporation of the NVQF and TVET-related components;
- Assistance to AVET to promote partnerships between business and the TVET sector to develop occupational standards;
- Technical Assistance to AVET to support the **Regional Methodological Centres (RMCs)** task of facilitating the implementation of new curricula and embedding competency-based modularized training;
- Technical Assistance to support the National Learning Resource Centre (NLRC) to serve as a national forum to disseminate new curricula programmes, to act as centre to distribute training and learning resources to TVET schools and to conduct research on issues of technical education and the development of new technology;
- Technical Assistance to support the RMC programmes to provide initial pedagogical training to new trainers in student-centered training approaches and assessments, and to gain practical experience.

Support for **AVET and other relevant stakeholders at regional and provincial level to replicate and up-scale best practices experienced in Mongolia to develop new curricula** and implementation materials related to the rural development sector focused on developing the economy/livelihood of rural areas.

- **Efficiency: No Data**

In the absence of any monitoring or evaluation report, it is not possible to establish if and to what extent the project was efficient.

- **Coherence: A**

Within the scope of the project's implementation, the Delegation will facilitate communication with the Directorate-General for Education and Culture and the EU Agency for Vocational Education and Training, so as to ensure that the Mongolian Beneficiaries, through the Technical Assistance Team, will benefit from the experience and advice that can be obtained through these channels. On a request basis, the Delegation will further facilitate the networking with a similar EU-funded project in the region.

The possibility of providing assistance to the Mongolian TVET system to adopt European principles, norms and standards, in coherence with article 7 of the EU-Mongolia Partnership and Cooperation Agreement (PCA), will also be considered during the inception phase.

- **Quality of the Design: A**

An overall work plan will be drafted by the implementing partner during the inception phase in consultation with local public and private stakeholders and in close coordination with the donors, already active in this field. The work plan will be coupled with a global assessment of the level of progress made by the Government of Mongolia and the respective donor agencies with regard to initiatives in the TVET sector to determine gaps and/or the need for additional/alternative activities. The work plan will have to be coherent with the Government Strategy Plan, its specific objectives and indicators of results in order to have a 'sector programme approach', coordinated with other major donors active in the sector (e.g. SDCA, GIZ, Canada), under the overall responsibility of the AVET.

- **Impact: No Data**

In the absence of any monitoring or evaluation report, it is not possible to establish the impact of the project.

- **Sustainability: B**

As part of this programme, there will be a familiarisation of Ministry of Labour (MoL) personnel with regards to the EU and other models to provide a framework for assessing and improving organisations at different stages of their development.

A component of the programme, mostly implemented through a separate service contract to be signed in the second year of the programme, will provide technical assistance and capacity building support to the MoL to develop new curricula and implementation materials for the rural development sector, building on best experiences from other donor implemented projects in the field at local level.

• **Added value of ETF: NA**

4.3. Beneficiaries Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

The direct beneficiaries of the project will be the Department of TVET in the MoL and the National TVET Council; the Technical Assistance Team will work towards the definition and implementation of the national strategy for the sector. Particular attention will be given to rural areas in order to provide alternatives to migration to rural youths.

5. Synopsis Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The project provides technical capacity building support to the Department of TVET in the Ministry of Labor which has responsibility for the implementation of the national TVET strategy. The support provided would enable the MoL to develop and carry out its strategy, which prioritises the establishment of competency-based training in TVET institutions. Support activities include the implementation of quality assessment and assurance processes, the accreditation of TVET institutions, and support for the establishment of a National Vocational Qualification Framework (NVQF). The support will also provide capacity building to MoL and other TVET-related groups (National Vocational Education and Training Council), Sector Councils and TVET institutions to strengthen strategy and decision-making skills to support the implementation of a nation-wide TVET program as well as to support donor coordination. Strong emphasis is given to the development and maintenance of public-private partnerships to meet market demands for skills that match needs. In addition, emphasis will be given to achieve appropriate financing of the TVET sector and the revenue-generating capacities from TVET schools.

6. Key elements of success What were the critical elements that contributed to “scalability”? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

The project builds upon the Action Plan of the AVET and is thus consistent with the reform priorities of the Government of Mongolia. It will also be instrumental in developing institutional and human capacities to deliver vocational qualifications to nationally (and internationally) recognised standards. The need to ensure national quality standards and a uniform assessment system with a concomitant need for an effective Quality Assurance system will seek to obviate the present tendency to promote short-term skills development in isolation from a wider national focus.

A crucial aspect will be the *programme based approach* adopted with other major donors active in the sector, under the framework of a common ‘dashboard’ with results, indicators and activities agreed with the Government, and a single reporting and monitoring system to the national authorities (both the Agency and the Council).

7. Lessons learned Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.

Lessons learnt from other capacity building initiatives in Mongolia indicate the importance of closely tying projects to the Government of Mongolia's programmes and priorities. Awareness of other donor activities and development projects is also important in order to ensure that activities complement the broad TVET reform agenda. One should further consider that the different line Ministries with a stake in TVET (e.g. Education, Labour, Agriculture and Light Industries, etc.) must be involved at all stages of the project in order to ensure coherence in the country policies. Projects implemented in the field have usually been disconnected from the national government strategy and from other external donors’ initiatives, thus creating a very fragmented scenario in which no single quality and assessment framework exist.

The findings of the formulation mission indicate that there is a need to develop the leadership and management qualities of the AVET to ensure that its operations are managed in a coordinated manner, in line with its own strategic roadmap. Furthermore, it is crucial that the Agency will be enabled to promote the decision-making capacities of the Government of Mongolia through the National and

Sector Councils as well as via promote public-private partnerships.	
8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
Ministry of Finance of the Government of Mongolia.	
9. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail
EU Delegation to China and Mongolia, Beijing.	
10. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)
DEC22921_1.doc Action Fiche for Mongolia. DEC22921_2.DOC COMMISSION IMPLEMENTING DECISION of XXX on the Annual Action Programme 2011 in favour of Mongolia to be financed under Article 19100101 of the general budget of the European Union. DCE22921_3.doc (same to DEC22921_1.doc Action Fiche for Mongolia. DEC22921_4.pdf Appendix 1 – TVET SUPPORT LOGFRAME. DEC22921_5.pdf Financial Agreement. DEC22921_6.doc annex ii to financing agreement n°DCI-ASIE/2011/022-921. EU TVET Mongolia .pdf ANNEX II: TERMS OF REFERENCE.	

PAKISTAN

Project title: Support to the Technical and Vocational Education and Training Sector in Pakistan and Supporting TVET Reform in Pakistan (TVET II)-

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: ND
3. Efficiency: ND
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of Design: A
6. Impact: ND
7. Sustainability: B
8. Added value of ETF: N/A

0. TVET at a Glance

The Constitution of Pakistan assigns the responsibility for education and training to the provinces, leaving policy development and regulatory functions affecting national interest with institutions at the federal level. Formal TVET comprises two streams with little articulation between them and with the general education system. Technical Education is (mainly) post-matric, more academic, preparing middle-level technicians for work as supervisory staff to bridge the gap between semi-skilled workers and engineers/managers. Vocational Training is defined as lower level training after primary school or lower secondary completion for the preparation of semi-skilled workers, delivered through vocational training centres under the auspices of the provincial labour departments with the Trade Testing Boards responsible for registration of providers and certification. The two streams are provided and regulated by different provincial sector departments and for both, private institutions are also registered and long-term courses between one and four years are offered alongside short courses. Unregistered training institutions and company-based training is mostly offered in urban/industrialised areas. A formal apprenticeship system, currently undergoing a revision of its rules and coverage, is complemented by the traditional apprenticeship that is the largest training provider in the country, known as *Ustad-Shagird*. Another pathway is through the *Madrassahs* (Islamic schools) which are completely state independent and consider themselves as social institutions catering for disadvantaged population groups, providing free primary and religious education and, in rural areas, some vocational training.

1. Identification CRIS decision number	19952 and 21329
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Area:	TP-TVET policy and systems: TM -TVET access to target groups LS- Active Labour Market policy and Measures
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI Asia/2008/19952 and DCI-Asia/2009/021329
c) By region	Geographic Zone (Country or region): PAKISTAN
d) By Period and Status	TVET I Decision year: (2000-2012) Status: Closed, TVET II 2009-20012 Start planned date 1/4/2010 End date - planned: 30/06/2017 Status: ongoing
3. Financial data	TVET I: Project Approach: direct centralised and joint management with ILO. TVET II: Project approach: Indirect centralised management through delegated cooperation.

TVET I: EUR 21 965 446, EC Contribution: EUR 20 000 000; ILO: EUR 909 890; Beneficiary's contribution: EUR 1 055 556; Government's contribution (in kind): EUR 500 000.
TVET II: EUR 61 500 000, EC Contribution: EUR: 26 000 000; DFID Contribution: EUR 34 000 000; GTZ/BMZ: EUR: 1 500 000; : EUR: 1 919 401 (in kind)

4. Outcome

What were the goals of the project?

TVET I: the overall objective is to enhance socio-economic development through an investment in human capital. The project purpose is to improve the quality and outreach of skill training provision predominantly in the rural areas of Pakistan and in response to the needs of the economic sector.

Specific objectives:

- To strengthen the analytical linkage between the demands of the labour market and the training provided;
- To strengthen Technical Education and Vocational Training Authorities (TEVTAs) in two provinces and the organisation and operationalisation of the TEVTAs in the other provinces;
- To address the issues of relevance and quality as well as access and equity in the TVET sector by targeting beneficiaries in poverty-stricken rural areas, deliver vocational and skills training through restricted Calls for Proposals from qualified providers.

TVET II: the overall objective was poverty reduction through increased and improved access to employable skills. The project purpose was to increase the access, equity, relevance and quality of the TVET sector in Pakistan. The specific objectives entail:

- Institution Building: to improve governance, policy and strategy advice on NSS implementation, the apprenticeship training policy and a sustainable TVET financing, NQF (formulation of standards and implementation of assessment and certification, curricula course structures and in prioritised economic sectors or sub-sectors);
- HRD to support the development of a comprehensive standard-based pre and in-service training scheme for teaching as well as management staff and the upgrading equipment of staff training institute as well NAVTEC 's TVET HRD policy;
- Labour Market Services to identify gaps in labour exchange and job mediation, from on job-specific preparation for workers qualifying to work abroad, to career counselling and guidance services in schools with support to the Ministry of Education, research on skills demand and training needs in various sectors as part of the NQF pilot implementation and support to innovative training delivery;
- Efficient and innovative training delivery through two approaches: the Learning Regions (to bring players from different educational, business and labour market sectors together with the objective to jointly develop new offers for lifelong learning relevant for the locality) and a TVET Innovation Fund (support selected target groups and project concepts for bottom-up innovative training and labour market services).

4. 1. Objective (problem statement)

- What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?

TVET System

TVET I and II address the problems of fragmented governance structures; insufficient coordination; poor quality and irrelevant trainings; low efficiency of teaching and management personnel; absence of job counseling services; and lack of innovative approaches to provide TVET services for the poor and vulnerable.

VET reform: policy, strategy, governance

The Government established the National Vocational and Technical Education Commission (NAVTEC) to facilitate, regulate and provide policy direction for TVET. NAVTEC developed the National Skills Strategy 2008 – 2012 (NSS). Its implementation depended on the capacities of key actors: NAVTEC, the training authorities and providers, the private sector and civil society. TVET I did not provide support at the federal level because of NAVTEC's lack of understanding of its role, and its actions were limited to training implementation. TVET II, through continued research, considered the importance of NAVTEC's guiding role for further support.

Management of the TVET system.

The TVET structure is highly fragmented and governance is a major problem. In the public sector, a number of central government ministries and provincial departments provide TVET offers at provincial

level, in principle under the coordination of the Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority (TEVTA). Vertical coordination is still weak in spite of NAVTEC's policy formulation, regulatory and coordination mandate. No coordination between private sector and government-run TVET exists and monitoring of TVET is largely limited to registered institutions and enrolment data.

Quality of the system

The TVET system is supply driven. A number of public TVET institutions are dysfunctional and characterized by shortage of teachers, generally untrained and underpaid, no quality-oriented accreditation procedures of training providers, no unified system of skills standards and (standard-based) certification, curricula and courses aligned with outdated standards and not relevant to the skills in demand by the employers.

Funding

No sustainable funding mechanism in place.

Participation of key stakeholders

Private sector not involved in decision-making, several economic sectors, companies and associations run their own demand-led but unregulated training schemes.

Skills demands

Public authorities do not utilise labour market information. Private providers operate closer to the market. The access barrier is poverty which was meant to be overcome through stipends for TVET students. The management of the student stipend scheme, as a possible option for easing access has been criticised for misallocation, mismanagement lack of targeting

Skills supply

The TVET system excludes the majority of youths: most of the government training institutions are located in urban areas, limiting the access for target groups in the rural areas where 70% of the population lives. Access to females is further discouraged. Targets of annual training of 950 000 students (700 000 in public training institutes and 250 000 in private training institutes) in 1647 training institutions, set by the Medium Term Development Framework (2008-2013) are not realistic. The formal apprenticeship system, criticised by employers as too rigid and unable to cater for the industry's needs, is outnumbered by the traditional apprenticeship training system (*Ustad-Shagird*); however, no recognition mechanism is in place.

Labour Markets

Labour exchange offices exist in all provinces but are underfinanced and lack concepts, instruments and competent staff and job placement services are not available to the majority of job seekers and employers. Labour market services are underdeveloped with regards to career guidance and counselling. Private labour exchanges exist for specific segments of the labour market but are not regulated. Rural and female TVET graduate salary levels are slightly better than those of their non-TVET counterparts indicating a low level of quality and relevance of TVET services.

TVET stigma

TVET is unattractive and considered as a second rate choice.

4.2. Result of the project

- Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)

Expected results were:

Phase I:

- Labour Market Information Analysis (LMIA): LMIA cells strengthened through technical expertise, training and provision of essential equipment; data collection mechanism at the sector level established; special studies on selected topics conducted; Labour Force Survey expanded to district level; staff of NAVTEC, training providers and employers trained on how to use LMIA data; feedback mechanism to employers and training providers on government plans and actions developed;
- Planning, coordination and implementation capacity of TEVTAs and other stakeholders strengthened at the provincial level: TEVTA's organisation developed and training needs assessed; TEVTA's management and operating systems developed; staff developed in-country; partnership model with prioritized private business sector in a selected trade area in at least one training institute established; capacity of selected training providers under Calls for Proposals in Component 3, built;
- Calls for Proposals were open for projects proposed by TVET eligible suppliers (NGOs or networks of

NGOs, private not-for-profit educational/training institutions, employers' and workers' federations and chambers of commerce with affiliated training institutions), to be focused on economic sectors also in rural areas, for up to 26 000 beneficiaries.

Phase II:

- Institutional structure and governance of the TVET sector improved through cooperation and coordination between NAVTEC, provincial authorities, private sector and civil society to implement the TVET reform;
- NQF developed and introduced in priority economic sectors; standards; course concepts and programmes; assessment and certification systems developed;
- Private and public TVET institutions better managed, modular competency-based training in agreed sectors delivered. The teaching, technical and management skills level in training institutions enhanced and competency-based pre and in-service training scheme for TVET personnel introduced. 30% of upgraded teachers/trainers will be female.
- Access to relevant labour market services increased using the competences of overseas workers. Career counselling services introduced across the country. Training delivery in selected economic sectors successfully adapted to local conditions by capitalising on innovative elements of the TVET reform, by introducing the concept of Learning Regions (around 500 000 persons will complete competency-based training by the end of the five years, out of which around 200 000 will be females).

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)

- 3 main broad criteria **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF**

- **Relevance: A**

Relevance is high at the design level. The proposal builds on government development policies and strategies (Employment Policy 2007, the (draft) Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) II, the Medium-Term Development Framework (MTDF) 2005-2010, the Education Policy 1998-2010, the Small and Medium Enterprise Policy, and the Draft Youth Policy). The National Skills Strategy (NSS) is the core strategy to address HRD: relevant skills for industrial and economic development; improving access, equity and employability; and assuring quality for skills development;

The 2007-13 EC Country Strategy Paper (CSP) focused on poverty reduction. Education and Human Resources Development is the first focal area for intervention with an emphasis on vocational education. The Multi-Annual Indicative Programme (MIP) 2007-10 allocates 32% of the funds to education and HRD including a 'facilitation of skills development to enter the labour market'. The project integrates gender, governance and environmental sustainability as crosscutting issues.

- **Effectiveness: ND**

The effectiveness of the project could not be assessed on the basis of the provided documentation. On the basis of contacts with the implementing agency (the ILO), the project is not progressing and it seems to have been put on hold.

- **Efficiency: ND**

No monitoring report. Indicators proposed in the Log Frames include:

For the specific project objectives include: information on the number/percentage of companies employing people trained under the reform programme express that the skills correspond better with job requirements compared to before; 500 000 people complete relevant TVET by 2014. Expected results include: agreement between the roles and mandates between NAVTEC, provincial authorities and the private sector; number of accredited TVET institutions, number and quality of training courses updated/initiated further to skills competencies identified at enterprise level (317.1); number of VT centres equipped/rehabilitated (318); percentage of trainers trained and re-trained (319); number of standards, course concepts and assessment packages in trades suitable for females and males students; and number of trainees enrolled in a given year (321.1); number of trainees trained through new CBT programmes; number of trainees obtained NQF qualifications; number of principals with improved management skills; number of vocational counselling modalities in use; and percentage of VET graduates hired after training (323); number of public private partnerships developed under the learning region and the disbursement ratio of the TVET innovation fund.

- **Coherence: B**

The two projects are not in sequence but run mostly in parallel. The justification provided is that at the time of TVET I's design, time to support a federal authority – NAVTEC - which was mostly assigned to a raining implementation mode rather than policy-making, was not considered appropriate. Nevertheless, DFID and GIZ, that were part of the design of TVET I together with the ILO, continued the research in further support. The Delegation was encouraged by HQ to consider the option of co-funding the DFID initiative. TVET II was developed on the basic idea of complementing TVET I, thus supporting its actions and covering additional issues. Areas for close coordination between TVET I and II were identified on:

The LMI system (TVET I on LMIA and TVET II on Labour market services (job counselling and job preparation services)).

Capacity building (TVET I works on Provincial TEVTAs, TVET II at the federal level and provincial training institutes).

Coverage: TVET I contains an outreach component, through civil society, focused on rural areas, while TVET II works with the private and civil sector through Learning Regions situated in urban areas.

Target groups: the TVET I outreach component targets a direct impact on the livelihood of the rural poor and disadvantaged; the Innovation Fund under TVET II targets the innovative delivery of TVET services.

Project governance: on NSS implementation of the National Skill Strategy (NSS), both projects have the same Project Steering Committee - chaired by NAVTEC.

- **Quality of the Design: A**

Joint project design by three organisations (DFID, EC and GIZ) indicates the EC's and Member State's commitment to aid effectiveness. The project has further been designed in full compliance with the previous EC-funded TVET project (TVET I). Moreover, the project is designed in such a way that other donors easily can join in. At the time of the design, it was not considered the right time to support the federal level that was mostly involved in a training implementation mode. DFID and GIZ were part of the design of TVET I and decided to continue research into further support. The Delegation was encouraged by headquarters to consider the option of co-funding the DFID initiative. TVET II has been developed on the basic idea of complementing TVET I, thus supporting its actions and covering additional issues.

- **Impact: ND**

The impact, similarly to the effectiveness, could not be assessed on the basis of the provided documentation. The ILO is no longer involved in the project's implementation.

- **Sustainability: B**

Strong leadership was ensured by NAVTEC throughout the process, by chairing the PSC of both TVET I and II, with the technical units located in its offices and a leadership role regarding the NQF, curricula and standards. A demand driven and participatory approach was adopted through the Learning Regions concept. The private sector and civil society were involved through the implementation of the NSS. Financial contributions were received from beneficiaries using the innovation fund. Focus on the establishment of sound TVET governance structures, transparency and accountability, and zero-tolerance regarding corruption. The project will use state of the state-of-the-art technologies that are in use in the private sector for upgrading the management and training capacities of the training institutes.

- **Added value of ETF: NA**

4.3. Beneficiaries	Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?
National TVET Authority; Provincial authorities; TVET providers; social partners; target groups including marginalised groups.	

5. Synopsis	Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.
--------------------	--

Both projects support the implementation of the National Skill Strategy, yet with different focal areas. TVET I supports the quality and outreach of skill trainings provision predominantly in the rural areas of Pakistan in response to the needs of the economic sector. TVET II aims at increasing the access, equity, relevance and quality of the TVET sector.

6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach
-----------------------------------	--

	that led to policy impact/changes?
	The projects provide an almost complete coverage of TVET policy, systems, management, external and internal efficiency and quality, including financing mechanisms and a strong emphasis on the inclusion of marginalised groups and ALMPs. The quality of design is high and baseline studies and analyses (diagnosis of the Pakistani TVET systems) are accurate.
7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.
	In the absence of monitoring and mid-term evaluation reports, the main lesson learned related to the need of improving the identification and formulation phases to avoid the case of two TVET actions running in parallel through TVET I and II. The unanswered question is why assistance was not channelled through one project, avoiding the duplication of management costs and procedures.
8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
	NAVTEC chairs a Donor Coordination Working Group (DCWG). Effective Government-led donor coordination is part of the capacity building for NAVTEC. The EC is part of both TVET I and II and I will ensure coordination amongst the two projects. The Joint Project Steering Committee (PSC) will further ensure donor coordination, as other active donors will be part of the PSC. Joint project design by three organisations (DFID, EC and GIZ) indicates the EC's and Member States' commitment to aid effectiveness. Other players are: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) on funding under-graduate and graduate study programmes, and non-formal TVET. It plans to establish 52 technical centres; • Chin, is developing Centres of Excellence; • UNESCO, is supporting TEVTA and the rehabilitation of TVET providers in the earthquake-affected regions of AJK and North West Frontier Province (NWFP); • The British Council is supporting training providers through a twinning project and exposure for NAVTEC personnel to components of the British TVET system; • Skill development components of USAID support to the development of value chains; • UNHCR, skills development in emergency aid programmes.
9. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail
	EU Delegation in Pakistan.
10. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)
	Financial Agreements Phase I and II. Country Strategy Paper 2007-13. Action Fiches. Preliminary analysis by independent consultant, GIZ and DFID.

ARGENTINA

Project title: *Programa de educación media y formación para el trabajo para jóvenes – fase II* Annual Action Plan 2007. Secondary Education and Training for Young People Programme

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: C
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: B
7. Sustainability: B
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

National education in Argentina is a responsibility shared by the national government, the provinces, federal districts and private institutions. The Ministry of Education is in charge of setting basic national guidelines, while curricular decisions are generally made at the provincial level.

In order to foster education coverage and quality as a way to tackling social exclusion and poverty, a new legislative framework for education has been established, including a Law on Technical and Professional Education⁷, a Law on Financing of Education⁸ and a new National Education Law⁹. The Laws aim to give a new impetus to technical education in Argentina. The main achievements presented in the legislation include:

- A unified curriculum level over a minimum of six years;
- A proposed national system that articulates the various offers of existing vocational technical education at various levels and in different jurisdictions;
- An established need to implement mechanisms in order to agree on criteria and homogenise programmes; a professional qualifications system and the registration of technical education entities nationwide;
- A recognition of the importance of the linkage between educational institutions and productive sectors;
- A recognition that knowledge can be obtained outside the educational system;
- The National Fund for Professional Technical Education for funding and higher technical education and vocational training.

Professional technical education leads to a wide range of qualifications for various activities and occupations in the numerous sectors of the production of goods and services. These include agriculture, hunting and forestry, fishing, mining and quarrying, manufacturing, electricity, gas and water, construction, transport and communications, energy, information technology and telecommunications, health and environment, economy and administration, health and safety, tourism, gastronomy and hospitality. Training paths designed to grant professional technical degrees and certifications are distinguished by providing:

- Training oriented appropriation (by the students) of knowledge, skills, attitudes, cultural and ethical values relevant to a professional profile, whose formative path integrates the fields of general education, science and technology, targeted technical and professionalising practice developments and a mastery of appropriate techniques for insertion into a specific professional sector;
- Technical and technological knowledge, with a basic scientific theoretical basis that allows specific technical interventions in production processes with a certain level of autonomy and responsibility in solving technological problems in various sectors for the production of goods and services;
- Preparation in certain occupational areas that require a range of skills, including specific technical skills and knowledge on institutional labour environments in which such performance is framed.

Professional Technical Education includes the following educational institutions: secondary level professional technical education institutions; professional technical education level institutions; technical

⁷ Law 26.058 http://www.me.gov.ar/doc_pdf/ley26058.pdf.

⁸ Law 26.075 http://www.me.gov.ar/doc_pdf/ley26075.pdf.

⁹ Law 26.026 http://www.me.gov.ar/doc_pdf/ley_de_educ_nac.pdf.

colleges, institutes of technology, institutes of higher education (that teach higher technicians and issue technical certificates with a different name, but of equivalent character); vocational training institutions. Youth and Adult Education is established by the Education Act whereby the educational programmes and activities for youths and adults of the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology and the various jurisdictions are articulated with the initiatives of other ministries, particularly those of the Ministry of Labour, Employment and Social Security, Social, Justice and Health and Human Rights, linked to the world of production and work. To this end, under the Federal Council of Education, agreed mechanisms exist for the participation of stakeholders, at national, regional and local levels. The state also guarantees access to information and guidance on continuing education offerings and the possibilities of access to them.

1. Identification CRIS decision number	DCI-ALA/2010/21952 DAC Code: 11 230, 11330
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Area	TP-TVET policy and systems: TM -TVET access to target groups: Basic life skills for youth and adults Vocational training
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI-ALA: geographic programmes
c) By region	Geographic programmes: Latin America Republic of Argentina
d) By Period and Status	15/08/2008 to 15/08/2012: 48 months. Operational implementation phase: 42 months. Closing phase - 6 months. Status: Closed
3. Financial data	
The Programme budget has a total of EUR 27 500 000. EU contribution: EUR 9 400 000. Beneficiary country contribution: EUR 18 100 000.	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
<u>General Objective:</u> to contribute to the improvement of access to the labour market for young people and young adults from the most vulnerable social sectors in Argentina. <u>Specific Objective:</u> to promote the completion of secondary education and increase labour qualifications of young people from 18 to 29 years; broadening access to high quality education and training opportunities.	
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<p>One of the main objectives of the reform is to solve the problem of school dropouts, as it is estimated that about 40% of young people enrolled in secondary education leave schooling prior to finalising their studies. As a result, it was estimated in 2008 that about 5.4 million people did not complete secondary education. Only some 575 000 of these are enrolled under <u>Permanent Education for Young People and Adults (EPJA)</u>. This 'modality', foreseen by the National Education Law - guarantees literacy and the completion of compulsory schooling for people up until the minimum age stipulated by law and provides opportunities for complementary professional training.</p> <p>It is estimated that over 1.1 million people between 18 and 29 years of age neither study, nor work. Most of those who work tend to do so under precarious conditions in the <u>informal sector</u>. Indeed, the percentage of unregistered work in Argentina is estimated at 41.6%. For the 18 - 29 age group, this percentage reaches 75%, and exposes young people to the risks of continued instability, social exclusion¹⁰ and the connected social problems. As secondary education has become compulsory since 2006, those who did not complete the level required have even less chances of becoming employed in the formal sector.</p> <p>Until recently, most of the efforts of the Argentine Government at national and federal levels were devoted to 'mainstreaming' compulsory education. As a result, the EPJA (and its precursors) suffered</p>	

¹⁰ *Caracterización sociodemográfica y socio cultural de los jóvenes en Argentina*, Instituto Torcuato Di Tella (2010 - Study elaborated in the framework of Phase I of the project).

from a lack of attention and resources. From 2004 onwards, a new process to improve the relevance and the quality of EPJA began and was reinforced by a new legal framework. Through this process, the Government intends to bring young people (18-29 years of age) who did not complete compulsory education back to school and improve their chances of inclusion in the formal labour market. The EC-funded project *Secondary Education and Training for Young People* supports this specific effort. The offer of adult education is mainly provided by the public education system: 5801 schools for young people and adults (94% of the total) are managed by the public sector. Two out of three adult students are younger than 25, while 52.5% of the students are women. The services for primary and secondary education for young people and adults are offered during afternoons and at night school. These schools – that function under standard education arrangements – are generally rigid in their organisation. The regular curriculum for young people and adults is structured into 2 to 5 year programmes, depending on the study plan and the province. In the Argentine federal system, the professional training situation varies depending on the provincial jurisdiction. The wide array and heterogeneity of training offers leads to a situation whereby the same certificate awarded by different establishments implies different durations, contents and level of qualification. Many of the EPJA schools propose professional training courses, although in most cases, this offer is marginal and of uncertain quality. On the other hand, the Centres for Professional Training follow the guidelines of the National Institute for Technological Education (INET) based on Law 26.058 on Technical and Professional Education (TPE).

4.2. Result of the project

- Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)

Result 1: Strengthened policy management of the System for Permanent Education of Young People and Adults: Chapter IX of the Title II of the National Education Law implemented.

Result 2: Expanded and improved Secondary Education for Young people and Adults: 23 000 young people from vulnerable backgrounds enrolled on the programme in order to complete secondary education; a 15% increase in the rate of enrolment for secondary education under the Permanent Education of Young people and Adults in beneficiary provinces.

Result 3: Improved relevance and quality of the training offered to young people and young adults: 20% increase in the rate of enrolment for Vocational Education in the Permanent Education of Young people and Adults in beneficiary provinces.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)

- 3 main broad criteria **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF**

• **Relevance: B**

High relevance, to the Laws of 2005 and 2006, give the project greater strength. The relevance of the project is also supported by a national counterpart contribution: 60% of the budget. The initiative is consistent with the actions of the EC; the choice of target groups is successful because education for youth and adults has been historically disadvantaged and more importance to primary and secondary education has been given by the state.

• **Effectiveness: B**

The strategy of the Programme is focused on granting access to high quality secondary education and training opportunities to young people from vulnerable groups, particularly in those areas where the current offer of educational services is low. The Programme acted in three complementary areas:

- Strengthening of policy management of the System for Permanent Education of Young People and Adults (EPJA), through capacity building for the National and Provincial Ministries of Education in areas of Permanent Education for Young and Adults and Labour Training;
- Expanding the offer of Secondary Education for Young people and Adults through the implementation of a flexible institutional model to allow young people to complete secondary education. As first phase of the Programme, a flexible offer was implemented in schools in the least developed areas of the country. The Programme trained teachers specifically devoted to the Programme and provided learning materials and equipment for the schools. The initiative also foresaw training for EPJA teachers on issues such as the pedagogical use of ICT and science teaching. In order to maintain the students under the Programme's education and training offer, scholarships to 23 000 beneficiaries will be

granted;

- Improving employment training for young people and adults – complementary to the secondary education offer. The offer will be linked to the labour market, establishing local priorities in close dialogue with private and public stakeholders. The Programme will increase the capabilities of trainers and will provide specialised equipment, supplies and training materials. Training facilities will be refurbished to facilitate high quality training.

- **Efficiency: C**

According to the ROM 2009, efficiency is low due to unsatisfactory financial performance mostly linked to slow administrative procedures, which always require a double approval (EU Delegation and Government). In some cases, changes in political contexts and officials in jurisdictional governments impacted upon the project and this could not have been predicted. This is a typical case of risk management.

There were delays in the execution of payments, but the Project Management Unit (UTP) was capable of managing these delays. The programme has a good monitoring system based on the logical framework; however, there is no IT support. Financial management is transparent and clear. The organisational structure of the project led to coordination gaps and thus hindered its optimal execution. The activities carried out to date (training, selection of sites, preparation of tender documents, launch of the international seminar, studies etc.) were of good quality and followed the set schedule

- **Coherence: B**

The programme is consistent with the 2006 Education Act and **Argentina's commitment to the Millennium Development Goals**, which established that in 2015, all children and young people shall complete education (primary and secondary)¹¹.

Result 1: Strengthened policy management of the System for the Permanent Education of Young People and Adults (EPJA): A1 Technical assistance to the national and provincial ministries of education on policy and management issues for EPJA; A2 Training on educational policy and management for national provincial teams and authorities; A3 Studies on specific issues on education and on training for work of young people and adults; A4 Exchange of national and international experiences for authorities and technical teams of EPJA and Vocational Training in the 24 provinces and the national ministry; A5 Design and implementation of motivation and awareness campaigns for young people, for incorporation into the Programme.

Result 2: Expanded and improved Secondary Education for Young people and Adults: A1 Hiring of human resources to increase education offers (financed by the local counterpart); A2 Preparation, production and distribution of support material for teachers and students; A3 Training of tutors, advisers and teachers on the new institutional and curricular model; A4 Training of directors, supervisors and teachers of EPJA on pedagogical aspects of education for young people and young adults; A5 Training of directors, supervisors and teachers of EPJA on the pedagogical use of ICT; A6 Training of directors, supervisors and teachers of EPJA on teaching of sciences; A7 Provision of teaching equipment and facilities (Information and Communications technologies – ICT-, laboratories, books) and furniture for EPJA schools; A8 Refurbishing works in EPJA schools; A9 Granting of scholarships to 23.000 eligible young people to support their studies and training¹².

Result 3: Improved relevance and quality of the Labour Training offered to young people and young adults: A1 Organisation of consultation fora with the productive sector and other social actors in the selected provinces for the prioritisation of professional profiles; A2 Technical assistance to provinces for the preparation of the Improvement Plans for Centres of Vocational Training; A3 Technical assistance for the development and/or adaptation of specific curricular contents for prioritised professional profiles; A4 Training of directors, supervisors and teachers of Vocational Training in pedagogical aspects of the education of young people and young adults; A5 Training of teachers in specific aspects of prioritised areas of labour training; A6 Development, production, procurement and distribution of pedagogical materials (manuals, guides, etc.) for students and training centres taking part of the programme; A7 Refurbishing of the premises of vocational and/or labour training centres according to federal regulations;

¹¹ Objetivos de Desarrollo del Milenio Argentina, La oportunidad del Reencuentro, Presidencia de la Nación, Octubre 2003.

¹² The National Scholarship Programme is implemented by the Ministry of Education. The actions include retention and inclusion scholarships directed to all levels of studies. Under this policy line of the Ministry of Education, scholarships will be granted to Programme's beneficiaries.

A8 Provision of equipment for the development of the vocational training courses; A9 Additional human resources, including instructors and tutors, financed by the local counterpart; A10 Purchase of consumable goods for the development of prioritised vocational training courses. Nevertheless, the implementation of the programme resulted in a set of incoherences, as indicated in the 2009 ROM report.

• **Quality of the Design: B**

The design is of good quality; the logical framework is well developed, with clear indicators and focus on the most disadvantaged provinces in particular (R2 and R3). Gender mainstreaming is not explicitly included in either the logical framework or implementation procedures, but is articulated around a Project Management Unit which is responsible for coordinating with ministerial departments and jurisdictions. The design is consistent with the institutional context and is embedded in government policies and strategic objectives. However, it lacked an institutional structure between the central government and local jurisdictions to coordinate and manage the execution of the Project.

• **Impact: B**

The project is part of the implementation of a nationwide policy on education for youth and adults that holds high potential impact. The main risks to achieve the ultimate impact of the project are the fluctuations of the national and jurisdictional situation, the country's instability, which leads to limited execution times and thus impedes contractual planning and shortfalls in impacts. Lacks a developed communication and information policy, especially aimed at the target population. The project should improve the capacity of the communication agencies to serve as a bridge between the government and the jurisdictions and even among jurisdictions, so as to encourage the dissemination of lessons learned and best practices. The project should establish structured institutional relationship with similar sector initiatives to ensure complementarity and synergy.

• **Sustainability: B**

Good prospects for the project have been identified and implemented within the framework of the policy of the current Education Act. However, a large part of sustainability is related to both the commitment of the nation and the jurisdictions to take up the jobs generated by the project's implemented reforms and also the maintenance of infrastructure and equipment. An exit strategy to ensure the sustainability of the know-how and achieve greater involvement of local stakeholders (jurisdictions) is missing.

• **Added value of ETF: -NA**

4.3. Beneficiaries

Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

The Direct Beneficiary of the Programme is the Ministry of Education of Argentina. The dialogue and coordination for the implementation of the Programme with national and provincial education authorities was carried out by the Ministry of Education, in the framework of the governance structure set up in the National Education Law.

The Monitoring Committee was composed of the Secretary of Education, INET, EPJA, the Administrator of the Programme, provincial ministers of education and a representative of the Ministry of Labour. The EU Delegation in Argentina took part in the meetings as an observer.

23 provinces with a low Human Development Index and the City of Buenos Aires and at the national level.

Direct final beneficiaries: an estimated 575 000 young people attending secondary education under the Education System of Young People and Adults and 23 000 young people aged between 18 and 29 years from vulnerable social sectors.

Indirect beneficiaries: National and provincial ministries of education and their authorities and personnel; private sector. Employment Offices of the Ministry of Labour¹³ to act as linkage between beneficiaries seeking jobs – after completion of their studies and training – and enterprises.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

This Programme is the second phase of the Programme of Secondary Education and Training for Young

¹³ There are 298 Employment Offices around the country. The mission of the Employment Offices is to intermediate in the labour market at a local level, helping to fill vacancies in companies and other organizations requiring personnel. The Employment Offices provide information and orientation to jobs seekers while acting as a channel to disseminate information and support the access to those social programmes executed by the Public Sector aimed at increasing employability and employment.

People and Adults (DCI-ALA/2007/18991) which was signed by the Commission and the Government of Argentina. The first phase is focused on the Institutional Strengthening of the Permanent Education of Young people and Adults at a national and provincial level, as well as expanding and improving Secondary Education and Training for Young people and Adults in provinces with a lower Human Development Index.

Nevertheless, many problems are still to be tackled due to the markedly unequal distribution of the benefits from education, and especially from the EPJA:

Regarding policy management: Lack of trained officials to design and implement policy and programmes for the sector; restricted capabilities of the Ministry of Education to develop and implement public policies on EPJA and labour training. Absence of specific initial and continuous teacher training policies and programmes. Despite an advance made in the first phase of the Programme for the design of training materials and developing mechanisms to train EPJA and Labour Training teachers, there is still room for improvement - particularly regarding teacher training.

Regarding EPJA schools: Lack of capacity of the regular school system to respond to critical socio-educational situations of young people and adults; as the drop-out rates in the regular secondary education remain high, EPJA schools are supposed to be the means to provide a second opportunity in education. Low proportional investment in the sector leading to restricted coverage and low quality of educational services; given the strong priority to move forward with the universalisation of primary education in the last decades, EPJA schools were relegated to the implementation of programmes and projects to increase quality. Completion of the compensatory model that, as stated in the National Education Law, EPJA, should not only provide the opportunity to complete, but should also be focused on lifelong learning.

Regarding Labour Training: Labour training initiatives isolated from educational systems and local productive sectors; there is a lack of federal recognition of many labour and professional training qualifications¹⁴ and their consequent validity on the labour market.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

The programme makes a relevant contribution to the development of human capital in Argentina by supporting some of the main government education and training policies and programmes linked to the National Education Law (*Ley de Educación Nacional 26.206/2006*). The objective being to promote the completion of secondary education and increase the labour qualifications of young people from 18 - 29 years, broadening access to high-quality education and training opportunities. The programme takes place within the scope of the National Indicative Programme (NIP) which is based on the analysis set out in the Mid-Term Review of the Country Strategy Paper 2007-2013.

7. Lessons learned

Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.

A 2009 ROM mission monitored the first phase of the Programme and confirmed the relevance and the good prospects of impact and sustainability of the project. However, it drew attention to the delays that had occurred in implementing the action due to the complexity of structures and procedures to be considered.

During the implementation phase, main outputs were delivered, such as high quality studies providing information which is essential for any decision-making process in this sector (i.e. EPJA and Labour Training policies and organisation; curriculum structure and design; socio-demographic and socio-cultural aspects of the target groups; baseline indicators; etc); training for the EPJA management units took place in the provinces etc. During the first half of 2010, many activities in the field were due to be launched, with the arrival of the foreseen equipment and the organisation of the training activities and regional fora, etc.

Additionally, the ROM mission stressed that - as in the case of similar initiatives that are underway in the

¹⁴ The recognition of qualification of professional training is established in Chapter VI, Article 38 of the Technical and Professional Education Law (No. 26.058). The National Institute of Technological Education is the authority on recognition of qualifications - with the participation of the jurisdictions - establishing criteria and standards that have to be approved by the Federal Council of Education.

sector - the Programme should strengthen inter-institutional coordination in order to ensure complementarities and synergies. This phase of the Programme was intended to strengthen the links with other governmental initiatives, support the Ministry of Education to carry out the Programme and the sector policies associated with the Programme's strategy.

8. Implementation partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

Currently, the Ministry of Education is implementing a series of actions to improve quality at all educational levels, as well as to promote the inclusion and permanence of students in the 'system'. The European Commission has funded a EUR 10 000 000 project for the pedagogic strengthening of schools that are part of the Integral Programme for Educational Equality (PIIE) – ALA/2005/17541 – aimed at contributing to an increase in equal opportunities for the children who attend Basic General Education (EGB) in urban and suburban schools. Furthermore, the Secondary Education Improvement Programme, partly financed by the Inter-American Development Bank and aimed at strengthening regular secondary education is presently being implemented. Additionally, during 2006, the World Bank approved a loan to finance a Rural Education Improvement Programme.

In 2008, the National Ministry of Education launched the Plan for Completion of Primary and Secondary School (FinEs). This Plan is executed on a nationwide basis including all provinces and the city of Buenos Aires. In its initial phase, the Plan focused on young and adults aged 18 or above who finished courses in secondary education but did not obtain certification. Since 2009, in addition to the first phase, a second phase of the Plan was launched focusing on young people and adults who did not start or finish primary or secondary education.

Other areas where the Federal Government implements programmes and projects complement this action is the PROSAP Programme –cofounded by the Inter-American Development Bank¹⁵ and the World Bank¹⁶ with - the Ministry of Agriculture that implements a Young Rural Entrepreneurs initiative. This programme aims at reducing rural migration and promoting the creation of new youth enterprises in rural areas.

The Ministry of Labour is currently implementing the Project *Young People: More and Better Jobs*. This project is a component of the World Bank financed Lifelong Learning Programme¹⁷. The project's objective is to generate opportunities for social and labour inclusion of young people through integrated actions of training, education, and professional practice in order to start an independent enterprise or to join the labour market.

9. Contacts:

Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail

AG CPN María Inés Martínez Directora General Unidad de Financiamiento Internacional.
Lavalle 2540 – Piso 5 Ciudad Autónoma de Buenos Aires.
TE: 4959-2200.

10. Sources, links and publications

Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)

AF_21952_3 Action Fiche for ARGENTINA.

MR ROM 21/09/2009 25/09/2009 (21952- ROM Missing).

Other documents:

FA 21952 Anex II to the Financing Agreement DCI-ALA/2010/21952. DTA.

Annex I - Logical Framework Matrix.

http://www.mejuyuy.gov.ar/blogs/edja/?page_id=662

http://eeas.europa.eu/delegations/argentina/eu_argentina/cooperation/cooperation_proj_list/edja/index_es.htm

¹⁵ IADB Loan Agreement Number 1956/OC-AR (US\$ 200.000.000)

¹⁶ World Bank Loan Agreement Number 7597-AR (US\$ 300.000.000)

¹⁷ World Bank Loan Agreement Number 7474-AR (US\$ 200.000.000)

PERU

Project title: Support to Vocational Training for insertion into the Labour Force (APROLAB) (Programa de Apoyo a la Formación Profesional para la Inserción Laboral en el Perú: APROLAB)

Project title: Support to the Vocational Education and Training in Peru: Consolidation and Enlargement - APROLAB II Apoyo a la Formación Profesional para la Inserción Laboral en el Perú: APROLAB II consolidación Ampliación.

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: C
3. Efficiency: C
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: C
7. Sustainability: B
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

The Peruvian government adopted Law No. 28044 on general education in 2003, where two different levels of occupational qualifications are defined in articles 12 and 15: 'primary education' and 'higher education' respectively. In articles 40 to 45 the strategy of 'technical-productive education' is set forth more concretely. This strategy aims at imparting working and management skills and is tailored to the needs of people who seek to enter or re-enter the labour market and of primary education graduates. In Act no. 28518 concerning the Modalities of Developing the Labour Force (28 May 2006), Act no. 28740 for the Establishment of a National Evaluation, Accreditation and Certification System (19 May 2006) and the Presidential Decree No. 021-2006-ED dated 28 July 2006, the Peruvian government redefines and institutionalises the basic principles of its VET policy, by laying down four strategies in a binding manner. This is particularly true for the requirement to impart predominantly working skills that take into account local needs. This decree also turns equal access and the need to involve all relevant groups in defining contents and designing skills-oriented vocational education into binding regulations.

The Directorate of Higher Education Technology and Technical Production (DestP), under the Directorate General of Higher Education and Professional-Technical Education, Ministry of Education, updated the National Catalogue of Titles and Certifications, to achieve the articulation between educational technology in higher education and technical production, with labour demands and the productive sector.

The National Catalogue of Qualifications and Certifications (CNTC) was prepared by the Ministry of Education in collaboration with the Spanish Agency for International Cooperation and was concluded in its experimental version that was posted on the website of the Ministry of Education (destp.minedu.gob.pe), in 1998 and, according to Vice-Ministerial Resolution No. 0085-2003-ED, is the reference for the design and development of the curriculum of Higher Technological Education and Technical Production Education. Given the time and the changes in the world of work, the great advances in science and technology in recent years and the current demands of work, the professional profiles in the National Catalogue of Titles and Certifications has been updated and new profiles developed. All have been incorporated within the National Catalogue of Titles and Certifications through Board Resolution No. 1938-2011-ED, dated August 18, 2011.

Productive Technical Education is a form of education geared to the acquisition of job and business skills from a perspective of sustainable development and competitiveness. It contributes to a better performance of the persons working to improve their employability and personal development. It is intended for people looking for integration or reintegration into the labor market and basic education students.

The objectives of Productive Technical Education are to: a) Develop job skills and entrepreneurial skills for dependent or independent work. b) To motivate and prepare students to apply learning in a specific field of production or services with a business vision c) Upgrade the skills of active workers or unemployed, according to labor market requirements. d) To complement the development of education for work that basic education offers.

Productive Technical Education is organised into cycles determined by the characteristics and complexities of technical and professional profiles and specific academic requirements. The modules are organised into cycles of productive skills in line with employment value and are duly certified. They are not successive or propaedeutic. The particularities of each cycle are:

a) The basic cycle of Productive Technical Education provides students with the skills needed to perform less complex jobs that will allow them to enter the workforce. This cycle is accessed without prior formal education.

b) Productive Technical Education in secondary schools provides students with the necessary skills required for specialised occupational activities. The access requires the equivalent competencies for the second level of basic education.

The Ministry of Education sets the requirements, content and length of each cycle. Successful completion of a course entitles a student to an appropriate technical degree with a major in a respective specialty. With several conditions, students can continue to complete their training in Basic Education levels and consequently be able to access higher education.

There are a great many training providers and programmes - both formal and informal. At the secondary education level, these include technical-type secondary schools. At the post-secondary level, there are national sectoral training services for industry (SENATI), construction (SENCICO), telecommunications (INICTEL) and tourism (CENFOTUR), as well as ISTs (Higher Technological Institutes) or ISPs - Higher Pedagogic Institutes). Outside the academic hierarchy there are Vocational Education Centres (CEOs), which recently started a transition to a new model which involved a change of name to Technical-Production Education Centres (CETPROs).

1. Identification CRIS decision number	Aprolab: CRIS: 16895 Aprolab II: CRIS 18363
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Area	TP-TVET policy and systems TM -TVET access to target groups LS- Active Labour Market policy and Measures
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI: geographic programmes Aid Modality: Project approach
c) By region	Geographic programmes: Latin America Peru. Comunidad Andina
d) By Period and Status	APROLAB project, financing agreement ALA/ 2004/016-895; Decreto Supremo Nº 006-2004-TR 13/05/2004. ALA Comité: 18/11/2004. Period: Start Date: 01/01/2005 End Date: 31/07/2008 Duration: 32 months + extension = 42 months Status: Closed APROLAB II project, financing agreement ALA/2006/18363, of the general budget of the European Communities Period: Start Date:01/08/2007 End Date: 01/05/2012
3. Financial data	
APROLAB: EUR 6.000.000 EU: EUR 5 000 000. Real: 3.500 000 (83% of the project) Duration: 2005-2008 Gobierno de Perú: 1.000.000 APROLAB II: EUR 25 000 000. EUcontribution : EUR 18 717 741.14 + Government of Peru: EUR 5 000 000	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
<u>Aprolab I and II:</u> The overall objective of the project is to contribute to strengthen the competitiveness and quality of the Peruvian workforce in order to promote economic development and reduce poverty in Peru. The specific objective is to refocus vocational education towards market demands, socioeconomic needs and support the development of a skilled labour force.	
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?

Peru is experiencing important changes in the field of technology and information to embrace trade liberalisation and globalisation. To generate more jobs, the country has sought to diversify its productive sectors and to develop a more stable economy. The positive effects of economic growth are already visible in the workplace. However, this growth has not been enough to tackle social problems and to provide employment for all.

A diagnosis of the Peruvian training market, incorporating much recent research, indicates that post-secondary schooling and vocational training systems suffer from serious quality problems that impact the effectiveness of training investments. In effect, for the last four decades, the Peruvian education system generally - and vocational training specifically - have experienced a vertiginous, but dispersed and somewhat chaotic expansion. Within a context of little to no supervision and regulation, as well as a lack of information systems that might guide the demand for training, a training supply system exhibiting three main characteristics has emerged: a system with great heterogeneity, offering average training of low quality and pertinence, with disjointedness between existing sub-systems. Though the market is dynamic and expanding, a lack of information and regulation may be inducing private and social welfare losses. Thus, returns on investment for post secondary, non-university formal schooling are low in a context where there is evidence of an increasing demand for skills (Jaramillo, 2009).

4.2. Result of the project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)
-----------------------------------	---

Aprolab: The three results achieved by the project include:

1. Vocational sector oriented to the demands of the market and the regional development needs;
2. Implementation of the this reform in 3 to 4 regions of the country;
3. Promotion of innovative experiences in the framework of the vocational training in each of the selected regions responding to the expectations of the rural and indigenous people with a substantial female participation.

Aprolab II: Results achieved by the project include:

1. Creating and strengthening planning, monitoring and evaluation capacities of local authorities
2. Re-structuring training of 50 Technical Education & VET centres and developing a new training curriculum;
3. Strengthening management skills of the Directors of 50 Technical Education & VET centres and establishing a new VET curriculum model;
4. Provide and equip 50 Technical Education & VET centres with appropriate facilities;
5. Establishing a Fund for micro-projects on the promotion of Pedagogical and Technological Innovation;
6. Establishing a programme to increase the programme coverage to priority target groups (youth and women from rural areas);
7. Creating 7 Socioeconomic, Labour and Employment finding Observatories (OSELCOV).

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 3 main broad criteria Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency 5 additional criteria: Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF
---	--

• Relevance: B

Based on the ROMs, both projects are relevant as a means to elevate the quality of professional training and labour adjustment levels. The development of management skills, curriculum articulation with the productive sectors, the care strategies for youths, the poor, rural populations and women (the most excluded groups in the country), as well as the improvement of equipment and materials are a key development and a consolidation of a national, professional training system.

• Effectiveness: C

Effectiveness is low. At the end of the programme, a VET reform was not defined or approved, even if the existence of APROLAB I and the actions it implemented to incorporate the main reform components allowed a strong advocacy. The results were not obtained as a whole although the quality of the achieved ones was considered as high. Beneficiaries had access to benefits through the Competitive Fund; 17 projects were funded in the fields of implementation through grant contracts. The delays and difficulties of internal organisation and coordination of the supervising ministries and a lack of consistency in institutional culture led to products that could not be used in the political reform

process that was taking place. Among the positive effects, the Pedagogical Training Programme, Technology Update, the Management Training Centers and the Pontifical Catholic University of Peru (PUCP) used the APROLAB methodology on a sectoral analysis for the identification of training needs. Aprolab II did not fully attain any of the 6 expected results and achievements as can be observed in the ROM 2; more information is available at: <http://www.aprolab2.edu.pe>.

- Institutional strengthening and capacity building for planning, monitoring and evaluation in the Ministry of Education in the area of basic vocational training and formal higher, Regional Education and Education Management for Local Units in 7 departments. The aim was to generate stable and competent manpower through a training policy in the country and abroad, equipment, computer management tools and libraries. However, learning from the workshops was not replicated;
- Rearrangement of the training of formal professional training and support for the development of a new curriculum. It is based on the development of skills and the character is modular and flexible (with potential to be adapted in schools to local specificities);
- Strengthening the management capacities of the 50 school directors (CETPRO and IST in 7 departments), as part of a substantial increase to their autonomy and capacity for integration with civil society and companies in their areas of influence. Building a culture of teamwork, participatory design, institutional educational projects and school curricular projects; systematic linkages were organised with the corporate world, creating a culture of accountability and addressing comprehensive training that includes internalising the democratic values. They seek to promote innovative management experiences with private sector participation. Libraries will be strengthened and will create coordination networks between the various schools in the regions;
- In-service training programme. Teachers of the 50 centers benefited from training on pedagogical issues, technological updates and strengthening democratic values and practices in workplaces. It is positive that most teachers know local employers and their needs; their knowledge is not systematic but has great potential. Self-employment and the micro-enterprise sector – usually in informal settings – are the fate of the majority of graduates, which is why the centers often include business management issues;
- Infrastructure and equipment. The component attempted to overcome technological obsolescence in the CEO, and IST CETPRO beneficiaries, by providing equipment, laboratories and educational materials adapted to the characteristics of competency-based training and flexible modular structure. By short-term technical assistance defined the equipment and materials for the new curriculum. A smaller sum was allocated for a minor refurbishment of infrastructure. They benefited only 50 schools in seven departments. False expectations regarding equipment undermined the credibility of APROLAB.
- Establishing a Micro-Fund for the Promotion of Educational Innovation and Technology. The aim was to promote the development of new pedagogical practices and strengthen the relationship with the labour market.
- Establishment of a policy of scholarships for low income students who attend CEO-CETPRO and IST areas / specialties labour demand and development potential mechanisms to promote social inclusion and combating poverty. Formal vocational training takes on about 36 students per year. The population categories attending vocational training centers are those with low economic resources, which is why it is socially important to encourage access for these young people. 50% of the beneficiaries of the scholarships were the young and of rural Indian extraction. There must be an equitable distribution of grants between men and women, in order to ensure that crosscutting issues such as gender and multiculturalism are respected. In adjudication committees (one in each region) center representatives were not included;
- Creating socioeconomic Observatories on labour, placements and careers (OSELCOV), with responsibility for vocational and non-formal training.

- **Efficiency: C**

The APROLAB programme had the potential to provide an important impetus for building a training system in the country. However, the incapacity of the Ministry of Education and the MTPE (Ministry of labour) to effectively coordinate, since this was a requirement of the EC for programme financing, was disastrous; this made it twice as difficult to manage the programme, as mutual distrust between the MED and the MTPE dominated and every little activity needed to be approved by each Ministry. Thus, the programme's implementation was repeatedly delayed. The result is that for the second phase of the programme, Aprolab II is now being executed by the Ministry of Education only. One possible

conclusion is that a reasonable division of labour rather than an ineffective coordination between the two ministries could be a more realistic solution to continuously duplicating efforts. This division of labour may be achieved in the context of establishing long-term vocational training policies. In 2008, both Programmes were implemented in parallel. In 2013, Aprolab II continues its financing actions.

- **Coherence: B**

APROLAB emerged out of Peru's Country Strategy Paper 2002-2006 (CSP). The CSP allocates 60% of the financial allocation of Commission cooperation for socioeconomic development, focusing on the theme of 'vocational training for employment', with 30% of the total budget available for the period 2002-2006 (EUR 86 000 000). Three priorities were formulated: (1) improving vocational training, (2) strengthening the link between supply and demand of employment, (3) increasing the competitiveness and productive capacities of indigenous and rural women.

Aprolab II aims to consolidate and extend the return results of Aprolab; it is coherent with the 2006 'Guidelines for Vocational Training Policies in Peru', promoted by the Ministries of Education and Labour to define a long-term strategy in the vocational training field. The document summarises the broad lines along which the Education and Labour sectors, actors from the production sector, academics, and civil society agreed that a national vocational training policy must be put into place, with the proposed objective of improving vocational training quality and increasing labour adequacy levels.

- **Quality of the Design: B**

The Logical Framework of APROLAB was developed with clear indicators, but could not adapt to the institutional context, as indicators were linked to political decisions (consistent with the intervention method chosen). The absence of a risk management plan and institutional architecture rendered it difficult to execute; hence, a contingency plan was implemented that gave more support to the channels and mechanisms operating between the two institutions, but given the weight and stiffness of the institutional structure, these changes (in the final run), did not achieve the expected results. The crosscutting issues were taken into account theoretically as a requirement for the development and dissemination of programme aspects; however, this focus did not always materialise.

The APROLAB II design has methodological weaknesses in the formulation of objectives (multidimensional, imprecise and unrealistic); the results (heterogeneous) and indicators (insufficiently specific and feasible) impede the monitoring and evaluation of the project. Weaknesses in the design of the budget are also noticeable, as the provident fund which was made in the Financing Agreement has proved inadequate and is being completed with funds granted by the SNIP worth over EUR 5,000,000.

- **Impact: C**

APROLAB's impact is indicated by 280 small entrepreneurs, 114 teachers and 8 120 persons actually trained.

Beneficiaries achieved greater efficiency, with a better chance of finding a job and staying within the labour market.

Aprolab's impact is directly linked to actions based upon this project's achievements. The Ministry of Labour took a number of actions, among which:

a) A draft Law on Vocational Training has been drawn up, proposing the establishment of a Vocational Training System that gives priority to joint production and labour demand to meet the country's development needs.

b) Guidelines for Vocational Training Policy have been implemented at the regional level.

c) The definition of profiles based on Occupational Standards of Competence in the Agro-industrial Sector.

d) Support to the three socioeconomic work observatories (OSEL APROLAB) implemented by the Programme and the creation of further OSEL in various regions of the country.

According to the mid-term evaluation, impact is not high because the considerable delay in the project's implementation, due to the signing of the Financing Agreement before the approval of SNIP; thus the request for EC funds was not been authorised.

Weakening of the internal consistency of the results: increasing the coverage of formal vocational education system (Result-7: Creating 7 Socioeconomic, Labour and Employment finding Observatories (OSELCOV)) has become a scholarship programme operated by independent external entities of the Ministry of Education. This situation adversely affects the efficiency and effectiveness of the project.

The Competitive Fund for Micro Projects with its high budget, the dimension that it will acquire, its complexity and the limited execution time available is one of the sensitive points of the project in

terms of efficiency and the management of funds.

The acquisition of ICT equipment resulted in a reduction in the budget allocation for specialised equipment workshops and classrooms, without to justify this distribution.

The simultaneous performance of various activities such as labor demand, prospective professional families, professional profiles and curriculum guides affected the consistency and mutual complementarity.

- **Sustainability: B**

The institutional capacity of both ministries was strengthened, in terms of capacity to implement public policies in the field of vocational training; a growing inter-institutional coordination was a necessary condition for long-term impact. Among the noted progresses are the implementation of the National Guidelines for Training Policy, approved by Supreme Decree No. 010-2008-ED; the Criteria Certification Process for Work Skills, approved by Ministerial Resolution No. 026-2010-TR and the Work Plan for Skills Certification, approved by Ministerial Resolution No. 082-2010-TR.

Since investing in VET does not have an immediate return, the identification of models for efficient and innovative production at training centres could be way to reduce dependence on public funding. Now the centers have regional income (fee) and registration, which - although limited - permit investments in infrastructure and equipment. APROLAB II 's success depends also on a participatory and transparent management and interagency partnerships to attract more students.

- **Added value of ETF:**

Not applicable

4.3. Beneficiaries

Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

Aprolab I y II: Education Ministry- MED-MINEDU.

Aprolab: Ministry of Labour and Employment Promotion- MTPE

National Direction of Higher Education Technology and Technical Production (DestP), under the Directorate General of Higher Education and Professional-Technical Education (DINESUTP).

7 Education Regional Directions (DRE).

50 Education Management Units (UGEL).

50 technical-professional education centres and ISTs (20 ISTs and 30 CETPRO).

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The APROLAB programme provided support to the reform of vocational training in cooperation with the Ministry of Labour and Employment Promotion and the Ministry of Education. The overall objective of the Financing Agreement during its 3-year implementation period was to contribute to an increased competitiveness and quality of the work force in order to promote economic development and reduce poverty in Peru. The programme is to be implemented on a national level. The specific objective of the programme is to align technical and vocational training to the demands of the market, the socioeconomic needs and the development potential of the country.

The APROLAB II Program is part of the bilateral cooperation of the European Union and the Government of Peru. It aims to contribute to improve competitiveness and quality of the labor force, for economic development and the reduction of poverty in Peru. This will be conducive to achieving the overall objectives of the country's development policies, oriented towards a proposal for reform of vocational training in Peru. The programme has a European contribution of EUR 20 000 000, which represents 80% of the total budget; its implementation phase was completed in November 2011. With APROLAB II, the European Commission seeks to capitalise on the experience gained in implementing various projects in the field of vocational training. As a result, it is expected that the project will contribute to the design of a legal and institutional framework to strengthen the education sector in Peru.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

- Strategic Policy Guidelines for Vocational Training. Decentralisation of TVET actions: APROLAB Public Agenda introduced the issue of vocational training, visibility and awareness around the issue, and was critical in attracting the interest, participation and commitment of national and regional actors and beneficiaries;;
- Strengthening institutional management. Contribution to improve consistency between training demand driven, current teachers, the resources and technology to date and strategic management

of change at all levels were key strategic;

- Training Offer: a study on "Standardization and Validation Standards Agroindustrial Sector Job Skills", for the purpose of developing a general guide for future monitoring and incorporation into the work of the MTPE (Ministry of labour);
- Integrated and coordinated system of labor market information and training offer.
- Systematization of experiences for replicable innovative Training (Competitive Fund in the regions) were implemented, monitored and evaluated;
- Training plans and teacher training: developed a proposal for a plan of training and development of teachers and managers of training institutions could not be applied in curricular aspects, methodological and educational management and projects. For the technological upgrading of teachers, APROLAB developed a technology training plan in the four Regions (ICA, LA Libertad, Cajamarca and Ayacucho) and Proposed Plans pedagogical training and management training centers and institutes, to be analyzed by MINEDU and adjusted and implemented in the framework of APROLAB II;
- Aprolab II pedagogical management capacity for change. Teacher training as paradigm changes APROLAB II to play the new educational model promoted by the project;
- Plan was reached for technical vocational education, and 7 regional strategic plans: Ayacucho, Cajamarca, Ica, La Libertad, Sindh, Piura and Puno;
- They developed two courses in pedagogy for 1250 management and staff; were equipped the Education and UGELs of the 7 regions with computers.; Physically 45 were improved beneficiary institutions and a digital network was installed to establish an Information System for Education Labor, and finally applied 5000 scholarships for young, highly valued and appreciated in all regions;
- Strengthening of labor market studies were conducted on Diagnostics Development of Regional Labour Market and Labour Market Integration Mechanisms, differentiating urban areas from rural areas, Evaluation and Proposal for Strengthening Labour Mediation Service at the level of CIL RED PROEmpleo. With the support of a mission ATI conducted with the MOE and the PETM, a joint analysis of the problem of Job Placement at the 4 Regions of APROLAB and the proposal of a National Job placement, seeking to reconcile the MTPE systems and MOE initiatives;
- As for the design of products, the creation of OSEL achievement is a substantial businesses by providing information on the regional labor market and employment and self-employment opportunities, so that should maintain their autonomy and strengthen their analytical skills. It should prioritize this structure inserted in the regions and organize sectoral information systems based on their feedback, without overlapping the Observatories. S
- Sustainability of the project or projects for funding and scholarships, or for the maintenance of infrastructure and equipment;
- Design of a Lifelong Learning Plan.

7. Lessons learned

Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.

- The APROLAB design incorporated an assessment of the institutional capacity, sectoral policies and a culture of dialogue and cooperation involving all TVET stakeholders to increase sustainability and impact of the action;
- APROLAB 1 did not have a baseline for follow up and monitoring, at the beginning of the programme,. ;Aprolab II required a mapping of actors and a baseline, making visible potential conflicts and critical paths of the expected changes for each family. The circumstances of the project Aprolab II and its effects and risks caused considerable delay in the execution by the snip approval and signature authority for lack of funds management
- Project monitoring and quality of execution. Aprolab: A significant number of the recommendations of the EC (in ROM, Evaluations Intermediate, Final Evaluations) are neither discussed by the partners, nor incorporated, lost economic resources and the ability to correct errors in time. Aprolab II Tracking merely preparing quarterly technical and financial reports. Deficiencies in the identification phase affected the quality of the design in terms of objectives, outcomes and indicators and hinder monitoring and evaluation. The Advisory Committee will be created soon. Project monitoring is especially important after the hiring process, externalized almost all the shares. The initially foreseen funds for CF operation has proved inadequate and had to be supplemented with funds from the SNIP;

- The equipment of the beneficiary institutions, rehabilitation works and, especially, the Micro-Competitive Fund for Innovation, proved critical in terms of effectiveness and efficiency of the project;
- Management scheme. Aprolab was considered a funding opportunity by the Ministries of Education and Labour, which led to lack of financial and administrative autonomy, necessary for the execution: The programme foresaw its implementation through a Management Company, with autonomy to prosecute the activities, and should be taken preventively appropriate provisions for inter-institutional structures ensure the operation of UG that can meet the objectives. Aprolab II failed to appoint a National Director. The structure of the Executive Unit is the national leadership assumed by the same DestP and managed by the JATN, has provided efficient procurement activities, with little delegations of functions and internal communication. The external execution unit model contributes to technical levels and MINEDU DestP meso and micro levels perceive the project as alien to their functions;
- Selection of beneficiary institutions. Heterogeneity of beneficiaries in excellence and innovation. Particular statute UGELs beneficiaries without charge centers. The selected CETPRO except in some isolated cases did not meet the requirements to impart technical education Middle productive cycle. A significant number of EI beneficiaries accumulate weaknesses and do not meet minimum requirements to be considered suitable to initiate innovation processes Peruvian professional training system;
- Adequacy of training supply to demand. Non-strategic alliances with beneficiary institutions hinders the adequacy of supply and planning their internship. The OSEL does not guarantee the link between education and employment sector;
- Technological equipment for the workshops. Equipment for the priority sectors: agriculture, food industry, hotel and tourism, textiles and clothing, mechanics and metals, construction, and leather and footwear. The equipment reinforces the current bid dispersion instead of specializing in a differentiated way the centers. The sustainability of workshop equipment varies according to the house and in the specialty of Agricultural presents risks from the high volume of current expenditure, maintenance and replacement of the production machinery;
- APROLAB encouraged the inclusion of women through public sector institutions and private services to support the inclusion of women in the labor market, including the participation of institutional representatives of women at all levels of training. The gender has no desirable treatment APROLAB II for its great potential for change, must design a gender strategy; carrying a cross between gender and career promoted by the program. but expectations about it are favourable;
- Expectations of sustainability. The DestP can ensure the sustainability of CNTC policy development, competency-based DCB and tracking system of graduates. Regional governments are key actors for sustainability but its link to the project and the degree of ownership that are the same should improve significantly. APROLAB II has been a matter for the state to invest in professional technical training well above normal budgets, with promising prospects for economic sustainability.

8. Implementation partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

APROLAB: Education Ministry– MED-MINEDU and Ministry of Labour and Employment Promotion – MTPE
APROLAB II: Education Ministry through the National Direction for Secondary and Non-University Technological (DINESST).

9. Contacts:

Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail

The Peruvian International Cooperation Agency (APCI) Gobierno de Perú.
APROLAB II - 2008. Salvador Dalí 312 Oficina 2A y 3A San Borja, Lima 41
Central Telefónica (01)346-1543 / (01)346-1731
Webmaster: aprolab2@minedu.gob.pe

10. Sources, links and publications

Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)

- FA-DEC16895.pdf Convenio de financiación
- 16895_ROM.doc Ex-Post
- OTHER DOCS

- 9.162 - Peru ToR.pdf Evaluación final. Términos de referencia
- contratos_Agosto_APROLAB.pdf Contratos de subvención Mayo-agosto 2007
- expo_aprolab_2007_01.pdf Presentación PwP
- Diagnóstico de la Formación Profesional en el Perú. Ministerio de Trabajo y Promoción Social, Consejo Nacional de Trabajo y Promoción Social, Comisión de Formación Profesional y Capacitación para el Trabajo 2001
- 10-Financial Agreement
- Carta adendum 2.
- Adendum 2.
- Request for amendment
- 11_ Financial Agreement Ryder
- 19_Technical offer.
- 21_Initial Project Report. IPR_DEC
- 32_Studies: Factibilidad sobre FP en Perú
- MR-105185.01-ROM1 Date: 12/07/2008
- 18363_ROM_2.doc Date 15/06/2009
- 18363_Peru_interim_eval.pdf: Evaluación de Medio Término del proyecto APROLAB II. LoC N°2009/219340. Framework Contract Beneficiaries – Lot 9. EuropeAid/119860/C/SV/multi. Informe Final. 19/03/2010

Other documents:

- Ley de Creación del Sistema de Información de Educación para el Trabajo. Ley N° 28.340, 19/08/2004.
- Reglamento de Educación Técnico Productiva. Decreto Supremo N° 022-2004-ED.
- Resolución directorial 2005 de Diseño curricular básico de la Educación Técnico productiva. Ciclo básico.
- Ley del Sistema Nacional de Evaluación, Acreditación y Certificación de la Calidad Educativa. Ley 28.740, 22/05/2006.
- Ley 29394 de Institutos y Escuelas de Promoción Educación Superior. 31/07/2009
- Resolución directorial 0920-2008 Diseño curricular básico de la Educación Técnico productiva. Ciclo medio
- Resolución directorial 0686 de 2010 Normas de adecuación de los Institutos Tecnológicos.
- Convocatoria pública Becas Aprolab ICA
- Guía Metodológica para el diseño y elaboración de la política y plan regional de la formación profesional Dirección Nacional de Promoción del Empleo y Formación Profesional. Ministerio de Trabajo y promoción del Empleo.
- Skills Development Policies in Peru and the Changing Role of International Cooperation. Miguel Jaramillo Baanante. Grupo de análisis para el desarrollo (GRADE) NORRAG . Geneva 2009
- <http://digesutp.minedu.gob.pe/destp/>

BANGLADESH, CAMBODIA, BRAZIL, INDONESIA, PHILIPPINES, NIGER, PERU, UKRAINE, ZAMBIA

Project title: ILO/EC Project “Monitoring and Assessing Progress on Decent Work” (MAP)

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: A
3. Efficiency: B
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of Design: A
6. Impact: B
7. Sustainability: A
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

The project does not directly concern TVET.

1. Identification CRIS decision number	DCI-HUM/2008/164787
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Area:	LS- Active Labour Market policy and Measures: IE- Informal Economy IP.
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI: thematic programmes (Investing in People (IiP))
c) By region	Geographical Zone (Country or region): Multiple BANGLADESH, CAMBODIA, BRAZIL, INDONESIA, PHILIPPINES, NIGER, PERU, UKRAINE, ZAMBIA
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: (2009-2013) Duration: 55 months from 2009 Status: Closed
3. Financial data	Joint management action
EUR 4 199 997 EU Contribution: EUR 3 989 997	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
<p>The 2008 ILO declaration on Social Justice and a Fair Globalization reaffirmed the ILO Member States' commitment to these principles. To promote decent work (DW) in its articulation of 4 strategic objectives (employment, social protection, social dialogue, fundamental principles and rights at work), the European Consensus on Development confirms the promotion of DW. The thematic EC programme 'IiP', as a global platform for identifying and exchanging experiences, innovations and best practices between countries, in its Pillar 'Human and Social Development', promotes social cohesion and decent work, also through supplementary actions to underpin country and regional programmes. The overall objective is the realisation of decent work as a contribution to social justice and poverty reduction in developing and transition countries.</p> <p>The specific immediate objective of the project is the development – in support of the global decent work policy agenda – of a global methodology to strengthen the capacity of developing and transition countries to self-monitor and self-assess progress towards decent work.</p>	
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<p>The need in target countries of a methodology for self-monitoring and self-assessment of progress towards DW is acute since most of the monitoring on labour markets is limited to the quantity of employment, while the ILO has elaborated a list of DW indicators related to the 4 strategic objectives of the Decent Work Agenda.</p> <p>The elaboration of statistical data for DW requires statistical instruments like labour force-enterprise-household surveys including DW indicators as well as the improvement of the administrative databases</p>	

in Ministries of Labour and Labour Inspectorates. Guidelines on how to collect DW statistics are not available.

Data are not interpreted and correlated with labour market policies and institutions as well as macroeconomic policies, thus they cannot assure that quality and quantity of employment are analysed and addressed in an integrated manner, their cumulative effects measured and selected options be consistent with public budget spending (including external aid) and finally be evaluated in terms of welfare of economically active persons. Direct beneficiaries are government agencies (Ministries of Labour, statistical offices, research institutions) employers' and workers' organisations of selected countries.

4.2. Result of the project

- Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)

The production of a global methodology to self-monitor and self-assess progress towards decent work will strengthen the capacity of target groups to establish benchmarks for measuring progress towards decent work and will make it possible for actors of social dialogue to formulate coherent policies that better promote decent work for all women and men in the labour force:

- Country-specific decent work indicators identified;
- Statistical instruments improved;
- Coordination between producers and users (policy makers) of decent work statistics improved;
- Determinants of decent work trends empirically analysed;
- Training on decent work self-monitoring and self-assessment delivered;
- Tripartite dialogue on policy implications in the countries established;
- Methodology and results disseminated through regional workshops;
- Awareness on DW indicators raised through a global conference;
- Decent work in EC development cooperation mainstreamed through a toolkit.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)

- 3 main broad criteria **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF**

- **Relevance: A**

The MAP project's specific, immediate objective to develop a global methodology to strengthen the capacity of developing and transition countries to self-monitor and self-assess progress towards decent work is a highly relevant contribution to the overall developmental objective. It meets a demand expressed that has been brought to the ILO by member states at numerous occasions, namely to give them support and to provide them with useful tools to monitor and assess progress towards decent work.

- **Effectiveness: A**

The technical support to national statistical offices and other institutions involved in data ensured that the gaps identified by ILO constituents were addressed in an effective manner and that national capacity to monitor and assess progress on decent work was strengthened. While the focus on a limited number of pilot countries helped to ensure that project support addresses specific national challenges in an effective manner, several of the project activities were ready for dissemination of project outcomes to further countries. This dual approach of in-depth collaboration with a small group of countries and outreach to others proved a useful way to combine effectiveness and efficiency.

- **Efficiency: B**

Indications from monitoring suggest that the project is being implemented in an efficient manner. Internal management issues (replacement of the Chief Technical Adviser) and external factors have been dealt with via alternative options that proved viable. In general, all the 14 outputs/activities were implemented in line with plans. The action plan updated in January 2011 shows that the MAP project started on 1st February 2009, activities started when the MAP CTA was hired in April 2009 and the end is expected by January 2014. The project is implemented within the context of the ILO system of Results-Based Management (RBM).

- **Coherence: A**

The project is highly coherent with the 2008 ILO Declaration on Social Justice and a Fair Globalization

and reaffirmed the commitment of member states to promote decent work, and highlighted that member states may consider the establishment of appropriate indicators or statistics, if necessary with the assistance of the ILO, to monitor and evaluate the progress made. Coherence is also with the ILO Decent Work Agenda that seeks to promote “productive work in conditions of freedom, equity, security and human dignity” and with the joint objective of the International Labour Organization (ILO) and the European Union (EU); the European Consensus on Development indicated that ‘the EU will contribute to strengthening the social dimensions of globalisation, promoting employment and decent work for all’ and that ‘the Community will promote decent work for all in line with the International Labour Organization agenda’.

- **Quality of the Design: A**

The design of the project is in line with the ILO quality standards and the Result Based Approach. Strong emphasis is placed on gender equality, human rights and good governance.

- **Impact: B**

The impact on the beneficiary is indicated in the receipt and utilisation of the manual with definitions and concepts of Decent Work Indicators, the guidelines on data interpretation and analysis issues enabling countries to monitor decent work without extensive support from the ILO - and the manual on the LFS questionnaire. Awareness for Decent Work Indicators and the need to monitor and assess progress on decent work has already been raised during regional workshops on decent work indicators.

- **Sustainability: A**

In order to achieve results that will be sustained after the completion of the action, the project puts great emphasis on building broad-based national ownership through Tripartite Consultation Workshops that have been carried out successfully in several countries. This is achieved by building new or strengthening existing national capacity in the tripartite ILO constituents; dissemination of best practices at regional level and the development of a global methodology as the tool for the implementation of the Global Decent Work Policy Agenda. It builds on EC funded- ILO implemented regional technical cooperation activities (Euro social in Latin America), and on the nationally owned DW strategies formalised in the ILO Decent Work Country programmes. The action is also a prolongation of ILO institutional support to constituents on the subject.

- **Added value of ETF: NA**

4.3. Beneficiaries Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?
Final beneficiaries and/or target groups are government agencies, workers’ organisations, employers’ organisations, national statistical offices, and research institutions involved in data collection and analysis. Final beneficiaries are all women and men engaged in the labour force, especially those without access to decent work and with earnings below the poverty line.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The MAP aims at developing a global methodology and tools to strengthen the capacity of developing and transition countries to self-monitor and self-assess progress towards decent work. The project puts great emphasis on: building broad-based national ownership through Tripartite Consultation Workshops, provide technical support to national statistical offices and other institutions involved in data national capacity to monitor and strengthen progress on decent work. It focuses on a limited number of pilot countries to address specific national challenges with technical support, training and knowledge-sharing with the aim of disseminating the project activities and outcomes to further countries.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to “scalability”? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

The dual approach of in-depth collaboration with a small group of countries and outreach to others has so far turned out to be a useful way to combine effectiveness and efficiency. The MAP Project has frequently received explicit support from the political leadership in the target countries and high-ranking officials have addressed and participated in project activities. The involvement in the selected countries of ILO tripartite constituents in MAP project as implementing partners and beneficiaries. The ILO competence and capacity in technical cooperation project and programmes’ implementation. The

network of expertise mobilised from HQ technical department, Decent Work Teams based in the Regional offices, country offices and the competent international and national expertise, familiar with ILO principles, technical knowledge and management/implementation procedures.	
7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.
<p>The importance of institutional relations, of the ILO with governments, employers' and workers' organisations in this case, in all countries targeted by the action, which boosts credibility and participation.</p> <p>The recognised competence and effectiveness of the implementing agency working on subjects that stem from its own <i>raison d'être</i> and hence is not challenged.</p> <p>The MAP project falls under the full mandate of the ILO and the acknowledgement by the beneficiaries and partners (constituents) that the implementing agency will not disappear at the end of the project since the ILO had and will continue to support them on the subject matter - progress towards Decent Work.</p>	
8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
Government agencies, workers' organisations, employers' organisations, national statistical offices, and research institutions involved in data collection and analysis.	
9. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail
ILO HQ Geneva. DEVCO Brussels.	
10. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)
Contribution Agreement. Monitoring/Interim Reports 2009-10, 2010-11.	

BANGLADESH, INDONESIA, BENIN AND GUATEMALA

Project title: ILO/EC Project: Assessing and Addressing the Effects of Trade on Employment (ETE)

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: A
3. Efficiency: B
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of Design: A
6. Impact: B
7. Sustainability: B
8. Added value of ETF: N/A

0. TVET at a Glance

The project does not concern TVET.

1. Identification CRIS decision number	DCI-HUM/2008/ 164791
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Area:	TP-TVET policy and systems LS- Active Labour Market policy and Measures
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI: thematic programmes (Investing in People IiP)
c) By region	Geographic Zone (Country or Region): Multiple BANGLADESH, INDONESIA, BENIN AND GUATEMALA
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: (2009-2014) Duration: 55 months from 2009 Status: Ongoing
3. Financial data	Grant
EUR 4 199 997 EU Contribution EUR 3 227 710	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
	The ETE project supports the ILO through 4 strategic objectives of Decent Work: 1) labour standards and fundamental principles and rights at work, 2) decent employment and income, 3) social protection for all, and 4) tripartism and social dialogue. These objectives have informed ILO global reach initiatives envisioned in the Declaration on Social Justice for a Fair Globalization (2008) and the Global Jobs Pact (2009), the Millennium Development Goals and the European Consensus on Development. Through technical assistance, the ETE project is helping Indonesia, Bangladesh, Benin and Guatemala analyse trade and labour market policies addressing the adjustment challenges that workers and employers face, expanding the opportunities for the creation of decent employment and improving working and living conditions. The ETE project generates quantitative and qualitative knowledge on the relationship between international trade and employment at the level of the pilot countries and globally, by developing tools for the formulation of coherent trade and labour market policies, based on sound data and diagnosis, with the involvement of the social partners (first specific objective). The second specific objective of the ETE project is to strengthen the capacity of policy makers, researchers and social partners to assess the effects of changes in trade policies on employment and to design effective and coherent policies that enable the pilot countries to mitigate any negative effects of trade liberalisation and expand employment.
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?

EU partner countries face risks related to the changes of the global trade environments: i) commodity and price volatility; ii) agreement in WTO Doha Round; iii) Free Trade Agreements (FTAs) with EU and other countries; iv) regional integration; v) increased competition from China and India; vi) Economic Partnership Agreement with the EU and ACPs. The implications on employment are not clear and need to be analysed to design adjustment policies and monitor progress on Decent Work. These countries have not prepared labour markets to meet the needs for new skills as well as make available income support measures that provide social safety nets. The fiscal impact of reduced tariff on social expenditure and public sector employment, the supply side constraints reducing the diversification of export structures, the relation between trade liberalisation and informal economies, are all aspects deserving further investigation to formulate a labour market policy agenda and strategies to anticipate these effects. Trade and labour market time-series data are not entirely reliable or comparable. The capacity of policy makers, staff of intermediary labour market institutions, research institutions, statistic authorities, employers', workers' and civil society organization, to make use of analysis for policy making or select and use appropriate models and approaches, require strengthening.

4.2. Result of the project

- Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)

- For government officials: knowledge of trade liberalisation effect on labour market and capacity to design effective policies increased;
- For intermediary LM institutions: capacity to implement LM policies and strategies strengthened;
- For staff of research institutions/statistical offices: knowledge of techniques and methodologies enhanced;
- For social partners and CSOs: knowledge and participation to policy dialogue increased;
- For workers: active, decent employment policies (skills, benefits, placement) available;
- Literature review, 4 country targeted papers, quantitative and qualitative techniques and methodologies, book on trade and employment, country reports, training material, training in pilot countries, policy working groups in pilot countries, national seminars for working groups, formulated policies and programmes, reporting and dissemination of experience/knowledge to other countries.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)

- 3 main broad criteria **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF**

- **Relevance: A**

The ETE is highly relevant to the demand of the selected countries of support in acquiring and developing methodologies and tools as well as to capacitate the key stakeholders of the country policy response to the effects of trade liberalization on employment and Decent Work. This is also indicated in the report of the joint ILO-EU formulation at the EC Delegation and country level as well as by the reports of the country tripartite working groups.

- **Effectiveness: A**

The project's knowledge component (initial studies based on literature review and analysis of the trade-employment nexus) and how it is linked to adjustment costs, economic diversification, gender, and informality, have been converted into a global training tool, subsequently offered by the ITC-ILO and used in capacity building activities in the pilot countries. The thematic studies focused on the specific economic, institutional, and governance characteristics of the pilot countries. The knowledge basis has been used in building the capacity of constituents consisting of training, platforms for tripartite discussions and formulation policies to mitigate negative effects of trade liberalisation on employment. The results of the evaluation of the capacity building activities, including tripartite knowledge sharing workshops and technical training are positive. The focus on a limited number of pilot countries helped to ensure that project support addresses specific national challenges in an effective manner. Moreover, several project outputs were ready for dissemination to other countries. This dual approach of in-depth collaboration with a small group of countries and outreach to others proved a useful way to combine effectiveness and efficiency.

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Efficiency: B 	<p>Indications from the ETE narrative report 2011 suggest that the project is implemented in an efficient and timely manner within the context of the ILO system of Results-based management (RBM). Activities were generally implemented according to schedule. The logical framework was revised to realign the implementation of the activities among the 4 countries. Minor budget revisions were introduced as cost of the process of establishing and proceedings of the tripartite working groups became clear. The Budget Plan and flow of expenditure were substantially respected. External factors linked to overall political events or the lengthy process of composition of the tripartite-plus working groups did not impact on the implementation schedule and costs.</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Coherence: A 	<p>The project is coherent with the 2008 ILO Declaration on Social Justice and a Fair Globalization and the dialogue on effects of trade liberalisation on employment at the ILO Governing body. Coherence is also ensured with the European Union Communications on 'The social dimension of globalization' and 'Promoting decent work for all'.</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of the Design: A 	<p>The design of the project is in line with the ILO quality standards and in the Results-Based Approach, strong emphasis is placed on gender equality, human rights and good governance.</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Impact: B 	<p>The impact on the beneficiary is indicated in the evaluation reports of the capacity building component as well as in the receipt and utilisation of the global tools and methodologies manual as being substantially high. To what extent the developed approach, global tools and methodologies can actually influence the implementation of the policies formulated with the TA of the ETE project is not possible to determine, as the project is ongoing. The ETE outputs and results are expected to service the dialogue at the ILO Governing Body on the specific subject as well as influence policy analysis in ILO Member States.</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sustainability: B 	<p>The financial, institutional and policy sustainability of the project are considered as high. The ETE activities are part of ILO institutional support to constituents in the selected countries, and the developed knowledge is integrated within the programme of regular courses offered by the ILO international training centre. EU Technical cooperation is expected to integrate the ETE's results as well as Departments of Labour of concerned ministries and statistics offices in the 4 countries. The results of the tripartite-plus working groups and of structured dialogue based on capacity building and technical assistance indicate that the project is demand-driven and owned by the beneficiaries.</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Added value of ETF: NA 	
<p>4.3. Beneficiaries</p>	<p>Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?</p> <p>Final beneficiaries and/or target groups are government agencies, workers' organisations, employers' organisations, national statistical offices and research institutions involved in data collection and analysis. Final beneficiaries are all women and men engaged in the labour force, especially those without access to decent work and with earnings below the poverty line.</p>
<p>5. Synopsis</p>	<p>Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.</p>
	<p>The ETE project supports the ILO's 4 strategic objectives for Decent Work (employment, social protection, social dialogue, fundamental principles and rights at work), which have informed recent ILO initiatives with a global reach such as those envisioned in the Declaration on Social Justice for a Fair Globalization (2008) and the Global Jobs Pact (2009). The ETE project, through technical assistance in trade, is helping the pilot countries enhance their employment opportunities and improve working and living conditions by developing global knowledge tools that can support the formulation of coherent trade and labour market policies at the national level, based on sound data and diagnoses, with the involvement of the social partners.</p>
<p>6. Key elements of success</p>	<p>What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?</p>

The dual approach of in-depth collaboration with a small group of countries and outreach to others has proved to be a useful way to combine effectiveness and efficiency. The ETE Project has frequently received explicit support from the political leadership in the target countries and high-ranking officials have addressed and participated in project activities. The involvement in the selected countries of ILO tripartite constituents as implementing partners and beneficiaries. The ILO competence and capacity in technical cooperation project and programme implementation. The network of expertise mobilised from HQ's technical department, Decent Work Teams based in the regional offices, country offices and the competent international and national expertise, familiar with ILO principles, technical knowledge and management/implementation procedures. The involvement of the ILO International Training Centre in translating technical results into capacity building packages and training courses for the project beneficiaries and, by including the courses in the regular programme to other ILO Member States.

7. Lessons learned

Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.

The importance of institutional relations of the ILO with Governments, Employers' and Workers' organisations in this case, in all countries targeted by the action, which boosts credibility and participation.

The recognised competence and effectiveness of the implementing agency, which provides support to own constituents on subjects stemming from its own *raison d'être*.

The ETE project falls under the full mandate of the ILO and the acknowledgement by the beneficiaries and partners (constituents) that the implementing agency will ensure continuity of support on the subject matter, beyond the closure of the EU-funded project.

8. Implementation partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

Government agencies, workers' organisations, employers' organisations, staff in national statistical offices, research institutions, civil society and regional institutions.

9. Contacts:

Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail

ILO HQ Geneva (Jurgen Schwettmann, Director of Partnerships and Development Cooperation Department).
 DEVCO Brussels.

10. Sources, links and publications

Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)

Contribution Agreement.

Interim annotated narrative report 2ND. Year of action (2010/2011).

ILO financial statement June 2011.

BURKINA FASO; CAMBODIA; ETHIOPIA, HONDURAS

Project title ILO/EC Project: Improving Social Protection and Promoting Employment

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: ND
3. Efficiency: ND
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of Design: A
6. Impact: ND
7. Sustainability: B
8. Added value of ETF: NA (Not applicable)

0. TVET at a Glance

No direct reference to TVET.

1. Identification CRIS decision number	DCI-HUM/2009/215230
2. Classification: a) By Sectors / Thematic Area:	LS- Active Labour Market policy and Measures (Trade and labour market policies, creation of decent employment. and improvement of working and living conditions in developing countries).
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	Investing in People
c) By region Geographic Zone (Country or region)	Multiple. Target country(ies) or region(s): BURKINA FASO; CAMBODIA; ETHIOPIA AND HONDURAS
d) By Period and Status	1 st November 2009. Duration 36 months Status: ongoing
3. Financial data	Joint management action

Total cost of the action: EUR 2 769 124

EU Contribution: EUR 2 500 000, equivalent to 90.28% of the estimated total eligible cost

4. Outcome What were the goals of the project?

The 2008 ILO Declaration on Social Justice and a Fair Globalization commits to promoting decent work based on the strategic objectives of employment, social protection, social dialogue and rights at work. The Decent Work Agenda is the key policy and operational concept to attain the ILO's objectives and provide effective support to constituents and is also a framework to confront the social impacts of the economic crisis and preserve social cohesion. In April 2009, the UN System Chief Executives Board for Coordination called for joint initiatives to address the global financial and economic crisis and highlighted the Global Jobs Pact on Decent Work for All and the extension of social protection as core measures. The EC communication of 8 April 2009 on 'Supporting developing countries in coping with the crisis' also highlights social protection and employment. The project demonstrates that the Decent Work Agenda is an economically, fiscally and administratively feasible approach for national development strategies in countries at different political conditions, development and socio-economic levels, and calls for a coherent strategy integrating the introduction of a set of basic social protection benefits, and the development of employment policy and labour market programmes for more and better jobs, with a particular focus on the informal economy as major components of the decent work agenda. The overall objective is the promotion of integrated social protection and employment policy built by national consensus. The specific objectives are: 1) to develop national plans to extend social protection and promote employment, hence demonstrating the feasibility and effectiveness of basic social protection packages and coordinated inclusive employment strategies; 2) to promote an international campaign and a platform for awareness raising and exchanges of good practice in social protection and employment.

4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<p>At the time of the project's formulation and analysis, in the selected countries, economic expansions were juxtaposed with sluggish real wage growth, persistence of the informal economy and low social protection coverage, declining wage shares in national outputs and raising inequalities with high shares of the population living below the poverty line, mostly as poor in rural areas, with most of the economically active population in the informal economy, high unemployment and underemployment rates mainly among youth and women and, social protection measures that were nearly inexistent. The 4 countries could not: adopt economic and social policies and measures to increase the impact of growth on poverty; put productive sectors as a priority target of poverty reduction strategies; devise employment-friendly macroeconomic frameworks boosting productivity, economic transformation, availability of decent jobs and ability of workers to do them; increase employability of the workforce combining: (i) access to basic education, and improvement of the quality of education including VT and retraining; (ii) strengthening partnership between education and business; (iii) providing employment services to help vulnerable find gainful employment (iv) training SMEs and informal economy operators; and, finally, develop new social assistance schemes linking social protection and employment policies.</p>	
4.2. Results of the project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)
<p>The expected results in the four pilot countries were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A diagnosis of the national situation and needs in the areas of social protection and employment in consultations with government agencies and social partners, prepared; • National plans for the extension of social protection coverage and for employment promotion policies through a social dialogue process, demonstrating the feasibility and effectiveness of their coordination, are drafted; • Policy makers and social actors are capable to use diagnostic tools to prepare national plans on extension of social protection and employment promotion and to participate in specialised social dialogue discussions; • Dissemination of experience providing support for the International Campaign for the Extension of Social Protection to All and for implementation of the Global Employment Agenda, implemented. <p>Through:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • National Tripartite Steering Committees (NTSCs) and preparatory training for their members; • Assessment of social protection and employment national needs and opportunities and technical peer review by NTSC; • Development of diagnostic tools, knowledge transfer and capacity building on their use; • National action plan drafting, assessment of policy options by NTSC and organisation of National Employment and Social Protection Policy Dialogue Conferences to discuss national action plans; • Elaboration and publication of the final project synthesis report; • Organisation of major global conference to disseminate policy guidelines on employment and social protection in low and middle-income countries. 	
Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3 main broad criteria Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency • 5 additional criteria: Coherence, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF, Quality of the Design
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevance: A <p>The project, as designed, is highly relevant to the needs of well-coordinated social protection and employment policies to effectively reduce poverty in the short term and enhance productivity and standards of living of the selected countries in the longer term and to the demand of key stakeholders for diagnostic tools to prepare national plans on extension of social protection and employment promotion. The project is relevant to the ILO Decent Work Agenda as the cornerstone for crisis recovery as well as to the EC Communication of Promoting decent work for all - the EU contribution to the implementation of the decent work agenda in the world", and with the thematic programmes like</p>	

'Investing in People' with a focus on employment, decent work, social protection and social cohesion, health, gender, culture, children and youth.

- **Effectiveness: ND**

In the absence of any monitoring or evaluation report, it is not possible to establish if and to what extent the project was effective.

- **Efficiency: ND**

In the absence of any monitoring or evaluation report, it is not possible to establish if and to what extent the project was efficiently implemented

- **Coherence: A**

The project is coherent with the 2008 ILO Declaration on Social Justice and a Fair Globalization and the dialogue on effects of trade liberalization on employment at the ILO Governing body. Coherence is also ensured with the European Union (EU) Communications on 'The social dimension of globalization' and 'Promoting decent work for all'.

- **Quality of the design: A**

The design of the project is in line with ILO quality standards and the Results Based Approach strong emphasis is placed on gender equality, human rights and good governance. The articulation of results/activities, logical framework and planning/budgeting are all well prepared and clear.

- **Impact: ND**

In the absence of any monitoring or evaluation report, it is not possible to establish the project's impact. The project document anticipates that while it is difficult to estimate the impact of the project in the final beneficiaries, at the end of the project, it is expected that draft policy reforms will be in place and will have been the subject of public consultations with social partners. Such policy reforms, if implemented, would in principle affect the improvement of the employment and social protection situation of a large segment of the population.

- **Sustainability: B**

The national ownership and the tripartite social dialogue commitments assures that the project reflect the national priorities while, the interactive training-by-doing diagnosis and elaboration of the national plans combined with the transfer/adaptation of technology builds lasting national capacity. The methodology of the social protection component builds on a previous project that was financed by DFID in Tanzania and Zambia. The experience acquired during this project will be used to streamline and simplify the analytical process and seek greater and permanent interaction with a wider range of national stakeholders. From a country perspective, the ILO has been engaged in social protection activities and projects with all of the selected countries before: the ILO has been advising countries on their employment policies and inclusive labour markets as well as integrated strategies for reducing informality in line with the 2002 International Labour Conference conclusions. The present project builds upon the acquired experiences. The country activities are to be part of national Decent Work Country Programmes (DWCP), the ILO framework of execution of all ILO technical co-operation activities in its member states. The EU has explicitly supported the DWCP as these are agreed by governments, employers and workers and ensure longer term ILO support for the implementation of the national plans. The EU has developed employment guidelines that are applicable to EU Member States.

- **Added value of ETF: N/A**

4.3. Beneficiaries

Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

Stakeholders are national governments, employers' and workers' organizations as well as universities, UN system (e.g. UN, UNICEF, WHO, UNDP), other international and donor agencies, as well as civil society organisations. Final beneficiaries are low-income persons, including the elderly, people with disabilities, unemployed, children living in low income households and workers in the informal economy.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The project intends to contribute to the development of a coherent and integrated social protection and employment policy framework in the pilot countries based on sound data and diagnostic tools and with the active participation of the social partners. It supports the achievement of Millennium

Development Goals on poverty reduction in line with the European Consensus on Development and the EU commitment to decent work for all, as well as the 2008 ILO Declaration on Social Justice for a Fair Globalization. National plans to extend social protection coverage and to promote employment are proposed in the context of a decent work strategy response to the economic crisis. The results of the national experiences are used to promote an international awareness raising campaign to exchange good practices on extension of social protection coverage and employment promotion.

6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to “scalability”? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?
-----------------------------------	---

The strong foundation of the project in international and EU policies and programmes: the European social model, other EU activities implemented in the framework of Investing in People thematic programme, other EC initiatives in the area of Employment and Social Cohesion (the recent projects on Decent Work and Trade Effects and on Safety and Health at Work), the International Campaign on the Extension of Social Protection and the Global Employment Agenda, the implementation of the ILO social protection floor and the global jobs pact, the ILO Programme and Budget outcomes to employment and social protection for the next three biennia and the UN overall strategy on crisis response. In the proposed design and implementation strategy, key success elements are found in the strong involvement of stakeholders, the well-tested methodological framework (Social Protection Expenditure and Performance review). The broader international dissemination of the project experience in pilot countries.

7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.
---------------------------	---

In the absence of monitoring and evaluation report it is not possible to draw any lessons from the implementation of the project.

8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
-----------------------------------	--

Government agencies, workers’ organisations, employers’ organisations, staff in national statistical offices, and research institutions, civil society, regional institutions. The project supports coordination with other development partners, particularly bilateral cooperation agency of EU member state already active e in the 4 countries on the same subject.

9. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail
---------------------	--

ILO HQ Geneva (Jurgen Schwettmann, Director of Partnerships and Development Cooperation Department).
 DEVCO Brussels.

10. Documentation DEVCO Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)
--	--

Contribution Agreement.
 Addendum.

REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA, UKRAINE, HONDURAS, NICARAGUA, MALAWI, ZAMBIA
Project title: ILO/EC Project: Improving safety and health at work through a Decent Work agenda

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: ND
3. Efficiency: ND
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of Design: A
6. Impact: ND
7. Sustainability: B
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

No direct reference to TVET.

1. Identification CRIS decision number	DCI-HUM/2009/220873
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Area:	ST- Sectoral Training: LS- Active Labour Market policy and Measures:
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI: thematic programmes (investing in people iIP)
c) By region	Multiple: REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA AND UKRAINE. HONDURAS AND NICARAGUA. MALAWI AND ZAMBIA
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: (2000-2012) 1st November 2009. Duration 36 months Status: Ongoing,
3. Financial data	Joint management action
Total cost of the action: EUR 1 667 171 EU Contribution EUR 1 500 000, equivalent to 90.28 % of the estimated total eligible cost	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
The Overall Goal of the project is to contribute to a more inclusive and productive society in the pilot countries through a reduction in occupational accidents and work-related diseases, by: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Adopting a systematic approach to improve Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) by the highest political level, which introduce consideration of OSH concerns in national development policies; • Introducing and implementing practical OSH management measures at enterprise level in accordance with national action plans; • Promoting global knowledge and good practice sharing on OSH tools that support a systematic and sustainable approach to OSH improvements. 	
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
As a consequence of globalisation and the structural adjustment response to financial and economic crisis, negative trends arise in the world of work. The changes seem to point towards increasing precarious contracts, downsizing and outsourcing, increasing working from home, numbers of workers engaged in the informal economy, labour mobility and migration and decreasing rates of unionisation. These changes have an aggravating impact on OSH. A situation common to the selected countries gives evidence to the real risk of enterprises (especially small-scale enterprises) engaged in the reduction of costs including OSH budgets. This situation is prone to a rise in workplace accidents and diseases. Selected countries considered essential to keep the safety and health of workers as a priority on their social and economic agendas to respond the increase of working hours to compensate	

manpower reduction, or to move to precarious work contracts if not to the informal economy. The selected countries are not fully capable to adopt alone a systematic approach to promote the continual improvement of OSH through a national OSH policy and building or strengthening a national OSH system (legislation, labour inspection services, tripartite bodies for OSH, information and advisory services, OSH training, occupational health services) and implement national OSH strategies and programmes.

4.2. Result of the project

- Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)

The results expected in the 6 pilot countries by the end of the project are that: national dialogue processes on OSH are established and functioning, advocacy tools developed by the project are used by stakeholders to promote and prioritize OSH in the national socio-economic policies and programmes, national OSH programmes/action plans are adopted, all stakeholders are capable of using tools and methodologies to improve OSH management at the workplace, and, methodologies used and the good practices developed are acknowledged and taken up by more countries. The project is expected to achieve the following results through:

- National tripartite steering committees, linked to existing national tripartite OSH mechanism to ensure continuity after the project and sustainability;
- A methodology for accurate accounting of numbers of occupational accidents and diseases in a country;
- A model to calculate the costs of poor working conditions in the economy of the pilot countries;
- OSH priority setting capacity by national policy-makers through a seminar in each pilot country;
- A national OSH profile (current national OSH infrastructure and inspection services), a National OSH Programme/action plan, with regular reviews;
- National OSH trainers/specialists trained in risk assessment and OSH management on the basis of the ILO WISE and WIND methodology;
- Labour inspectors trained on efficient and effective workplace inspections;
- National awareness is raised through targeted and general campaigns, publication of the final project synthesis report;
- Dissemination of the project results and best practices to other countries are ensured through a global conference.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)

- 3 main broad criteria **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF**

• **Relevance: A**

The project, as designed, is highly relevant to the need of the pilot lower, middle income and least developed countries that have demonstrated a national commitment to improving health and safety at work, as witnessed by the formal agreement between governments, employers' and workers' organisations, formalised in the ILO cooperation frameworks of the Decent Work Country Programmes. The project is consistent with the ILO Decent Work Agenda as the cornerstone for crisis recovery, the ILO's Global Strategy, the Promotional Framework on OSH, as well as the Seoul Declaration on OSH. Consistent with the Occupational Safety and Health Convention, 1981 (No.155), as well as to strengthen the capacity of national systems for a preventive culture, and Convention, 2006, No. 187. The project is consistent with the EC Communication of Promoting decent work for all - the EU contribution to the implementation of the decent work agenda in the world" and with the thematic programmes such as 'Investing in People' with a focus on employment, decent work, social protection and social cohesion, health, gender, culture, children and youth.

• **Effectiveness: ND**

In the absence of any monitoring or evaluation report, it is not possible to establish if and to what extent the project was effective.

• **Efficiency: ND**

In the absence of any monitoring or evaluation report, it is not possible to establish if and to what extent the project was efficiently implemented.

- **Coherence: A**

The project is coherent with the 2008 ILO Declaration on Social Justice and a Fair Globalization, and with the European Union Communications on 'The social dimension of globalization' and 'Promoting decent work for all'. The EC's Investing in People thematic programme comprises other projects aimed on employment and social cohesion, including recent projects on Monitoring and Assessing Decent Work in Developing Countries and assessing and addressing the Effects of Trade on Employment. This project will complement such projects in that it will raise a concrete opportunity to include OSH outcomes as a component of measuring decent work, and to consider the safety and health effects of trade and labour market policies.

- **Quality of the Design: B**

The design of the project is in line with ILO quality standards and the Result Based Approach. Strong emphasis is placed on the methodology. The articulation of results/activities, logical framework and planning/budgeting are all well detailed, accurately prepared and clear. Nonetheless, it is noted the contradiction between the declared objective of global dissemination and the decision to renounce to the strategic utilization of the ILO International Training Centre to enable teams from the selected countries to compare results and exchange best practices.

- **Impact: ND**

In the absence of any monitoring or evaluation report, it is not possible to establish the project's impact. The project document anticipates that while it is difficult to estimate the impact of the project in the final beneficiaries, at the end of the project, it is expected that draft policy reforms will be in place and will have been the subject of public consultations with social partners. Such policy reforms, if implemented, would in principle affect the improvement of the employment and social protection situation of a large segment of the population.

- **Sustainability: A**

As OSH activities which are relatively low-cost to sustain, the project sustainability is mainly based on capacity building to develop national programmes, the creation of a pool of national expertise available after the end of the project, tools to calculate costs of not improving OSH conditions that are aimed at motivating policy-makers to allocate financial resources to OSH. The sustainability of the activities targeting OSH improvements at the workplace are based on the links between improvements in OSH and higher productivity, hence motivating employers and actors in the informal economy to initiate improvements at a low cost. The existing institutional platform for OSH dialogue, existing labour inspection functions, are strengthened and not built *ex novo*. Pilot countries have been selected for their declared commitment to improving OSH, taken in their Decent Work Country Programmes. National allocations and regular ILO assistance through the DWCP activities is expected to expand the reach out the project. Finally, the WISE and WIND methodologies are highly motivating, rely on simple techniques and local experience of showing improvements in OSH coupled with gains in productivity at a low cost.

- **Added value of ETF: N/A**

4.3. Beneficiaries

Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

National governments and associated agencies, employers' and workers' organisations as well as NGOs and relevant training and research institutes in pilot countries. Workers and their families, and small businesses in both the formal and informal economy, as final beneficiaries.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

This project aims at revealing that the decent work concept is a viable approach for a national development strategy and brings focus to occupational safety and health as an essential element for decent work. It also aims at promoting a preventive approach to occupational accidents and diseases and thus aims at reducing disabilities, exclusion and poverty. It will do this through mobilising and promoting the responsibility to governments and social partners to work together to develop and implement a national programme on OSH, with eventual ratification of the Promotional Framework for Occupational Safety and Health Convention 2006 (No. 187). The aim is to get OSH taken on board at the highest political agenda, including integration into national development policies and to translate the OSH programme into action at the workplace level. It will necessarily mean improving the

implementation of the OSH programme and standards through effective labour inspection.	
6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?
Potential elements of success, at the mere design level, are identified in: the strong foundation of the project in ILO and EU policies programmes and tools. The link of the intervention with the development framework of the ILO that will outlive the EC project. The quality of the proposed methodology and the solidity of the inclusive OSH development process. In the proposed design and implementation strategy, key success elements are found in the strong involvement of stakeholders, the selection of countries that already committed to strengthening the OSH policies and programmes. The broader international dissemination of the project experience in pilot countries.	
7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.
In the absence of monitoring and evaluation report it is not possible to draw any lessons from the implementation of the project.	
8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
Policy planners in government agencies, social partner organisations, training and research institutions, labour inspection services, civil society organisations, employers and workers in selected sectors and workplaces.	
9. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail
ILO HQ Geneva (Jurgen Schwettmann, Director of Partnerships and Development Cooperation Department). DEVCO Brussels.	
10. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)
Contribution Agreement.	

MALI, NIGER
Project title: Sahel AgroFormation

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: C
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: C
7. Sustainability: C
8. Added value of ETF: N/A

0. TVET at a Glance

The VT system entails the Ministry of Employment and Vocational Training (MEFP) in Mali and the Ministry of Vocational and Technical Education (MFPT) in Niger, as the main players. Other ministries and authorities provide agricultural and rural VT. (*Ministries of: l'Enseignement Technique et Professionnelle, l'Agriculture, l'Élevage et de la Pêche*, professional associations, international and local NGOs, government programmes).

In Mali, under the MEFP, a fund, the FAFPA (Fonds d'Appui à la Formation Professionnelle, Continue et à l'Apprentissage) exists. The National Council for Agriculture Education and Vocational Training (CNEAPA) is responsible for rural and agricultural training strategies. Formal TVET institutions (diploma level) counts 10 (6 public and 4 private) technical schools and 3 higher education institutions. Non-formal VT (qualification level) includes 30 centres of rural promotion (CAR) for young farmers. Moreover, Centres of Education for Development (CED), for basic education of children above school age (9-15 years offer pre-vocational training on land planting.

Similarly, in Niger, under the MFPT, the fund FAFPCA (*Fonds d'Appui à la Formation Professionnelle Continue et à l'Apprentissage*) supports non-formal VT. The governance of the system is supported by *the Conseil Supérieur de l'Enseignement et de la Formation Professionnelle et Technique* (COSEFPT). The delivery structure for agriculture and rural VT includes: 18 rural institutions (Training Centres Community Development CFDC) training agro-forestry-pastoral trades, the centre of the national federation of farmers (CNOP) and other small training centres established by municipalities. The VT on agriculture, post-primary and secondary education is also provided by farmers' professional associations (APCAM, CNOP, l'AOPP in Mali; CNOP/Plate Forme Paysanne in Niger). In Niger, the MFPT manages the Community VT Centres (CFDC), which are the only existing providers in many rural areas.

1. Identification CRIS decision number	DCI-EDUC/2009/226321
2. Classification:	
e) By Sectors / Thematic Area:	TM ST - Sectoral Training
f) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	Investing in People
g) By region	Geographical programmes: Multiple MALI, NIGER
h) By Period and Status	1st November 2009. Duration 36 months Status: Closed
3. Financial data	Joint management action

Total cost of the action: EUR 1 928 782

EU Contribution: EUR 1 728 782 equivalent to 89.63 % of the estimated total eligible cost

4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
The overall goal is to contribute to improve revenues and the job insertion rate of vulnerable groups (youth, women and rural) in Mali and Niger. Specific objectives: to establish demand driven agricultural and rural VT systems by:	

- Increasing the offer of rural and agricultural training in a strengthened partnership framework;
- Institutionalising rural and agricultural VT system, taking into account regional and national policies, the experience gained and introducing the recognition of qualifications;
- Implementing agriculture and rural VT in 1 region of Mali and 10 municipalities of Niger;
- Establishing mechanisms and procedures for regular exchange and dissemination of good practices.

This is achieved through:

- Development or adaptation of national policies and regional/local strategies for agricultural and rural VT;
- VT master plans including TOT in Mali and Niger;
- Training needs and economic opportunity assessment in agriculture-related sectors;
- Agricultural training institutions rehabilitated and ready to deliver VT programmes;
- Implementation of VT programmes and courses at regional and local level;
- Framework and tools for validation of VT, recognition and certification of agricultural and rural VT;
- Utilisation of experiences of other countries, dissemination and replication of the project's best practices;
- Implementation of a system for monitoring, internal and external evaluation.

4. 1. Objective (problem statement)

- What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?

At the time of the project formulation, the international and national development frameworks for Mali and Niger as well as the set of related policies concurred in identifying agriculture, livestock, fisheries, agroforestry as potential robust-growth sectors were not supported by adequate an skills response.

A strategic vision on how to match the skills offer with the demand of the major employment sector of the two countries had not been developed. Coordination among institutions responsible for a TVET system based on LMI, standardised in quality and certification, flexible and relevant on offer, enlarged to workplace training through public-private partnerships and accessible by disadvantaged groups (women, rural youth, early school leavers, youth without access to TVET, youth graduates job seekers) was not apparent. An agriculture and rural VT sub-system as such was not in place. The existing training programmes (training offer) were assessed as scattered and poor in quantity and quality; qualifications of human resources (outcome) not relevant to the sector's needs; continuing vocational training for workers undeveloped; training demand, though projected as broad was basically non quantified because not systematically assessed; apprenticeship, alternating training, training in farmers' professional organisations, all present but rather occasionally promoted. Planning, guidance and institutionalisation (standardisation, accreditation, development) of local/regional VT programmes through the formalised consultation of relevant stakeholders, had not taken place. In the absence of a system as such, relevant experiences developed on a small scale were not systematically replicated or scaled-up within and between the two countries as well as in the sub-region. Involvement of existing networks such as the Group of Experts for Vocational Training (GEFOP) and the Agricultural and Rural training Network (FAR Network) for dissemination and replication of good practices was not regularly sought and irrespective of inherent results of the many projects and initiatives, sustainability was not ensured.

4.2. Result of the project

- Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)

- MEFP/Mali and MFPT/Niger Strengthened at central and local level on coordination, policy and strategy making, (4000 trained (1500 women); 200 jobs created through 20 entrepreneurial projects);
- The supply of agricultural and rural training is developed and improved in a strengthened partnership framework (3 types of training mechanism adopted in each country, 60 rural trainers/facilitators trained (30 per country); 50 technical trainers from agricultural training institutions trained; 20 centres are strengthened in their infrastructure and / or their operation, 50 programmes and training materials tailored to the needs of market are developed and validated at the national level);
- The system of agricultural and rural training is institutionalised through the inclusion in regional and national policies of the developed experience and the recognition of qualifications (training schemes, national policies for agricultural and rural VT, monitoring system, 20 standard

<p>qualifications in rural and agriculture trades, recognition of qualifications acquired through the project training, procedure for RPL);</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The implementation of agricultural and rural training is supported in the region (Mali) and in ten (10) Municipalities (<i>Communes</i>) (Niger) (40 courses and 80 training sessions in the 2 countries); • Mechanisms and procedures for permanent exchanges between the various stakeholders are established for the accumulation and dissemination of good practice (radio, TV, ICT and communication plans for all the project partners). 	
<p>Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3 main broad criteria Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency • 5 additional criteria: Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevance: B <p>The project is relevant to international and national policies and strategies. In their commitment to supporting sustainable development, the Mali and Niger governments have developed strategic frameworks for poverty reduction: the Strategic Framework for Growth and Reduction of Poverty (CSCR 2007-2011) in Mali and Strategy for Accelerated Development and Poverty Reduction (PRRS 2008-2012) in Niger. The project is relevant to the skill needs of the agricultural and rural sectors and to the training providers involved in delivery as well as the national training institutions (strengthening VT systems).</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Effectiveness: B <p>The mid-term evaluation of the project suggests that project effectiveness is higher for the components related to training delivery (in 2011, the project trained 830 beneficiaries out of the planned 4000), development and dissemination of training tools related to CBT, modules, methodology, database and repository and the assistance to the 5 VT mechanisms existing in the two countries. The component related to the 5 proposed institutional development processes that are expected to fully materialise in the medium-term and beyond the end of the project appear to be less effective. For example, the support by national funds (FAFPA/Mali and FAFPCA Niger) on funding and access to training had to be suspended because the project is designed to assist training mechanisms based on these funds and not to provide direct funding. The inclusion of vulnerable groups is not fully evident.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Efficiency: C <p>The project was reported to be in full operational capacity. Several planned activities could not be undertaken and have been re-programmed for the second part of the project. In terms of results, the project is likely to reach the expected results according to the indicators formulated except for the number of trained people (4000 expected) due to the inability of the project partners to fund the planned training.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Coherence: B <p>The project is coherent with the achievements of the various EU programmes conducted between 1994 and 2009 to support Vocational Training in Niger (Nigetech I and II -1994-2004) that mostly developed short training programmes, the Programme of support to apprenticeships (2006-10) and the SOUTEBA programme that supported basic education and literacy in Niger.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of the design: C <p>The formulation is of high quality and the level of analysis is quite detailed. The description of the VT system in the two countries is not accurate and it may partly be explained by the difference between the expected impact on the systems and the actual mid-term results. The project document presents the institutional component as the main one and as rather achievable, contrary to what was stated in the mid-term evaluation whereby the small "critical mass of diplomatic support" and the short duration (36 months) are besought as a justification for results and a lower impact than expected.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Impact: C <p>In terms of structural impact at mid-term, which is the true purpose of a project, expected results had not yet been achieved. In late 2011, the project activities to support the revitalisation of the VTCs were considered as having a real structural impact. To a lesser extent, the regional unit of agricultural and rural training could link up farmer and producer associations as well as public authorities with providers of formal and non-formal training. The impact on the TVET systems e.g. the recognition by national authorities of the qualifications of trainers and final beneficiaries, defined by the project and</p>	

built through the provided training, or on the national policies for agricultural and rural VT is low. The final impact is considered to depend to a large extent on the ability of the project to disseminate experiences, training product concepts and methods beyond the professionals involved in the agricultural and rural training programmes.

- **Sustainability: C**

The project attaches great importance not only to the inherent sustainability of actions, but also the possible continuity of support incurred after 2012 by seeking coordination and synergies with other projects on rural and agricultural VT. The project attaches great importance to the component of capitalisation and dissemination of its own tools, products, approaches and good practices to ensure sustainability. At the time of the mid-term report, a high turnover of counterparts was noted, which required a continuous effort in terms of integration on the project logic and an updating on the project's results that also challenged the assumption of ownership as a basis for sustainability. In the absence of a final report, it is not possible to express a final view on this issue.

- **Added value of ETF: N/A**

4.3. Beneficiaries

Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

- The two Ministries in charge of VT (MEFP/Mali et le MFPT/Niger); their central and local services
- The farmers' associations: APCAM, CNOP, l'AOPP in Mali; CNOP/Plateforme Paysanne in Niger.
- Local authorities such as the the Regional Assembly of Kayes in Mali and the 10 municipalities of Dogon Doutchi in Niger);
- Private and public training institutions: 20 VTCs established or rehabilitated, in the two countries;
- Trainers: 60 trainers from professional organisations of the 2 areas trained on practical training programmes and apprenticeships;
- Unemployed youth, women and men; agricultural enterprises benefitting from higher productivity.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The 36-month project in two countries, Mali and Niger, consists of actions at the micro, meso and macro levels applicable to a wide variety of actors and training mechanisms. It has helped to build or structure 5 mechanisms of agricultural and rural training (FAR) that allow to train young producers and as final beneficiaries, establish or support processes, through 12 outcomes and 36 activities.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

The local partnerships' commitment and coverage render the project well-grounded in the specific technical subjects and in the territories. The links and coordination with other initiatives on the same subject and areas by international donors and implementing partners augments the possibility of exchanging good practices and the dissemination of material and tools. Training delivery is expected to outnumber the expected results, hence witnessing satisfaction by beneficiaries, relevance to needs and quality of delivery.

7. Lessons learned

Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.

A project with the ambition to initiate processes that are expected to deliver tangible results in the medium term and thus beyond the life of the project (end of 2012) should not be considered as a stand-alone initiative but rather be part of a programme of complementary, interlinked and mutual supported actions. The assumptions on which the institutional component was built seem not to have materialised and the risk of ineffectiveness exists. The risk mitigation strategy presented in the mid-term report is limited to postponing and rescheduling the activities. The institutional component should be considered only for more structured, longer and complex interventions.

8. Implementation partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

The project partners are: *Association des Organisations Professionnelles Paysannes (AOPP), Assemblée Permanente des Chambres d'Agricultures du Mali (APCAM), Coordination Nationale des Organisations Paysannes du Mali (CNOP), Assemblée Régionale de Kayes; Ministère de l'Emploi et de la Formation Professionnelle (MEFP), Comité de coordination des communes de Dogon Doutchi, Plateforme*

paysanne du Niger. Other synergies were looked for with (i) Centres for management and information on Migrations ; (ii) the GIZ's 'Programme of inter-sectorial promotion of agricultural jobs' (iii) the AfD (*Agence Française de Développement*) on the improvement of VT training in Kayes region; (iv) DANIDA's Programme of support to employment promotion in the private sector in Mali and the Suisse. Bilateral Cooperation. In Niger, cooperation was established with national and international NGOs on basic literacy, life and rural technical skills. Other links were consolidated with Suisse Cooperation, the Danish programme PAPESPRIM and Luxembourg Bilateral Cooperation.

9. Contacts:

Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail

Swisscontact, Zurich.
 EU Delegation in Bamako, Mali.

10. Sources, links and publications

Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)

Contribution Agreement.
 Description of Action.
 Narrative Interim Reports 2010-2011.

MALI, MOROCCO

Project title: Amélioration des capacités de formation paramédicale au Maroc et au Mali, par l'appui à la création d'instituts de formation paramédicale au sein du Croissant-Rouge marocain et de la Croix-Rouge malienne

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: B
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of the Design: ND
6. Impact: ND
7. Sustainability: ND
8. Added Value of ETF: N/A

0. TVET at a Glance

The VT in Mali system entails the Ministry of Employment and Vocational Training (MEFP) as the main players. In Mali, under the MEFP, a fund, the FAFPA (*Fonds d'Appui à la Formation Professionnelle, Continue et à l'Apprentissage*) exists. The National Council for Agriculture Education and Vocational Training (CNEAPA) is responsible for rural and agricultural training strategies. Formal TVET institutions (diploma level) counts 10 (6 public and 4 private) technical schools and 3 higher education institutions. Non-formal VT (qualification level) includes 30 centres of rural promotion (CAR) for young farmers. Moreover, Centres of Education for Development (CED), for basic education of children above school age (9-15 years offer pre-vocational training on land planting.

The TVET system in Morocco was restructured in 2004 and embraces pre-school, the two cycles of compulsory education and secondary general and technical education, higher education and scientific research under the Ministry of National Education, Higher Education, Cadre Training and Scientific Research. Vocational Training falls under the responsibility of the Ministry of Employment and Vocational Training that also incorporates the OFPPT (*l'Office de la formation professionnelle et de la promotion du travail*) that manages the public VT system, and the ANAPEC (*l'Agence nationale de promotion de l'emploi et des compétences*) that implements, in addition to labour market intermediation for graduate youth, Active Labour Market Policies and programmes like (*Idmage, Moukawqalti and Formation-Reconversion*). The training of adults is considered as an integral part of the national offer of education and VT. The Moroccan system of initial vocational training is characterised by the presence of multiple public and private stakeholders within a structured regulatory framework. The management of continuing vocational training suffers from the absence of a legal framework, with inefficient management of special training contracts and the lack of control of the recipient firms.

1. Identification (CRIS decision number): (2009)	211719
2. Classification	
a) By Sector/Thematic Area:	ST – Sectoral Training LS – Active Labour Market policy and Measures IE – Informal Economy IP
b) By Instrument (fund/budget line):	DCI thematic programmes (investing in people iIP): YES
c) By region:	Africa: MALI, MOROCCO
d) By period and status:	Decision year (2000-2012): 2009 Status (Closed, On-going, Committed, Provisional): ON-GOING Dates of implementation of the project: 01/2010-02/2013
3. Financial data	
Planned (Primary commitment) EUR 1 451 028.45	

Disbursed: ND € (only contract data).	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
<p>The project's objectives are: to improve access to employment of TVET paramedical students in Mali and Morocco in targeted areas of Tétouan et Casablanca in Morocco and Bamako in Mali, and to reinforce paramedical training at selected technical training institutes by means of structured (coordinated and regulated) partnerships. The response suggested by the project is the establishment of a TVET network in the paramedical field in the Maghreb and West Africa. The French Red Cross in partnership with the Malian Red Cross and Crescent Moon Moroccan, have established an institute for paramedical training in Casablanca – Morocco; strengthen the existing ones in Tétouan – Morocco and Bamako – Mali, and develop a twinning mechanism for students' and teachers' exchanges. These actions include the involvement and participation of private and public health operators to be involved in the VTCs' operations (internships, teachers, training programmes, graduates employment) and the support of line ministries (validation of curriculum and curricula and recognition VTCs programmes and qualifications).</p>	
4.1 Objective (statement of the problem)	What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<p>In both countries the situation analysis identifies a shortage of skilled paramedical personnel which is caused a limited offer quality paramedical training programmes, a restricted access for women and a drain of skilled paramedical personnel from public to private structures. For Morocco, contradictory policies on opening paramedic training to private providers and the lack of financial resources led to a deficit of more than 10 000 registered nurses in the health facilities. Mali has 0.8 doctors per 10 000 population (WHO standard: 1 in 10 000) and 2.45 nurses per 5000 inhabitants (WHO standard: 1 for 5000), but they are unevenly distributed across the territory with a serious deficit in the Northern regions of the country. Training institutions do not provide follow up services supporting the employment of their paramedical graduates in public or private health institutions and services in the selected areas. Moreover, training programmes up to international standards need to be recognised and institutionalised in both countries by the concerned ministries. The national institutions and training providers also need to be exposed to international experiences and exchange best practices in a systematic and regular manner.</p>	
4.2 Result of the project	Please describe the results achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention).
<p>While the ex-ante nature of the information received precludes the assessment of project results, it can be said that the expected results match the general problems identified (i.e. the absence of quality paramedical training). The expected outcomes are as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The supply and quality of paramedic training is increased in Morocco and Mali, and accessible to disadvantaged students; • Partnerships between VTCs s allow transfer of learning skills and techniques in a North / South and South / South cooperation modality; • VTCs' management improved and their sustainability enhanced; • VTCs Graduates are supported in their job search in the c selected geographical areas. <p>The project is expected to implement the following activities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Refurbishment , equipment and organizational plans of the selected VTCs • Recruitment and training of the VTCs' staff • Selection and training of students • Formalisation of partnerships with concerned ministries' institutions in relation to recognition of certification, fellowships, and field stages for the students. • Twinning between the training centres of the two countries and France (teachers/trainers and students' exchanges, and transferability of competences). <p>The quantitative indicators are set at: 700 students (400 in Morocco and 300 in Mali), 62 trainers (23 in Morocco and 39 in Mali), 19 Vocational Education and Training Centres' managers and administrative staff (19 in Morocco and 7 in Mali)</p>	
Grading: Overall analysis carried out against 8 criteria (to be applied flexibly)	<p>3 main broad criteria: Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency</p> <p>5 additional criteria: Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability and Added Value of ETF</p>

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevance: B <p>The project appears to be in line with the current EU priorities regarding VET in health as well as with the IiP priorities of its associated Call for Proposals.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Effectiveness: B <p>The effectiveness of the intervention is appreciated at the level of the methodology chosen by the project to solve a skills shortage problem: a mechanism of public/private structured partnership by competent implementing partners and beneficiaries as well as the involvement of public and private health structures both in training and employment support of the graduates from the VTCs.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Efficiency: B <p>Based on the data received it was not possible to assess this criterion in economic terms. On the selected implementation modalities, it is possible to observe the establishment of a structured monitoring and evaluation system that separately controls the technical and financial aspects; a project management structure and the adoption of administrative procedures of the French Red Cross. All of these elements support the impression of efficiency.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Coherence: B <p>Aside from <i>ex-ante</i> information, no data were received based on which to assess this criterion. However, the Logical Framework and contract (including the TAPs) would suggest coherence between the project and the TVET system in addition to the observed coherence with the general EU TVET policy.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of the Design: ND <p>This could not be assessed, as only the logframe, contract and TAPs were available for study.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Impact: ND <p>No data were available for assessing this criterion as only <i>ex-ante</i> information (contract and logframe) was received. Hence only "expected" project impact can be considered (as is done at the project formulation stage in the form of a list of expected results).</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sustainability: ND <p>As only the logframe, contract and TAPs were available, project sustainability could not be predicted based on the data received.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Added Value of ETF: N/A <p>This was not applicable except for Morocco (see Morocco fiche and country analysis).</p>	
4.3 Beneficiaries	Who benefited/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?
<p>Direct recipients (as stated in the contract) are the 700 students (400 in Morocco and 300 in Mali); 62 teachers (23 in Morocco and 39 in Mali); and 19 administrative and logistical IFP staff (12 in Morocco and 7 in Mali) that will be trained and capacitated through the assisted structures. The final beneficiaries to which additional paramedical capacity is available are estimated at 800 000. Families benefitting from the graduate students employed as paramedicals are estimated at 3000.</p>	
5. Synopsis	Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.
<p>The project aims to improve the quality of vocational training for paramedics as well as to reinforce and set up new paramedical technical training institutes in Morocco and Mali that recruit qualified teachers and staff, thereby formalising partnerships with local health ministries and health structures. The project consists of 4 main components addressing institutions' structural rehabilitation and technical/pedagogical strengthening; Institutions' management and administration capacity; public-private partnerships between national institutions, public and private schools and public and private health providers at both central and community level; follow up and placement services for paramedical training graduates. Cross cutting issues like the gender balance access and the establishment of international networks to exchange knowledge and experiences (best practices) complete the project design.</p>	
6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to project "scalability"? What was the specific approach to capacity development that led to policy impact/changes?
<p>Key elements of project success on the basis of the project design indicators, (if applied correctly during implementation) are likely to be the investment on ownership and accountability and the</p>	

establishment of inclusive partnerships for project execution and of networks involving the sector educational centres, agents and authorities, professionals, health centres and communities.

7. Lessons learnt

Please include any lessons learnt (regardless of whether these were envisaged at project inception).

No data were received based on implementation and as only *ex-ante* information was available it is possible to anticipate that the emphasis on the follow-up and accompanying services for graduates could be a decisive element of success hence a good lesson to learn for future endeavours in very specific serctoral TVET interventions as in the case of this project.

8. Implementing Partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

IPs are the French Red Cross and undetermined local sector schools, workers and teachers in the form of local NGOs (some under the Red Cross and Crescent).

9. Contacts

Provide contact details for further information, including telephone and e-mail.

Céline MacLeod, Service Relations avec les Bailleurs de Fonds Institutionnels;

Tel: +33 1 44 43 12 41, E-mail: celine.macleod@croix-rouge.fr

Isabelle Whitehouse-Polisset, Responsable des programmes Afrique et Afrique du Nord, Croix Rouge Françaises

Tel: +33 1 44 43 14 57, E-mail : Isabelle.Polisset@croix-rouge.fr

10.Sources, links & publications

Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs).

Ex-ante documentation. The consulted documents were: CTR706606 (logframe) and CTR706603 (Contract).

<http://www.croix-rouge.fr/Nos-actions/Action-internationale/Rechercher-un-programme/Mali-Formation-paramedicale>.

BOLIVIA, NICARAGUA; MOROCCO; SENEGAL; GAMBIA
Project title: Vocational Training and Sustainable Tourism

Grading

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: ND
3. Efficiency: ND
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: ND
7. Sustainability: ND
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

Bolivia: Santa Cruz (Chiquitania); Nicaragua: Managua; Morocco: Riff region; Senegal: Dakar; Gambia: Baku

The project does not concern the countries' TVET systems.

1. Identification CRIS decision number	211877 Contract 2009 / 211-877
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Area:	TM -TVET access to target groups: Women ST- Sectoral Training: 3 Addressed sectors Tourism LS- Active Labour Market policy and Measures: access to decent and stable employment
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI: thematic programmes (investing in people IiP) DCI-EDUC 2008: Call for Proposal: "Education, Knowledge and Skills: Towards demand-driven Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) systems" 127-87
c) By region	Latin America; Bolivia: Santa Cruz (Chiquitania); Nicaragua: Managua; Morocco: Riff region; Senegal: Dakar; Gambia: Bakau
d) By Period and Status	18/01/2010 (24 months) Addendum (25 months) Contract 17/12/2009 Status: Closed. End 02/2012
3. Financial data	

Total: EUR 1 243 392

Total EC contribution: EUR 1 119 053 (equivalent to 90% of total)

4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
-------------------	-------------------------------------

Overall objective: To help build capacity and give people access to decent and stable employment in African and Latin American countries through inclusive, gender-focused, demand-driven TVET systems that are transferable to other countries.

Specific objective: To design, produce, disseminate and exchange training and awareness-raising instruments in the area of sustainable tourism that are adapted to respond to demand in the African and Latin American countries taking part in the project, with particular focus on women's empowerment and access to the promotion of decent, stable employment.

4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
--	---

Tourism is one of the world's largest industries and is increasingly important for economies of most developing countries such as the Gambia, Senegal and the Latin American sub region as a whole. Tourism is responsible for some of the largest movements of people throughout the world, bringing together many different cultures and introduces people to many different natural environments. The implications of this are complex. Wealthy tourists in poor communities highlight social inequality. However, the mixing of cultures can lead to greater appreciation and an understanding of cultural differences than can lead to an increasingly peaceful world. For tourism to be sustainable there needs

to be better understanding and planning.

All participating countries, except Spain, have a strategy to combat poverty, with a focus on the Millennium Development Goals, incorporating education and equality between men and women as key aspects of the agenda to achieve human development, sustainable development and poverty reduction. Tourism, and in particular, sustainable tourism, also appear in the policy framework of the participating states as another sector which further these goals as a means to achieve socio-economic development in the concerned countries. This project will build on existing work in the field of sustainable tourism training in each of the countries and establish, on the one hand, a common curriculum framework and, secondly, a training programme that matches the reality of the sector in each country and which also takes stock of their own experiences and those from other countries involved.

4.2. Result of the project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)
-----------------------------------	---

- Situation analysis report on training needs in terms of sustainable tourism;
- Elaboration and evaluation, in coordination with national organizations, of a training programme adapted to local needs;
- Production of the teaching and audiovisual materials needed to initiate the training programme, including a teaching guide;
- Activation of two pilot experiences to validate the training programme;
- Identification of success training stories in sustainable tourism, with an emphasis on successful cases of women's empowerment, access and promotion to decent and stable work;
- Publication of a Sustainable Tourism Awareness and Education Guide, which will contain the identified good practices;
- Setting-up of a network and forums for the exchange and diffusion of good practices.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3 main broad criteria Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency • 5 additional criteria: Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF
---	--

- **Relevance: B**

The project is relevant because sustainable tourism training programs are necessary to educate and create awareness among stakeholders, including local communities and entrepreneurs, on how to implement sustainable tourism strategies and the importance of such developments.

- **Effectiveness: No Data**

In the absence of monitoring and mid-term evaluation reports it is not possible to comment on the effectiveness indicators built into the project's design.

- **Efficiency:- No Data**

In the absence of ROM and interim evaluation report, it is not possible to comment on the efficiency of the project.

- **Coherence: A**

The project is coherent with the national Plans and Strategies of Tourism and Sustainable Tourism in the participating countries are linked to the training of the people who develop and evolve in the future this sector and training there are several initiatives in this regard.

- **Quality of the Design: B**

The quality of the design is considered as high in terms of the proposed objectives (Overall Objective, Purpose, Results).

- **Impact: No Data**

No monitoring report.

- **Sustainability: No Data**

In the absence of ROM and Interim evaluation report, it is not possible to comment on the sustainability.

- **Added value of ETF: NA**

4.3. Beneficiaries	Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?
---------------------------	---

Vocational training teachers and students in the area of tourism, public and private training entities, entrepreneurs and sectors of the civil society involved with sustainable tourism in Bolivia, Nicaragua,

Morocco, Senegal and the Gambia. The main direct beneficiary is the general tourism sector, insofar as it can both benefit from this intervention and replicate the former in the targeted countries and regions.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The project: *Vocational Training And Sustainable Tourism* is intended to design, elaborate, circulate and exchange vocational training and awareness-raising instruments in the field of sustainable tourism specifically adapted to Gambia, Morocco, Senegal, Bolivia and Nicaragua, particularly emphasising the empowerment of women and their access and promotion to decent and stable work.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

Networks were established, including the collaboration of all concerned parties, emphasising group work and constant communication and information flows.

As working-groups that facilitate and articulate the various activities and objectives of the project:

- **Working in a network** connecting the demands of touristic concerns and economic activities related to technical and professional training;
- **Vocational Training** in sustainable tourism through a curriculum adapted to demand;
- **Women, training and tourism** identifying good practices that include success empowerment stories and ensuring a focus on gender for all project activities.

The final meeting on the Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) curriculum for Sustainable Tourism Project, which focused on the appropriation and dissemination of the results, was organised by International and Ibero-American Foundation of Administration and Public Policies (FIIAPP) in Madrid, Spain.

The curriculum for sustainable tourism was first validated in Santa Cruz, Bolivia and then piloted in The Gambia in June 2011. The University of Don Carlos III in Spain, involved two local teachers and 20 students who participated in the piloting phase, which was facilitated by NTA and ASSET.

7. Lessons learned

Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.

Good practices on gender and sustainable tourism and the appropriation and dissemination of the outcomes of the project.

All organisations collaborating on the project have experience in fields related to sustainable tourism, gender and sustainable development and technical and vocational training in tourism. In short: "Sustainable Tourism cannot be sustained in the absence of women".

8. Implementation partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

The management of the Project was entrusted to a Consortium under the leadership of: International and Ibero-American Foundation for Administration and Public Policies (FIIAPP) resulting in a joint initiative with:

- Partner1: Banesto Cultural Foundation;
- Partner 2: Carlos III University of Madrid;
- Partner 3: Organización de Estados Iberoamericanos para la Educación, la Ciencia y la Cultura (OEI);
- Partner 4: Association of Small Scale Enterprises in Tourism (ASSET) in Gambia;
- Partner 5: Ministry of Higher Education, Research, Science and Technology Gambian;
- Partner 6: The National Organization of Tourism Integration (ONITS);
- Partner 7: Association Rif pour le Développement du Tourisme Rural (RIFTOURISME) ;
- Partner 8: Mancomunidad de Municipios Chiquitanos Bolivia;
- Partner 9: Universidad Nacional Autónoma de Nicaragua-León (UNAN);
- Partner 10: Instituto Nicaragüense de Turismo (INTUR).

9. Contacts:

Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail

International and Ibero-American Foundation for Administration FIIAP
C/ Beatriz de Bobadilla, 18 4ª planta

28040 – Madrid – España
Tel: +34 91 591 46 00 Fax: +34 91 534 23 14
fiiapp@fiiapp.org

**10. Sources,
links and publications**

Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)

SC (Subvention Contract).
SC-CTR713160_Contract.pdf SC-CTR (Addendum nº 2).
<http://www.tourismslovakia.org>.
<http://www.uc3m.es/portal/page/portal/inicio/universidad/institucional/proyecto europeo>.
www.vtsustainabletourism.org.

MOROCCO, IVORY COAST, BENIN, BRAZIL, HONDURAS, GUATEMALA AND EL SALVADOR
Réseau Interrégional pour l'adaptation de la Formation technique et professionnelle aux besoins de l'Artisanat (RIFA)

RIFA - Interregional Network for the Adaptation of Technical and Professional Education to the Needs of Crafts

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: B
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of the Design: B
6. Impact: ND
7. Sustainability: C
8. Added Value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

The project target countries are Benin, Ivory Coast and Morocco. It will be referred to the experience of Brazil, Guatemala, El Salvador and Honduras through the model of the Vocational training centers of the Bavarian Employers' Associations to contribute to benchmarking activities at interregional conferences.

Morocco: please refer to *Appui au développement de la formation professionnelle dans les secteurs du tourisme, du textile et des NTIC - Formation Professionnelle II*. CRIS 4631

Ivory Coast: please refer to *Programme d'appui à la formation professionnelle et à l'insertion des jeunes en Côte d'Ivoire* CRIS 22049.

BENIN: please refer to *Projet d'appui au développement du secteur privé* CRIS 22582.

1. Identification (CRIS decision number):	A title refers to a project or programme. CRIS Decision N°: "Contrat de subvention DCI-EDU C/2009/211438; Ares (2011) 1258837 – 24/11/2011"
2. Classification	
a) By Sector/Thematic Area:	TP – TVET policy and systems LS – Active Labour Market Policy and Measures IE – Informal Economy IP
b) By Instrument (fund/budget line):	DCI: thematic programmes (investing in people IiP) Call 2008: "Education, Knowledge and Skills: Towards demand-driven Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) systems"
c) By region:	Target Countries Africa: Morocco, Côte d'Ivoire, Benin Associated Countries Latin America: Brazil, El Salvador, Guatemala, Honduras
d) By period and status	Decision year: 2009 Dates of implementation of the project: 42 months 2011-2015 Status): Ongoing
3. Financial data	
Planned (Primary commitment): EUR 1 499 295 (90% of total 1.665.884).	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
The general objective is that TVET improves qualifications and therefore the employability of human resources as well as the competitiveness of enterprises. The specific objective is that the alignment of the offer of technical and vocational education and training with demand as well as the dissemination of interregional comparative analyses (benchmarking) that contribute to the reinforcement of TVET systems in the target countries.	
4.1 Objective (statement of the problem)	What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
The context in the three countries is quite different, yet they all face the problems of youth unemployment, even among trained people. There are insufficient mechanisms to link firms (demand for skilled human resources) and TVET institutions (supply of human resources). This mechanism is a	

precondition for the proper functioning of the dual apprenticeship scheme that already exists in Benin and which is disseminated in Morocco in the handicraft sector. Once introduced, the system has great benefits, even if the dual system is not spread completely across the countries, as is the case in Ivory Coast.

In Benin and Morocco, the dual system of vocational training already exists. In Ivory Coast, only pilot training centers offer dual type vocational training. The problem in the partner countries as well as in many other countries is that the offer of the professional training centers is not aligned with the demand for technical and professional education of required by businesses. The adaptation of supply and demand promises a better employability of trained people and therefore it increases the competitiveness of local businesses. The project will use the practice of dual vocational training system as in Germany. The cornerstone of the dual system of vocational training is represented by the business associations, which play a key role between enterprises and vocational training centers. The professional education systems in the partner countries are facing multiple challenges. The exchange of good practices and lessons learnt between Morocco, Benin, Ivory Coast, Brazil, El Salvador, Honduras and Guatemala will promote improvements in the professional education systems.

4.2 Result of the project

Please describe the results achieved by the above project/ programme (or policy intervention).

Expected results:

- Development and reinforcement of capacities of TVET institutions in cooperation with skilled crafts chambers in order to gear the offer of TVET to demand through dual apprenticeship system;
- Increasing the weight of enterprises and other stakeholders as representatives to the state in the organisation and management of the TVET system;
- Introduction of services aiming at improving the employability of trained people;
- Promotion of peer learning through the dissemination of best practices and cooperation among national, regional and interregional stakeholders.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against 8 criteria (to be applied flexibly)

3 main broad criteria: **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability and Added Value of ETF**

- **Relevance: B**

The action aims to improve the technical and vocational education systems and to demonstrate the advantages of the dual system for the handicrafts sector in the participating countries. The German system serves as a model which can be adapted to the specific conditions of the countries or regions. German skilled crafts chambers are centres of excellence in TVET as they monitor and accompany vocational training in Germany and are responsible for the examination of apprentices, for further professional education and training as well as for vocational retraining. Together with the skilled crafts chambers of Morocco, Benin and Ivory Coast as well as with local TVET institutions, they will transfer (under the auspices of the project) their competences to improve vocational and technical training. The project will focus particularly on how to render the TVET system more demand-driven. The skilled crafts chambers play the role of a central focal point between enterprises and the TVET system. This will ensure alignment between the TVET systems and employment.

- **Effectiveness: B**

Publication of the the project documentation on the collaborative platform available on the website: <http://www.rifa-eu.org/rifa-en/downloads.rsys>. More than 15 analytical studies on gender equality, informal economy, TVET financing access to TVET, in rural areas, M & E, national innovation systems, TVET public-private partnership, TVET portability between informal / formal / public / private; recognition of certificates, basic literacy, life skills and sustainable livelihoods, regional harmonization of TVET programmes are prepared and distributed.

- **Efficiency: B**

The information provided on the website is clear: studies, conferences and the development and reinforcement of the capacities of TVET institutions in cooperation with skilled crafts chambers gear the TVET offer to labour market demand through the dual apprenticeship system. However, the available documentation enables an assessment that is only based upon the design of the project; therefore the grading is restricted and subject to confirmation by further documentation.

- **Coherence: B**

The project will build on the achievements of the MEDA-ETE: creation of networks of TVET institutions and analytical studies that enable peer learning. Morocco has already gained relevant experience and can be an example for other countries. The project is also in line with the Copenhagen process (1. Transparency, information, guidance 2. Recognition of skills and qualifications 3. Quality assurance 4. Regional dimension) and the principle of lifelong learning. Cooperation with the ETF, the association of TVET in West Africa (about to be set up) and UNEVOC will be sought to expand the circle of policy-makers, TVET experts and stakeholders in order to conduct analytical studies

• **Quality of the Design: B**

The general concept of this project aims to replicate the activities and results of the project as much as possible (coordination committee, private public dialogue, national conferences, interregional conferences, transfers of personnel, creation of networks of Chambers and TVET institutions inside the national and international framework). The collaborative platform will also be an essential source of information available to the Chambers and TVET institutions which will use them to develop additional activities that were not foreseen under this initiative.

The project's activities are organised around four geographic components and one cross-cutting component. This structure will allow partners to specifically address each region while encouraging the exchange of information and experiences between regions. Each component will be led in tandem between a European partner and a partner in the target region. The lead applicant (SEQUA) ensures the coordination between the components and leads the cross-cutting.

• **Impact: ND**

It is expected that the action has a significant impact. The transfer of skills of the German Chambers will lead to the introduction of a new management style of the TVET systems, in particular cooperation among policy-makers, TVET institutions and companies (represented by the skilled crafts Chambers). Among the numerous benefits, it must be emphasised that the participation of enterprises will make them more accountable to social issues, such as youth unemployment. An effective dual system or a more demand-oriented TVET system presents economic and social benefits: the trainees will be more adapted for work required by the companies and thus find a job more easily; businesses become more competitive with better qualified and efficient human resources. The public-private dialogue and the dissemination of information and experiences during the conferences will stimulate an improvement of legislation reflecting all stakeholders in the TVET systems.

No data was received to assess this criterion, mainly because the project was still ongoing at the time of assessment and also due to the *ex-ante* nature of the documentation received.

• **Sustainability: C**

If tensions arise because of disagreements between stakeholders at national level, the project risks of suffering from political obstacles hindering the dissemination of project achievements and of a low commitment of African partners, who will not be supported by their respective governments.

According to the data received, and considering the nature and extent of the core activities, it can be concluded that the grading for this project is restricted and subject to confirmation by further documentation.

• **Added Value of ETF: N/A**

4.3 Beneficiaries

Who benefited/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

Target group(s) Chambers of skilled crafts, TVET institutions, governmental agencies (central public and private vocational training) in Benin, Côte d'Ivoire and Morocco. In all three target countries, a partnership between a local and a German chamber is established. Final beneficiaries: TVET Students and enterprises.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The activity of RIFA is based on two principal foundations: the objective of RIFA is to adapt the offer of technical and vocational training according to demand as well as to disseminate comparative, inter-regional analyses contributing to the strengthening of the technical and vocational training systems in the target countries.

The first action therefore refers to the direct strengthening of capacities. The project aims to improve the technical and vocational education and training systems based upon the dual apprenticeship schemes in Morocco, Benin and Ivory Coast.

The second action refers to peer-learning. The national, regional and interregional conferences and

study visits are aimed to create a network of chambers of commerce and vocational training centres to share best practices between the three target regions.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to project "scalability"? What was the specific approach to capacity development that led to policy impact/changes?

Skilled Crafts Chambers in Germany have developed expertise in almost all areas covered by this Call for Proposals. The core objective is to disseminate skills and knowledge to local partners who will assess the relevance of their TVET systems and adapt the transferred competencies to local conditions. The action aims to promote improvements in the TVET system among local partners as well as to disseminate the project's achievements at national and even regional and interregional levels if possible. As part of this objective, experience gained during project implementation will be disseminated at national conferences that serve as a basis for creating a network among chambers and national TVET institutions. Any actions related to projects are to be disseminated nationally in order to generate discussions and to stimulate reforms in the TVET systems.

The interregional and national conferences and collaborative platform (project website) will stimulate the creation of a network of TVET institutions in the three regions. Project activities and conferences will be publicised in order to emphasise the importance of enterprises in the process of the modernisation of the TVET systems and to raise public awareness about the need to align the offer of training with private sector demand. On the one hand, analyses and studies present the current situation and on the other, the challenges of the respective TVET systems and enable peer learning. Major themes in this regard will be gender equality and the informal economy.

The direct target countries of the project are Benin, Ivory Coast and Morocco. The project will resort to the experience of Brazil, Guatemala, El Salvador and Honduras through bfz in order to contribute to benchmarking activities at interregional conferences.

Morocco is the country with the most advanced TVET system. The dual-type system is being introduced in the crafts sector. Until now, this sector was completely neglected, whereas in other sectors, dual apprenticeship schemes had already been introduced some time before. Now the importance of this sector has been recognised and the Moroccan government has established a blueprint for training in the crafts sector (2008), which is supported by regional crafts development programmes. Fez is a capital of crafts and thus a perfect ground for a pilot project which aims to disseminate good practice. The importance of such a project is also expressed by the Moroccan government which determined the 2000 - 2010 period as the decade of TVET in Morocco.

In Benin, the dual system exists in the craft ssector and is already quite advanced. Yet to anchor it in a sustainable way to0 the education system, huge investments are needed.

In Ivory Coast, the dual system exists only in pilot institutions and is not spread throughout the country. The country is very interested in closer cooperation with German Chambers, demonstrated by the opportunities presented by the dual system in the crafts sector.

In Morocco, the informal sector poses a major problem and is not included in the TVET system. Even though 80% of TVET institutions in Morocco are private; a minority of public TVET institutions train more than 70% of TVET students. A big problem in this country is youth unemployment; this is the reason why a mechanism linking companies to TVET institutions is required as a prerequisite for the proper functioning of the dual system, which is about to be further disseminated to the crafts sector. Such a system is also important for those who are not yet trained in the dual system, so that the training offer covers the needs of enterprises in a better way.

In Benin, the TVET system also faces several challenges. The offered training is very limited and the private sector, especially the informal one, trains ten times more people than the public sector. The formal TVET sector and a huge part of the private TVET sector are not adapted to the needs of enterprises; hence the link between TVET institutions and enterprises is far from satisfactory. In addition, there are wide disparities among the regions of the country as reflected by the fact that over 55% of TVET institutions are located on the coast for example. In general, the dual system in crafts is well established and includes the informal sector - focusing particularly on disadvantaged groups. It is also a necessity because the informal sector represents 95% of jobs in the Beninese economy. The system is very elaborate and institutionalised (Support Office for craftsmen, National Confederation of Craftsmen of Benin) and can serve as a model for other countries in the region. However, as with Morocco, a sustainable mechanism linking enterprises and TVET institutions is absent.

In Ivory Coast, the big challenge is to revitalise the TVET system in the wake of the civil war. The

country faces enormous challenges to its TVET system, which are characterised by institutional weakness. This provides the advantage of introducing best practices during the early reconstruction of the TVET system. Linking enterprises with TVET institutions will improve the system, even if the system will not be introduced in a generalised way.

The problem in all countries participating in the project is that there are no mechanisms linking the micro level (enterprises, institutions TVET), meso level (Chambers) and macro level (policy-makers). The Skilled Crafts Chamber can serve as an intermediary to connect all these levels, as is the case in Germany.

Morocco is currently disseminating the dual system in the craft sector and involves Chambers. Such an arrangement may be a means to provide relevant information to other countries (peer learning) in order to avoid the same mistakes and to identify good practices. An important task of the project will be the attempt to integrate the informal sector in the new system.

In Benin, the dual system in the crafts sector already exists and is well developed. It fits into the traditional apprenticeship system and is managed largely by the Chambers. A lack of information exchanges between enterprises and TVET institutions is due to deficiencies in the institutional capacity of the Chambers. The biggest challenge in Benin is to increase the quality of education to upgrade the skills of craftsmen. Despite the challenges that exist in the TVET system in Benin, it is a model for other countries in the region, as it has managed to incorporate the informal sector in this system.

Ivory Coast is a country ravaged by war and the main purpose of the action is to support the reconstruction of TVET infrastructure. Morocco and Benin may act as a model for Ivory Coast

7. Lessons learnt

Please include any lessons learnt (regardless of whether these were envisaged at project inception).

The pilot projects at local level between the project partners are a point of dissemination of good practice for all the involved countries. National conferences are used to publicise the achievements of the project and also to create a national network of Chambers and TVET institutions in which good practices can be disseminated. At the same time, national conferences intend to initiate discussions on some key themes of the TVET system, such as the informal sector or gender equality based on the analytical studies and the interregional conferences, which stimulate possible reforms in the future. The public-private dialogue takes into account the position of policy makers and also serves as a point of dissemination of innovative ideas. In Morocco and Benin, the possibilities of replication are significant, as in these countries, the dual system has been already introduced. This explains why these countries are very receptive to the project. In Ivory Coast, although the needs are more basic, the achievements of the project will create references that can support the reconstruction of the country's TVET system. The focus of dissemination will be the national conferences. It is therefore essential to prepare and ensure follow-up carefully. The local project managers encourage the creation of working groups on topics discussed in the conferences in order not to lose the created impetus.

8. Implementing Partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

Sequa GmbH is a non-profit organization that was established in 1991 by the Association of German Chambers of Commerce and Industry (DIHK), the Confederation of German Crafts (HwKs) and the Confederation of the German Employers Association, and its partners (www.sequa.de);

1. **Handwerkskammer Rhein-Main - Chamber of Crafts Rhein-Main** Companies belonging to the crafts sector in Germany are defined only by their production structure of crafts, and not by their size.
2. **Chamber of Crafts in the Region of Fez-Boulemane (Morocco).**
3. Saar- Lor- Lux-Umweltzentrum gGmbH (www.saar-lor-lux-umweltzentrum.de): non-profit, limited liability corporation and a subsidiary of the Chamber of Crafts of Saarland (Handwerkskammer des Saarlandes).
4. **Bfz** bfz gGmbH (www.bfz.de) is a network of professional training centers in Bavaria.
5. Confederation of Artisans of Benin CNAB.
6. The National Chamber of Skilled Crafts of Ivory Coast (CNMCI).
7. *Centres de formation professionnelle des associations patronales bavaroises.*

Associates:

INTECAP: The Technical Institute for Training and Productivity INTECAP is a leading Guatemalan institution for workers training and human resources and supports people in joining the workforce.

CAMARASAL From 2012, the associate project partner in El Salvador is the country's Chamber of Commerce and Industry.

CACB: The Confederation of Commercial and Business Associations of Brazil - CACB is a multi-sector organisation, constituted of 27 state federations and representatives of each federative unit of Brazil.

IPC: An institution in Honduras for Technical and Comprehensive Education concerned with studying continuous improvements in processes and technologies that continuously perform in industry.

9. Contacts

Provide contact details for further information, including telephone and e-mail.

EU Delegations to the countries concerned, EuropeAid F3.

Sequa GmbH: M. Markus Eicher, Alexanderstraße 10; D-53111, Bonn, Germany.

10. Sources, links & publications

Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs).

Action Plan (plan of activities, but no calendar).

Contract and Annexes (summary and brief description of the action).

Addendum 1 (grant and consortium distribution).

<http://www.rifa-eu.org/rifa/index.rsys>.

SOMALIA

Project title: "Developing Vocational Training for the Informal Economy in Somalia" (DVTIES)

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: ND
3. Efficiency: ND
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: ND
7. Sustainability: C
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

The TVET system exists in line with the Education Policy of the Ministry of Education (MoE) (Strategic Plan 2007-2011) based on the TVET Policy developed under the EU PETT project in Puntland and Somaliland. It is structured in the following manner: Basic Level, (Grade III), Intermediate Level (Grade II) and Advanced Level (Grade I). The Ministry of Labour (MoL) implements legislation and regulations on apprenticeship schemes, the code of conduct for training at work places and employment promotion programmes. Curricula are available for Grades III and II only. The system is expected to adopt a Vocational Qualification Framework to support the implementation of the existing TVET sub-sector policies and standardise - under a coherent structure - all the main aspects of TVET quality assurance (occupational skills, work related competence-based qualifications, curricula and courses, trainers and managers qualifications, facilities, equipment and material specification, and the entry requirement of trainees). Apart from this, the VQF will exist in Somaliland and Puntland.

1. Identification CRIS decision number	DCI-EDUC/2010/231093
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Area:	IE-Informal Economy IP
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI: thematic programmes (investing in people IiP)
c) By region	AFRICA: SOMALIA
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: October 2011 – March 2014. Duration 26 months Status: ONGOING
3. Financial data	Grant

Total cost of the action: EUR 1 199 990.

EU Contribution: EUR 1 599 992 equivalent to 80% of the estimated total eligible cost.

4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
<p>The expected outcome of the project is the improvement of employability and employment opportunities of disadvantaged Somali youths by augmenting – to the nature of 19% - the capacity of the TVET system to provide skilled graduates, mitigating a skills brain drain, providing alternative sources of livelihoods to families and relatives and opening skills opportunities for the upcoming youth generations in Somaliland, Puntland and Galmudug.</p> <p>The objective is to strengthen TVET methods and systems that foster employment promotion in Somalia by: increasing the quality of state-run TVET institutions, broadening the access of youths to Enterprise-Based Technical Vocational Education and Training (EBTVET) as well as Institute Based Technical Vocational Education and Training (IBTVET).</p>	

4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
--	---

An estimated exodus of up to 80% of skilled manpower during and after the civil war in Somalia emphasises the need to expand the offer of and increase the access to TVET in Somaliland, Puntland and Galmudug as well as to provide to youths (without access to skills or education), viable alternative

options for reintegration into post-war civil life and the economy as opposed to enrolment in militias. The TVET system offers limited chances to graduates of Grade III (basic level) to advance to Grade II (intermediate level) mainly because of the low capacity of the existing training centres in Somaliland, Puntland and Galmudug. Weak management; low quality; lack of qualified technical trainers; a limited number of standardised TVET courses and course progression; incoherent standardisation and certification of examinations and difficulties of sustainability of TVET interventions are the main causes.

4.2. Result of the project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)
-----------------------------------	---

The project's expected results are:

- Access to relevant TVET for 1890 youths (16-24 age group), drop-outs and illiterate adults (50% female) ensured;
- Basic literacy prior to skills acquisition provided to youth (50% women) and access of Grade III graduates to Grade II increased;
- Three state-run TVET centres (Hargeisa-Somaliland, Bosaso and Galkayo- Puntland) upgraded as Technical Institutions (TI) and offering Grade II courses;
- EBTVET and IBTVET capable to offer Grade III courses;
- Labour market surveys carried out, curricula, courses and material relevant to skills in demand, developed;
- 120 trainers trained in teaching methods, examined (80% passing a pedagogical course with a score of 60%), and best 76 trained as master trainers in 3 trades by international master trainers;
- TVET exams developed and standardised (90% trainees passing examinations with a 50% score);
- 3 month bridging English language course attended by Grade II trainees in 3 secondary schools;
- Training centres inputting data in MoE-EMIS (Education Management Information Systems);
- Apprenticeship scheme at the MoL developed;
- Cost recovery system for TVET institutions' financial sustainability developed and applied;
- VQF developed occupational skills standards, competence-based qualifications, curricula, trainer's qualifications, equipment and material, trainee's entry requirement reviewed accordingly.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 3 main broad criteria Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency 5 additional criteria: Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF
---	--

- Relevance: B**

In the absence of monitoring and evaluation reports, it is possible to express a few considerations on what is declared in the technical proposal: the action appears as relevant to the social demand as well as the need to increase internal efficiency of the TVET system and institutions. Relevance to economic demand is not apparent, since a labour market survey and analysis was foreseen in the implementation phase. The EBTNET and the development of an apprenticeship scheme for the MoL are expected to increase the relevance of skills demanded by the employers.

- Effectiveness: ND**

For this criterion also, a few considerations can be expressed on the basis of the project's design. Effectiveness on TVET institutions should be ensured by the limited scope on policy and the focus on quality and access. The establishment of VTCs within the project's life span appears optimistic. Insofar as the effectiveness of the foreseen action to upgrade technical institutions, is worth noting that the amount of resources allotted in the budget mostly concerns capacity building and material. The proposal does not clarify if the selected institutions had already been upgraded by other projects/donors.

- Efficiency: ND**

Efficiency cannot be assessed in the absence of any monitoring or implementation report. The project started and was amended with an extension from 24 to 26 months. The maximisation of costs is expected by increasing the number of youths attending functional literacy coupled with training as opposed to those only attending technical skills training.

- Coherence: B**

The project is coherent with the European Union Strategy for the Implementation of Special Aid to Somalia (SISAS); the PETT 1 and 2 projects; the Education Policy as outlined in the MoE Strategic Plan

2007-2011 includes a TVET Policy that was developed under the PETT. No reference is made to broader national and international development frameworks.

- **Quality of the Design: B**

The proposal is weak in analysing local labour markets, skills demand, employability of graduates from the TVET system and in relation to overall Skills Development in the country. It is stronger on the methodology and describes the implementation process in a detailed manner. The extension provided may be the result of assumptions that did not materialise as foreseen or changes that cannot be entirely predicted in the post-conflict context of a fragile state. This is in spite of analyses of assumptions and risks and the proposed mitigation plan which appear as accurate.

- **Impact: ND**

In the absence of monitoring and implementation reports, only a few considerations on the potential impact can be expressed: a 19% increase of skilled youth obtaining a higher qualification level with women and girls targeted at 50%; trained trainers and master trainers, available by the end of the project. Better equipped schools are expected to have quite an impact on a TVET system that is limited in access and coverage. The impact on living conditions of families as a result of the income that better skilled youths are expected to generate, once employed and self-employed, as well the increase in productivity and better performance of the private sector are strong assumptions.

- **Sustainability: C**

According to the project proposal, the main elements of sustainability are to be found in the approaches of EBTVE (on-the-job training) and IBTVET (in a classroom setting). The former requires almost no investment, as training centres or private and public enterprises are already established and running. IBTVET centres and TI, by adopting a cost-recovery system, should generate sufficient income for the replacement of training equipment, salaries, and training costs. The project provides financial support in the form a monthly-based student fee. The project declares that since the MoE will directly manage one of the 3 assisted centres, whilst IBTVET centres are linked to secondary schools including Community Education Committees (CEC), the allocation of resources and mainstreaming of IBTVET centres and TI into the MoE system should take place at the end of the project. The sustainability of the institutional development component is based on the project's support to existing policies (Education and Labour) and existing departments of MoE and MoL.

- **Added value of ETF: NA**

4.3. Beneficiaries Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

Youths in the 16-24 age group, management and training staff of TVET institutions, MoE and MoL staff, local entrepreneurs

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The 26-month project aims at increasing the access of youths to certified skills; this includes the acquisition of higher employability potential by progressing through competency-based training leading to certified qualifications. To achieve this objective, the project provides support to Technical Schools (quality and access) and training at the workplace through apprenticeship schemes. It also aims at strengthening the TVET system by introducing a VQF for the first three levels of the national TVET system, establishing a coordination mechanism for the Ministries of Labour and Education. The chosen approach promotes the involvement of a broad base of stakeholders, from institutions to associations and communities. In addition to the immediate impact on the final beneficiaries, the project results should be mainstreamed into the TVET system.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

The main elements, regarding the project's design, are: complementarity of the consortium partners and respective experience in the field. Networking with other development partners. Focus of the actions on limited and thus more attainable objectives. The limited expectations of impact on the TVET system.

7. Lessons learned

Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.

In the absence of monitoring and implementation reports, it is possible to remark that the justification for funding such initiatives are to be found beyond the inherent quality and the relevance to the needs

of the country; it is interlinked and mutually reinforces actions of the broader EU assistance framework to Somalia.

8. Implementation partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

Horn Relief, Kenya, International Aid Services, Sweden, and Gothenburg Initiative, Sweden, as members of the consortium led by Diakonia. MOE and MOL. The international partners with whom the project was intended to interact with were: UNESCO, for curricula developed in trades that would be utilised if endorsed by the MoE Education Development Centre (EDC); USAID funded Employment promotion services; Africa Educational Trust (AET) that supports the Examination and Certification Board of the Ministries of Education using examination and certification guidelines developed by previous EU-funded interventions; TVET with Food/Non-Food Items for Training and provision of toolkits for graduates by WFP and UNHCR.

9. Contacts:

Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail

Krister Adolfsson (Diakonia Regional Office, Nairobi), Eva Åberg (Diakonia, Head Office, Sweden). EU Delegation, in Kenya- Somalia Operation Unit.

10. Sources, links and publications

Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)

Description of the Action.
 Signed Contract and addendum.

SIERRA LEONE

Project: Unblocking the Cocoa Value Chain Through Formal and Informal Pathways to Learning in Eastern Sierra Leone

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: A
3. Efficiency: B
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: B
7. Sustainability: A
8. Added value of ETF: NA (Not applicable)

0. TVET at a Glance

Rebuilt as a post-conflict tool of the Demobilization, Disarmament and Reintegration programme and carrying the traditional second option/remedial choice stigma, TVET in Sierra Leone responds to the priorities of the President's National Development Agenda for Change (Nyalley, 2010). The Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports (MEYS), has the overall responsibility for TVET policy and management. The Education Management Information System (EMIS) was put in place in 2009; a school census had been conducted since 2010 and Education Sector Reviews (ESR) have taken place on an annual basis since 2008. Several ministries activities have major 'skills' dimensions such as the Ministries of Trade and Industry, Labour, Infrastructure, Agriculture, Mining and Tourism that own vocational skills training programmes. National stakeholders include: relevant ministries, commissions and councils at the central and local governmental levels; private sector representatives; representatives from TVET centres/secondary schools; local NGOs In Sierra Leone, TVET was originally designed for school drop-outs and those who failed the Basic Education Certificate Examination (BECE), West African Senior Secondary Certificate Examination (WASSCE) or failed to enter tertiary institutions. Consequently, the TVET system is stereotyped as being for those with a low level of academic achievement.

The government's Agenda for Change stresses the need for a strong TVET system that recognises the risks of an un-educated and under employed youth in the process of the country's reconstruction. The draft National TVET Policy (2010) is part of the educational system reform. About 35% of the population are classified as youths and 70% of this age group are without formal work. The provision of an accessible and labour market-driven TVET policy is considered a strategic instrument for addressing the problem. The Education Sector Plan (ESP). proposed the following strategic goals for TVET: expanding and improving post-primary schooling, providing more and improved literacy and skills training possibilities; meeting teachers' needs of an expanding schooling system; providing improved governance, planning and management; increase of national budget allocated to education to 20% and the non-formal education (NFE) budgetary allocation from 0.7% to 6% of the growing education budget.

About 380 public and private institutions (commercial, NGOs and faith-based institutions) that offer TVET at tertiary level, are registered with the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST); 154 receive financial support. The private provision of TVET is on the increase and is partially regulated by the MEST. The number of actual skills providers is estimated at double of those registered. The National Council for Technical, Vocational, and other Academic Awards (NCTVA) oversees examinations and accreditation as well as coordination of the TVET and Technical Vocational Skills Development (TVSD) consultation mechanism. TVET institutions below the polytechnic level are the Technical/Vocational Schools and the Community Education Centres (CECs). The CECs offer basic skills training for income generation and are supervised by the Non-Formal Education Directorate in coordination with the Inspectorate at District Education Offices (DEO) and Local Councils. Links between the formal and non-formal TVET exist and CEC graduates can move to formal TVET schools. The London based City and Guilds is the main external accreditation and certification body for middle and lower level TVET qualifications (secondary and lower secondary level). Three polytechnics, two teacher training colleges, several Community Education Centre (CEC), Teachers Certificate (TC), Vocational Centre (VC), Technical and Vocational Institute (TVI) constitute the backbone of the TVET

supply system in the country.	
TVET financing in Sierra Leone for the period from 2008 to 2010, fluctuated along the Government's expenditures, and were 4.2%; 2.1%; and 2.2 of the national budget. The education budget in 2010 was a total of 21.7 % (divided between MEYS (14.4%) and decentralised education services (7.3%).	
1. Identification	DCI-EDUC/2010/ 231059
CRIS decision number	
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Area:	ST- Sectoral Training IE- Informal Economy IP
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI: thematic programmes (investing in people IiP)
c) By region	AFRICA Country: SIERRA LEONE
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: October 2011 – March 2014 Status: ONGOING
3. Financial data	Grant
Total EC amount (+ % of indicative programme): Total cost of the action: EUR 1 194 323.30 EU Contribution EUR 955 458.64 equivalent to 80% of the estimated total eligible cost	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
<p>Overall objective:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To contribute to the livelihoods and income generation of cocoa farmers in Eastern Sierra Leone through improvement in the quality and quantity of cocoa being produced and exported. <p>Specific objectives:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To improve the skills and employability of actual and potential cocoa farmers and workers through the provision of formal and informal TVET opportunities; To improve the skills of staff of Eastern Radio to develop and produce educational radio programming for the informal cocoa sector; To redevelop Njala University and SLARI's capacity to deliver training and accreditation to potential farmers and farm workers; Using cocoa as an entry point, to improve access to trustworthy local radio programming that strengthens public awareness and debate on key information relevant to the development needs of men and women cocoa farmers in Eastern Sierra Leone. 	
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<p>The issue that the project addresses is related to the poor quality and low productivity of cocoa being produced in Eastern Sierra Leone that locks cocoa farmers in a poverty cycle with low knowledge and skills in cocoa production, value addition and marketing. Farmers and farm workers in the informal cocoa sector lack the basic modern skills in cocoa production (seed selection, nursery establishment, transplanting, rehabilitation), value addition (harvesting, pod breaking, transportation, fermentation, drying and storage) and marketing (buyer relations, market information). This has resulted in a production of cocoa that is below the West African average. The quality grade of cocoa from Sierra Leone is very low and there is a complete exclusion of cocoa farmers from the marketing demand side of the cocoa value chain. Due to this gap, there is no horizontal integration among the different cocoa sector actors. Downstream market information flow is missing. Poor farmers are not able to engage the other actors mutually and thus they do not play an active role in determining the course of the cocoa farming.</p>	
4.2. Result of the project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)
<p>The project's expected results are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A package of radio programmes (discussion shows, drama and information bulletins) produced, reaching 140 000 farmers and potential farmers increasing their knowledge of and interest in the cocoa sector; 5000 farmers and potential farmers participate in a flexible and market-oriented radio training course on cocoa which increases their skills and knowledge in cocoa farming; Financial sustainability of Eastern Radio improved with a solar power generation system and establishment of commercially sponsored programme streams; 	

- Lasting capacity created within Eastern radio to continue to produce and deliver informative and educational programming on the cocoa sector (46 staff and mentors trained for 18 months);
- Training hub established, providing a platform for Njala University to develop curriculum and 2-3 month TOT courses;
- Lasting training resources and capacity created, including re-establishment of Njala University to offer distance learning programmes to the informal cocoa sector supported by SLARI and strengthened linkages between the informal economy and formal education training;
- Improved people awareness of and engagement in local development process that affect cocoa livelihoods in the Eastern Region.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)

- 3 main broad criteria **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF**

• **Relevance: A**

The project is relevant to the National Development Agenda for Change and the NCTVA objective, the needs for enhanced productivity of the sector and the social demand of improving livelihoods, increased incomes and promoting wider access to skills opportunities for low income workers and vulnerable and marginalised groups rotating around the cocoa sector. It is also relevant to the TVET system outreach effort by opening up to a much wider audience that the formal and non-formal TVET can reach through the traditional face-to-face delivery modality.

• **Effectiveness: A**

The project is delivered using a combination of formal and informal learning methodologies by offering flexible, educative, entertaining and market appropriate training programmes to current and potential farmers in Eastern Sierra Leone. This is to improve their knowledge and skills in cocoa production so as to improve the quality and quantity being produced in and exported from Sierra Leone. The implementation of the components of programming, training and research, drama production and partner development appear to be in line with the plans. The interim report was expected by March 2013. The project seems to have achieved the envisaged milestones in its first year.

• **Efficiency: B**

The project started with a 6 month delay as the Project Manager had to be changed. The implementation of activities related to the three components nevertheless went forward as planned and at the end of 2012, expenditures reached 35% of the project's budget.

• **Coherence: B**

The project is coherent with national policy (TVET and sector related) priorities, the Poverty Reduction Strategy, the National Sustainable Agriculture Sector Plan and the Private Sector Development Strategy and has become progressively better aligned with the EU A4D programme.

• **Quality of the Design: B**

The project's socioeconomic analysis and the educational contents of the skills offer, via radio or face-to-face short courses, is anticipated to the initial phase of the project, while the project proposal mainly details the methodology and the steps to set-up the media component. The target set for the final beneficiaries only concerns the potential audience of the broadcasted teaching modules, whilst a quantification of persons undergoing face-to-face training, obtaining a certificate, curriculum development, the duration of courses and the development of training and instructional material are not provided. Moreover, in the early implementation phase, the changes required by the EU Delegation to avoid overlapping with another EU-funded project required the cancellation of two activities.

• **Impact: B**

The expected impact on the workers of the cocoa sector, the vulnerable groups, the formal TVET system and the short-term training offer cannot be fully appreciated after one year of implementation. The capacity building and strengthening of the partner - Eastern Radio - is demonstrated by the capacity to broadcast for 24 hours, the airing of the weekly Cocoa News bulletin, radio dramas and discussions to address the issues of the cocoa farmers are raised in the dramas.

• **Sustainability: A**

According to the project proposals, the main elements of sustainability are to be found in the advertising and sponsoring mechanism; the BBC will help Eastern Radio set up a cost recovery mechanism for low fee based 2-3 month courses for Njala University. The courses are expected to be in high demand as a consequence of the advertising made by the radio courses. Capacity building is

also indicated as a key element, as the BBC will directly carry out one activity, while partners throughout the implementation of the project will 'own' all other activities.	
• Added value of ETF: N/A	
4.3. Beneficiaries	Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?
Workers and potential workers from the informal economy, stakeholder associations, training providers, trainers and validation assessors belonging to partner institutions or their networks.	
5. Synopsis	Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.
The 36 month project aims at improving livelihoods and increasing the incomes of poor farmers from the cocoa sector in Eastern Sierra Leone by improving the skills and employability of actual and potential cocoa farmers and workers through the provision of formal and informal TVET. Access to skills opportunities are planned through a mix of radio programmes to be broadcasted by Eastern Radio, assisted to develop and produce educational radio programming for the informal cocoa sector, as well as by the training and capacity building of partners - Eastern Radio, Njala University and SLARI. This is achieved by working with the co-funders - GIZ and the FAO - to shape and facilitate access by the farmers to the radio teaching modules. Farmer field schools are expected to provide listening groups to teaching modules and develop a certification system for farmers that have attended a minimum number of modules at the schools. Njala University and SLARI are expected to become resource hubs to provide knowledge and skills on cocoa production. The private sector (cocoa buyers, traders and banks) are key associates in the project.	
6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?
The utilisation of a mass medium (radio) and face-to-face training for multiplying the offer of skills and reaching a wider audience while strengthening the capacity of partners (radio, university and service centre) to develop and deliver training contents relevant to a productive sector and its workers. The synergy between a world class media producer (BBC), specialised UN agencies (FAO) and bilateral development actors (GIZ) presents a win-win situation that is expected to have a strong impact on the final beneficiaries, on the quality of the skills offer and on the image of TVET and of the agricultural occupations related to the sector. The scheme is also replicable for other sectors of the economy or in other areas of the country and Western Africa at large.	
7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.
The project responds to the need for a process and products that were indicated as a priority in the concerned national policies. Is internal coherence of the project design sufficient to reassure that expected results can impact on the medium term and on a national system, or should an institutional analysis corroborate proposals declaring such a scope? The proposal omits reference to or possible synergy with any national or international development partners presumably active in non-formal TVET in the country.	
8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
Partners in the Action: Eastern Radio, Njala University and SLARI (Associate).	
9. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail
BBC London. EU Delegation, Sierra Leone.	
10. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)
Description of the Action. Signed Contract and addendum. 4 quarterly implementation reports for 2012.	

UGANDA

Project title: Workers' PAS-Validation of Non-formal and Informal Training

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: ND
3. Efficiency: ND
4. Coherence: B
5. Impact: ND
6. Sustainability: ND
7. Quality of Design: C
8. Added value of ETF: N/A

0. TVET at a Glance

The Education Sector Strategic Plan (EESP) 2005-12 devised by the MOES (Ministry of Education and Sports) established the Uganda Vocational Qualification Framework/Authority (UVQF/A) for the assessment and certification of occupational competencies and the articulation of course objectives and guidance. The BTNET department was established and its policy defined under this legal framework. The Directorate of Industrial Training (DIT), responsible for assessment, has developed an Assessment Training package and training modules to support the recognition and certification of skills acquired in the informal economy. Universal Primary Education leavers have access to the formal TVET diploma-based stream or to the non-formal certificate-based vocational training.

1. Identification CRIS decision number	DCI-EDUC/2010/231275
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Area	Informal Economy
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	Investing in People
c) By region	AFRICA Target country Uganda
d) By Period and Status	1 st January 2011. Duration 36 months Status: Ongoing
3. Financial data	Grant

EU Contribution: EUR 498 466 (equivalent to 80% of the estimated total eligible cost of the action: EUR 632 082)

4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
-------------------	-------------------------------------

The overall goal is to contribute to increasing employability and the level of incomes of the poor working in informal and formal economic sectors in Kampala, Jinja, Kamuli and Iororo.

The specific objective is to develop private sector driven and innovative non-formal modes of skills training and its accreditation with the awarding of the workers' Proficient Acquired Skills (PASs) to the project's final beneficiaries, (potential and actual workers of the informal economy). The project implementation methodology is centred on capacity building, institutional development, coaching and technical assistance of training providers, collective actions of workers and employers for network development, career guidance and pre-vocational skills and advocacy, in an area of the country where the majority of members of the Uganda Small Scale Industries Association (USSIA) and the Uganda Association of Private Training Institutes (UGAPRIVI) are located. The outcome is:

- Skills training and upgrading for potential and actual workers in the informal sector;
- Skills validation through an established Workers' PAS accreditation system;
- Issuing of Workers' PAS to certified trainees and support to job placements and self-employment;
- The project supports a voluntary process of validation that aims at leading towards a coherent and institutional validation practice in the country.

4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
--	---

At the time of the project's formulation, the analyses emphasised that un- and under employment were unanimously indicated as the priority cause of poverty, that the already high proportion of unskilled and low skilled persons was on the rise and related to employment in the informal economy, characterised by low working conditions, exploitation and low wages (estimated at more than 70% of the total employment of the national economy). Youths and women in rural areas were indicated as the most vulnerable groups. Although within the informal economy, activities ranged from subsistence activities to successful small enterprises, it was the informal economy (800 000 informal businesses employing 1.5 million workers, contributing 20% of GDP to the national economy and with an annual growth rate estimated at about 20%) and not the formal manufacturing and large scale agriculture that created the highest number of jobs. Hence, there was a need to increase the level of skills, as a way to establish links between the informal and formal economy. The learning that takes place in the informal economy, although not produced by any accredited institution, needs to be made visible through recognition and certification. Validation of non-formal and informal skills is defined by the national policy as part of lifelong learning, but specific policies and modalities, e.g. agreements between public authorities and the private sector on validation had not yet been defined in Uganda.

4.2. Result of the project

- Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)

Through the utilisation of the local Skills Development approach which is a non-formal educational and training system (mass-effective and low cost), with the participation of the Federation of Ugandan Employers (FUE), the National Union of Trade Unions (NOTU) USSIA and UGAPRIVI:

- UGAPRIVI and 10 of its training providers (200 trainers) trained on new modular curricula (DACUM-based on: metal work, carpentry, automotive, transport, hotel and catering, textiles, construction and agribusiness) and on PAS standards, offer training (skills training for potential workers and, skills upgrading for actual informal sector workers) for the informal sector that leads to Workers' PAS accreditation;
- UGAPRIVI manages the Workers' PAS accreditation system on a sustainable basis (qualification process for Workers' PAS), 20 UGAPRIVI and USSIA assessors trained, 5 UGAPRIVI assessment centres upgraded, 5 Trade-specific assessment tests item (ATPs) developed, assessment results, identification cards and Workers PAS are provided on line;
- Potential and actual workers (1200) undergo skills training (potential workers through Learning Groups of 15 trainees; actual workers through skills upgrading) and obtain Workers' PAS. Their placement is facilitated through USSIA member enterprises and parallel support is provided for self-employment;
- Awareness raised on the opportunities and dissemination of information on local and informal labour markets (scanning and baseline studies, stakeholder workshops, case studies, publishing of results) is provided through USSIA, other stakeholders as well as the BTNET Department of the MoES (formal TVET links).

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)

- 3 main broad criteria **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF**

• Relevance: A

The project is relevant to international principles guiding TVET for the non-formal and informal economy i.e. recognition and validation of skills acquired outside the formal stream. It is relevant to national policies and strategies (MoES- EESP and BTNET), reflecting a need to increase the service capacity of non-formal TVET providers, associations of stakeholders and social partners. It also responds to the social and economic demand of the workers of the informal economy.

• Effectiveness: ND

In the absence of any monitoring or evaluation report it is not possible to express any opinion on the effectiveness of the project's implementation. At the design level, it can be observed that the components addressing the development of a validation process, the product specifications (certificate to be awarded) and the capacity to produce it, look solid, while effectiveness related to setting a more comprehensive institutional development process in motion is less evident.

• Efficiency: ND

In the absence of any monitoring or evaluation report, it is not possible to express any assessment on

the level of efficiency of the project's implementation. The proposed project management structure and its projected costs appear realistic in comparison with the project's activities and lifespan, as well as the distribution of tasks and resources among the partners.

- **Coherence: B**

The project is coherent with the priorities of the 2005-12 Education Sector Strategic Plan (EESP) of the MOES, the UVQF/A objectives and the procedures of the BTVET.

- **Impact: ND**

In the absence of any monitoring or evaluation report, it is only possible to consider that the expected technical impact is related to the sizeable sample of workers and potential workers that will be awarded with Workers'PAS, to partners and stakeholders involved in process and tool development, training delivery and follow-up services. Impact is also expected in the form of an enduring capacity by the project partners and providers of PAS-certificate training, to continue to offer fee-based validation services to informal workers beyond the end of the project. At the level of the project proposal, how this large pilot could be institutionalised in formal TVET by way of interaction with the national TVET authority (MoES) is not described but only 'expected'.

- **Sustainability: ND**

At the formulation level, it is worth noting that the main elements of sustainability are identified in the participatory and practical approach based on local capacity building, involving stakeholders, authorities and social partners; on the dissemination and awareness creation about the advantages of the Workers' PAS validation of non-formal education for the individual workers; the training sector and the enterprises; on the quality of the validation process and on the standards that are designed in relation to those of formal education; on the financial viability of the scheme that should be paid by workers seeking a validation of acquired skills.

- **Quality of the design: C**

The project's rationale is strong. However, the evidence basis lacks accuracy in terms of the socioeconomic background and the TVET sector analysis. This is reflected in the weak arguments provided in support of institutional sustainability. The description of the validation process is accurate and the risk mitigation strategy against the risk that assumption 'b' of the project document does not materialise, is well conceived. No target share is set for vulnerable groups such as youths and women, though indicated as a priority target in the general background.

- **Added value of ETF: NA**

4.3. Beneficiaries Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?
Workers and potential workers of the informal economy, stakeholder associations, training providers, trainers and validation assessors belonging to partner institutions or their networks.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The 36 month project aims at developing a system of validation, recognition and certification of skills acquired in the non-formal (potential workers) and informal (actual workers) economy against standards set in formal TVET. It intends to achieve the results through a large partnership including all the relevant stakeholders of both the demand and supply sides. It introduces elements of quality in the training offer by making use of internationally renowned approaches and tools. It also expects to establish a financially viable service that responds to the demand for skills recognition and validation expressed by the individual workers of the informal economy, the TVET providers, the social partners and the enterprises.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

The project openly declares its intention to pave the way for a further scaling-up of the validation practice and sets up a large and partnership consisting of all relevant stakeholders with the exception of the national TVET authority, the MoES, with which, the links besought throughout the project document do not materialise in any of the proposed activities. The response, on a pilot basis, to a priority indicated in the national policy but not yet put in practice by the national TVET authority, was the true *raison d'être* of the project. The idea is strong and the process to achieve it is credible. It is not possible to verify how identification and recruitment of the targeted 1200 workers went, if placement and self-employment targets were achieved, if the demand for validation was as high as

expected and the business perspective of partners finally materialised.	
7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.
The project responds to the need for a process and products that were indicated as a priority in the concerned national policies. Is internal coherence of the project design sufficient to reassure that expected results can impact on the medium term and on a national system, or institutional analysis should corroborate proposals declaring such a scope? The proposal omits reference to or possible synergy with any national or international development partners presumably active in non-formal TVET in the country.	
8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
The project partners are: SuisseContact Germany, SuisseContact Uganda, UGAPRIVI, USSIA, Training Providers of USSIA and ICT Diamond	
9. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail
SuisseContact Germany GMBH. EU Delegation, Kampala.	
10. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)
Description of the Action. Contract. http://www.ugaprivi.org/workers-pas.html http://dituganda.org/assessment-certification-2/	

NEPAL

Skill Development and Employment for the Informal Sector in Nepal (SEIS)

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: B
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of the Design: B
6. Impact: B
7. Sustainability: C
8. Added Value of ETF: N/A

0. TVET at a Glance

The Council for Technical Education and Vocational Training (CTEVT) was constituted in 1989 and is a national autonomous apex body for the Technical and Vocational Education and Training sector committed to the production of technical and skillful human resources required by the nation. It is mainly involved in policy formulation, quality control, the preparation of competency-based curricula, developing skill standards of various occupations and testing the skills of the people, conducting various research studies and training needs assessments etc. CTEVT through its constituted technical schools and training centers, affiliated technical colleges and institutes and annex schools offer proficiency/diploma levels, technical school leaving certificates and short-term vocational and skill training. In brief, the existing provision of TVET programmes can be mentioned as below:

- Vocational Training Provision;
- Technical Education Provision;
- Attraction in TVET Programs.

There is four types of Curriculum (see <http://www.ctevt.org.np/> Council):

- Diploma/Certificate level curriculum;
- Technical School Leaving Certificate (TSLC) level curriculum;
- Technical and Vocational Training curriculum;
- Curriculum for 9-10 Technical Stream Secondary Education.

Donor TVET trends in Nepal focus on 'quality, not quantity', real learning and gender parity in order to promote real equality in practice. There is a clear focus on i) poverty; ii) increased integration of the environment and development agenda; iii) food security; iv) access to energy; v) continued emphasis on health and education, with greater focus on the quality of skills and adaptability to the market; and vi) the incorporation of governance, democracy, peace and human rights into the new priorities for a New Development Agenda on Education.

1. Identification (CRIS decision number):	DCI-EDUC/2010/231089
2. Classification	
a) By Sector/Thematic Area:	TM- TVET targeted groups LS- Active Labour Market policy and Measures IE – Informal Economy IP
b) By Instrument (fund/budget line):	DCI: thematic programmes (Investing in people IiP)
c) By region:	Asia and Central Asia: (NEPAL)
d) By period and status:	Decision year : 2010-2013 Total duration of the action (months): 36 Status: ONGOING
3. Financial data	
Total eligible cost of the action (A) EUR 1 849 609. Amount requested from the Contracting Authority (B) EUR 1 479 687. % of total eligible cost of action (B/Ax100) Total EC amount: 80 % of indicative programme.	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?

Overall objective: To contribute to lasting peace and economic prosperity in Nepal through effective skills training and employability of disadvantaged young women and men in the informal economy.

Specific objectives:

- O1) Develop appropriate skill training packages for technical and vocational education and training of the informal economy, which confirms with occupational skills standards of the government.
- O2) Support skills training service providers to improve the quality of their training, links with employment and to expand their services.
- O3) Train 4000 disadvantaged women and men and link them to employment.
- O4) Create and develop effective platforms and fora with informal sector workers, entrepreneurs and policy-makers for exchanges of best practices and feedback on quality of training and policy dialogue.

<p>4.1 Objective (statement of the problem)</p>	<p>What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?</p>
<p>Most of Nepal's economy is informal. In the transition phase from conflict to peace in which the country currently finds itself, changes in economic sectors take place quickly. Skills offered by training providers are often outdated and do not meet the demands of labour markets, while entrepreneurs cannot find Nepali workers with the necessary skills to run their businesses. Effective and cost-efficient methods for assessing and monitoring local, informal labour markets and the capacities to use these methods are lacking. A specific drawback is the lack of curricula, training manuals and support modules that can respond to the needs of local labour markets and to the capacities of young trainees. Current curricula and training manuals are often unresponsive to the specific skills requirements of informal sector enterprises and to the capacities of young trainees; consequently, only a fraction of young skills training graduates find employment.</p>	
<p>4.2 Result of the project</p>	<p>Please describe the results achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention).</p>
<p>The project is ongoing; however, according to the Interim Narrative Report - 2012 (www.seis.org.np) SEIS delivered the services through fourteen (14) Training and Employment Service Providers (T&Esp). Among the 14 T&Esp selected in 2011, contracts were extended with 13 - whereas a new T&Esp was selected in 2012. In total, 130 T&Esp resource persons were trained on four models: Rapid Market Appraisal (RMA) methodology, Life Skills Training and Business Skills and Orientation and Training of Trainers. Similarly, in total, 130 RMA reports were received out of which 121 were screened and forwarded for verification in District Employment Review Forum (DERF) meetings. Nineteen DERF meetings were held in centres covered by the project. Eighty-two (82) training events on 18 trades were implemented and evaluated. During 2012, 1635 youths completed skills training. Out of this, Dalits - 131, Janjatis (both indigenous nationals) - 1146, widows - 11, people with disabilities - 7, internally displaced and victims of trafficking - 69 and ethnic minority groups - 29 completed the skills training. This means that 85% of the trainees who completed the skills training were from disadvantaged communities. Likewise, out of the total number of trainees, 1617 sat the skills test conducted by the National Skill Testing Board (NSTB) and 1513 passed. This represents 93.56% of the total number who sat the skills test. As per the preliminary report submitted by T&Esp, more than 90% of skills graduates were employed. However, this is yet to be verified by the project. In 2012, four skill training manuals were prepared in collaboration with SKILL Nepal. These concerned: Junior Plumbers, Industrial Electricians, Electric Motor Re-winders and Barbers. Two toolkits on business skills (business-plan preparation and product and service marketing techniques) were also developed during the year. A summary of outputs and outcomes achieved is presented in the 2012 Interim Report 2012. Income verification of the skills graduates of 2011 was completed in April 2012. The results revealed that 1387 persons (87.5%) out of 1584 secured gainful employment with 36.04% in self-employment and the remaining in wage employment. The income verification revealed the per capita average monthly income of the employed graduates to be NRs. 5, 769 against the project benchmark of NRs.4, 500.00.</p>	
<p>Grading: Overall analysis</p>	<p>3 main broad criteria: Relevance, Effectiveness and</p>

<p>carried out against 8 criteria (to be applied flexibly)</p>	<p>Efficiency 5 additional criteria: Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability and Added Value of ETF</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevance: B <p>The action focuses on developing the skill training potential of young people engaged in the informal sector from disadvantaged communities in Nepal and bringing them into gainful employment. It directly addresses the main objective of this Call for Proposals: 'Provide appropriate training opportunities to actual and potential workers in the informal economy in order to improve employability, productivity, and income generating capacities.' It also seeks to include people from disadvantaged communities in technical skills training with emphasis given to young women and <i>Dalits</i>. The objectives of this proposed action are aligned with the specific objectives of the Call for Proposals. The action makes a significant contribution towards reducing youth unemployment and underemployment. The employment of young people is a crucial factor for enhancing political stability in Nepal, particularly in the current post-conflict and transition period.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Effectiveness: B <p>According to the Interim Narrative Report, SEIS has been found to be successful in implementing almost all of the targeted activities as planned. Furthermore, other results have been documented such as press meeting, case studies, thematic study etc. The following outputs were accomplished: all planned meetings and interaction events with stakeholders; PDRMs; DERF; TVET policy feedback meetings and reviews with T&ESP; RMA; sub-sector analyses; income verification; training and orientation; technical training, life skills and business skills training. The project demonstrate public accountability by creating its own website, printing and distributing brochures, fixing training information sheets on all the training sites as well as by holding press meetings. The stakeholders were provided with an opportunity to provide feedback on various forums (DERF, PDRM etc.). With their increased exposure to SEIS activities, the government and other stakeholders have now become well familiar with the scope, activities, funding sources and working approach of the project.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Efficiency: B <p>According to the Interim Narrative Report, the efficiency of SEIS is above compliance in relation to the achievements made in 2012:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Skills Training: Target 1600 Achievement: 1635; 4000 youths for the duration of 2011 - 2013; • Women participation (%): Target : 40 Achievement: 45 - Above compliance ; • Disadvantaged Group's participation (%): Target : 80; Achievement: 85 - Above compliance; • Skill test appear (out of a total of 1635 trainees) (%): Target: 90 - Achievement: 99; • Skill test pass (out of 1617 skill test entrants) (%): Target: 80 - Achievement: 93.56 - Above compliance. 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Coherence: A <p>The programme is fully coherent with the objectives of the initiative. It is also coherent with UN policies and specifically with the Millennium Development Goals, as one of its objectives deals with the need to improve the provision of health services with a central focus on the MDGs (namely: reducing child mortality, improving maternal and child health, and addressing socially significant diseases, in particular HIV/AIDS and TB). This alignment of policy priorities and a harmonisation of efforts suggest that coherence is present.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of the Design: B <p>The literature reviewed (mainly of the Description of the Action and the SEIS website) suggests that the project design matches the complexity of the actions undertaken, as well as being in line with the addressed objectives.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Impact: B <p>SEIS has been emphasising the creation, practice and establishment of processes, systems and for a relating to the TEVT sector at local level. The creation of such a system and forums are helpful in improving TEVT services at local level. The practice of DERF, PDRM, the establishment and mobilisation of MEDF and implementing skills training through local service providers are</p>	

some of the clear examples of practices initiated at the local level. The holding of policy feedback meetings on TEVT sectors, press meetings, a thematic study on many important skills training related areas as well as documentation of many case studies have been completed successfully. The project has been able to ensure a local contribution into MEDF. Along with District Development Committee (DDCs), Chambers of Commerce and Industry and Municipalities have also made their contribution to the MEDF fund. The task of carrying out the income verification of the 2011 skills graduates was completed in April 2012. The results revealed that 1387 graduates (87.5%) of graduates out of 1584 completed the training and they have been placed in gainful employment; among these, 36.04% are in self-enterprises and 63.95% are in wage employment. Interestingly, per capita average monthly income stood at NRs.5, 769.00 which surpassed the NRs. 4, 500 benchmark set for the project. As the project has chosen the strategy for partnering with local training employment service providers, it relatively consumed much time and efforts to coach and position the local service providers.

• **Sustainability: C**

A review of the project description and activities would suggest the potential sustainability of the action as long as continuous external support is received from donors (EU or NGOs) for the different activities.

4.3 Beneficiaries

Who benefited/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

Target country: Nepal: 8 districts located in Central, Mid- and Far-Western Tarai. Regions: a) Central Region: Parsa, Bara, Rautahat and Sarlahi; b) Mid-Western Region: Banke and Bardiya; c) Far-Western Region: Kailali and Kanchanpur.

Final beneficiaries: i) The family members of skills training graduates which are estimated at 24 000; ii) SKILL Nepal, the partner, iii) associate partners (training and employment service providers), concerned government bodies: local as well national iv) workers in the informal sector; v) informal sector entrepreneurs, who seek skilled workers; who gain access to labour market information; curricula and training methodologies; vi) Council for Technical Education and Vocational Training (CTEVT), vii) wider society in Nepal that is still affected by conflict and violence.

The target group of the action is the 4000 unemployed and underemployed women and men from the Disadvantaged Group (DAG), who receive skills training and are ensured linkages to employment. *Dalits* and *Janjatis*, (indigenous nationals) widows, people with disabilities, internally displaced people and victims of trafficking and ethnic minority groups make up at least 80% of the target group. At the same time, 40% of the beneficiaries of training should be women.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The Skills Development and Employment in the Informal Sector project in Nepal is funded by the European Union and implemented by HELVETAS Swiss Intercooperation Nepal in partnership with SKILL Nepal. Project implementation is being carried out in the Parsa, Bara, Rautahat and Sarlahi districts of central Nepal, Banke and Bardia districts of mid-western Nepal and Kailali and Kanchanpur districts of far-western Nepal. Other partners in the implementation are Training and Employment Service Providers, a district-based fund called Micro Enterprises Development Fund represented by the District Development Committee, municipalities, Chambers of Commerce and Cottage and Small Industries Offices.

The overall goal of the project is to contribute to lasting peace and economic prosperity in Nepal through effective skills training and employment of disadvantaged young women and men, mostly in the informal economy. The main objective of the programme is to contribute to lasting peace and economic prosperity in eight Tarai districts of Nepal. The project has been under implementation in all the eight districts since January 2011. In 2011, more than 1500 youths were trained, out of which more than 87% were gainfully employed earning more than NPR 31,000 in six months. Skills Development training was provided for more than 1600 youths in 2012.

6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to project "scalability"? What was the specific approach to capacity development that led to policy impact/changes?
<p>The concordance between the initial objectives, the activities performed and the achievement of the expected results can be identified as the key element of success for this project at this stage of implementation. In addition, the initial objectives outlined in the project description are technically feasible and achievable via project budget support. These are as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training curricula, training manuals and support packages demonstrate greater relevance to the needs of the market; • At least 80% of 4000 skill graduates have employment and an average income of USD 2 per day; • Training providers have a better understanding of the skills-related requirements of the informal sector; • Skilled graduates entering self-employment can establish and operate viable businesses; • Policy and procedures related to the TVET sector are influenced/improved through regular interaction among stakeholders; • A culture of review and learning will be integrated into the Action. 	
7. Lessons learnt	Please include any lessons learnt (regardless of whether these were envisaged at project inception).
<p>Despite the careful implementation of the project, the following unforeseen challenges have been faced:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Many of the skills (tasks) mentioned in the existing three months Occupational Skills Standard/ Occupational Profile (OSS/OP) of CTEVT have been found to be insufficient in fulfilling the employment requirements at local level. In this regard, the findings from RMA & suggestions from DERF have been of great assistance as in during the course of RMA/DERF, the respondents/participants suggested the additional skills to be incorporated into the training. Following these suggestions, the skills training course added the skills which were not covered by the OSS/OP and Curriculum; • The demand of skilled workers is high at local level, particularly in the construction sector. These include: masonry, electricity, iron works etc. Furthermore, it is challenging to enrol female youths onto these kinds of trades; • Although it is crucial to deliver the skill training via local trainers, identifying local human resources has been a time consuming and tedious process – particularly in identifying trainers with relevant market skills to facilitate the skills training; • A range of nationwide strikes and associate programmes organised during April and May 2012 by various groups in the far western region had an unfavourable effect on the skills testing schedule. 	
8. Implementing Partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
<p>Partner 1: SKILL-Nepal (EuropeAid ID number: NP-2020-EKP-1801735551). Nationality and date of establishment: Nepal, 1992; Legal status: Nepalese NGP. Partners 2: Helvetas: Swiss Association for International Cooperation (implemented by the Nepali branch).</p>	
9. Contacts	Provide contact details for further information, including telephone and e-mail.
<p>Delegation of the European Union to India: Head of Finance, Contract and Audit Section (FCAS) 65 Golf Links, New Delhi 110003 INDIA Mr. Shiva Pd. Aryal Country Programme Director Helvetas, P.O. Box 688, Kathmandu, Nepal Email: shiva.aryal@helvetasnepal.org.np SEIS/HELVETAS Swiss Intercooperation Nepal Pipara, Simara-1, Bara Tell: +977 53 520743 Fax: +977 53 520743 Email: seis@helvetas.org.np</p>	
10.Sources, links & publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs).

Logical framework.

Description of the Action.

Contract.

Contractual special conditions.

Other documents and links:

http://nepal.helvetas.org/en/our_projects/seis.cfm

[Web: www.seis.org.np](http://www.seis.org.np)

Skill Development and Employment for the Informal Sector (Seis) in Nepal Interim Narrative Report – 2012.

<http://www.ctevt.org.np/> Council for Technical Education and Vocational Training (CTEVT).

BANGLADESH

Project title: Technical and Vocational Education and Training for Young People in the Informal Economy in Bangladesh

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: A
3. Efficiency: A
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: B
7. Sustainability: B
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

Education in Bangladesh has three major phases: primary, secondary and higher. Primary education starts at the age of six with a five-year cycle while secondary education lasts seven years with three sub-stages: junior secondary (3 years) for ages 11-13 (grades 7-8), secondary (2 years) for ages 14-15 (grades 9-10) and higher secondary (2 years) for ages 16-17 years (grades 11-12). Secondary education has three main streams: general, technical-vocational and *madrasha*. Formal technical vocational education starts after grade 8 with a two-year course in basic skills. This can be followed by certificate-level courses or Secondary School Certificate Vocational courses (SSC Voc), which also require completion of grade 8. Successful completers can progress to Higher Secondary Certificate (HSC) General, HSC Vocational or an Engineering diploma of 4 years' duration (grade 12 plus 2). Institutions that offer SSC Voc courses include 500 secondary schools run by the Ministry of Education (MoE), 49 technical secondary schools under the Directorate of Technical Education (DTE) with an additional 26 under construction, 12 technical training centres (run by the DTE) and approximately 14,000 private training institutions. These are classified in four groups: (i) public, (ii) private (commercial), (iii) non-governmental organisation (NGO), and (iv) industry (managed by industrial associations and including on-the-job training). Formal TVET in Bangladesh consists of a choice of three programmes—basic, certificate, and diploma—with class (or grade) 8 completion a minimum entry qualification. Basic trade (basic skill standard certificate or national skills standard – Basic) is a 360-hour skills training course that focuses mainly on practical skills with some theory requiring class 8-level education. Various ministries manage the public institutions involved. The Directorate for Technical Education of the Ministry of Education (MoE) manages polytechnic and mono-technic institutes and technical schools and colleges; the Ministry of Labour manages technical training centres; the Ministry of Textiles manages vocational textile centres and the Ministry of Agriculture manages agricultural training institutes. In the case of industrial TVET, the majority of workers acquire their skills on the job. The majority (72%) of the firms have no training facilities and thus send their workers to external training organisations for upgrading as the need arises. Some employers' associations also have training establishments (centres of excellence) and NGOs also offer vocational education and training, while polytechnics under the DTE also offer post-secondary level diplomas. The formal TVET system has had minimal impact on the economy and on poverty reduction; of the total labour force in 2003, only 0.12% received technical training from the system.

1. ² CRIS decision number	A title refers to a project or programme (executed either by a Government, a single agency project or a joint programme).
2. Classification:	CRIS Decision number: ASIA/DCI-EDUC/2010/231125
e) By Sector/Thematic Area	TM – TVET access to target groups IE – Informal Economy IP: YES
f) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI: thematic programmes (investing in people IiP)
g) By region	Geographical programmes: Asia and Central Asia: BANGLADESH
h) By Period and Status	Decision year: 2010 Status: Ongoing (01/2011 + 36 months). Period: 01/2011-01/2014
3. Financial data	
Total EC amount Planned (Primary commitment): EUR 1 692 568 (80% of indicative programme).	

4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
<p>The goals of the project are to provide demand-driven and flexible TVET to the target population (women, young people and disadvantaged groups) in the informal economy with a view to securing their inclusion in formal employment. Thus the project aims to contribute to the establishment and rollout of a flexible and demand-driven Technical and Vocational Education and Training system in Bangladesh.</p> <p>The overall objective of the proposed project is to provide demand-driven and flexible TVET to 5000 young people in the informal economy through direct service delivery and strengthened TVET systems, thereby improving young people's employability and income-generating capacity in the informal economy in 7 divisional cities of Bangladesh.</p>	
4.1. Objective (statement of the problem)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<p>In a situation where nearly 51% of the labour force has no schooling, where only a small fraction (0.4%) has received vocational/technical/skills development training and where the informal sector accounts for 88% of the 47 million people employed in the total economy, a low employment rate of TVET graduates in productive trades is paradoxical.</p> <p>This situation reflects the low relevance of the current TVET system to the needs of the labour market. The main gaps concern the types of trades or occupations in which programmes are being offered; the competencies acquired compared with industry requirements, and skills for self-employment opportunities versus opportunities for practical experience among students and trainees. Employers contribute only minimally to the establishment of competency standards and to the development of curricula and of a testing and certification system. Several NGOs and private providers supply non-accredited, basic skills and training. There is thus extensive potential for engaging employers in the TVET system.</p>	
4.2. Result of the project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Please describe the results achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention).
<p>The Expected Results are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A participatory labour market survey and training needs assessment completed and results disseminated to a wide range of stakeholders; • Flexible, demand-driven and competency-based training curricula, teaching-learning materials and modules developed in 7 potential functional/trade areas; • 5000 young people from poor and underprivileged households have received training and have access to better jobs; • 5000 poor households have enhanced income as a result of the training and employment of 5000 young people; • Selected TVET institutions adapt their syllabus and curricula to the needs of the informal sector; • Demand-driven, flexible TVET programmes for the informal economy are recognised in the National TVET Policy; • An information management system (IMS) for the informal local labour market is developed in partnership with the government and private sector. 	
Grading: Overall analysis carried out against 8 criteria (to be applied flexibly)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3 main broad criteria: Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency • 5 additional criteria: Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevance: B <p>The project is relevant to the requirements of the Call for Proposals as well as to the national policy and development priorities of the non-formal skills development subsystem.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Effectiveness: A <p>The project conducted a preliminary stakeholder mapping and Training Needs Assessment and 9 existing curricula and training modules were updated with handbooks and taught at 10 training centres under the Implementing Partner (UCEP Bangladesh) with the involvement of the Directorate of Technical Education (DTE), the Bangladesh Technical Education Board (BTEB) and representatives of business and industries. According to the enrolment plan, between July 2011 and December 2012 about 3300 youths (of the planned 5000) completed the training programmes and the remaining 1852 learners (including 761 girls) were identified in accordance with selection criteria and enrolled in the</p>	

respective training. About 88% of the trainees were hired at the end of the programme and their income significantly increased. Moreover, the project increased the duration of the training programmes from 6 months to 1 year in order to achieve alignment of the certification with the NTVQF.

- **Efficiency: A**

The project's expected results have been achieved according to plan. Save the Children submitted an amendment request to the EU for a six-month no-cost extension with minor revisions made to Specific Objectives 2 and 3 as per the recommendations of the ROM report approved in March 2013. Continuing political unrest in Bangladesh throughout the reporting period has affected project implementation and some planned activities have been delayed and disrupted owing to staff as well as students being unable to travel to project areas. The continued *hartals* (strikes) and the threat of violence slowed down implementation. Partner NGOs adopted mitigation solutions e.g. running classes during weekends and holidays.

- **Coherence: B**

The Government of Bangladesh has now approved both the National Skills Development Policy and the National Technical Vocational Qualifications Framework (NTVQF). Save the Children and its partner NGO have been engaged in ILO initiatives under the EU-funded TVET reform project, which has provided technical assistance to BTEB in developing the qualifications framework via a competency-based curricular approach. The project team works in close coordination with ILO and other actors involved in TVET reforms through promoting the National Skills Development Policy (2011).

- **Quality of the Design: B**

The quality of the project design appears mostly satisfactory and some over-ambitious statements, such as those concerning the development of the TVET system for youth in the informal economy, have been modified into a more realistic formulation of TVET programmes.

- **Impact: B**

According to documentation received, the project works closely with ILO- and ADB (Asian Development Bank)-funded TVET interventions in the country and contributes to the development of curricula and a qualifications framework, modules and learning materials on TVET. The project also reinforces national activities aiming to update pedagogical materials and methods. The project's objective of exerting a durable impact on the technical aspects of TVET in the country cannot be measured, given the small scale of the intervention in relation to the high number of young people in Bangladesh who are in need of increased and improved skills. Dimensions such as the 'socioeconomic level' and the 'policy/institutional level' appear to be beyond the project's reach.

- **Sustainability: B**

The project has not created a sustainable scheme beyond the availability of external resources. Elements of sustainability can be identified in the coherence of activities with other TVET reforms currently being implemented in the country, together with the use of networking with local employers, the coordination of reputable implementing partners (UCEP) and the involvement of the national certifying and quality assurance body (BTEB) in the production of training materials.

- **Added value of ETF: NA**

Not applicable.

4.3. Beneficiaries

Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

The beneficiaries of the project total 5000 young people aged 15 and over (of which approximately 40% will be girls) who failed to complete grade 8 and who are working or will be working in the informal economy, in the 7 districts of the country with a particularly high concentration of workers in the said economy. 6 employers' and 6 workers' associations are potential stakeholders for capacity building on good workplace practices and the training of workers.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The project aimed to provide demand-driven and flexible TVET to young people in the informal economy and to strengthen existing TVET systems, thereby improving young people's employability and income-generating capacity in the informal economy in 7 districts of Bangladesh. The project aims also to provide demand-driven, flexible training to the informal sector in response to the overall concern consistently expressed by employers regarding the quality of TVET graduates. The approaches of the project support are: i) Direct service delivery; ii) Research, documentation of good practices and ongoing analysis of the demands of the informal labour market; and iii) Advocacy to support the

implementation of the National TVET Reform Policy.	
6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to project "scalability"? What was the specific approach to capacity development that led to policy impact/changes?
<p>The key elements of project success are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The utilisation of efficient and effective training partners, capable of managing the entire cycle from the point of identification of local economic opportunities; • The utilisation of eligible candidates in the 10 areas in which the training centres operate; • The adaptation of already well-prepared curricula; • The delivery of training courses; • Successful placement of the trainees; and • The conducting of follow-up studies after the training. 	
7. Lessons learnt	Please include any lessons learnt (regardless of whether these were envisaged at project inception).
<p>The project's impact benefits from strong links with the main EU Bangladesh Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) Reform project, funded by the EU and executed by the ILO with the support of the Government of Bangladesh. In addition the solid partnership with the UCEP produced an effective and efficient production cycle, from baseline study to the identification, training, placement and follow-up of the trainees.</p>	
8. Implementing partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
<p>The implementing partners of the project were Save the Children, the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Labour and Employment.</p>	
9. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail
<p>EU Delegation Bangladesh, Operations section. MoE: Building #6, Floor #17-18, Bangladesh Secretariat, Dhaka-1000, Bangladesh. Telephone: 7168711 MoL and Employment Directorate of Technical Education. F-4/B Agargaon Administrative Area, Sher-e Bangla Nagar, Dhaka-1207. Ph: 9110664 Fax: 9110671 e-mail: techedu09@gmail.com Save the Children. Michael McGrath Country Director Bangladesh. Country Office House: 10, Road: 137, Gulshan-1, Dhaka-1212, Bangladesh. Email: michael.mcgrath@savethechildren.org</p>	
10. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)
<p>AD-CTR952628_2_Description of the action.doc. GAP-Annex II - General Conditions.pdf. LFM-CTR952628_3_Logframe.xls. SC-CTR952628_1_Special Condition.pdf. SC+AB-CTR952628_5_Addendum 1.pdf. 1_First interim report final.doc. Interim Report Save the Children Bangladesh.</p>	

BANGLADESH

Project title: Skills for Unemployed and Underemployed Labour (SkillFUL): Promoting sustainable training in the informal economy for poverty reduction

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness A:
3. Efficiency: A
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: A
7. Sustainability: B
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

Education in Bangladesh has three major phases: primary, secondary and higher. Primary education starts at the age of six with a five-year cycle, while secondary education lasts seven years with 3 sub-stages: *junior secondary* (3 years) for ages 11-13 (grades 7-8); *secondary* (2 years) for ages 14-15 (grades 9-10) and *higher secondary* (2 years) for ages 16-17 (grades 11-12).

Secondary education has three major streams: General, technical-vocational and *madrasha*. Formal technical vocational education starts after grade 8 with a two-year course in basic skills. This can be followed by certificate-level courses or Secondary School Certificate Vocational courses (SSC Voc), which also require completion of grade 8. Successful completers progress to Higher Secondary Certificate (HSC) General, HSC Vocational or HSC Business Management.

Institutions that offer SSC Voc courses include 500 secondary schools run by the Ministry of Education (MoE), 64 vocational training institutes run by the Directorate of Technical Education (DTE), 12 technical training centres (run by the DTE) and approximately 14 000 private training institutions.

Management of the education system falls under two ministries: the Ministry of Primary and Mass Education and the Ministry of Education. Other ministries (e.g. the Ministry of Agriculture) also have their own training institutions for which they are responsible. The Ministry of Education (MoE) is responsible for secondary, vocational and tertiary education, the Ministry of Labour and Employment (MoLE) provides skills training through its technical centres, and non-governmental organisations (NGOs) also offer vocational education and training, although there are no figures available concerning the percentage of overall training that they provide. In addition polytechnics offer post-secondary level diplomas.

1. Identification CRIS decision number	CRIS Decision number/IIP code: DCI-EDUC/2010/231223
2. Classification:	
a) By Sector/Thematic Area	TM – TVET access to target groups IE – Informal Economy IP
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI: thematic programmes (investing in people IiP)
c) By region	Geographical programmes: Asia and Central Asia: BANGLADESH
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: 2010 Status: ONGOING
3. Financial data	

Total EC amount: EUR 1 466 345 (80 % of indicative programme)

4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
-------------------	-------------------------------------

The main goal of the project is to contribute to poverty reduction in Bangladesh through securing employability in the informal economy of the poorest populations via improvement of their skills. Emphasis is placed on:

- Workers' access to the formal system of technical and vocational training;
- Recognition and certification of skills and knowledge in the informal economy;
- Programmes to enhance the capacity of women, people with disabilities, people from disadvantaged communities etc.

The specific objective of the project is to 'improve opportunities for sustainable income generation for

the labour force in the informal economy'. Project strategies towards accomplishing the specific objective included:

- Ensuring the effective participation of relevant stakeholders in project activities from design to implementation;
- Developing and implementing flexible, relevant and affordable training;
- Developing certification and recognition of the training;
- Promoting an employment information system (job placement, self-employment and continuous career development).

4.1. Objective (statement of the problem)

- What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?

Bangladesh has a labour force of about 49.5 million people working in both the formal and the informal sectors:

- About 88% of workers are employed in the informal economy;
- The highest concentration of workers in the informal economy is found in the rural areas (92%) with most of them working in the agricultural sector;
- Around 40% of the total labour force in Bangladesh lacks any form of education and possesses little or no skills.

4.2. Result of the project

- Please describe the results achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention).

Expected Result 1: Informal economy stakeholders and TVET institutions in project areas are able to cooperate and contribute effectively to the development of an approach that addresses the current gaps in skills-related and training needs among informal economy workers. The yearly plan of operations for the year 2012-2013 was prepared based on the integrated logical framework of the project.

Assessment and upgrading of infrastructure, tools and equipment of 22 Training Service Providers (TSPs) in all six districts was conducted (under Output 1.4). 13 networking and awareness-raising meetings were organised for TSPs, enterprises and associations in the project districts at which to discuss skills development and the project's goals and objectives. The project also organised a 'Skills Fair' event in Dhaka which was attended by TSPs, industries, Government agencies, NGOs and other stakeholders. Progress review and information-sharing programmes between partner TSPs and the project have been organised (under Output 1.5). A study on 'Assessment of Financing Options for Sustainable Financing Models in Skills Development' has been completed and the final report is available. In addition the project organised a round table conference for TSPs, trainees and graduates at which the findings of the study were disseminated among the stakeholders. 4 TSPs in Kurigram have taken out loans from banks and non-bank financial institutions to improve their training facilities.

Expected Result 2: Flexible, affordable and effective trainings that respond to informal labour market demand as per the learning capacity and types of informal workers are in place.

A total of 200 potential TSPs were assessed in all six project districts by means of examining their profiles and conducting field visits throughout the reporting period. A general profile of 70 TSPs has been documented and 42 of them were shortlisted to submit project proposals as likely project partners. 4 orientation and capacity development programmes (each entitled 'Skills Training Programme – A Sustainable Approach') were conducted for the shortlisted TSPs. SkillFUL's proposal template and guideline entitled 'Winning Project Proposals' were also discussed during this programme. A number of capacity-building events were conducted benefiting 240 participants from present and potential partner TSPs. Themes were as follows: Financial Management and Procurement, Business Proposal Writing, Marketing Plans and Sales Strategy, Disaster Risk Reduction for TSPs and Stakeholders, Monitoring & Evaluation, Entrepreneurship Development, and Gender Mainstreaming.

Expected Result 3: Recognition and certification systems that attempt to link informal to formal training are in place.

Basic instructional skills training were provided to 129 instructors (of which it is unknown how many were female) from partner and other TSPs in Dhaka, Kurigram, Jessore, Bogra and Sunamganj. Training programmes in 'Competency-Based Learning Materials Development and Delivery' and 'Master Trainer Training' were conducted in Dhaka for 90 participants from partner and other TSPs, industries and Government institutions. 6 Master Trainer Training manuals on 'Developing Competency-Based Training and Learning Materials', 'Delivering Competency-Based Training', 'Conducting Workplace-

Based Training', 'Assessing Competency-Based Training', 'Training Needs Assessment' and 'Organising Competency-Based Training' were developed. In order to understand the requirements of the private and public sectors as regards testing and certification systems, five meetings were held between the project and relevant stakeholders such as the Bangladesh Technical Education Board, (BTEB), Bureau of Manpower, Employment and Training (BMET), Institute of Technology, Engineering and Technological Services (MAWTS) and Gas Transmission Company Limited (GTCL). One meeting was held with the Bangladesh Engineering Industry Owners' Association (BEIOA) at which the possibility was discussed of installing a certification system within the light engineering sector. Three meetings were attended together with other skills development projects funded by the EU (2 of which were coordinated by the EU with the third taking place at the TVET Reform Project office) in order to identify possible means of linking certification for informal/non-formal training with the NTVQF (National Technical and Vocational Qualifications Framework). A literature review of the testing and certification systems of Nepal and Sri Lanka was conducted, along with a survey entitled 'Exploration of skills testing and certification options for private training provision and its linkage to the public TVET system in Bangladesh'. The study findings were disseminated at a workshop entitled 'Panel Discussion on Skills Testing and Certification: Options and Opportunities'. During the next reporting phase, the application of suggested models will be further investigated and the selected model tested.

Expected Result 4: Target groups in project areas benefit from diversified, accessible training opportunities delivered by training and outreach centres.

Four orientation programmes were conducted to familiarise 7 TSPs with SkillFUL's Competency-Based Training (CBT) training packages and TIG and another four programmes were delivered on competency-based training packages in Dhaka, Sunamganj, Jessore and Bogra. New contracts have been signed with 16 TSPs (11 private organisations and 5 NGOs) and five contracts (4 private organisations and 1 NGO) were also renewed with existing partner TSPs. The project facilitated enrolment of trainees through organising awareness-raising campaigns, workshops and other promotional activities in 6 districts: Dhaka, Jessore, Bogra, Sunamganj, Kurigram and Nilphamari. A total of 7629 trainees were enrolled by the TSPs. Five TSPs have also enrolled DAPs. The provision of additional centre-based training at flexible times (mornings, evenings and weekend classes, etc.) is proposed to make training more accessible to the target group. Training through outreach centres has been conducted in Dhaka, Kurigram, Nilphamari and Bogra. Primary assessment shows that almost 85% of working people now have access to flexible skills training conducted through outreach centres. A training centre established by a leading industry (namely the Akhtar Furniture Academy) operates by providing skills training in the furniture sector. The project is also testing a voucher scheme with the aim of providing additional access to skills training and of scaling up training services. Five TSPs have been contracted to provide training for voucher holders. The slum-based organisation Nagar Daridra Basteeshashir Unnayan Sangstha (NDBUS) selects and registers applicants and distributes the vouchers through four of its slum-based centres. Three orientation meetings were held with voucher stakeholders (TSPs, campaign agencies and VIDCs). So far, around 121 vouchers have been distributed among the target group and 20 trainees have enrolled in different trades. Of the total 7629 enrolled, 5264 (70%) trainees are female and 42 are DAPs. A total of 5,382 trainees have successfully graduated and 4575 (85%) have secured employment during this reporting period.

Expected Result 5: Employment support services attuned to the needs of both project areas are in use by the beneficiaries including job placement support, business start-ups, and improved local informal labour market information.

Potential partners for the implementation of an LMIS for blue-collar jobs have been identified. However, some major hurdles (agreements, budget) will need to be cleared during the coming year in order to achieve progress (under Output 5.1). An assessment was conducted of the existing Placement, Counselling and Marketing (PCM) functions at TSPs and their specific needs for support in these areas. The capacity of TSPs will be developed to make the PCM units of selected TSPs operational during the coming year (under Output 5.2). An assessment of Financing Options for Sustainable Financing Models in Skills Development was completed, the final report is available and the findings of the study were disseminated to stakeholders at a round-table workshop. As a result of this intervention four TSPs in Kurigram have already received loans from the Agrani Bank, the Rupali Bank and Solidarity International. The project has also signed an MoU with TMSS offering micro-credits to graduates for business start-up (under Output 5.3).

Expected Result 6: A scale-up model for wider dissemination is developed.

In order to ensure that project progress is properly captured, documented and communicated, an MRM Toolkit (which includes the development and maintenance of project result chains) has been developed and made operational. A tracer study has been commissioned which will provide essential information for the first batches of graduates about important indicators such as employment, income, livelihood, usefulness of training and others (under Output 6.1). A study on 'Evaluating the Potential of the Franchise Model: A Way Forward for Scaling up SkillFUL' was conducted in order to explore feasible options for scaling up the training services provided by SkillFUL. Application of the proposed models will require further investigation during the next reporting phase (under Output 6.2).

A marketable skills assessment of the informal economy was conducted in the four new project districts and the report made available (under Output 2.1). A 'Sector Brief' report was developed via an assessment of market trends, opportunities and constraints and a training needs analysis was conducted of the nationwide target group across the different sectors. RTNAs of workers in the light engineering and furniture sectors were conducted and reports made available. A comprehensive sector assessment study was also undertaken in order to identify the gaps in skills and training needs of workers engaged in retail chain stores in Dhaka. Appropriate skills training courses will be designed to address the skills-related needs of this nascent sector based on the findings of the study conducted under Output 2.2.

30 occupations for which flexible training packages could be developed were identified and 13 Rapid Job Analysis workshops conducted for developing 16 CBT curriculum guides in 16 occupations. 16 CBT manuals were developed and a total 6 Master Trainer Training manuals (on 'Developing Competency-Based Training and Learning Materials', 'Delivering Competency-Based Training', 'Conducting Workplace-Based Training', 'Assessing Competency-Based Training', 'Training Needs Assessment' and 'Organising Competency-Based Training' were developed (under Output 2.3).

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against 8 criteria (to be applied flexibly)

- 3 main broad criteria: **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability and Added value of ETF**

• **Relevance: B**

The acceptance of the National Qualification Framework as per the National Skills Development Policy (NSDP) 2011 is a major political achievement toward ensuring transparency, accountability and clear market orientation in the national Technical Education and Vocational Training (TVET) sector. By defining the criteria for accreditation and certification, the NSDP has amplified the already existing need for capacity development on all levels. There is an indication that the absorptive capacity of the system is already strained to its limit. All major TVET projects lag behind schedule and development over time will most likely produce compromises in standards to accommodate realities.

SkillFUL rooted its activities from very outset with training service providers (TSPs) in the district centres and with the communities in their catchment areas in order to provide affordable, accessible and flexible training conducive to employment. The project's bottom - up approach has the potential to link the slow - working, top - down approach with the reality of poor communities and their informal economies.

• **Effectiveness: A**

Looking ahead and in the light of the successful achievement of all criteria, project effectiveness is understood to have been achieved, in its majority if not fully.

• **Efficiency: A**

Due the nature of the project design, (holistic intervention approach), an approach focused both on efficiency and sustainability is inherent to the project, and the methodology and strategies are aimed at meeting these objectives.

• **Coherence: B**

The project is in line with donor trends in Bangladesh and also addresses the cross-cutting EU equity priorities of inclusivity, poverty reduction and gender. The project design is equally coherent with the EU's TVET policy and is both internally coherent and convergent with the Bangladeshi system policy and coordination mechanisms. Therefore the project itself has high potential for synergy and thus for the generation of coordination mechanisms.

• **Quality of the Design: B**

The design of the project proposal has been assessed by means of indirect sources as the project proposal itself was not available for this assessment exercise. Thus a detailed project description (that

summarised the project proposal itself) and collateral project documentation were used for this assessment.

The application form seems to strongly support the structuring of the design of the project. In this sense it is not an exclusive achievement of the project itself, but the form as well, which has played an important role.

The project design approach is excellent (A rated) due to its holistic nature, although it would be more appropriate to rate it as merely correct (B) because of the confusion of (relevant) terms and concepts, and also because the monitoring (inherent part of the project cycle) appears to be, if not absent, difficult to perceive, and could be affecting the materialization of concrete expected results as for instance in the expected result number 6 'Scale up model for wider dissemination is developed'.

• **Impact: A**

The project is still being implemented and therefore the assessment carried out has had its limitations. Nevertheless, it is revealed that the impact is expected to be outstanding and will therefore surpass the expectations raised during the initial phases defined as "design and application". Most of the expected results had already been partially achieved by the middle of the project's implementation.

• **Sustainability: B**

The holistic approach that is intrinsic to the project's design has been taken into account when assessing the sustainability of the project. The project aims to generate sustainable impact through the creation of mechanisms, which will allow for continuity of action, replication and scaling up of impact while taking the necessary measures to mitigate the risks associated with the project. These are described in further detail below.

• **Added value of ETF: NA**

Not applicable (as this is not a project in which ETF intervenes either directly or indirectly).

4.3. Beneficiaries

Who benefited/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

The final beneficiaries of the project (by target group) are:

The 5000-strong labour force in the informal economy (with a focus on women, youths and the disabled), urban poor in Dhaka (including in slums) and the rural poor in Kurigram.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The SkillFUL project focuses on improving the earning capacity of the labour force in the informal economy. To this end, it encourages the participation of training providers, businesses and industries, government organisations, local authorities, community leaders, professionals in skills development and local elites in all stages of marketable skills training programmes from design to evaluation. The primary concern and focus of the project is on the need to build the careers of those trained by providing them with relevant skills training and offering post-training support services. The project's working areas include Dhaka, Kurigram, Bogra, Sunamganj, Nilphamari and Jessore. Swisscontact is implementing the SkillFUL project in collaboration with the Centre for Mass Education in Science (CMES), a non-profit organisation. The project is funded by the European Union and the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation.

Strategies: The project aims to facilitate vocational training that is flexible, needs-based and characterised by the provision of affordable courses of short duration at convenient locations through public and private training providers. The involvement of relevant stakeholders from both the formal technical vocational education and training institutions and the informal economy in the development of the training courses will strengthen their linkages as well as ensuring the labour market orientation of the training programmes. Furthermore, adequate employment support will address the existing gaps between the informal and formal systems and will provide useful insight into the most relevant professional skills and possible areas of improvement. The employment support to be provided includes job counselling, placements, internships, advocacy and assistance in self-employment.

Major project activities include:

- Strengthening the capacity of service providers;
- Supporting the development of relevant training for the labour force in the informal economy;
- Promoting better information systems for use by the labour market;
- Facilitating the provision of training programmes to selected target groups as per needs assessed;
- Supporting qualifications, testing and certification of those trained;
- Facilitating job placement services and the provision of continuous career development services;
- Facilitating linkage of trainees and training providers with financial institutions;

- Organising workshops, seminars and policy dialogue; and
- Produce publications to promote the exchange of good practices.

The Project began implementation in March 2011 and will continue until 2014. It is expected that by the end of 2014, 20,000 young people will have benefited as a result of the interventions.

A significant number of trainees from the target group completed skills training and successfully secured employment in a variety of occupations in both formal and informal industries. The TSPs under the project upgraded their training infrastructure and delivery, thus enabling them to provide training as per the needs of the labour market. Increased levels of employment among graduates resulted in significant improvements to their income and livelihoods. Trainers of partner and other invited TSPs and industries have enriched their expertise in quality skills training through learning how to develop curriculum guides, training manuals and learning materials for CBT. These additional trainers and industry experts are not only important for project implementation but will also contribute effectively to skills development in the future.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to project “scalability”?
What was the specific approach to capacity development that led to policy impact/changes?

Of particular note are the holistic approach, methodology and intervention model with a remarkable flexibility in its implementation that characterise this project.

The core activity, that of skills development in the informal sector, has proven to have been appropriately planned through:

- A comprehensive technical methodology capable of adapting itself to the previously identified needs and skill levels of a specific population group;
- The development, implementation and evaluation of pathways in close collaboration with beneficiaries and in direct partnership with relevant economic and professional organisations as well with the public and private providers best suited to implementing them (where applicable);
- Identifying, strengthening and improving existing education and training actions organised by informal actors themselves (prior to designing and developing new means of acquiring external knowledge and skills);
- Ensuring the integration of skills development for young people and adults in the informal economy;
- Proposing measures to increase the skill level of young people and adults in the informal sector, taking into account the fact that the sector is not a homogeneous entity.

Furthermore, the project has proven to be a flexible intervention and vehicle of connection (within the Education and Labour systems) that is capable of:

- Examining current schemes and projects for the informal sector (with the ability to meet the knowledge- and skills-related needs of those who work in it);
- Drawing up a list of the most appropriate education and training measures (for boosting social and human development among actors in the sector) that progressively enable beneficiaries to increase their income while reducing the insecurity of their work and jobs.

7. Lessons learnt

Please include any lessons learnt (regardless of whether these were envisaged at project inception).

This project has proven to be a source of lessons learnt influencing the country’s education and training policies as follows:

- Skills development for young people and adults in the informal sector should be integrated into a comprehensive approach that places lifelong education and training at the heart of reforms and does not treat it as a separate aspect of the education and training policies of Bangladesh;
- Actors in the informal economy will participate more readily in the tax and social security process if their knowledge and skills are subject to professional recognition and nationally awarded certificates. This process bridges the gap between the two systemic structures (education and labour).

8. Implementing partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

The received documentation shows how ‘implementation partners’ are conceptually mixed with ‘Implementing bodies’, which makes it difficult to review the information provided by the beneficiary. However the following can be defined:

Swisscontact and local NGOs are the implementing partners, and it is foreseen that they will work with qualification authorities as the Bangladesh Technical Education Board (BTEB), the Bureau of Manpower

Employment and Training (BMET) and the Executive Committee of the National Skills Development Commission (ECNSDC).

The abovementioned institutions should not be considered as implementing partners but rather as *reference agents* who must be informed, consulted (involved) on the action and engaged in the expansion of its potential political influence, including through the increasing of project visibility (currently it is neither visible outside its area of influence nor accessible to the wider public).

The project literature also envisages and mentions initial networking activities with financial institutions for providing information and further financial support to trainees beyond project closure.

Lastly, it should be noted that financial institutions are not detailed but only mentioned. Similarly to the institutions mentioned above, financing institutions should not be considered as implementing partners but rather as future supporters of the action (where they fund trainees). Thus, they are considered principal actors (not partners) in a continuous holistic process.

9. Contacts:

Provide contact details for further information, including telephone and e-mail.

Devi Prasad Dahal
Project Manager, SkillFUL
Swisscontact
Phone [+88 02 988 26 63](tel:+88029882663)
Mobile [+88 017 30438542](tel:+8801730438542); [+88 01928919927](tel:+8801928919927)
devi.dahal@swisscontact.org.bd

10. Sources, links and publications

Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs).

AD-Annex I - Description of the Action.docx.
SC-CTR904272_1_Special.
231223_Bangladesh_interim1.doc.
231223_Bangladesh_interim2.doc.
130328 SkillFUL Midterm Review with Executive.
NATIONAL SKILLS DEVELOPMENT POLICY – 2011. Ministry of Education Government of Peoples Republic of Bangladesh. Dhaka, Bangladesh.
<http://www.swisscontact.org.bd/inner.php?Title=35>.

MULTI-COUNTRY (BENIN, GHANA, MALI, MOZAMBIQUE, CAMBODIA, NEPAL, VIETNAM)
Project title: High-impact Tourism Training for Jobs & Income (HITT)

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: B
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: B
7. Sustainability: C
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

Benin: TVET in Benin is fragmented and has been administered through four departments since 2011:

- Ministère des Enseignement Maternel et Primaire (MEMP);
- Ministry of Higher Education and Scientific Research (MHESR);
- Ministry of Culture, Literacy, Handicrafts and Tourism (MCAAT).
- Ministry of Secondary, Technical and Vocational Training, Retraining and Youth Integration (MESFTP IRfJ); In particular: the Directorate of Technical Education (DET) is responsible for management supervision of public and private technical schools and the design, control, implementation and control of the state policy in the field of technical education; the Directorate of Training and Professional Qualifications (DFQP) is the counterpart of the DET for training, specialisation, qualification and preparation for working life. Its scope covers Craft Centres (CM), Vocational Training Centres (PSC), Units of Production and Development (UPP) and all public, semi-public and private organisations that invest in both formal and non-formal training.;

In addition to these departments, the Ministry of Labour and Public Service manages the Centre for Advanced Personal Business (SBP); the Ministry of Development, Economy and Finance manages the School of Executive Education Treasury (EFCT), the School of Professional Training of Central Finance Administration and the School of Executive Education taxes; the Ministry of Mines, Energy and Water has the Staff Training Centre of the Benin Electric Power Corporation under its supervision. Private operators have become predominant in the sector since the end of the Marxist regime (1989).

Ghana: TVET in Ghana is provided through the Ministry of Education (MoE) and the Ministry of Employment and Social Welfare (MoESW): A 2006 Act established the legal framework for TVET and the authority coordinating and overseeing all of its aspects: the Council for Technical and Vocational Education and Training. COTVET has formed industry advisory, qualifications, quality assurance, and traditional apprenticeship committees. The Council formulates national policies on skills development (pre-tertiary, tertiary and informal), whereas the different ministries are responsible for implementation within their respective TVET institutions. The overall goals of the COTVET are to ensure that the unemployed (particularly youths) receive employable and entrepreneurial skills within the formal and informal sectors. The Ministry of Education coordinates the Technical and Vocational Education Division (TVED) responsible for the implementation and monitoring of the 26 public pre-tertiary TVET Technical Training Institutes (TTIs), curricula development and review, programme development, testing and certification. TVED oversees private providers offering the TTI programmes. Finally the Ministry of Employment and Social Welfare operates the National Vocational Training Institute (NVTI) with a coordination mandate of 37 vocational training centres, providing demand-driven employable skills and enhancing the income generating capacities of basic and secondary school leavers. It also provides competency-based apprenticeships, master craftsmanship training, testing and certification and career guidance.

Mozambique: The National System of Education (NSE) was introduced in 1983 as enshrined in Law n°4/83 of 23 May and integrated into the framework of social, political, and economic changes initiated in 1975 (the year of national independence). The structure of the NSE integrates pre-school education (children under 6 in kindergartens and nurseries), school education (general, technical-professional, higher education and special modalities) and extra-school education (literacy and the upgrading of skills). School education includes general education (primary and secondary) that provides integral and polytechnic training and whose objectives include access to education based on the integral development of the individual; technical-professional education provides professional training of the

workforce and higher education ensures the high-level training of human resources and of specialists in different knowledge areas.

Nepal The New Development Agenda focuses on democracy; peace; human rights, poverty; environmentally sustainable development, renewable energy, food security health and education. TVET in Nepal focus on learning, gender equality, access, quality of skills and adaptability to the market; governance. The core objective of the Nepalese TVET is to produce the basic and medium-level technical human resources needed for the country's development. Nepal's school system comprises five years of primary education (Grades 1 to 5 for ages 6-10); three years of lower secondary education (Grades 6 to 8), two years of secondary education (Grades 9 to 10), two years of higher secondary education (Grades 11 to 12), three years for a Bachelor's degree and two years for a Master's degree. There are four types of technical and vocational schools: i) technical institutes for training technical instructors, ii) community development centres, iii) trade schools and iv) annex schools. The organisational structure of the Ministry of Education and Sports (MOES) devolves roles and responsibilities from central to district level. The aims for the Nepalese non-formal education are: to increase the literacy rate among adults, ensure basic literacy and technical skills; to children deprived of school education through non-formal alternative schooling programmes. These programmes are offered by organisations providing informal education community study centres expected to increase the offer of continual and functional education.

The Council for Technical Education and Vocational Training (CTEVT) was constituted in 1989 as the national autonomous apex body responsible for skilled human resources. It is mainly involved in policy formulation, quality control, competency-based curriculum development, occupational skill standards, skills testing, research studies and training needs assessment. CTEVT is also a training provider through its technical schools and training centres, affiliated technical colleges and institutes offering proficiency/diploma level, technical school leaving certificate and short-term vocational and skill training. The TEVT long-term programmes are provided at Vocational Training Centres, Technical Education Schools which also supply TVET short-term programmes. Curricula have been developed at Diploma/Certificate level; Technical School Leaving Certificate (TSLC) Level; Technical and Vocational Training; Technical Secondary Education.

Vietnam: The TVET system is under the responsibility of: Ministry Education (MOET) for secondary technical and vocational education and of the Ministry of Labour (MOLISA) for vocational training. At local level, TVET it is under the supervision of the local authorities. The Secondary Technical and Vocational Education Department (STVED) of MOET takes responsibility for national policies, strategic plans, management regulations, planning the TVET institution system, re-training teachers, management of the core curricula of different trades and the NQF. TVET programmes include: short-term vocational training/re-training for unemployed and for employed individuals seeking for a a certificate; the 1 to 3 year programmes for students who graduate from lower or upper secondary education to obtain a vocational certificate as skilled workers; the 2 to 3 year vocational and technical education programmes combining general and technical education and leading to a diploma that enables enrolment in higher education. TVET modalities include: formal, informal, continuous and in-service training. Eligible providers are public, semi-public, and private institutions.

1. Identification:	254084
2. Classification:	
a) By Sector/Thematic Area	TM-TVET access to target groups ST-Sectoral Training: IE- Informal Economy IP:
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI thematic programmes (Investing in People (IiP)):
c) By egion/Geographical Zone (Country or Region)	Geographical programmes: Asia:
d) By Period and Status	Decision year (2011-2014): 2010 Status: ONGOING
3. Financial data	
Total EC amount: EUR 1 996 337: (80% of the estimated total eligible cost of indicative programme)	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?

This project is a multidimensional undertaking. The HITT project aims at the development of the tourism sector in seven developing countries (Benin, Ghana, Mali, Mozambique in Africa and Cambodia, Nepal and Vietnam in Asia) through TVET programmes for vulnerable groups and local informal workers. The objectives of the HITT project is to provide adapted and relevant training courses to informal workers in the tourism sector resulting in a virtuous circle of better qualifications and skills, better services provided, a higher number of clients, an income increase for informal workers as well as job creation in the sector.

4.1 Objective (problem statement) What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?

Tourism worldwide has seen a constant rise in its development over the past 25 years and has become an increasingly important source of foreign currency for LDCs. Lack of awareness and appropriate skills are the main factors inhibiting people to access job opportunities. Limited access to skills opportunities, higher quality and better adaptation of training programmes and courses, insufficient training facilities and out-dated approaches for practical training can be overcome through partnerships between governments, industries and development partners promoting and developing a tourism in remote and less developed areas of countries. The Benin skills forecast for 2019 identifies about 37 000 new jobs related to tourism alone. In Vietnam, a forecast of about 400 000 jobs applies for the same period. The four major tourism sub-sectors of non-formal employment in accommodation and restaurants; informal traders; handicraft production, sales and excursions and guides in the 7 selected countries need to be surveyed, training needs analyses carried out and existing training opportunities mapped and disseminated. The response of the project is a core training programme, adapted to the national specificities, integrated with mentoring and follow-up services for job placements and self-employment income generation.

4.2 Results of the project Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)

By grouping several countries under the same umbrella project, the two main expected results are:

- the informal economy on tourism mapped;
- skills and employment barriers and opportunities for informal workers identified; data gathered and analysis disseminated to stakeholders and decision makers;
- links between informal and formal tourism sectors and training providers and tourism business communities established;
- job profiles identified, curricula developed and tourism training programme designed in 7 LICs;
- VT institutions' capacity to outreach target communities, strengthened;
- 8000 job seekers trained;
- sustainable training system to ensure post-project continuity developed; tools material methodologies and lessons learned documented and disseminated for national and international further support and scaling up.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against 8 criteria (to be applied flexibly) 3 main broad criteria: **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability and Added value of ETF**

• **Relevance: A**

The project appears well balanced with EU trends in certification processes and harmonisation strategies that aim to increase access to jobs and improve sector productivity by facilitating labour mobility and the matching of jobs to candidates. Progress made by the project toward the socioeconomic empowerment of informal workers in the tourism sector in the seven countries has been classified as 'relevant' by the mid-term evaluation, which applied the following evaluation questions when measuring project relevance: 'Are the approaches, strategies and training materials developed and implemented by HITT relevant to country needs? Does the project deal with the priorities and skill-building needs and constraints of the target group in each country?'

• **Effectiveness: B**

The effectiveness achieved appears to be in line with the initial project design (which could not be reviewed, although the following is mentioned in the reviewed *résumé analytique* (analytical summary):

'La méthodologie du projet affiche une certaine efficacité, étant donné que toutes les équipes pays ont

produit un rapport de préparation du projet pertinent vis-à-vis des objectifs du projet. Avec des simplifications et des adaptations, la méthodologie pourrait s'appliquer non seulement à des projets dans le secteur du tourisme, mais aussi à d'autres secteurs de l'économie. Les remarques suivantes ont pour but de mettre en évidence des bonnes pratiques extraites des cas par pays pour améliorer le projet'.

The present assessor thus rates the project's effectiveness as 'B', in line with the ratings expressed in the mid-term evaluation of the following criteria:

'Have the planned results and activities been achieved? Why or why not? Is the intervention logic correct? Do the activities implemented contribute to the programme purpose (target beneficiaries are increasing their income and employability, using enhanced skills, offering market-orientated products and services and increasing their productivity and professionalism)?'

- **Efficiency: B**

A review of implementation reveals project results to be both efficient and contextually appropriate. Efficiency was also assessed according to the evaluation questions asked during the MTE: 'Were inputs (time and resources) used in the best possible way to achieve outcomes, results and targets? Why or why not? What could be done differently to improve the implementation of HITT in the future, thereby maximising impact at an acceptable and sustainable cost?'

- **Coherence: B**

The project is in line with the main EU policies on TVET and the Call for Proposals under which the project was awarded.

This can be observed below:

'Un autre résultat important de la phase de préparation concerne l'identification des processus nationaux de certification. A cet égard, les caractéristiques des formations dispensées par le projet doivent être soulignées ici: formations courtes, pratiques et prenant en compte les besoins du marché. Les conséquences de ces caractéristiques (adoptées parce qu'elles répondent aux besoins des travailleurs informels) entraînent souvent des différences avec le système habituel de certification basé sur des programmes de formation longs.'

- **Quality of the Design: B**

While the project design itself could not be reviewed, the rationale and background analysis and related methodology set a solid ground for the implementation of the project; it appears to be articulate, well thought-out and planned in detail, thus revealing a solid and structured project design.

- **Impact: B**

No applicable information was available based on which to assess this criterion, as the project is still ongoing. However, the results achieved to date are in line with the expected initial outcomes, as can be seen below:

'La mise en place du projet a été conçue par HITT sur la base d'une méthodologie solide préparant bien les phases successives. La formation de comités de partenaires fait partie intégrante de la phase de préparation du projet étant donné qu'ils jouent un rôle stratégique dans sa mise en place, même si son rôle va au-delà de cette phase'.

Predicted project impact is based on criteria established by the *Assessment of projects selected by Calls for Proposals targeting the informal economy*, published by the European Commission at:

<http://capacity4dev.ec.europa.eu/public-employment-social-protection/document/final-report>.

- **Sustainability: B**

The project needs to generate multiple synergies likely to achieve sustainable and timely execution like: access to a certification process for the provided short training; the inclusion of project activities in the National Training Policy or promoting a national training policy in the target countries; access to public funding agency and the collaboration with other projects. However, due to the nature of the action, it is envisaged that this project will require further grants for continuity and replicability. As expressed in the MTE, the sustainability of the project is dependent on its 'capacity...to generate sustainable links between the formal and informal economies. Improvements due to the project are expected to last in the long term after its end and the project should also generate potential for a multiplier or development effect.' The evaluation questions that addressed this point are: 'Will there be continued positive impacts as a result of the development initiative once it has finished? Why or why not? What is the capacity of the HITT interventions to have a multiplier and development effect? Can the approach and tools developed be extrapolated from the tourism sector and utilised in other economic development sectors?'

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Added value of ETF: NA <p>Not applicable.</p>	
4.3 Beneficiaries	Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?
<p>The target groups identified by the project are: government authorities and development planners: private and public VT institutions and NGOs; unemployed, underemployed and disadvantaged groups including women, youth and under skilled adults; Tourism companies and associations. Final beneficiaries are the unskilled and semi-skilled informal workers, potential workers and informal micro and small enterprises, with focus on youth, women and all under skilled with limited access to TVET opportunities.</p>	
5. Synopsis	Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.
<p>Implementation began in February 2011. The three year High Impact Tourism Training (HITT) for the informal sector programme, is implemented in seven countries from Africa (Benin, Ghana, Mali and Mozambique) and Asia (Cambodia, Nepal, Vietnam). The High-impact Tourism and Training (HITT) for Jobs and Income programme aims to achieve a multi-country, interregional harmonisation of certification systems and curricula etc., in order to improve tourism training in such a way that the income of the sector, employees and jobseekers is increased.</p>	
6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to project "scalability"? What was the specific approach to capacity development that led to policy impact/changes?
<p>Scalability is being achieved by means the replicability of the actions. It is relevant in this case to consider the selection and distribution of the project partners. The mid-term evaluation mentions that: <i>'La formation d'un comité de pilotage comprenant les principaux intervenants dans le domaine de la formation professionnelle dans les secteurs du tourisme formel et informel est une activité importante de la phase préparatoire du projet.'</i> On the delivery aspect, the apprenticeship model based on the integration of short courses and training at the workplace appears as innovative and potentially replicable in other contexts and sectors of the informal economy.</p>	
7. Lessons learnt	Please include any lessons learnt (regardless of whether these were envisaged at project inception).
<p>No lessons learnt could be identified from the documentation reviewed, although it is considered relevant and innovative that in the early stages (during the identification of project partners) functions such as project sustainability, replicability and ownership were delegated to the programme partners. This can be observed here: <i>'Des fonctions de pérennisation du projet:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Faciliter l'accès aux processus de certification;</i> • <i>Faciliter l'inclusion des activités du projet dans la politique nationale de formation ou promouvoir cette politique nationale de formation;</i> • <i>Faciliter l'accès à une agence publique de financement (lorsqu'elle existe);</i> • <i>Faciliter la collaboration avec d'autres projets.'</i> 	
8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
<p>SNV Nepal and other local NGOs such as EWN (Empowering Women Nepal), TITI, REACH, CCBEN, etc. Provided examples are those of the USAID Global Sustainable Tourism Alliance in Mali, the Education for Income Generating programme in Nepal, the EC Environmentally and Socially Responsible Tourism Capacity Development Programme in Nepal and Vietnam Tourism Operating Standards.</p>	
9. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including telephone and e-mail.
<p>http://www.snvworld.org/en/countries/nepal</p>	
10. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs).
<p>Contract. Addendum (1, 2).</p>	

HITT Programme Résumé Analytique (French and English Versions).
Final mid-term evaluation report.

NICARAGUA

Project title: *Articulación del Sistema Nacional de Educación Técnica y Formación Profesional con las necesidades formativas de la Economía informal en Nicaragua*

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: A
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: A
7. Sustainability: C
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

The Nicaraguan education system consists of three subsystems: General, Primary and Secondary Education. The responsibility for its conduct and guidance is under the mandate of the Ministry of Education (MED). The Higher Education sub-system (is composed of universities and higher technical education -both public and private. The National Council of Universities (CNU) drives this sub-system. The National Technological Institute (INATEC) drives the Vocational Training sub-system, and it comprises programmes for Training levels (linked to the Education System): Basic Rural Technician, Medium Technician, and Technical Bac. Also there is TVET and SD with courses of Learning, Specialization etc.

INATEC is an autonomous state institution combining the functions of in-service training with the preparation of middle level technicians that was previously under the responsibility of the Ministry of Education. Educational programmes are financed with 2% of monthly payrolls paid by employers, national and international resource funds. INATEC has a board composed of the Ministry of Labor, Education, Economy and Development, Finance, and representatives of business, labor and private sectors.

To fulfill its functions and powers, INATEC has implementing units and fixed and mobile operation centers, schools, technological institutes and polytechnic education in the areas of agriculture, industry, forestry and administration and economics. For youth programmes, INATEC has 34 state schools.

In the field of Higher Technical Education, Nicaragua has several state and private institutions such as the Centre for Commercial Sciences, Polytechnic University of Nicaragua, Nicaragua Tech University and the Universidad Iberoamericana of Science and Technology among others.

1. Identification CRIS decision number	255169 DCI/EDUC/2010/255-169
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Area	TM -TVET access to target groups: IE- Informal Economy IP.
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI: thematic programmes (Investing in people IiP) 2009-2010 Call for Proposal: Developing TVET methodologies and services for the informal economy - 129198
c) By region	Geographic programmes: Latin America: NICARAGUA
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: 2010. 11/2010 (36months). CONTRACT 10/01/2011 Expected end by 2013 Status: Ongoing
3. Financial data	
EU Contribution: EUR 511 532.76 (equivalent to 80.00 % of the total eligible cost of the action: EUR 639 415.95)	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
The overall objective of the project is aimed at providing appropriate training opportunities to workers in the informal economy and the prospects of Nicaragua to improve access to employment,	

productivity and gains in capacity.
The project is committed to expanding opportunities for technical and vocational education as a means to access decent work and to enable the insertion of disadvantaged groups into economic and social spheres.

4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
--	---

Issues to address: Increase of the informal economy; disadvantaged groups, in particular youths and women excluded from education.

In Nicaragua, workers in the informal sector, which is composed of microentrepreneurs, vendors, independent professionals and contractors are estimated at 1.2 million. Sources (Central Bank and NGOs INIDE) estimate that the informal sector accounts for 77.4% of the economically active population and 61% of GDP. 52% of the population are women, accounting for 40.65% of the overall rate of economic participation (EAP/PET), and 46% of the economically active population. 78.5% of employed women are self-employed and work in the informal sector. 44.1% of companies have 1-2 employees. Women and men have found opportunities to create their own jobs. Given the complexity of the training activity in the informal sector and its characteristics, it has become crucial to apply a training methodology that reflects the reality of the training subject (informal workers), depending on age, gender, occupation, geographic distribution, educational level, previous training, customs and culture and the family life cycle.

4.2. Result of the project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)
-----------------------------------	---

The expected results and those analysed in the interim evaluation are:

- RE1: Characterisation and diagnosis of the formal sector in the selected trades (are only partially achieved);
- RE2: Methodology for the design of programmes and tools tailored to the needs of the informal sector and implementation performed;
- RE3: 17 new courses for the population target groups are available;
- RE4: Training developed and an exchange of international experiences undertaken. Project actions are undertaken for the five beneficiary Technical Training Centers in four sectors of the economy.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3 main broad criteria Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency • 5 additional criteria: Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF
---	--

• **Relevance: A**

The relevance is assessed as strong because the beneficiaries expressed a need for training and technical training as an essential requirement for economic and social development. Similarly, local and national authorities indicate the importance of supporting the self-employed. The relevance of the self-employed in the informal sector of the economy and its socioeconomic implications validates the relevance of the project.

• **Effectiveness -B**

The ROM values effectiveness as 'good'. The expected results of the project are being met and are in line with the overall general and specific objectives. The following have been achieved: (RE1) wholesale market data in Managua methodology for the design of programmes tailored to the needs of the informal sector; (RE2) joint efforts between experts and the INATEC project has been made in tailoring 17 different types of training curricula to the user characteristics in order to prevent dropouts; (RE3) development of training programmes; (RE4); an exchange of experiences took place in a seminar where a presentation was made. The documentation available was not sufficient to assess the achievements on quality assurance and measurements.

• **Efficiency: A**

Efficiency is rated as very good. In the ROM, it was observed that the project had invested mainly in fixed costs for the category of personal equipment and supplies. The project has an accounting system and efficient and effective internal controls that ensure complementary support to the objectives and goals of the project demonstrating transparency and compliance with EU standards. The project management team placed special emphasis on the optimal use of all resources ensuing savings that

have consequently enlarged the scope of some activities for the benefit of the target group. The logical framework is not used as a management tool, but rather to present the project and for the purposes of the progress report. It is planned to update the activities and indicators in the logical framework. Monitoring is done through specific meetings with the Bureau of Local Actors who are informed of the progress, putting more emphasis on the implementation of activities, without IOV measurement for evaluating the achieved effects.

The Monitoring Report indicated the quality of the products as 'good'. In particular: 1) the study of the Managua open markets (the two largest in the country) defined jobs, skills in demand and individual training needs; 2) the Bureaux of Local Actors, instituted by the project, coordinates the priority trades to be taught in each centre; 3) the centres develop two or three curricula with the support of INATEC and the experts of the project; 4) Confederation of worker trade unions monitor the project through the centers and the markets; 5) 17 of the 20 expected courses were delivered and evaluated.

- **Coherence: A**

Coherence with the EC's Nicaragua Country Strategy Paper (2007-2013) Main priorities and goals: The global objective is to raise the quantitative and qualitative level of life with a special emphasis on education and in particular on vocational education. The EC contribution will help Nicaragua to achieve the MDGs related to education. The partner institution (INATEC) is empowered to institutionalise and ensure the sustainability of the initiatives promoted by the project.

- **Quality of the Design: B**

The ROM assessed the quality of the design as 'good' because it is appropriate that the project strengthens INATEC as the institution that assumes responsibility for technical training for the informal sector and ensures this through practical experience, applying the 'learning to do' methodology, jointly with experts involved on the project. This is compounded by applying a simple intervention strategy and practice; however, there are some distortions that lower the assessment: a) the initial design included aspects that could not be met and although they have been solved in the implementation, the Delegation has not been informed; b) there is a sustainability strategy with clear responsibilities for different actors; c) the gender strategy is more focused on participation and the use of language and graphs used for disseminating messages about equality and domestic violence.

- **Impact: A**

Impact, according to the ROM, is considered as 'good' because it is likely to meet the overall project objectives. The impact of vocational training for the self-employed sector of the informal economy ensures visibility and inclusion of the former within the INATEC as the institution in charge of technical training in Nicaragua. Monitoring enlightened upon the impact of the project in terms of improving the incomes of individuals and their families, the improved quality of services and business opportunities, increased confidence and self esteem of the people, improving the quality and quantity of productive activity of women and especially young women. Close collaboration with INATEC, the methodology and training curriculum that was adapted to the reality of the self-employed in the informal sector of the economy and the broad participation of the beneficiaries ensured that the impact on the quality of life of the target group was sound and an achievable goal. However, the impact of gender mainstreaming in training posts should be improved, because they have trained women with consequently higher incomes and hence generated better self-esteem.

- **Sustainability: C**

Good sustainability has been ensured, as this has included a process of institutionalisation of the project's objectives by INATEC, even when there is no clarity on who will provide the necessary resources for remaining training services and follow-up for the self-employed as none of the actors are in charge. The interest shown by the target groups, their representatives, the heads of the institutes and local authorities makes it likely that the institutes will continue offering the courses. It is also an advantage to have a sound inter-institutional structure that involves many actors, so that they can contribute to maintenance and support services. However, while there has been an increase in the INATEC budget, new institutes lead to a reduced budget and scope for general maintenance and operating expenses only.

- **Added value of ETF: N/A**

4.3. Beneficiaries

Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

- Confederation of self-employed workers (Confederación de Trabajadores por Cuenta Propia CTCP);
- Departments (Managua, Masaya and Chinandega);
- 5 INATEC centers benefitted: Centro de Formación y Desarrollo Integral 'CEFODI' en Managua

<p>(Sector Comercio); Centro de Capacitación Nicaragüense Alemán 'CECNA' en Managua (MiPymes); Instituto Politécnico de Masaya 'IPM' en Masaya (Sector Artesanías); Centro de Enseñanza Técnica Agropecuaria 'CETA' en Chinandega (Sector Agropecuario); Instituto Politécnico Héroes y Mártires de Villanueva 'IPHMV' en Chinandega (Sector Agropecuario).</p>	
5. Synopsis	Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.
<p>The project focuses on providing opportunities for technical education and vocational training for the self-employed, who constitute the largest part of the private sector and the cornerstone of the country's socioeconomic development in order to obtain decent employment and become involved in socioeconomic life. It also allows greater visibility of these workers, highlights the importance and contribution of economic activity through educational institutions and the country's labour and vocational training positions as a means to improving productivity and the quality of life for individuals.</p>	
6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The choice of the target group, especially young women; • Choice of implementation partner: the governing body of professional training, INATEC; • Choice of training methodology. The institutes offer courses and INATEC provides the certificates; • Selection of the study subjects in the sectors of the economy, their geographical coverage and centers to be partners in the joint project of the national system of technical education and vocational training with the training needs of the informal economy in Nicaragua; • The alliance with the trade union organisations of the self-employed (CTCP - FNT); <p>The implementation process has provided important lessons that require subsequent project adjustments:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Update the project documentation with changes in the work strategy (activities, timelines, indicators, etc.) and request approval from the Delegation; • Establish new IOV that helps describe the objectives and results in terms of quality and quantity; • Develop a sustainability strategy that sets forth the responsibilities of each actor; • Develop a gender strategy linking all actors, establishing specific IOV, focusing on participation and changing attitudes. 	
7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Collaboration between INATEC and the Centres Directorate ensures the quality of the training infrastructure, methodological equipment and knowledge on the geographical areas of intervention; • Actions undertaken with the INATEC training infrastructure ensures the sustainability of the intervention and ownership of the project objectives, the validation of the proposed curricula and methodologies applied; • The selection of economic sectors (Agriculture, non-traditional, trade and services and SMEs) is due to a prior identification undertaken in consensus with associations and labor organisations; • The partnership with CTCP - FNT is a strategic element for the success of interventions in the territories regarding: selection of themes and outlines of the courses, students retention and reproduction of knowledge among industry members; • The players in each training centre play a key role both in the processes of appropriation and coordination of goals and objectives, such as monitoring the progress of the courses; • The design of the organisational structure does not represent a high financial burden and keeps the focus on the objectives of the project 1) Foreign Coordinator: 2) International Director and Head of Project - INATEC Representative Coordinator, 3) National Director - Technical Coordinator, 4) Manager, 5) two technical specialists). This structure comprises a representative in each work center to monitor the implementation of the proposed project, operational teaching and guarantees effective communication between the executive structure and management. The structure also enables efficient and effective internal control and coordination 'in real time' with INATEC's management and the technical teams; • The design included unachievable elements; the characterisation study and diagnosis of the informal sector in the geographic areas of influence was costly in terms of time and money. It was nevertheless possible to undertake characterisation studies for wholesale markets. It was 	

<p>necessary changing Institutes for lack of availability. Support for the insertion of graduates will not take place because the project's objective is to improve the working and living conditions of the TCP. The design incorporated the CINTERFOR (ILO), as a major player in charge of the training of officials, technicians and teachers in the selected centers; however, this was not feasible, because the institution is located in Uruguay.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • It is necessary to define how the technical changes have impacted upon the costs of the implemented activities and the running budget costs; • An Early Warning System to inform timely decisions (control activities, and mainly results and risks) should be developed as well as a system for the systematic dissemination of the studies and analyses to all the concerned parties. 	
<p>8. Implementation partners</p>	<p>Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.</p>
<p>Instituto Nacional Tecnológico (INATEC) y sus Direcciones de centros.</p>	
<p>9. Contacts:</p>	<p>Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail</p>
<p>Fondazione Terre Des Hommes Italia Onlus (TdH IT). Sra. Donatella Vergari. Viale Monza 57 - 20125 Milano Italia. Teléfono +39 02 28970418 Fax +39 02 26113971. d.vergari@tdhitaly.org</p>	
<p>10. Sources, links and publications</p>	<p>Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)</p>
<p>DEVCO:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • AP-CTR924730_2_Description of the (Action Plan); • SC-CTR924720_1_Special conditions.doc (subvention Contract); • SC-CTR924736_4_Explicative note Nota explicative; • SC-CTR1104401_5_Signed contract with Condiciones particulares; <p>OTHER DOCS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • EC: Nicaragua. Country Strategy Paper. 2007-2013; • Formulario de solicitud de subvención 2010; • EU. Nicaragua, Country Strategy Paper 2007-2013. 03.04.2007 (E/2007/479); • ROM Terres des Hommes - Response Sheet. Date of Report 23/05/2012; • Sistematización Etapa Piloto TdH, Lic. Francisco Martínez Cano, Dr. Felipe A. Molina Chow. Managua, 2011; • Report Reference: MR-144499.01 Response Sheet Questions. <p><i>Manuales para el Participante del curso: Cerrajería; Cocina Nicaragüense a la Carta I y II; Estilismo; Elaboración de vino y vinagre de plátano; Técnicas de Elaboración de Conservas; Electricidad Residencial Básica; Fontanería Básica; Soldadura por Arco Eléctrico con Electrodo Revestido Convencional; Edición de Fotografías Digitales, Aplicando Photoshop; Procesamiento de Frutas y Vegetales; Procesamiento de Lácteos; Formulación de Proyectos; Reparación Y Mantenimiento de Triciclos; Reparación de Celulares; Reparación de Motocicletas; Lubricantes de Uso Automotriz y Elaboración de Inventario; Vendedor Integral Exitoso.</i></p>	

BENIN, MAURITANIA

Project title: *Programme d'appui au développement de la formation par apprentissage (PAFPA)*

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: ND
3. Efficiency: ND
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: ND
7. Sustainability: C
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

Au Bénin, le chômage et le sous-emploi sont très répandus. La formation professionnelle a une longue tradition, mais n'est plus suffisante pour répondre aux défis et aux exigences du marché du travail, des employeurs et des apprenants actuels. Un système formel de formation qui intègre à la fois la théorie et la pratique n'existe tout simplement pas. Cela conduit à des conséquences indésirables telles que le décalage croissant entre les demandes des employeurs en matière de qualité de produits et services, et les compétences fournies, augmentant ainsi la difficulté pour de nombreuses entreprises à se développer ou à maintenir leurs quotas sur le marché.

Le système public de formation professionnelle ne peut pas maintenir le nombre de jeunes qui seraient stagiaires potentiels - et est capable de répondre aux exigences du marché du travail dans une mesure minimale. Le système dual de formation a été officiellement lancé en 2001. Depuis lors, les vocations et les métiers ont progressivement adopté le nouveau système. Cela a permis à un nombre croissant de jeunes qualifiés à trouver un emploi salarié. Pourtant, mieux savoir-faire immeuble de transfert et le réseau est encore nécessaire de renforcer les bases techniques de la formation professionnelle, améliorer sa pertinence et sa accroître l'accès aux jeunes. Une formation post-primaire des jeunes qui passe essentiellement par un apprentissage au sein des micros et petites entreprises (MPE) du secteur informel;

- Au Bénin, ce sont en moyenne 200 000 jeunes qui sont formés tous les ans « sur le tas » par le biais de l'apprentissage traditionnel, contre 12 000 dans le cadre de l'enseignement et de la formation professionnelle, soit plus de quinze fois l'effectif de l'enseignement technique et la formation professionnelle (ETFP);*
- Le besoin d'améliorer la qualité de ce type de formation en le faisant évoluer vers un mode d'apprentissage de type dual ;*
- Une opportunité de mettre en oeuvre une Formation Professionnelle en Alternance rénovée qui soit reconnue et ancrée durablement dans le dispositif national de Formation technique Professionnelle.*

Le contexte béninois:

- Un pays disposant d'une longue tradition dans le domaine de la formation par apprentissage;*
- Des artisans du secteur informel très organisés (CNAB - 800 groupements, plus de 10 000 adhérents) ;*
- 2 diplômes spécifiques aux besoins du secteur informel: le certificat de qualification aux métiers (CQM) et le certificat de qualification professionnelle (CQP);*
- Le CQP: un diplôme sanctionnant trois années de formation par apprentissage de type dual, positionné juste en dessous du CAP;*
- Intervention du PAFPA en amont du CQP (préparation des jeunes au test d'entrée) et en aval pour mieux préparer les jeunes en fin de formation à leur entrée sur le marché de l'emploi (formations associées en gestion, en fiscalité, sur les risques métiers et l'accès au financement).*

Le contexte mauritanien:

- Un pays qui entame sa réflexion dans le domaine de la structuration de l'apprentissage traditionnel;*
- Mise en place du Certificat de compétences (CC) en 2010 (décret non encore opérationnel): objectif du projet: articuler FPA avec ce nouveau CC.*
- Des formations courtes (3 à 9 mois) permettant d'accéder au niveau d'ouvrier semi-qualifié.*

1. Identification

DCI-EDUC/2011/ 231211

CRIS decision number	
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Area	TP-TVET policy and systems: TM -TVET access to target groups: IE
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI: thematic programmes (investing in people iIP)
c) By region	Africa: Benin, Mauritania
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: 2011 Start: 01/09/2011 End: 31/08/2014 Status: Ongoing
3. Financial data	
Total amount: AFD, Inap-FTP, European Union: EUR 1 817 321 Total EC amount: EUR 1 453 856 (80% of total)	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
<p><i>Population cible; jeunes femmes et homes vulnérables</i> <i>Le Pafpa vise à appuyer cette dynamique et à renforcer l'employabilité des jeunes par le développement d'une offre de formation adaptée dans ses modalités et son contenu, articulée avec le système formel d'éducation et de formation technique et professionnelle et capable de leur fournir les compétences professionnelles dont les entreprises ont besoin, en particulier celles du secteur informel, améliorer leur capacité de production et leurs revenus.</i> <i>Plus spécifiquement, il cherche à développer une offre de formation par apprentissage par alternance qui soit accessible aux jeunes, durable, réactive aux besoins en compétences des MPE et reconnue dans le cadre d'une action concertée entre institutions publiques, MPE et centres de formation professionnelle (CFP) concernés.</i></p>	
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<p><i>En Mauritanie et au Bénin, la croissance de la population et le phénomène d'urbanisation se conjuguent pour exercer des pressions considérables sur les systèmes d'éducation et le marché de l'emploi. Les jeunes représentent une part croissante de la population et les économies ont d'autant plus de mal à absorber leur afflux sur le marché du travail qu'ils n'ont que de faibles niveaux de qualification à proposer. Les systèmes d'enseignement technique et de formation professionnelle (ETFP), qui constituent une partie importante de la réponse potentielle à cette demande, rencontrent des limites aussi bien en termes d'adéquation de la formation à la demande des milieux professionnels qu'en termes de capacité d'accueil. La formation post-primaire des jeunes passe aujourd'hui essentiellement par l'apprentissage au sein de micro et petites entreprises (MPE) du secteur informel. Face à ce constat, les États mauritanien et béninois réfléchissent à améliorer la qualité de l'apprentissage traditionnel en le faisant évoluer vers un mode d'apprentissage de type dual.</i></p>	
4.2. Result of the project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)
<p><i>Le Pafpa vise quatre résultats :</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Les jeunes, en particulier ceux issus de milieux défavorisés, accèdent à une formation par apprentissage de qualité et la valorisent. En Mauritanie, 600 jeunes accéderont à une offre de formation par apprentissage. Au Bénin, 400 jeunes seront préparés au test d'entrée à la formation de type dual menant au CQP et 540 jeunes en 3ème année de formation de type dual seront plus compétents et mieux outillés pour commencer leur vie professionnelle; • Les MPE et leurs représentants contribuent au développement et à la mise en œuvre de la formation par apprentissage. En Mauritanie, 4 OP seront impliquées dans la gestion et l'organisation de la FPA et 100 maîtres d'apprentissage seront renforcés aux niveaux technique et pédagogique, et respectivement 14 OP et 720 artisans au Bénin ; • Les institutions publiques nationales concernées pilotent la mise en place d'un cadre d'action concerté reconnaissant la FPA en lien avec le système formel d'ETFP. Le Pafpa prévoit notamment le renforcement des compétences des institutions au travers de formations, d'équipement et l'organisation de visites d'échange dans d'autres pays; 	

- **6 CFP en Mauritanie et 12 au Bénin** mettent en œuvre des programmes de formation par apprentissage et de formation continue à partir de l'expression des besoins en compétences des MPE. Cela passera notamment par un renforcement des capacités des CFP, notamment organisationnelles, en gestion et en équipement et l'appui à l'émergence d'un réseau de centres impliqués dans la formation par apprentissage.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)

- 3 main broad criteria **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF**

- **Relevance -A**

Les diagnostics de chacune des associations étaient une étape préliminaire au lancement des activités du projet et leur pertinence ne fait aucun doute. Les réunions de coordination de la DCE avec les autres bailleurs de fonds (coopérations bilatérales, missions conjointes comme celle de la SFI) ont permis de « situer » le PASP pour éviter toutes duplications des actions

- **Effectiveness -B**

Appropriation du projet par les bénéficiaires (4 résultats sur 5)

- **Efficiency - No Data**

Il n'y a pas d'informations à ce propos.

- **Coherence - A**

Le projet s'inscrit dans les actions définies dans le Document de Stratégie Pays et le Programme Indicatif National définissant la coopération Union Européenne/Bénin pour la période 2009-2013 (10ème FED) dans le domaine de la compétitivité et de la cohésion sociale.

- **Quality of the Design: B**

Les stratégies de recrutement du Bénin et la Mauritanie sont différents. Ils sont bien structurés en Mauritanie et non-considérés au Bénin que les futurs stagiaires sont déjà bien conscients des opportunités offertes. Dans le cas du Bénin, cependant, il n'est pas clair si le projet va toucher les groupes les plus vulnérables.

Les deux principales améliorations pour les bénéficiaires viendront d'un renforcement des capacités de formation des employeurs de petites entreprises dans la gestion de l'apprentissage et le potentiel de certification.

- **Impact: No Data**

Uniquement des informations incomplètes disponibles à ce propos.

- **Sustainability: C**

Le potentiel de durabilité est fort en raison de la nature intégrée de l'apprentissage traditionnel et l'autonomisation des petites organisations entrepreneuriales. Le projet est également bien articulé en ligne avec la stratégie nationale. Toutefois, la viabilité financière reste vague.

- **Added value of ETF: N/A**

4.3. Beneficiaries Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

Les bénéficiaires finaux sont : (i) les jeunes qui accèdent à une formation par apprentissage de qualité (filles et garçons à partir de 14/16 ans); (ii) les micros et petites entreprises du secteur informel MPE, dont la compétitivité est renforcée via la formation des apprentis ainsi que des maîtres artisans, et qui plus généralement pourront recruter du personnel dont les qualifications correspondent mieux à leurs besoins ; (iii) les institutions en charge de la formation professionnelle, qui renforceront leurs capacités de promotion et de développement de la formation par apprentissage ; (iv) les centres de formation professionnelle (CFP) publics et privés, qui auront amélioré leurs compétences en matière de formation par apprentissage, acquis les équipements nécessaires pour proposer des formations de qualité et qui, constitués en réseau, pourront échanger sur leurs pratiques et devenir une force de proposition auprès des institutions en termes de formation professionnelle.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

Le Programme d'appui au développement de la formation par apprentissage (Pafpa) est un programme de trois ans cofinancé à hauteur de 80% par l'Union européenne et de 20% par l'Agence Française de Développement. Porté par le Gret, le programme est mis en œuvre dans deux pays, le Bénin et la Mauritanie, par deux structures partenaires: le Bureau d'Appui aux Artisans (BAA) au Bénin et l'Institut national de Promotion de la Formation technique et professionnelle (Inap-FTP) en Mauritanie.

Le Pafpa vise à renforcer l'employabilité des jeunes par le développement d'une offre de formation qui soit adaptée dans ses modalités et son contenu, articulée avec le système formel d'enseignement technique et de formation professionnelle (ETFP) et capable de leur fournir les compétences professionnelles dont les entreprises, en particulier celles du secteur informel, ont besoin pour améliorer leur capacité de production et leurs revenus.

Le Pafpa a démarré en septembre 2011 pour une période de trois ans. Il se déroule en Mauritanie dans les villes de Nouakchott, Atar, Boghé et Rosso et au Bénin dans les quatorze communes des départements de l'Ouémé et du Plateau.

Le Pafpa est porté par le Gret et mis en oeuvre par l'Institut national de Promotion de la Formation Technique et Professionnelle (Inap-FTP) en Mauritanie et le Bureau d'Appui aux Arti-sans (BAA) au Bénin. Son budget est de 1,8 millions d'euros, financé par l'Union européenne, l'Agence Française de Développement et l'Inap-FTP.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

Pérennisation de l'action et effet multiplicateur

- En mettant en place le cadre réglementaire (définition du statut du maître artisan, diplôme mis en œuvre par l'Etat...) : Projet pilote qui pourra être élargi au niveau national (élargissement à d'autres zones et d'autres filières); Volet renforcement institutionnel (sensibilisation et formation des cadres de la Direction DFTP) ;
- En impliquant et en renforçant les OP : Implication dans la définition des curricula: Implication dans l'identification des jeunes qui pourraient concerner le programme; À termes: implication dans la contribution à l'orientation de la politique d'EFTP ;
- En renforçant les artisans d'accueil/VAE: Permet un meilleur encadrement du jeune; Facilite l'acceptation par les artisans de ce nouveau type de dispositif (phénomènes de résistance observés lorsque les projets ne s'intéressent qu'à l'amélioration et la reconnaissance des compétences du jeune et non des artisans) ;
- En mettant en place par ailleurs un volet d'alphabétisation: Permet de faciliter l'accès au CC des jeunes ciblés par le projet (peu maîtrisent la fin du fondamental) ;
- En ouvrant des filières qui soient porteuses en matière d'emploi dans la région (renouvellement de la demande, meilleur taux d'insertion des jeunes) ;
- En testant une offre de formation à moindre coût (80% en entreprise, 20% en centre): Forte nécessité de mettre en place un dispositif de formation de masse (transition démographique non achevée, 54,7% de la population a moins de 20 ans) ;
- Choix de métiers acquis par apprentissage sur le tas et présentant un fort potentiel d'insertion: 13 métiers dans 4 filières: BTP (maçonnerie polyvalente, plomberie, électricité bâtiment); Services (mécanique, froid climatisation, coiffure-esthétique, coupe-couture, restauration); Artisanat de production (soudure métallique, menuiserie bois); MPE rurales (maraîchage - horticulture, artisanat rural).

7. Lessons learned

Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.

Les Activités de Suivi-Evaluation et de pilotage du programme indique que la capitalisation des approches adoptées Dans Les Deux Pays est un développement positif. La mise en œuvre dans le contexte respectif d'un système d'apprentissage structuré permet de comparer l'impact sur les mécanismes d'apprentissage informel dans les 2 pays. L'échange et la confrontation des expériences et des bonnes pratiques est un atout du projet.

8. Implementation partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

Le Gret est une ONG française de développement qui intervient depuis plus de 20 ans dans le domaine de l'appui à la petite entreprise et de la formation professionnelle et plus récemment sur le champ de l'insertion professionnelle des jeunes.

L'Inap-FTP est un établissement public à caractère administratif mauritanien sous tutelle du Ministère de l'Emploi, de la Formation Professionnelle et des Nouvelles Technologies (MEFPNT) créé en 2002. Il a un rôle de conseil en ingénierie de formation professionnelle, d'observatoire et d'analyse des besoins de compétences de l'économie du pays et assure la gestion du fonds de cofinancement de la FTP pour

les entreprises mauritaniennes, formelles et informelles.

Le Bureau d'appui aux artisans est une structure privée béninoise intervenant depuis vingt ans dans la promotion de l'artisanat et de la formation professionnelle. Il intervient notamment en appui au renforcement des MPE et de leurs organisations professionnelles, en appui conseil auprès de l'État, ainsi que dans l'amélioration et la structuration des modes de formation par apprentissage.

9. Contacts:

Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail

Gret – Sandra Barlet

Tél. : +33 1 70 91 92 53 - Fax : + 33 1 70 91 92 01

barlets@gret.org

Christine Uhder

Tél. : +33 1 70 91 92 23 - Fax : + 33 1 70 91 92 01

uhder@gret.org

**10. Sources,
links and publications**

Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)

-SC-CTR1100394_4_Contract signe.pdf.

<http://www.gret.org/projet/pafpa-benin-mauritanie/>

http://www.inap.mr/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=56&Itemid=66

BURUNDI AND ETHIOPIA

Project title: A shared bridge toward innovation: building up TVET demand driven services and networks for workers in the informal economy in Burundi and Ethiopia

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: ND
3. Efficiency: ND
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: ND
7. Sustainability: ND
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

Traditionally, Technical and Vocational Education and Training in Ethiopia has been fragmented and delivered by different providers at various qualification levels. Public TVET institutions under the MOE were concentrating on producing middle level technical graduates at post Grade 10 level. In parallel, public and private companies have had their own TVET programmes, as have NGOs and private TVET providers. Meanwhile, in non-formal TVET programmes, public institutions, NGOs, and private schools offer employment-oriented TVET.

Programmes are provided for various target groups, including school leavers, people in employment, school dropouts and marginalised groups in the labour market. The Industrial Development Strategy of 2003, the Education Sector Strategy Programme (ESDP) III outlines a comprehensive development vision for the TVET sector. The Burundi education sector is still at a developmental stage. Private and public sectors have had their equal share in the pursuit of educational growth and development. Most of primary and secondary institutions are owned by private entities while higher institutions are owned by the State. In turn, the educational system is comprised of a complete set of preparatory, elementary, high school, college, and vocational schooling.

The Ministry of education and Culture is the executive body responsible for the regulation of the national education across the country. Education for All (EFC) is the flagship policy of the ministry. To this end, a Comprehensive Strategy Note for educational reform was drafted in 2006 by a team comprised of members from the ministry. By 2015, the national government aims at achieving the Millennium Development Goal milestone for universal primary education.

In particular, the Burundian educational system is comprised of formal and non-formal education. Formal education consists of primary education (six years), lower (four years) and upper (three years) secondary education, and higher education (four years). The non-formal educational structure is comprised of preparatory and vocational education. Preparatory instruction is characterised by kindergarten schooling completed in two years while vocational instruction is characterised by lower level technical schooling for lower level in five years and upper level schooling in seven years.

1. Identification	260814
CRIS decision number	2011 / 260-814
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Are	TM -TVET access to target groups: LS- Active Labour Market policy and Measures: IE- Informal Economy IP.
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI-EDUC: thematic programmes (investing in people IiP) 2009-2010: Call for Proposal: Developing TVET methodologies and services for the informal economy – 129198
c) By region	African, Caribbean and Pacific (ACP) Burundi and Ethiopia
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: 2010 Status: Ongoing Start/duration: 05/2011 (36 months)
3. Financial data	
Total EC amount: EUR 1 642 989 (80 % of indicative programme)	

4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
<p>Overall objective: To contribute to the improvement of social, working and living conditions of the workers of the informal economy and the most disadvantaged and vulnerable groups in Burundi and Ethiopia.</p> <p>Specific objective: To improve the employability, productivity and income generating capacities of the workers in the informal economy in Burundi (Bujumbura) and Ethiopia (Addis Ababa, Mekelle, Dilla) through innovative, flexible demand-driven Lifelong Learning (LLL patterns and through a sustainable framework of public and private stakeholders between the informal economy and the TVET system.</p>	
4.1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<p>The informal economy in Burundi is estimated at more than 70% of the national economy and this is particularly evident in the seven northern districts of the city of Bujumbura, where the large majority of workers is concentrated in about 80 micro-sectors of production and services.</p> <p>The need to understand the characteristics of this informal labour market is acute. In particular, it should be analysed in relation to the formal productive sector, its products, the professional and educational qualifications of the workers, to the functioning of the enterprises within the whole economic process, the volume of business. The opportunities and difficulties met by the workers in the informal economy are related to the market trends in the short and medium term.</p> <p>The partially respond to this skills demna; in 2012, new training courses in carpentry and auto-mechanics were opened in the Salesian Centre of Buterere and some sessions on business creativity and management of small businesses in the <i>Maison de l'Entrepreneur</i> of Mutakura, run by the VIS in collaboration with the local NGO - ADISCO. Nevertheless, the offer remains largely below the demand for employable skills.</p>	
4.2. Result of the project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • More relevant training modules <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Assessment of the market needs and list of competencies (focus on two sectors: mechanics and carpentry); 2. New modules for target population for skill upgrading and for certification; 3. Alphabetization, basic accountancy and mathematics; 4. Modules for micro entrepreneurs. • Improvement of training pedagogy <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Training of trainers who will work for the Ministry of Vocational Training; 2. Training of teachers in 10 selected centres in areas with high concentration of targeted groups. • Support and training for micro entrepreneurs <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Support to create micro enterprises and small cooperatives; 2. Training modules for entrepreneurs; 3. Support for elaboration of a national policy to support informal SMEs. • Training <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Information on potential beneficiaries with the help of the communes and local NGOs; 2. Training students (formal and informal workers) with certification; 3. Flexible training of informal workers to obtain formal certification; 4. Training in agricultural, sewing, food preparation, textile, alphabetization, mathematics and entrepreneurship courses for vulnerable women, HIV positive cases, youths and ethnic minorities. • Insertion <p>Establishing job services office inside TVET centres.</p> • Lifelong learning, dissemination of best practices and training materials <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Creation of a public private partnership Committee; 2. Dissemination of training material and best practices; 3. Exchange between Burundian and Ethiopian stakeholders. 	

<p>Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3 main broad criteria Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency • 5 additional criteria: Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevance: A The project is relevant to international principles guiding TVET for the non-formal and informal economy. 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Effectiveness: No Data 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Efficiency: No Data In the absence of any monitoring or evaluation report, it is not possible to express any assessment on the level of efficiency of the project's implementation. 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Coherence: B The project is coherent with the priorities of Burundi and Ethiopia for workers in the informal economy. 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of the Design: B The project articulates the proposed actions and detailed activities in a clear manner and is consistent with the problem analysis. 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Impact: No Data 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sustainability: No Data 	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Added value of ETF: NA 	
<p>4.3. Beneficiaries</p>	<p>Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?</p>
<p>Two target groups in both countries are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Vulnerable groups in remote areas with no skills: at least 480; • Informal and formal skill workers wishing to upgrade their skills: at least 912; • Informal micro-entrepreneurs, at least 750. <p>90 trainers of trainers, technical trainers and key actors of e TVET in Burundi: <i>Cite des Jeunes Don Bosco</i> of Buterere, Don Bosco Vocational Training Center (VTC) in Bujumbura.</p>	
<p>5. Synopsis</p>	<p>Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.</p>
<p>The <i>A shared bridge towards innovation</i> TVET project carried out in Burundi and in Ethiopia represents a decisive step towards revitalising the national policy for Professional Training. The strategy to improve access is based on the fact that the training centres are located in area where the target groups are living and using communes and NGOs to inform potential beneficiaries, including all informal workers who want to upgrade their competencies (which may lead to a bias in favour of the less vulnerable).</p>	
<p>6. Key elements of success</p>	<p>What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improvement: Curricula and pedagogy (including alphabetisation) adapted to the specific needs of the target population will improve the conditions of the beneficiaries as well as the focus on the certification process; • The comprehensive support given by the project to micro enterprises is also an added value of the project; • Sustainability: The sustainability strategy is mainly based on improved capacity of the Ministry for Vocational Training in particular through the establishment of a core group of 6 trainers in life long TVET. How these trainers will be financed after the project remains unclear; • The creation of a public private partnership Committee is also supposed to sustain the activities of the project as well as the support structures for the development of micro enterprises and cooperatives. However, the financial sustainability of such structures is not addressed. The draft of a National Policy for the Development of micro enterprises is also part of the sustainability strategy. It may consider the financial dimension; • Organising the producers and supporting the establishment of cooperatives will increase the sustainability of the projects and development objectives; • The strategy for micro enterprises is well elaborated; • Presentation in Burundi of research on the informal economy on April 3rd: 2012 <i>Studies on Informal production units in the seven northern districts of Bujumbura.</i> 	

7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The public private partnership is an interesting strategy but not sufficiently elaborated; • Too many target groups; • Too many training structures for different groups/HIV women, ethnic minorities, informal workers, micro entrepreneurs etc.; • The added value of covering two countries is not clear. 	
8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
	<p>International Volunteers for Development (VIS). Ministry of Education and Professional Training. Partner 1. Oeuvre Don Bosco in Burundi. Partner 2. Salesians Don Bosco Ethiopian. Partner 3. ADISCO, (a business association) Burundi.</p>
9. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail
	Representative of VIS (Voluntariato Internazionali per lo Sviluppo/ International Volunteers for Development) Burundi, Pascal Martin.
10. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)
	<p>AB+AD-CTR1456495_2_Description Action GAP-CTR1456488_3_Description Action SC-CTR1456477_1_Contrat signé.pdf www.salesians-un.org/.../ http://www.salesians-un.org/FocusAreas/PovertyEradication/tabid/131/ArticleId/349/Burundi-Linking-Formal-Education-and-the-World-of-Work.aspx</p>

ETHIOPIA

Project title: Promoting Marketable Skills for the Informal Sector in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Grading:

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: ND
3. Efficiency: ND
4. Coherence: C
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: ND
7. Sustainability: ND
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

Traditionally, TVET has been fragmented and delivered by different providers at various qualification levels. Public TVET institutions under the MOE were concentrating on producing middle level technical graduates at post Grade 10 level. In parallel, public and private companies have had their own TVET programmes, as have NGOs and private TVET providers. Meanwhile, in non-formal TVET programmes, public institutions, NGOs, and private schools offer employment-oriented TVET.

Programmes to various target groups, including school leavers, people in employment, school dropouts and marginalized groups in the labour market. The Industrial Development Strategy of 2003, the Education Sector Strategy Programme (ESDP) III outlines a comprehensive development vision for the TVET sector.

1. Identification CRIS decision number	DCI-EDUC/2010/255372
--	----------------------

2. Classification:

a) By Sectors / Thematic Area:	IE-Informal Economy IP
---------------------------------------	------------------------

b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI: thematic programmes (investing in people IiP)
--	--

c) By region	Geographical zone (AFRICA): ETHIOPIA
---------------------	---

d) By Period and Status	October 2011 – October 2014. Duration 36 months Status: ONGOING
--------------------------------	--

3. Financial data	Grant
--------------------------	-------

EU Contribution: EUR 772 000 equivalent to 80 % of the estimated total eligible cost of the action: EUR 965 000.

4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
-------------------	-------------------------------------

The expected outcome of the project is the improvement of employability, productivity and income generation capacity of potential and actual informal sector - particularly women, disadvantaged youth, and HIV affected people. This will contribute to reducing poverty in Addis Ababa and contribute to MDG 1 – eradication of extreme poverty.

4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
--	---

The informal sector is the major source of employment for women, vulnerable youths and low skilled people in general. It has the potential to contribute to poverty alleviation by delivering goods and services, promoting entrepreneurship and providing livelihood to urban poor people. Limited opportunities to access skills and participate in the labour market increases social exclusion and diminishes self-esteem. Low productivity and low skilled staff, due to the difficulty to acquire skills in demand, affect businesses. Skills in the informal economy are acquired mostly on-the-job and the need for recognition is acute. Without the acquisition of new skills and the recognition and certification of the existing skills, people are prevented from tapping into employment or self-employment opportunities that are more economically and socially rewarding. The capacity of the Addis Ababa TVET Agency to offer non-formal training for the informal economy and to link skills providers, employers

and informal sector workers is not entirely developed and the capacity of its Centre of Competency to develop occupational standards and certify competency is limited to a small number of occupations. Labour market information on skills in high demand and viable business is not accessible by informal sector workers of the informal.

4.2. Result of the project

- Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)

The project's expected results are:

- A network formed by the Addis Ababa (AA) TVET Agency, 10 employers, 5 Vocational skills training structures, and representatives of informal sector workers is established to develop and replicate curricula and flexible training methodologies;
- Modular curricula in 6 trades, including core and entrepreneurial skills, are developed and piloted by training 900 workers and ready for replication by AA TVET Agency and 150 workers undergo tests for the certification of acquired skills;
- Links with formal and non-formal TVET by developing standards for assessment and certification of skills acquired in the informal sector by the Centre of Competency of the AA TVET Agency;
- Best practices are documented and made available by the AA TVET Agency to other regional Agencies; Labour Market Information on demand and the supply of skills in demand in the informal economy are available too and used by public and private actors.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)

- 3 main broad criteria **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF**

- Relevance: B**

The initiative appears to be relevant to the priorities of national development policies and the national TVET strategies, which emphasise the significance of enlarging and improving the provisions of better skills for the informal economy. It responds to social and economic demands of more and employable skills for the informal economy, and to the TVET institutions in charge of broadening access to and increasing the offer of non-formal training, services for skills recognition and certification and labour market information to the workers of the informal sector. It is also relevant for the employers facing a shortage of relevant skills through the provision of curricula and courses designed on the basis of labour market surveys and opportunity mapping.

- Effectiveness: ND**

For this criterion as well, a few considerations can be expressed on the basis of the project's design. The project establishes a strong mechanism for monitoring and following-up the skilled trainers, building ownership and business capacity of the training centres and the public involved in delivery.

- Efficiency: ND**

Efficiency cannot be assessed in the absence of any monitoring or implementation report.

- Coherence: C**

The project is coherent with the Plan for Accelerated and Sustained Development to End Poverty (PASDEP). Reference to broader policy and strategies such as the Industrial Development Strategy, the National TVET Strategy and the Education Sector Strategy Programme (ESDP) III are not provided.

- Quality of the Design: D**

The proposal does not provide an analytical view of the informal economy, non-formal and formal TVET sector as well as of the informal training system present in the country and its capital city. LMIA is left to the implementation phase; trades for which skills will be offered are not identified. Activities are sufficiently detailed. The capacity gap of the partners of the project, that the proposed action intends to bridge is not assessed and properly analysed. No reference is made to other national or international development partners active in the development of skills for the informal economy in Ethiopia.

- Impact: ND**

In the absence of monitoring and implementation reports, only a few considerations on the potential impact can be expressed. A target of 900 skilled workers from the informal economy is concerned. Out of the total target, 150 will obtain a certification on skills standards issued by the 5 training institutions involved by the project. Six (6) trainers will be trained on developing and teaching 6 curricula leading to qualification. The action can have an impact only if the assumption that the AA

TVET Agency, its Centre of Competences will make available the resources to scale up and replicate the proposed set of activities, materialis..	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sustainability: D According to the project proposal, the elements of sustainability are all internal to the project: network, quality of design, assumed interest of the AA TVET Agency to pilot, scale up and replicate. However, no reference is provided to any strategy or plan or resources of the Agency in this regard. • Added value of ETF: NA 	
4.3. Beneficiaries	Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly? 900 youth in the 16-24 age range; management and training staff of TVET institutions, MoE and MoL staff and local entrepreneurs.
5. Synopsis	Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs. The 36 month long project aims at increasing the access of 900 workers from the informal economy: these are mostly disadvantaged youths, women, persons with disabilities with better jobs or self-employment opportunities in the informal sector or in formal enterprises looking for the skills the project will produce (across 6 trades). The project seeks to link non-formal and formal TVET, by scoping the labour market, involving TVET Agencies, non-formal training providers and the Centre for Competency in the development of curricula, course design and training material that will provide the target groups with employable skills that may be recognised and certified. In so doing, the project will develop knowledge, tools and best practices that the TVET institutions involved in their conception, development and delivery are expected to replicate on a larger scale, throughout the country after the end of the project.
6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes? The main elements, in terms of the project design are: concurring interest of the involved institutions in strengthening the capacity to offer more and better skills and services to the workers and potential workers in the informal economy as well as the injection of TVET quality elements in a non-formal TVET system which, nonetheless, is not described. 6 competency based curricula and material, developed for the 6 trades that require more and better skills. Bridge to the formal economy or self-employment opportunities for the trained workers that undergo a certification process the project will establish against occupational standards.
7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project. In the absence of a monitoring and implementation report, it is not possible to identify any elements bound to probable success, on the basis of a low quality project design. The possible justification for funding this action is that the project is part of a broader EU programme consisting of a number of interlinked, mutually supporting and reinforcing actions targeting poverty reduction and job creation in Ethiopia.
8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners. Concern Worldwide, The Chadet Training Centre, the Government Addis Ababa TVET Agency, the Centre of Competency. 5 NGO non-formal training institutions, 10 Employers.
9. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail Concern Worldwide.
10. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs) Description of the Action. Contract-and Annexes IV, VI and VII. Ex-ante control documentation. http://hornofafrica.ngoaidmap.org/projects/2876

SIERRA LEONE

Project Title : Advancing Technical and Vocational Capacities for Employment and Enterprise Development in Sierra Leone

1. Relevance: B
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: B
4. Coherence: B
5. Quality of the design: B
6. Impact: B
7. Sustainability: B
8. Added Value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

Rebuilt as a post-conflict tool of the Demobilisation, Disarmament and Reintegration programme and carrying the traditional second option/remedial choice stigma, TVET in Sierra Leone responds to the priorities of the President's National Development Agenda for Change (Nyalley, 2010). The Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports (MEYS), has the overall responsibility for TVET policy and management. The Education Management Information System (EMIS) was put in place in 2009; a school census had been conducted since 2010 and Education Sector Reviews (ESR) have taken place on an annual basis since 2008. Several ministries activities have major 'skills' dimensions such as the Ministries of Trade and Industry, Labour, Infrastructure, Agriculture, Mining and Tourism that own vocational skills training programmes. National stakeholders include: relevant ministries, commissions and councils at the central and local governmental levels; private sector representatives; representatives from TVET centres/secondary schools; local NGOs In Sierra Leone, TVET was originally designed for school drop-outs and those who failed the Basic Education Certificate Examination (BECE), West African Senior Secondary Certificate Examination (WASSCE) or failed to enter tertiary institutions. Consequently, the TVET system is stereotyped as being for those with a low level of academic achievement.

The government's Agenda for Change stresses the need for a strong TVET system that recognises the risks of an un-educated and under employed youth in the process of the country's reconstruction. The draft National TVET Policy (2010) is part of the educational system reform. About 35% of the population is classified as 'youths' and 70% of this age group are without formal work. The provision of an accessible and labour market-driven TVET policy is considered a strategic instrument for addressing the problem. The Education Sector Plan (ESP). proposed the following strategic goals for TVET: expanding and improving post-primary schooling, providing more and improved literacy and skills training possibilities; meeting teachers' needs of an expanding schooling system; providing improved governance, planning and management; increase of national budget allocated to education to 20% and the non-formal education (NFE) budgetary allocation from 0.7% to 6% of the growing education budget.

About 380 public and private institutions (commercial, NGOs and faith-based institutions) that offer TVET at tertiary level are registered with the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST); 154 receive financial support. The private provision of TVET is on the increase and is partially regulated by the MEST. The number of actual skills providers is estimated at double of those registered. The National Council for Technical, Vocational, and other Academic Awards (NCTVA) oversees examinations and accreditation as well as coordination of the TVET and Technical Vocational Skills Development (TVSD) consultation mechanism. TVET institutions below the polytechnic level are the Technical/Vocational Schools and the Community Education Centres (CECs). The CECs offer basic skills training for income generation and are supervised by the Non-Formal Education Directorate in coordination with the Inspectorate at District Education Offices (DEO) and Local Councils. Links between the formal and non-formal TVET exist and CEC graduates can move to formal TVET schools. The London based City and Guilds is the main external accreditation and certification body for middle and lower level TVET qualifications (secondary and lower secondary level). Three polytechnics, two teacher training colleges, several Community Education Centre (CEC), Teachers Certificate (TC), Vocational Centre (VC), Technical and Vocational Institute (TVI) constitute the backbone of the TVET supply system in the country.

TVET financing in Sierra Leone for the period from 2008 to 2010, fluctuated along the Government's expenditures, and were 4.2%; 2.1%; and 2.2 of the national budget. The education budget in 2010 was a total of 21.7 % (divided between MEYS (14.4%) and decentralised education services (7.3%).	
1. Identification (CRIS decision number):	231058
2. Classification	
a) By Sector/Thematic Area:	TM – TVET access to target groups: IE – Informal Economy IP.
b) By Instrument (fund/budget line):	DCI: thematic programmes (investing in people IiP
c) By region:	AFRICA : Country: Sierra Leone
d) By period and status:	Decision year 2010 Status: ONGOING Period: Dates of project implementation: December 2011 to November 2013
3. Financial data	
Total EC amount EUR 513 944 000: (+/- 80 % of indicative costs of the project): EUR 642 430.00	
Contribution from the beneficiary (estimated as 20% of the costs)	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
<p>The overall objective is: 'To reduce poverty by enhancing the capabilities for employment and income generation of disadvantaged young people and adults'. The specific objectives are to 'Improve employability, productivity and income of vulnerable young people and adults in the informal and formal sectors through enhanced market demand-driven, flexible training provided by selected VTCs in Bo, Pujehun, Moyamba, Bonthe, Kenema and Tonkolili districts'.</p> <p>The programme's main aim is to reinforce the TVET system in Sierra Leone, as well as to support the quality of educational activities, toward a more innovative and market-orientated approach to fundraising and delivery of courses, which bodes well for long-term sustainability.</p> <p>Project implementation is currently focused on the continuation of government efforts to i) achieve equity of access to primary and junior secondary schools; ii) improve learning outcomes and school effectiveness in targeted schools; and iii) increase the capacity of the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST) and local councils to deliver educational services.</p>	
4.1 Objective (statement of the problem)	What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<p>Sierra Leone has made impressive progress in the past decade toward improving access to education for the majority of children at primary level (which has been a target ahead of VET and TVET). Gender equity in access to primary- and secondary-level education has also achieved near parity. However, large disparities still remain as regards educational opportunities as a result of poverty and the rural location of much of the population, with vast numbers of school-age children currently out of school and unlikely to ever be granted the opportunity to attend. Poverty has been identified as the overwhelming barrier to the exercising of rights to education, although these disparities are also magnified when combined with gender. Such disparities will not only hamper Sierra Leone's plans to reduce poverty but could also potentially destabilise the on-going peace- and state-building process as the gaps between the haves and have-not(s) increase. The project aims to address the need for poverty reduction by enhancing the capabilities of the unemployed through access to TVET and Skills Development opportunities in Vocational Training Centres of selected districts.</p>	
4.2 Result of the project	Please describe the results achieved by the above project/ programme (or policy intervention).
<p>The expected results were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The delivery of responsive, flexible, and market-driven courses at VTCs resulting in relevant skills for employment, entrepreneurial operations and business growth and development; • Better managed Vocational Training Centres (VTCs) with good governance and management 	

<p>capacities/systems and increased resources;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Established linkages with industries resulting in increased synergy and employment opportunities; Documented approaches and best practices shared and used to influence policies and programmes for vocational training; Cross-cutting issues such as HIV/AIDS, gender mainstreaming and conservation of the environment reflected in the policies and programmes of VTCs. 	
<p>Grading: Overall analysis carried out against 8 criteria (to be applied flexibly)</p>	<p>3 main broad criteria: Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency</p> <p>5 additional criteria: Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability and Added Value of ETF</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Relevance: B <p>The project can be considered relevant to the national TVET policy and strategy that is also supported by other donors; it addresses access, equity, poverty reduction, the decentralization of education as well as with the need to increase the responsiveness of TVET to the market. The project is equally relevant to the EU Country Strategy Paper for Sierra Leone, which prioritises actions that support the informal sector.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Effectiveness: B <p>The project is at an early stage of implementation, and therefore only a limited part of the activities planned for each of the 5 components were implemented. On the basis of the available monitoring documentation (quarterly implementation report) it is possible to observe that currently the VTCs offer NCTVA curricula and the higher certification level of the offered training triggered an increase in training demands; VTC board members received management and governance training; training on industrial trades was better linked to enterprises; best practices shared and cross-cutting issues of disability, HIV and gender were mainstreamed .</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Efficiency: B <p>The project is considered efficient in relation to the multiple levels of foreseen activities implemented with a holistic approach that recalls action research. Efficiency during the early stages of implementation appears to have been present. For example, on student enrolment numbers: the first year enrolment of youths on long courses was 1210 in 2011 against a baseline number of 897.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Coherence: B <p>The project is coherent with the Sierra Leone 2007-15 Education Sector Plan. The project is coherent with its supporting Call for Proposals. The project is both fully coherent with the Country Strategy Paper and in line with other regional interventions executed by other donors (e.g. DfID), thereby demonstrating its responsiveness to market requirements, the decentralisation process and the facilitation of access to education, along with other cross-cutting issues such as gender equality and poverty reduction, etc.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Quality of the Design: B <p>It can be deduced from previous analyses of project efficiency, efficacy, coherence and relevance that the project design is in line with the country's needs.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Impact: B <p>At this stage of implementation, it is not possible to predict if the project will have the expected impact on the intended beneficiaries and the system at large. Nevertheless, the project seems to be achieving the planned results as detailed in the project description. Progress in activities including the development of the individual capacity building plans and improving the governance structures, upgrading workshops, equipping centers and industrial liaisons, all critical to the improvement of the overall center development, has been defined as 'impressive' by the only available report. Moreover, the project seems to provide a strong foundation for the future development of the VTCs and the services they offer to youth and other community members.</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Sustainability: B <p>At the time of the project's design, a government financial support to VTCs had already been increased. An essential element of sustainability of the activities targeting the VTC was not yet completed: The inclusion of the proposed CBT and modular-based curricula developed by the project into the NCTVA accreditation system is indicated as another element in the project design; this is further reinforced by awareness and visibility creation and the systematic sharing of best practices.</p>	

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Added Value of ETF: (please see note regarding source/approach) NO ETF: N/A (not applicable). 	
<p>4.3 Beneficiaries</p>	<p>Who benefited/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Vocational Training Centres (VTCs) and their staff responsible for TVET actions; • Marginalised young men and women and unemployed adults (by gender or poverty lacking access to TVET education, together with training centre staff); • Micro and small enterprises; • Communities where the VTCs are located.
<p>5. Synopsis</p>	<p>Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.</p> <p>The assessed project intends to improve equity in TVET access of the marginalised and vulnerable groups. It intends to achieve this objective by increasing the capacity to supply quality training (modular approach in curriculum design, CBT, qualifications and short courses, school management and administration) of 8 VTCs in 6 selected districts and strengthening their partnerships with local industries and businesses. Additionally, it aims at building further capacities at the level of the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST), local councils and schools, employers and SMEs to influence TVET policy-making and programming. The project also seeks to extend Skills Development to illiterate adults through the recognition of prior learning and competency-based short courses for the workers of the informal economy. The main indicators entail: 1800 trainees, 80 VTC board members, 6 new regular courses, 1000 entrepreneurs trained on short courses, 40 VTC managers trained and all 8 VTCs equipped with relevant tools, equipment and training material.</p>
<p>6. Key elements of success</p>	<p>What were the critical elements that contributed to project "scalability"? What was the specific approach to capacity development that led to policy impact/changes?</p> <p>On the basis of the design and the progress on implementation in the available report, the main elements of success can be identified in relation to support to the process of decentralising leadership and management of schools to local councils: the participatory process approach from situation analysis to baseline data gathering, training needs analysis and market assessment to implementation; the market-driven approach in the identification and selection of trades and teaching technology matching the level of technology utilised by the enterprises in the local economies; the awareness creation and emphasis on visibility mostly in relation to the mainstreaming of the crosscutting themes of HIV, gender and disability.</p>
<p>7. Lessons learnt</p>	<p>Please include any lessons learnt (regardless of whether these were envisaged at project inception).</p> <p>At this early stage of implementation, lessons may refer to the upstream activities and the general project approach only. The main lesson concerns the importance of promotion and visibility, once the activities have been developed in order to make potential beneficiaries aware of opportunities, such as the higher number of trainees enrolled in new courses. Another important lesson concerns the involvement of micro entrepreneurs as potential employers of youths, in direct training activities through a flexible offer of short courses relevant to the trades. Finally, equipping VTCs with technologies that are in line with those in use in the local market reinforces effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability of project's actions.</p>
<p>8. Implementing Partners</p>	<p>Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.</p> <p>Swiss Contact and APT-Action on Poverty-UK (formerly APT-Enterprise Development-UK). The UN has established a Career Advising and Placement Service (CAPS) at Fourah Bay College (University of Sierra Leone) and at Njala University in Freetown. The ILO collaboration with UNDP, provided overall technical support for the project, which included a LFS design, staff training, results analysis and report writing. ILO, USAID, UNDP, UNICEF, and GOL provided financial support for the conduct of the Labour Force Survey. UNDP supported a Youth Employment Project (MDG funded) since 2009. The ILO supported the Ministries of Labour in re-establishing the capacity of the public employment services. Elements of TVET and Skills Development are present in many components of the post-conflict and DDR programmes, from livelihood to business, entrepreneurial and technical skills for ex-combatants, and operationalised in Sierra Leone by many international development</p>

partners including multilateral agencies, bilateral donors, international and national NGOs.

9. Contacts

Provide contact details for further information, including telephone and e-mail.

Swisscontact: www.swisscontact.ch

APT: <http://www.aptenterprise.org.uk/>.

10. Sources, links & publications

Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs).

Budget of the action.

Contract.

Annex 1 to the Contract.

Implementation Report.

DfID document: *Improving Schools in Sierra Leone (ISIS) Programme: Terms of Reference for Programme Evaluation.*

BURKINA FASO, NIGER, TOGO

Project title: *Accès et maintien dans l'emploi des personnes sourdes et malentendantes*

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: ND
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: B
7. Sustainability: B
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

Burkina Faso: *En application de l'article 27 de la loi d'Orientation de l'éducation, le Decret N° 2009-946 détermine l'organisation des structures de formation technique et professionnelle (FTP) et leurs conditions d'accès. La FTP vise l'acquisition de connaissances et de compétences spécifiques pour l'exercice d'un métier, d'une profession ou l'amélioration de la productivité du travailleur. Conformément la Politique nationale d'enseignement et de FTP, la formation technique et professionnelle prend en compte les voies de qualification, l'enseignement technique et professionnel et la formation professionnelle non formelle, permettant aux jeunes et adultes scolarisés, déscolarisés, non scolarisés, formés ou non d'être compétitifs sur le marché du travail dans tous les secteurs d'activités socio-économiques.*

L'enseignement technique et professionnel est l'ensemble des formations initiales à vocation technologique et/ou professionnelle organisées dans un cadre scolaire avec les finalités de préparer à l'insertion professionnelle et/ou aux études universitaires, et comprend: l'enseignement secondaire technique et professionnel; l'enseignement supérieur technique et professionnel. La formation professionnelle non formelle regroupe: la formation pré-professionnelle ou professionnelle élémentaire; la formation professionnelle par apprentissage; la formation continue.

La formation technique et professionnelle est dispensée dans quatre catégories de structures de formation: les établissements d'enseignement secondaire technique et professionnel constitués des lycées techniques, des lycées professionnels et des collèges d'enseignement technique et de formation professionnelle; les établissements d'enseignement supérieur technique et professionnel; les structures de formation et d'éducation non formelle que sont les centres régionaux de formation professionnelle (CRFP), les centres provinciaux de formation professionnelle (CPFP), les centres de formation professionnelle non formels (CFPNF), les centres d'éducation de base non formels (CEBNF), les centres d'apprentissages (CA), les écoles des métiers, etc; les écoles et les centres spécialisés constitués des écoles de formation professionnelle. -

Les curricula sont constitués essentiellement par les finalités, les compétences, les contenus, les méthodes pédagogiques, les modalités d'évaluation des apprentissages scolaires ou de la formation. Les curricula de la formation technique et professionnelle sont structurés en modules et sont définis par arrêtés des ministres chargés de l'éducation.

La fin des études à l'enseignement secondaire technique et professionnel est sanctionnée par diplômes d'Etat: au cycle court par le certificat d'aptitude professionnelle (CAP); au cycle moyen par le brevet d'études professionnelles (BEP); au cycle long technologique par le baccalauréat technologique (bac tn); au cycle long professionnel par le baccalauréat professionnel (bac pro). Les modalités de préparation, d'organisation des examens de fin d'études et de délivrance de chaque diplôme sont fixées par décret pris en Conseil des ministres sur proposition des ministres chargés de l'enseignement technique et professionnel et de l'enseignement supérieur.

:La fin des études à l'enseignement supérieur technique et professionnel est sanctionnée: au premier niveau par le diplôme universitaire de technologie (bac+2), le brevet de technicien supérieur (bac+2), le diplôme de la licence professionnelle (bac+3) ou le diplôme d'ingénieur des travaux (bac+3); au second niveau par le diplôme d'ingénieur technologue ou d'ingénieur de conception (bac+4), ou le diplôme de master professionnel (bac+5); au troisième cycle par le diplôme de doctorat (bac+8).

La fin des études dans les structures de formation et d'éducation non formelle est sanctionnée par le certificat de qualification professionnelle (CQP). Il est un diplôme d'Etat. La fin des études dans les

écoles et les centres spécialisés est sanctionnée par une attestation ou un diplôme dont les modalités de préparation et de délivrance sont fixées par arrêté du ministre chargé de la tutelle technique. Loi d'Orientation du Système Educatif au **Niger** (LOSEN) adoptée en juin 1998 définit entre les grandes orientations; le droit à l'éducation pour tout citoyen (4 à 18 ans); l'éducation permanente comme une des missions du système éducatif; développer l'enseignement technique et la formation professionnelle sur le plan qualitatif et quantitatif en prenant en compte l'environnement socio économique du pays ; identifier et éradiquer les freins socio économiques et culturels, les handicaps pédagogiques et autres obstacles entravant le plein épanouissement de la fille et de la femme dans le processus d'apprentissage.

Structure du Système Educatif: L'éducation formelle: enseignement de base, enseignement moyen et enseignement supérieur; L'éducation non-formelle: un mode d'acquisition de l'éducation et de la formation professionnelle dans un cadre non-scolaire. Elle s'adresse aux jeunes et aux adultes; L'éducation informelle: processus par lequel une personne acquiert durant sa vie des connaissances, des aptitudes et des attitudes par l'expérience quotidiennes et les relations avec le milieu; •L'éducation spécialisée (Art 42): a pour missions l'éducation ou l'auto-éducation et la formation des citoyens handicapés physiques ou mentaux afin de faciliter leur insertion ou réinsertion sociale.

Les Missions De L'ETFP selon la LOSEN: consolider les acquis de l'éducation de base; produire une main d'œuvre qualifiée pour des niveaux professionnels intermédiaires; fournir des connaissances techniques et des compétences professionnelles nécessaires pour développer l'agriculture, l'élevage, l'artisanat, l'industrie, le commerce et l'économie; fournir un personnel capable d'appliquer les connaissances techniques pour améliorer et trouver des solutions aux problèmes environnementaux pour le bien être de la société; développer les compétences nécessaires pour former des artisans, des techniciens et autres personnes qualifiées capables d'initiative et d'indépendance; assurer la formation continue des professionnels et préparer les jeunes à la vie active ou à l'enseignement supérieur.

L'apprentissage dans la LOSEN au Niger: Création d'un office national de la formation professionnelle chargé du pilotage de la politique nationale en matière de formation professionnelle continue et d'apprentissage (Art 63). Cette partie de la loi a été révisée en 2007. L'office est devenu un « Fonds d'Appui à la formation professionnelle continue et à l'apprentissage (FAFPCA) » conformément aux réformes en cours dans l'espace UEMOA et au souhait des partenaires techniques et financiers qui considèrent dorénavant ce fonds comme une source de financement qui doit être substantiellement alimentée par la taxe d'apprentissage en sus des appuis des PTF. Au Niger, la taxe d'apprentissage est passée de 70millions à 400 millions/trimestre.

Les instances de gestion du système éducatif: Conseil National de l'Éducation (CNE). C'est un organe de consultation sur avis duquel sera élaborée et appliquée toute nouvelle mesure intéressant le devenir de l'éducation au Niger. Conseil Régional de l'Éducation (CRE) chargé du suivi de la politique éducative au niveau régional. Conseil Sous Régional de l'Éducation (CSRE) chargé du suivi de la politique éducative au niveau sous régional.

Le système éducatif du **Togo** a été créé pendant la période coloniale du pays, et reflète les besoins des colons, et non-ceux des réformes peuples. Educational indigènes souligner gratuite et obligatoire la fréquentation scolaire, l'éducation préscolarisation et continue, l'égalité éducative opportunités pour girs et les garçons, et un programme développé à partir des besoins locaux. Un effort particulier a été fait pour adapter les programmes d'enseignement et les méthodes aux besoins économiques et sociaux du Togo enseignement. Les efforts du Togo dans l'éducation des adultes sont dirigés vers la population adulte vivant dans les zones rurales qui n'ont pas reçu l'éducation formelle. En raison de considérations financières, toutefois, cet effort est très limitée. Les efforts incluent l'amélioration des techniques agricoles, l'éducation sanitaire, l'éradication de la maladie et de l'éducation de l'alphabétisation. En outre, deux centres de formation sont maintenues pour former les travailleurs dans diverses professions, telles que le travail de secrétariat, dessin technique, la mécanique automobile, et le fonctionnement de l'équipement lourd. L'un des domaines de l'éducation des adultes les plus importants est la culture et les loisirs. Programmes efficaces d'éducation pour la population adulte sont les besoins essentiels de la croissance économique et sociale du Togo.

1. Identification	254350
CRIS decision number	DCI-EDUC/2010/254-350 «Projet EFTP».
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Are	TM -TVET access to target groups: LS- Active Labour Market policy and Measures

	IE- Informal Economy
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI: thematic programmes (investing in people iIP)
c) By region	Africa: Burkina Faso (régions Centre et Centre-Est); Niger (régions de Niamey, Maradi et Dosso); Togo (région des Savanes, Lomé Commune)
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: 2010 Status: On going 01/01/2011 – 31/12/2014. 36 mois
3. Financial data	
EU Contribution: EUR 1 961 823 (80% of the Total: EUR 2 452 279.94)	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
<i>L'objectif général est l'amélioration de la qualité de vie et la réduction de la pauvreté des Personnes en situation de Handicap (PSH) en général, et des personnes sourdes et malentendantes (PSME) en particulier, à travers la reconnaissance et l'application concrète de leurs droits économiques et sociaux. L'objectif spécifique vise à ce que les PSME des zones d'intervention ciblées au Togo, Niger et Burkina Faso aient accès à des formations professionnelles et techniques de qualité favorisant leur insertion socio-économique.</i>	
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<i>L'emploi rémunéré est un élément fondamental attaché à une personne, en ce qu'il participe à la définition de la place de chacun dans la société. Longtemps considérées comme une « sous catégorie d'emploi », les activités rémunérées sur le marché informel jouent également ce rôle essentiel. En Afrique de l'Ouest comme dans de nombreuses régions, les personnes en situation de handicap (PSH) sont très souvent exclues du marché formel comme de l'informel. Le manque de connaissance des acteurs, les marqueurs sociaux, les croyances limitent notamment l'accès de ces travailleurs à l'Enseignement et à la Formation Technique et Professionnelle (EFTP). Au moment où des efforts particuliers sont entrepris pour renforcer les compétences des travailleurs présents sur ce marché informel, il est nécessaire d'inclure dans cette dynamique, les travailleurs les plus vulnérables : les personnes en situation de handicap, et plus particulièrement les personnes sourdes et malentendantes. Le Togo, le Burkina Faso et le Niger occupent les derniers rangs de l'IDH (159^{ème}, 177^{ème} et 182^{ème} sur 182 pays). La situation des personnes en situation de handicap (PSH) y est préoccupante : dans la région, une personne sur cinq vivant en dessous du seuil de pauvreté est handicapée (Banque Mondiale), 90% des enfants handicapés ne sont pas scolarisés (UNESCO). Le taux de chômage des PSH atteint 85% dans certains pays (OIT).</i>	
4.2. Result of the project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)
Résultat 1: Les structures publiques et privées de formation technique et professionnelle développent leur offre de formation et l'adaptent au PSME.	
Résultat 2: Les PSME actives économiquement ou en recherche d'emploi accèdent à des formations techniques et professionnelles et à des mécanismes d'accompagnement modulables, adaptées à leurs besoins et contraintes	
Résultat 3: Les pouvoirs publics et organisations professionnelles, les familles et les communautés, se mobilisent pour l'insertion professionnelle des PSME.	
Réponse: principales activités à entreprendre	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Amélioration de la pédagogie de la formation et de l'insertion professionnelle: Formation de formateurs à la langue des sourds-muets, à de nouveaux modules techniques et à l'insertion professionnelle des apprenants; Le recrutement de stagiaires et l'insertion: identification via le réseau local; formation du personnel sur le terrain pour aider les stagiaires potentiels, la formation des parents pour aider les futurs stagiaires; La formation des interprètes pour aider les activités de formation. Des cours modulaires et flexibles pour les micro-entrepreneurs; La diffusion des meilleures pratiques et du matériel de formation: Des comités locaux d'échanger des informations et des conseils sur le projet; comité national pour promouvoir les politiques 	

nationales; Elaboration d'une stratégie nationale de communication, rédaction et diffusion des meilleures pratiques et des modules de formation.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)

- 3 main broad criteria **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF**

• **Relevance: A**

Le projet est pertinent car il a pour objectif de promouvoir et de soutenir l'adaptation et la mise en place d'actions de formation de qualité adaptées aux capacités d'apprentissage des personnes sourdes et/ou malentendantes en adéquation avec les besoins du marché de l'emploi.

• **Effectiveness: B**

Les seules informations retrouvées à cet égard se trouvent à l'adresse suivante :

http://www.cbm.org/article/downloads/55254/EMPLOI_POUR_TOUS_SECOND_EDITION_JAN-2012.pdf

• **Efficiency: No Data**

Il n'y a pas d'informations disponibles.

• **Coherence: A**

Le projet est cohérent avec l'Article 27 de la Convention Internationale sur les Droits des Personnes Handicapées : 'Promouvoir les possibilités d'emploi et d'avancement des personnes handicapées sur le marché du travail, ainsi que l'aide à la recherche et à l'obtention d'un emploi, au maintien dans l'emploi et aurtour à l'emploi.'

• **Quality of the Design: B**

Les curriculum et la pédagogie (y compris l'alphabetisation) sont adapté aux besoins spécifiques de la population cible et permettra d'améliorer les conditions de vie des bénéficiaires. Les réseaux activés par le projet permettront également d'améliorer l'insertion des stagiaires. Cependant, le processus de certification devrait être clarifié.

• **Impact: B**

Il n'y a pas d'informations disponibles.

• **Sustainability: B**

La stratégie de développement durable repose essentiellement sur l'utilisation des installations existantes. Pour soutenir ces activités, de nombreux comités et réseaux sont créés, mais leur durabilité et leurs relations / synergies ne sont pas clairement définis. La durabilité est également renforcée par les activités au niveau national visant à promouvoir la sensibilisation et des procédures juridiques.

• **Added value of ETF: NA**

4.3. Beneficiaries

Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

780 travailleurs Sourds et Malentendants de l'économie informelle / Les représentants de 9 associations de / pour personnes sourdes et malentendantes des pays concernés/ 460 professionnels de structures publiques et privées d'EFTP (enseignants, agents de suivi) / Les Associations de Réhabilitation à Base Communautaire agissant dans le domaine de l'EFTP pour personnes en situation de handicap (personnel encadrant, agents communautaires) / Services liés à l'EFTP des 3 gouvernements : ministères, services d'accréditation, chambres des métiers, ... / Au moins 12 représentants provenant d'au moins 6 organisations représentants employeurs et travailleurs / Les familles et les communautés touchées directement par les activités de sensibilisation.

Bénéficiaires finaux 110 000 travailleurs Sourds et Malentendants employés actuels ou potentiels de l'économie informelle / Familles et communautés des PSME visées par l'action / Ensemble des travailleurs en situation de handicap du secteur informel / Employeurs de l'économie informelle.

5. Synopsis

Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

Le projet en faveur des personnes sourdes a une durée de trois ans et couvre trois pays : le Burkina Faso, le Niger et le Togo. Il vise la formation professionnelle et technique de qualité des personnes sourdes et/ou malentendantes des pays cités et l'accès à l'emploi des groupes défavorisés. Ficelé par les ONG CBM (Ensemble nous pouvons faire mieux) et Handicap International, le projet est cofinancé à hauteur de 1, 6 milliard de FCFA par l'Union Européenne (80%) et CBM (20%) qui en assure la coordination. Il est piloté au Togo et au Burkina Faso par Handicap International. Le projet offre l'opportunité d'apprendre un métier, d'installer leur propre atelier afin de supporter leur famille. Les

enseignants professionnels, eux, seront mieux préparés à les accueillir, et la population verra les résultats pratiques d'une insertion réelle des personnes handicapées.

6. Key elements of success

What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

La formation des agents de terrain en suivi socioprofessionnel et langue des signes. L'élaboration des projets personnalisés des bénéficiaires.

La formation des partenaires aux techniques de plaidoyer. L'adaptation de curricula existants au public des PSME. Formation d'enseignants des établissements publics et privés. La formation initiale de jeunes PSME. Le suivi et accompagnement de PSME en situation de travail. La création de « comités locaux pour une formation adaptée »; La mise en place d'instances de concertations régionales, nationales et locales visant notamment à la reconnaissance des diplômes. L'identification et diffusion de bonnes pratiques.

7. Lessons learned

Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.

La formation des agents de terrain en suivi socioprofessionnel et langue des signes: Le suivi personnalisé des bénéficiaires du projet requiert un renforcement adéquat des capacités des agents de terrain.

La formation des partenaires aux techniques de plaidoyer: Le projet EFTP se veut multi-sectoriel, multi-acteurs avec une « approche droite ».

Au Togo. L'atelier de planification stratégique: Une étude d'identification des secteurs économiques porteurs dans la région des Savanes et dans la commune de Lomé a été réalisée au mois de juin 2011. Les résultats de cette étude devront permettre de définir une offre de formation adaptée aux besoins du marché de l'emploi.

8. Implementation partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

2 ONG de développement pour la coordination et la gestion du projet :

CBM, représentée par le Bureau Régional pour l'Afrique de l'Ouest (CBM AFW) et le Bureau de Coordination Nationale au Niger.

Handicap International Fédération, représenté par les Programmes Togo et Burkina Faso.

Cinq (5) structures locales :

Le Centre d'Education et de Formation Intégrée des Sourds et des Entendants (CEFISE), Burkina Faso.

L'Association des Sourds du Niger (ASN).

NIGETECH, Niger.

L'Association Togolaise d'Aide aux Enfants Malentendants et Sourds (ATAIDEMES), Togo.

L'Eglise des Assemblées de Dieu du Togo/Service de Formation et Réhabilitation des Aveugles et autres Handicapés (SEFRAH), Togo.

9. Contacts:

Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail

Christoffel Blindenmission Deutschland e.V. (CBM-D).

NIBELUNGENSTRASSE 124, 64625 BENSHEIM. Germany.

Désiré KABORE, Chef de Projet EFTP Handicap International. Programme Burkina Niger. cp.eftp@hi-burkinaniger.bf

10. Sources, links and publications

Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)

Contract de subvention.

Annexe I: Description de l'action.

CADRE LOGIQUE DE L'ACTION.

SENEGAL

Project title : Renforcement d'un dispositif pédagogique et de services pour la formation technique et professionnelle dans le secteur informel artisanal de la menuiserie et de l'ameublement au Sénégal

Grading:

1. Relevance: A
2. Effectiveness: B
3. Efficiency: ND
4. Coherence: A
5. Quality of Design: B
6. Impact: ND
7. Sustainability: B
8. Added value of ETF: NA

0. TVET at a Glance

Dans le cadre du Programme Décennal de l'Education et de la Formation (PDEF) et suite aux assises de l'Enseignement Technique et de la Formation Professionnelle (ETFP) en 2001, qui ont dessiné les grandes orientations de développement des ressources humaines par la qualification et la définition d'une nouvelle politique de l'ETFP en six (6) points, il a été décidé la création du Fonds de Développement de l'Enseignement Technique et de la Formation Professionnelle (FONDEF), comme outil de financement et de régulation du marché de la formation continue des PME/PMI.

L'ETFP épousent le concept de formation professionnelle et technique, qui fait l'objet d'une réforme en profondeur fondée sur une nouvelle vision. Celle-ci tient compte de la spécificité du sous-secteur, précisant ses ambitions et son champ d'action et modifiant ses principes ainsi que ses méthodes d'intervention. Dans ce cadre, elle est conçue comme un instrument visant à assurer la compétitivité et la performance de l'économie et est centrée sur les finalités ci-dessous: Mettre sur le marché du travail une main d'œuvres qualifiés, en réponse aux besoins du secteur productif et de l'économie en ouvriers, employés, techniciens, agents de maîtrise et techniciens supérieurs; Promouvoir le savoir-agir, l'employabilité et la créativité chez les jeunes et les préparer à devenir des acteurs performants dans la vie active; Accroître le taux de qualification professionnelle et technique au sein de la population.

La formation professionnelle et technique a pour ambition à moyen terme: De satisfaire les besoins en main d'œuvre nouvelle des 5 à 6 secteurs prioritaires de croissance du Sénégal avec un objectif de 20 000 personnes formées par an en 2010; De rehausser dans ces secteurs le niveau de qualification interne des employés pour une productivité de la main d'œuvre proche des standards internationaux; De permettre un taux d'emploi des formés proche de 100%.

Elle institue désormais le principe d'un pilotage partenarial systématique, impliquant les principaux acteurs et bénéficiaires de la formation professionnelle et technique et plus particulièrement le secteur privé, dans la préparation et la mise en œuvre des plans stratégiques y afférant. Elle est organisée autour des missions de formation initiale, de formation continue et d'insertion des formés. Son champ d'action s'étend désormais à l'apprentissage, en tant que formation professionnelle non formelle, dans l'objectif de la mise en place de processus de qualification normés et adaptés.

La réforme du secteur est en cours avec la parution en 2002 du document d'orientation de politique sectorielle comme extra des assises de 2001 qui visent la modernisation de l'ETFP. Les bases de la redéfinition des finalités, des missions et des objectifs de l'ETFP s'articulent autour d'éléments ayant un lien direct avec la compétitivité et l'essor de l'économie nationale. Il est question alors: de la création et de modernisation des entreprises; de l'attraction des investisseurs étrangers en éliminant les risques liés à la non disponibilité des ressources humaines ou aux ruptures de compétences; de la modernisation du secteur primaire; du développement d'un processus d'évolution des entreprises artisanales vers des PME/PMI performantes et compétitives; de la valorisation du secteur informel;

Les six points de la réforme: 1 - Une nouvelle orientation l'ETFP doit répondre aux besoins du marché du travail en ressources humaines qualifiées l'ETFP épouse aujourd'hui le concept de formation professionnelle et technique; 2 - Des missions élargies Désormais, le fonctionnement des structures de formation du secteur, est organisé autour des missions de Formation Initiale, de Formation Continue mais aussi et surtout d'appui à l'insertion des formés.; 3 - Un champ d'action élargi à l'apprentissage Il s'agira d'une intégration de l'apprentissage, plus particulièrement celui qui pratiqué en milieu non

formel dans le dispositif global de formation à travers la mise en place d'un processus de qualification normé et adapté; 4 - Un nouveau mode de gestion et de pilotage Qui se traduira par: une autonomisation des établissements avec des Conseils d'Administration présidés par le privé; l'implication des acteurs du secteur économique dans la gestion des structures de formation et le pilotage du système; l'introduction de la démarche qualité dans les dispositifs de formation du secteur; 5 - De nouvelles modalités pédagogiques: L'Approche par compétences; L'élaboration des « programmes » de formation obéira à la logique de compétence et non à la logique de contenu; La Formation par alternance; L'entreprise est un lieu de formation; 6 - Une nouvelle organisation du système de formation L'offre de formation du système ETFP est organisée autour de 3 niveaux de qualification : -Niveau V (CAP, BEP,...) - Niveau IV (BAC, BT...) - Niveau III (BTS ...)
La formation professionnelle est encore à développer au Sénégal et de nouvelles tendances sont en cours avec l'importance de la FPC de mieux en mieux perçue par les différents acteurs que sont l'Etat, les entreprises, les travailleurs, les centres de formation avec l'appui des partenaires au développement.

1. Identification CRIS decision number	DCI-EDUC/2010/ 231-190: 231190
2. Classification:	
a) By Sectors / Thematic Are	TP-TVET policy and systems: Renforcement d'un dispositif pédagogique et de services pour la formation technique et professionnelle TM -TVET access to target groups: ST- Sectoral Training: menuiserie et de l'ameublement IE- Informal Economy IP. secteur informel artisanal
b) By Instrument (Fund/budget line)	DCI: thematic programmes (investing in people IiP)
c) By region	African, Caribbean and Pacific (ACP) Senegal
d) By Period and Status	Decision year: 2010 Status: Ongoing. 01/01/2011-01/01/2014. 36 Months
3. Financial data	EUR 682 274
Total EC contribution: EUR 545 819 = (80% of indicative programme) Agence Française de Développement EUR 169 237	
4. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
<p>Le présent projet entend contribuer à la réalisation de trois objectifs généraux interdépendants :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Renforcer les capacités des producteurs artisanaux du secteur de la menuiserie comme acteurs clefs de l'émergence d'un entrepreneuriat populaire; • Contribuer au développement économique et à la vitalité sociale; • Réduire la pauvreté et l'inégalité socioéconomique. <p>L'objectif spécifique du projet est de renforcer la structuration des producteurs artisanaux du secteur de la menuiserie en tant qu'acteurs clefs de l'émergence d'un entrepreneuriat populaire. Plus précisément, il s'agit de:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • OS 1: Appuyer la structuration des artisans au sein de l'ONP (Organisation Nationale des Professionnels) Bois et leurs capacités d'influence sur les pouvoirs publics; • OS 2: Promouvoir un cadre de formation adapté aux besoins de renforcement des capacités techniques et de gestion des apprentis des ateliers artisanaux; • OS 3: Renforcer les capacités productives des artisans individuellement et collectivement au sein de l'ONP Bois; • OS 4: Promouvoir la commercialisation de la production des ateliers artisanaux. 	
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	• What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?
<p>Le secteur artisanal est un acteur de transformation sociale. Au Sénégal, le secteur artisanal, en employant plus de 500 000 personnes. La menuiserie Bois est l'un des corps de métiers artisanaux le plus pourvoyeurs d'emploi dans le secteur informel. Une grande majorité d'artisans menuisiers Bois produisent surtout du mobilier et des huisseries ou travaillent dans le bâtiment (coffrage, charpente). Moins nombreux, certains privilégient les objets d'artisanat design, et sont souvent aussi sculpteurs.</p>	

L'innovation et la diversification des productions constituent les principaux enjeux de développement des micro-entreprises artisanales aujourd'hui. Le plus souvent, l'apprenti, s'il est jeune, est confié par les parents/référents à un chef d'atelier, (un parent, un ami, une « connaissance »). Il évolue au sein de l'atelier où, petit à petit il apprend les ficelles du métier jusqu'à devenir prêt à son tour à ouvrir son propre atelier ou à être recruté comme ouvrier.

Le processus d'apprentissage au sein de l'atelier, principalement basé sur l'observation et le mimétisme, s'il s'avère performant, connaît ses limites. L'apprenti observe le maître artisan et apprend avec lui en reproduisant ses gestes et à travers les explications des professionnels les plus expérimentés de l'atelier. Pas toujours structuré, sans véritable progression pédagogique, l'apprentissage peut durer de longues années avant que l'apprenti obtienne le statut d'ouvrier, puis maître artisan.

4.2. Result of the project

- Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)

- R1. L'ONP Bois est représentative des intérêts des artisans grâce au renforcement de son assise, de son fonctionnement démocratique et des capacités de leadership de ses dirigeants; elle est renforcée en tant qu'acteur clef de l'émergence d'un entrepreneuriat populaire ; > 88 membres des CA (régionaux et national) formés ; 9 AG organisées (8 régionales et 1 nationale) ; 8 réunions du CA et 8 du Bureau nationaux organisées ; 1 étude sur la protection sociale des artisans réalisée ; une charte de l'apprentissage ébauchée;
- R2. Des contenus de formation sont ébauchés pour harmoniser la formation dispensée par les maîtres artisans ; la prise en compte – voire la prise en charge – de la formation complémentaire externe des jeunes est améliorée : > 4 CF renforcés ; 258 apprentis formés ; 3 référentiels de formation complémentaires rédigés et distribués ; 8 manuels de formation pour des produits phare rédigés ; des actions de plaidoyers vers les pouvoirs publics organisées;
- R3. Les maîtres artisans ont reçu des formations techniques pour l'acquisition de nouvelles compétences ; l'ONP Bois a renforcé sa capacité à fournir des services adaptés aux artisans en termes de moyens de production: > 80 maîtres artisans formés ; 1 centrale d'achat opérationnelle ; des actions de plaidoyer organisées;
- R4. La mise en valeur de la production locale et la notoriété des produits des artisans ont augmenté grâce aux actions promotionnelles réalisées : > 1 étude sur le marché de l'ameublement réalisée ; 25 minutes de spot audiovisuel diffusées à la télévision sénégalaise ; 135 artisans formés sur la participation à une foire ; 33 artisans participant à 3 foires spécialisées ; des actions de plaidoyers vers les pouvoirs publics organisées.

Grading: Overall analysis carried out against on 8 criteria (which will be applied in a flexible manner)

- 3 main broad criteria **Relevance, Effectiveness and Efficiency**
- 5 additional criteria: **Coherence, Quality of the Design, Impact, Sustainability, and Added value of ETF**

- **Relevance: A**

Le project est pertinent parce qu'au Sénégal, les artisans sont des importants acteurs de lutte contre la pauvreté, notamment à cause des revenus et des créations d'emplois qu'ils génèrent.

- **Effectiveness: B**

Les activités mises en œuvre que pour les informations fournies au <http://www.lakoraprd.org/> soutenir de manière cohérente la réalisation des objectifs fixés. Particulièrement importante apparaît la mise en œuvre de l'appui aux artisans à se joindre au sein de l'ONP, la conception et la prestation de cours de formation spécifiquement adaptés aux besoins des apprentis dans les ateliers identifiés ainsi que le renforcement des capacités de gestion des artisans.

- **Efficiency: No Data**

- **Coherence: A**

Le project est cohérent avec la réforme du secteur ETFP en cours.

- **Quality of the Design: B**

La qualité est bonne parce que les 5 champs d'actions pour un développement économique et social sont: 1) Renforcer le rôle social des artisans menuisiers 2) Améliorer la formation des jeunes apprentis 3) Développer les capacités de production des artisans 4) Soutenir la commercialisation des produits locaux et 5) Faire prendre aux pouvoirs publics toutes leurs responsabilités.

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Impact : No Data • Sustainability: B <p><i>Il s'inscrit dans la continuité du programme d'action mené entre 2003 et 2006, qui a posé les bases des formations et a permis la création de l'Organisation nationale des professionnels du bois (ONPBois). L'ensemble des activités mises en place dans le programme permet aux artisans d'être une réelle force de proposition. Pour que l'Etat assume pleinement son rôle de formation des jeunes Sénégalais, FdH accompagne, avec la Kora-PRD, les artisans et l'ONP-Bois dans leurs négociations avec les pouvoirs publics.</i></p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Added value of ETF: NA 	
4.3. Beneficiaries	Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?
<p><i>Beneficiaries will be both apprentices and craftsmen. The identification of beneficiaries is delegated to the local professional actors (e.g. Kora- PRD, Organisation Nationale des Professionnels du Bois). 10 des 14 régions que compte le Sénégal. Dans 11 villes telles que Dakar, Saint-Louis, Thiès ou Tambacounda, 700 apprentis et 400 artisans, parmi lesquels 80 femmes, vont participer pendant 3 ans aux formations techniques en menuiserie et en tissage.</i></p>	
5. Synopsis	Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.
<p><i>A partir de 2011 et sur une période de 3 ans, Frères des Hommes et la Kora-PRD développent un nouveau programme et mettent l'accent sur la formation technique et professionnelle. Sont concernés les artisans menuisiers de l'ensemble du territoire sénégalais. L'objectif: généraliser la mise en place d'un apprentissage de qualité qui puisse améliorer la formation des apprentis et la production de l'artisanat local.</i></p>	
6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?
<p><i>Au fil des 10 années, différentes étapes se sont succédées, se concrétisant par la mise en œuvre d'un dispositif de formation innovant pour les apprentis et maîtres artisans menuisiers Bois, implanté dans 10 régions du Sénégal. Des supports pédagogiques et référentiels de formation qui portent sur le contenu pédagogique, la progressivité de l'enseignement, l'organisation des cursus et le financement du plan de formation, des chartes de compétences ont été élaborées par des professionnels artisans et une charte d'apprentissage a été conçue par l'Organisation Nationale des Professionnels du Bois. Ces référentiels serviront à démontrer aux pouvoirs publics, notamment locaux, qu'il est possible d'étendre ce type d'initiatives de formation et qu'ils peuvent s'y associer. La formation dispensée par les maîtres artisans sera formalisée par des chartes qui décrivent, étape par étape, les compétences techniques qu'un apprenti doit acquérir en menuiserie. Pour les apprentis, c'est la garantie d'une formation de qualité qui leur donnera la capacité de devenir maître artisan, de monter leur propre atelier et à leur tour, de former d'autres jeunes.</i></p> <p><i>Parallèlement, des formations techniques sur des produits d'ameublement démontables, innovants sont proposées aux maîtres artisans menuisiers pour renforcer leurs capacités techniques et favoriser une diversification des productions au sein des ateliers.</i></p> <p><i>En plus de la formation technique et professionnelle, l'action de la Kora PRD et des Organisations régionales de professionnels du Bois, se concentre sur l'amélioration de l'accès aux équipements, à travers la mise en place de mutuelles d'équipements supports de formation, à Touba et Kolda. Une dizaine de machines à bois et des postes de soudure y sont implantés et ces espaces ont vocation à développer des prestations de services d'usinage et de formation.</i></p>	
7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.
<p><i>Sur les 120 corps de métiers qui composent l'artisanat sénégalais, la menuiserie arrive en seconde position après la couture. Depuis plus de 10 ans, Frères des Hommes et la Kora-PRD travaillent ensemble à renforcer le secteur informel de la menuiserie bois et de l'ameublement. Une filière qui en créant des emplois et en assurant une structuration sociale, permet aux jeunes de sortir de la pauvreté.</i></p> <p><i>Leur engagement sur le long terme a permis de contribuer au renforcement social des artisans menuisiers qui sont désormais réunis au sein d'une organisation professionnelle, l'ONP Bois. Pour répondre à l'évolution du marché, les menuisiers ont développé leurs capacités de production et ont</i></p>	

travaillé à une meilleure commercialisation de leurs produits. Ils ont également amélioré les formations apportées aux jeunes, luttant contre les dérives d'exploitation des apprentis.

8. Implementation partners

Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

Partenaire de Frères des Hommes, la Kora-PRD (Programmes, Ressources, Développement) est une ONG sénégalaise qui lutte contre la pauvreté urbaine en renforçant le secteur artisanal.

Son engagement prend des formes variées : formation, négociation avec les pouvoirs publics, mutualisation de moyens dévolus à l'approvisionnement en matières premières, à la production et à la commercialisation.

Agence Française de Développement.

9. Contacts:

Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail

Frères des Hommes

Kora-PRD

Siège Social Lot 1024

BP 225 Tambacounda Senegal

Tel Fax 221 981 16 14

email lakoratba@orange.sn

Bureau de Dakar Cité Djilly Mbaye n°28

BP 22589 Dakar Ponty

Tel 221 33 820 20 60

10. Sources, links and publications

Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)

Contract de Subvention.

<http://www.fdh.org/Senegal-La-formation-a-l-echelle-d.html>.

<http://www.lakoraprd.org/>.

Référentiel des Pré-Requis nécessaires à l'apprentissage des Pratiques Professionnelles au sein d'un

Atelier Artisanal <http://www.lakoraprd.org/KORA%20-R%C3%A9f%C3%A9rentiel%20pr%C3%A9-requis%202011%20-%20VF.pdf>.

http://www.fondef.gouv.sn/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=52&Itemid=74&lang=fr.