Teacher Policy, Governance and Training: Issues and Evidence to support programming

DEVCO B4 Education discussion paper

December 2014

Abbreviations

BMZ	German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development
CPD	Continuous Professional Development
ESSPIN	Education Sector Support Programme in Nigeria
GIZ	Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
INSET	In-Service Teacher Training
ODL	Open and Distance Learning
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PISA	Programme for International Student Assessment
PRESET	Pre-Service Teacher Training
PTR	Pupil Teacher Ratio
TTI	Teacher Training Institutions

Contents

The purpose of this note is to support the EC's education programming where a significant focus is expected on teachers and teacher training. The paper looks at the following:

1. Background on teacher policy, governance and training;
2. Seven key issues to consider when looking at teacher policy, governance, and training;
3. A checklist with guiding questions for assessment of country context
4. Some recommendations for policy dialogue
5. References for further reading, including sources for this paper

The annex provides some international experience in areas of teacher policy, governance and training.

1 Background

International effort over the past two to three decades has focussed primarily on getting children into school. Across the world, with very few exceptions, enormous progress has been made. More children go to school now than at any time in history: there are more schools, more classrooms and more teachers than ever before. Despite these impressive gains, far too many children are not learning. The fact that so many children leave basic education without achieving the minimal levels of literacy and numeracy points to a systemic failure. This is being described as the *learning crisis* and has become a dominant feature of the Post 2015 discourse. In order to ensure that every child not only enrols in school but learns, it is clear that a far greater focus will need to be placed on teachers and teaching. What strategies are needed to ensure that this happens?

The EC's Staff Working Document *More and Better Education in Developing Countries* (2010) underscores the importance of good teachers and teaching, and

the challenges many countries face in recruitment, deployment, management, retention, and professional development of teachers. The teacher's role is central to the learning process and they are the biggest investment in any education system. The McKinsey Report of 2007[1] emphasised the importance of teachers and teaching: "*no education systems can exceed the quality of its teachers*".

Getting the right people to become teachers and developing them to become effective instructors is essential to improving learning. This is echoed in the recent BMZ/GIZ discussion paper[2] that sees a two-fold challenge in teacher policy: firstly to ensure there are sufficient teachers working where they are needed, and secondly the actual quality of teaching results in adequate levels of learning.

The effectiveness of a country's teachers is influenced by a number of factors: their education and training, the ways in which they are recruited, deployed and managed, the career opportunities and pathways that are open to them; their pay and conditions of service; and how they are utilised, managed and supported within schools.

UNESCO[3] proposes four basic strategies to get the best out of teachers:

- Attract the best into the profession
- Improve teacher education
- Get teachers to where they are most needed
- Provide incentives to retain the best teachers

The UNESCO Global Monitoring Report (2014) focusses on the crisis of teaching and learning. It identifies ten key teaching reforms that are needed to address the learning crisis (see box). These offer a good starting point to frame the right questions for further research and analysis.

UNESCO Top 10 Priority Teaching Reforms[4]

1. Fill teacher gaps
2. Attract the best candidates to teaching
3. Train teachers to meet the needs of all children
4. Prepare teacher educators and mentors to support teachers
5. Get teachers to where they are needed most
6. Use a competitive career and pay structure to retain the best teachers
7. Improve teacher governance to maximise impact
8. Equip teachers with innovative curricula to improve learning
9. Develop classroom assessments to help teachers identify and support students at risk of not learning
10. Provide better data on trained teachers

In addition, other factors also affect teachers and their teaching. The size and nature of the curriculum and how learning is assessed both strongly condition how teachers

[1] McKinsey (2007) "How the World's best performing schools come out on top"

[2] BMZ/GIZ (2013): Teacher policy in Primary and Secondary Education in Development Cooperation. http://www.iiep.unesco.org/fileadmin/user_upload/Info_Services_Publications/pdf/2012/GIZ_Strengthening_Ed_Systems.pdf

[3] UNESCO (2014) EFA Global Monitoring Report - Teaching and Learning: Achieving Quality for All

perform. In addition, a number of school level factors, often outside of the control of teachers themselves, influence the effect teachers can have on their learners; these include class size, physical facilities including classroom conditions and space, and the availability of teaching and learning resources, including textbooks.

All of these 'external' factors need to be looked at when considering interventions to improve teacher skills, in particular investing in pre- and in-service training programmes.

2 Seven key issues to consider when looking at teacher policy, governance and teacher training.

Teachers do not work in isolation; they are an integral part of much wider systems that influence their motivation, attitudes, effort and performance. Countries that seek a high quality and effective teaching force need to ensure the following:

- A sound overarching **teacher policy** that:
  - ensures that the supply of teachers matches demand;
  - deploys teacher equitably so that more marginalised areas get sufficient and good teachers;
  - selects and recruits the right people to become teachers;
  - establishes clear pay and benefit structures so that skilled teachers are retained;
  - offers attractive and clear career progression based on merit.
- Teacher **management systems** that:
  - set professional standards for the profession;
  - licences teachers based on qualification, training and performance;
  - utilises teachers effectively in terms of their teaching loads and class contact time;
  - manages the payroll effectively, removing "ghost" teachers;
  - recognises and rewards good performance;
  - monitors, supports and appraises teachers regularly;
  - improves educational leadership in schools that sets high expectations and helps teachers develop.
- Teacher **professional development systems** that:
  - Offer good quality, practical initial teacher training, ensuring that all qualified teachers demonstrate basic competencies;
  - Offer regular on-the–job support and opportunities for advancement through high quality continuous professional development programmes

Teacher policy

1 Addressing the teacher gap. Many countries face an acute shortage of teachers. According to the latest UIS data, an estimated 4 million teachers are required to achieve universal primary education by 2015; this shortage is most severe in Sub-Saharan Africa[5]. The UNESCO *International Task Force for Teachers for EFA* has a useful resource for estimating the "teacher gap"[6]. Addressing the teacher gap is therefore a policy priority in many countries.

There are numerous policy options open to governments to increase the size of the teaching force. Each offers both opportunity and risk. The major policy tensions are around expanding the numbers of teachers without reducing quality (already seen as low in many countries) and not incurring unsustainable additional costs. There are no easy answers and trade-offs are inevitable. Key policy options for addressing the teacher gap include:

Strategy	Issues and Challenges
Expanding the capacity of pre-service training programmes.	Teacher colleges are often slow and resistant to change and unable to expand facilities quickly. Costs remain high.
Shortening the period of initial teacher training	Fear of reduced quality, especially with lower entry requirements. Can be mitigated by improving the quality of teacher training programmes.
Reduce entry requirements	Fear of reduced quality. Often resisted by colleges and unions.
Adopting in-service approaches for unqualified, serving teachers	Often perceived to lower standards and quality. Advantage is that training becomes "on the job". Requires different delivery models to conventional college based training. Can be very cost effective.
Using unqualified, contract or para teachers	Perceived to lower standards and resisted by teacher colleges, teachers and unions for fear of "de-professionalising" teaching.
Adopting multi-grade teaching	Cost effective in small schools but requires advanced teaching skills, often not addressed in initial training.
Use of double shifting	Widely used in various forms. Reduces class contact time; can increase hours and stress on teachers where they cover both shifts.
Use of community teachers, community cost sharing	Communities bear costs, including salaries. Affects the poorest the most; conflict with EFA policies; can improve accountability nd attendance.
Increase contact hours for secondary teachers.	Resisted by teachers and unions, may require reduction in size of curriculum. There is very mixed evidence of the impact of reducing or increasing hours of instruction: increasing the quality of instruction is more important than increasing the quantity[7].
Improve pay and conditions and career progression	Encourages higher educated entrants, improves retention but often beyond budget capacity of countries.

The consequences of NOT adopting clear and doable policies is to remain in shortage, with pupil:teacher ratios (PTR) too high for effective teaching and

[5] http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0022/002299/229913E.pdf
[6] http://www.teachersforefa.unesco.org/v2/index.php/en/
[7] Hincapie, D (2014) Do Longer School Days improve student achievement? Evidence from Columbia. This study finds evidence linking a longer school day to improved achievement.

learning. This results in low levels of pupil achievement and high rates of repetition and drop out.

On balance, contract teacher programmes in India have not worsened the quality of education. Lower levels of training seem to be compensated by higher levels of presence at school, which is likely to be linked to local recruitment rather than their contract type per se. But contract teachers' contribution and impact are minimal, since learning outcomes remain extremely low in most of India regardless of the type of contract a teacher holds, and have been declining in recent years. Given that training for both regular teachers and contract teachers is inadequate, policy-makers need to invest in subject knowledge and pedagogical skills training for all teachers, regardless of their contract type.
UNESCO GMR 2014 p 258

2 Getting teachers to the right places.

Almost all countries face problems in ensuring an equitable distribution of teachers. Remote rural areas, slum areas of cities as well as socially or ethnically marginalised part of the country, often fail to attract teachers who prefer to live and work in better off, more urbanised locations. These under-served communities who need more often in fact get less, compounding existing inequities. Policies are required to redress these inequities that encourage teachers to work in these difficult areas. These can include:

Strategy	Issues/challenges
Provision of housing	Often expensive and open to abuse. Can be community led.
Recruit locally	Reduces risk of non-attendance and frequent transfer; improved accountability. May require reduced entry requirements, but can be linked to future training options.
Pay and promotion incentives	Serving in difficult areas attracts increase allowances, so increases costs. Does not always solve poor attendance. Linking to promotion requires clear policy and management system.
Other incentives	Provision of household items (e.g. cooking equipment, furniture) and bicycles; subsidies for public transport etc.
Link posting to further training opportunity	Attractive to un- or under-qualified teachers, though results in eventual transfer of experience out of hard to reach areas.

3 Encouraging the right people to become teachers.

There is some evidence that links levels of education of teachers with improved pupil learning, so recruiting the best educated people possible into teaching is a sensible strategy. However, in many developing countries teaching is not seen as an attractive career and often fails to attract higher performing students. Numerous studies have pointed to teaching being perceived as low status, low paid, and as a career of last resort where preferred career paths do not materialise.

Teachers' salaries in developing countries are a significantly greater multiple of the average GDP per capita (average 4.1 (for primary) across 45 countries) than in the majority of OECD countries (average 1.23 after 15 years across 16 countries)[8]. This metric disguises the fact that in very many developing countries with very high levels of poverty, teachers' basic pay is insufficient to support a family[9]. Low levels

[8] BMZ/GIZ paper (op cit) using UIS (2011) date for developing countries and OECD (2012) for OECD countries.
[9] For a good graphical comparison of teachers pay see the GMR (2014) Figure 6.1 p.255.

of pay for teachers to take a second job, lead to frequent absence and encourage them to require pupils to take extra tuition to supplement their inadequate income.

Lessons from low cost private schools.

There has been a significant rise in the number of low cost private schools in many developing countries. This has been driven by persistent failure of governments to provide either sufficient places in government schools or education of adequate quality. There is growing evidence of the effectiveness of these schools. Large *chains* of low cost private schools, such as the Bridge International Academies (Kenya), Omega (Ghana), Gyan Shala (India), the Punjab Education Foundation (Pakistan) and iSchool (Zambia) deliver better learning outcomes at lesser cost when compared to government schools. Teachers in low cost private schools are generally lesser qualified and lower paid than in government schools. Their performance is largely attributable to

- high levels of school-level accountability that results in greater time on task,
- the use of high quality, standardised lesson plans and materials, often using ICT
- effective training, support and supervision of teachers at their schools.

Links to the examples above are given in Section 5.

Increased demands for more teachers can further lower the educational qualifications of those entering teaching. Despite the ideal of recruiting high performing school graduates, the reality for the majority of developing countries is they simply cannot afford to.

Despite this, there are a number of promising strategies:

- Providing competitive pay and benefits, including health, pension, and subsidised housing
- Broadening selection criteria, balancing academic performance with other aptitudes and competences, and recruiting those who want to teach
- Reducing entry requirements, matching these to the level to be taught and using specialised tests for selection.
- Prioritise the recruitment of women

4 Retaining teachers

High attrition rates from the teaching profession is a major issue in many developing countries, often a symptom of teaching not being the first choice of career. Teacher training is often seen as a way of securing a place in higher education, and so teaching becomes a stepping stone to other, more attractive occupations. Un- or under-qualified teachers that have been accepted into teaching to meet chronic shortages, often have good opportunities to pursue further training which, once completed, provides a springboard out of teaching into other careers. The practice of bonding teachers for a period of time following training can be practiced, though it is often hard to enforce and the results are mixed.

Many of the strategies used to attract the right people into teaching also apply to keeping them there. Incentives need not always be financial – increasing teachers' pay is frequently not a realistic option in poorer economies. Some success in retention is found in non-cash alternatives:

- Improving working conditions, including school facilities and infrastructure, including functional toilets and a staff room
- Increasing school autonomy over selection and recruitment, and involving the community: this can improve accountability and teacher attendance
- Increase community support for teachers helps teachers "belong" and improved accountability
- Ensure adequate resources, such as textbooks, instructional materials and teacher guides
- Provide mentoring and induction to new teachers
- Provide opportunities for professional development

Many countries pay less to teachers in primary schools compared to those in secondary schools. This is often because the entry qualifications are lower. This variation in pay acts as an incentive for primary teachers to seek higher qualification and migrate out of primary teaching to the secondary level. Lower teaching loads at secondary level provide an additional pull.

5 *Teacher Management*

Ensuring teachers are effectively managed is key to improving accountability that promotes effective teaching and learning. Good management is about enabling teachers to maximise their "time on task". Effective management starts with setting of clear standards or codes of conduct. This is typically enshrined in teachers' contracts of employment, regulations that set out what schools are obliged to do, including days and hours of effective instruction, and teachers codes of conduct. Standards underpin the routines and processes of formal school inspection, as well as local level monitoring by education office officials.

Effective management starts at the level of the school with important roles for school principals and school managers. Head teachers rarely receive any special training in leadership, and are often powerless to sanction or discipline teachers who fail to perform or behave. Introducing effective staff appraisal processes, together with skilling and empowering head teachers to use then effectively, provides means to manage poor and recognise good performance. Structures that engage the community in the running of the school, such as School Management Committees/Councils and parent teacher bodies can also exert a strong influence in improving teacher accountability.

Three persistent abuses are reported in the literature regarding teacher behaviour in schools:

- **Absenteeism**, some of which is sanctioned (illness, bereavement and collecting salary) but much of which is not, including internal absenteeism when the teacher is in school but not in class.

- **Physical abuse** of children including corporal punishment even when there are clear regulations that forbid it, and sexual abuse and harassment which frequently goes unreported and at worst is punished by transfer
- The practice of charging for **additional tuition** after school in order to supplement salaries. At its worst, teachers deliberately fail to deliver effective lessons, often withholding textbooks, or marking pupils down in tests or examination, unless they pay for extra classes

Teachers are an expensive resource, collectively they account for the majority of the education budget. A good teacher costs the same as a bad teacher, and an absent teacher the same as one in the classroom. Inefficient management, or deliberate abuse, of the teacher payroll often results in "ghost" teachers: teachers who draw salary but do not teach. This has been reported as a major problem in many countries including Pakistan and Uganda.

Similarly, teacher absenteeism substantially reduces the time children are actively and productively learning. It is estimated that teacher absenteeism accounts for the loss of up to a quarter of total primary school spending in the developing world[10]. In Transparency International's recent survey[11], five countries were reported with teacher absenteeism rates over 20% - Kenya, Uganda, India, Ghana and Senegal.

Strategies to reduce teacher absenteeism include:

- Strengthening monitoring from district authorities and inspectors. In many contexts these services are so underfunded that supervision occurs so infrequently as to render it ineffective.
- Empower local communities to monitor and report attendance through school report cards
- Using "objective monitoring" such as cameras to certify attendance and link this to pay
- Deduct pay for unapproved absence
- Improve pay to prevent teachers from seeking additional employment to supplement low salary
- Improve school infrastructure and facilities: teachers are more likely to attend regularly of the school is a decent place to work
- Improve pupil attendance: attendance by both pupils and teachers are mutually reinforcing.

Managing teaching loads to make the most optimal use of teachers' time is important in improving efficiency. Here the difference between primary and

[10] http://blogs.worldbank.org/education/hidden-cost-corruption-teacher-absenteeism-and-loss-schools
[11] Op cit

secondary schools is marked, where primary teachers generally teach a single class for most, if not all, of the time. Subject specialisation comes in at the secondary level where, depending on the curriculum and specialisations of teachers, actual contact hours can be as little as 50% of available time. This reduced load, often coupled with the better salaries at secondary level, discourage would be teachers from opting to teach in primary schools.

6 *Teachers unions*

In many countries, teachers are very often a powerful political force. They make up the largest single group of public employees and are widely dispersed across the population. In many communities they are invariably amongst the better educated and they become important political agents and influencers in elections. They are also amongst the more unionised of workers and collectively represent a powerful lobby. The threat of industrial action is often very real and many governments are often cautious about confronting teachers. They are frequently able to extract concessions, including pay rises in periods leading up to elections. (e.g Ghana).

They are able to use their power to relax controls on performance, including tolerance of high levels of absenteeism for example. There is evidence that the presence of strong teacher unions is associated with lower learning outcomes[12]. Given the power and influence that teacher unions often hold, there is a need to use this to greater benefit. Significant value could be added to addressing the learning crisis by working with unions to develop their capacity to set and uphold high professional standards and to ensure members adhere to agreed codes of conduct, including addressing absenteeism. There is scope to engage positively with teachers unions in overcoming the challenges of getting supporting teachers to work in difficult circumstances.

The importance of taking into account the views of teachers and their unions is highlighted by the UNESCO Task Force[13], citing examples of failed attempts to introduce reforms aimed to improve the accountability of teachers in Jamaica and Peru.

7 Teacher Training and Professional Development

There is considerable evidence that links the quality of teaching to learning outcomes. Effective pre-service training (PRESET) and subsequent access to Continuous Professional Development (CPD) or In-service (INSET) programmes are

[12] Geeta Kingdon et al (2014) A Rigorous review of the political economy of education systems in developing countries. DFID. https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/305753/Political-economy-education-systems1.pdf

[13] http://www.teachersforefa.unesco.org/v2/index.php/en/ressources/file/232-ei-global-managerial-reforms-and-teachers

necessary but not themselves sufficient factor in teacher effectiveness. Without addressing issues around teacher policy and their management, investment in teacher training may be ineffective. Teacher training therefore needs to be considered as part of a broader programme.

Hard evidence that links specific characteristics of pedagogy to learning outcomes is weak, though points generally towards the use of interactive pedagogy as being more effective. Effective teachers are those who regularly adopt a number of communicative strategies, such as seeking feedback, sustaining attention, including all learners, creating a safe and supportive environment and showing sensitivity to pupils' backgrounds. Teachers who adopt these strategies are more likely to demonstrate effective practice that includes a variety of whole-class, group or pair work, use of varied question types, use demonstration, explanation and a wide range of resources, and use local languages[14].

Initial Teacher Training.

Effective initial teacher training is a prerequisite in establishing an effective teaching force. Many initial teacher training systems operate on a very similar model of between one and there years of intra-mural study. Periods of time in teacher training institutions are balanced with periods of practical experience, where trainees are placed in schools under the supervision of experienced teachers. What sounds good in theory is often very different in practice. A number of issues affect the effectiveness of initial teacher training:

- Outdated teacher training curricula, that has often failed to keep pace with curriculum change in schools or the real needs of teachers in a context of rapid increases in enrolment.
- Low quality of staff, many of whom have not received professional development and who are out of touch with schools.
- Inadequate facilities, budgets and resources.
- A heavy focus on *content* (what to teach) at the expense of *methodology* (how to teach). In part this is driven by the intake into teacher training programmes, with a lowering of entry qualifications.
- Failure to effectively resource the classroom practice element of teacher training programmes, either through regular and effective supervision by college staff or by schools at which trainees are placed.
- Certification based largely on written tests and examinations and not on an assessment of practical ability to teach

[14] Jo Westbrook et al (2013): Pedagogy, Curriculum, Teaching Practices and Teacher Education in Developing Countries. Education Rigorous Literature Review. DFID.

Distance education for teacher training

As discussed earlier, the requirement to increase the numbers of teacher to meet rapidly expanding enrolment has often resulted in an increase in the number of unqualified and untrained teachers. In many countries, the trained teacher gap has widened (e.g. Ghana, Lesotho, Benin) in recent years[15]. In response, countries have often turned to open and distance programmes to reach unqualified teachers without the need to take them out of schools to provide training. Distance programmes had in fact been used long before the post-Dakar surge. Tanzania trained 45,000 teachers between 1965 and 1981 through a print-based programme through its National Correspondence Institute. Today, Ghana uses print material to reach unqualified teachers through its Untrained Teachers Diploma in Basic Education[16]. New technologies have increasingly opened up new models of distance programmes involving radio, television and video, computer-based multimedia programmes, web-based approaches and increasing now mobile models using cellular phones and tablets. These technologies have enormous power to reach large numbers of teachers, for both initial, pre-service training as well as in-service, continuous professional development programmes. They are proving increasing attractive, affordable and effective and challenge the limitations of more conventional, intra-mural approaches.

In-service Teacher Training or Continuous Professional Development (CPD)

Countries with the highest performing education systems ensure that their teachers receive regular professional development. Lack of opportunity to access CPD is not confined to developing countries. The PISA Report of 2000 estimated that more than 50% of teachers in OECD countries received no professional development[17].

For CPD programmes to be effective they need to:

- Be aligned to teachers expressed needs and their classroom realities;
- Provide follow-up in school support, particularly from heads, peers and the community for teachers to apply new practices;
- Be linked to the curriculum, which in turn is aligned to assessment.

In-service teachers' training is sadly neglected in many developing countries. This is very often driven by lack of finance, and where CPD is available it is often provided as part of a donor-funded project, with tendencies to being transient, linked to specific project objectives and unsustainable. Other flaws in in-service provision are

[15] Global Campaign for Education (2012): Every Child Needs a Teacher - Closing the Trained Teacher Gap http://www.campaignforeducation.org/docs/reports/ECNAT%20Report_RGB.pdf

[16] M Bruns (2011): Distance Education for Teacher Training: Modes, Models and Methods. EDC/UNESCO. http://www.teachersforefa.unesco.org/v2/index.php/en/ressources/category/97-teacher-training

[17] PISA 2000 cited in F Wheelan *Lessons Learned: How Good Policies Produce Better Schools* p.153. MPG Books. http://www.acasus.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/02/R2-Lessons-Learned.pdf

the frequent requirement to take teachers away from their classrooms for training, or to run programmes during school vacations. And finally, many CPD programmes rely heavily on the traditional *cascade* model using a number of tiers of trainers of trainers, with frequent variation and dilution of quality further down the cascade. More successful models of CPD involve whole school approaches to improvement, locating CPD within or close to schools. A good example is the ESSPIN programme in Nigeria[18].

3 Checklist with guiding questions for assessment of country context

The table below lists the major issues that should be taken into account in the design of programmes that aim to support teacher policy, management and training.

What is the current profile of the teaching profession, teacher policy and governance?	
Key questions	*Further questions and comment*
What policies exist on teachers and teaching, are they up-to-date and relevant to current needs?	Undertake a broad and fairly rapid analysis of relevant policies that should cover issues related to training, recruitment, distribution etc. What are teachers paid (at all levels), how are rates of pay generally regarded, and what is the multiple of average teacher salary to GDP per capita? Is there any overall strategy and plan that attempts to manage teacher supply and demand, remuneration, promotion, career path etc.
What are the teacher supply and demand dynamics?	Is there a shortage of teachers? How many teachers (male and female) are there at various levels/stages of education? National averages alone are not that useful. It is important to get a picture of the distribution of teachers, so data disaggregated by geographical area tells us where shortages might be. Typically, remoter rural areas are underserved, have greater numbers of unqualified teachers and higher transfer and teacher absenteeism rates. Also the number of female teachers….This might warrant targeted interventions in training, as well as incentives to promote better equity and quality.
What is the ratio of contract or para-teachers to conventional teachers?	Where there has been a reliance on the recruitment of contract teachers (e.g India, Zambia) what is the ratio between them and conventional teachers? What is government policy towards contract teachers: to incorporate them into the civils service or not? What are the differences in pay, and do we know anything about rates of attendance or performance? The evidence as to whether these teachers are as effective as qualified teachers is mixed, and often determined by other context-specific factors (for example…). All other things being equal, the evidence shows that qualification and training do matter.
What are the Pupil Teacher Ratios, trained vs untrained	It is important to get an understanding of the proportions of teachers who are trained/qualified and those who are not. Again, geographical data is essential, as is gender. Qualified teacher supply has often not kept pace with rapidly expanding enrolments, many countries have resorted to the use of unqualified or "para" teachers.
Teachers pay	How much to teachers get paid? What is the difference between primary and secondary teachers' salaries? Has teachers' pay changed in recent years? What is the general view on the level of teachers pay? Are low levels of pay linked to absence, second jobs and informal/illegal charges? Are there any incentives for teachers to work

[18] http://www.esspin.org/

	in difficult or remote areas?
Teacher Unions	How strong and influential are teacher unions? What is their relationship with Government? Are they included in key policy discussions around teachers, particularly pay and performance? What are their priorities?
What is the situation with regard to private school teachers?	This is worth looking at where there is a significant number of private schools, particularly those that are low cost and serve poorer communities.

What is the current situation regarding initial teacher training?	
What are the institutional arrangements for and capacity of Teacher Training Institutions?	What arrangements are there for initial (pre-service) teacher training? What format do courses take, particularly the division of time between college-based study (subject content and methodology) and teaching practice? Look at the number of colleges, What are the entry requirements? Is there any analysis of pre-service training, in terms of quality? What is the collective capacity of teacher training institutions to supply the system? Are these institutions at, under or over capacity? At the secondary level, are there particular subject areas that are under-supplied? Often there are shortages in Science and Maths. Where there are large numbers of unqualified teachers, are there special measures and programmes to enable them to become qualified/trained? How are these programmes managed? What do we know about their costs and their effectiveness in comparison to conventional initial training programmes?
What do we know about the quality of initial teacher training?	What is the length of training programmes? What is the balance of time spent between training institution-based study and teaching practice (*practicum*)? Common problems are an out-dated curriculum that is not aligned to what schools need; tired and out-of-touch teacher educators, many of whom have not ever taught at the level they are teaching; too much focus on content (subject matter) and not enough on methodology (teaching skills). Teacher training institutions often lack sufficient and up-to-date resources. Lack of funds often means that staff cannot effectively support or supervise teaching practice - arguably the most important part of teacher training. *Practicum* schools offer little guidance and supervision, often viewing a trainee as an additional pair of hands that frees up an existing teacher. Is there any use of open/distance approaches in initial training?
How is Teacher Training financed?	How are teacher trainees financed? Are costs covered through public funds and grants? Do trainees contribute? Are there loan schemes? Is there any "bonding" arrangements for graduates that require them to teach?
What opportunities do unqualified teachers have to become qualified?	Policies to rapidly increase enrolment over the last decade have seen the recruitment of large numbers of under-qualified and untrained teachers entering the profession. Many countries have developed programmes to train these teachers, some through gradually bringing them into conventional full-time programmes at teacher colleges, and some through on-the job open and distance programmes. Technology is now being more widely adopted in teacher training programmes,

	replacing the earlier reliance on print materials. This applies also to CPD programmes.
What is the current situation regarding teachers' Continuous Professional Development?	
What access do teachers have to in-service training/ Continuous Professional Development (CPD) opportunities?	Is there a CPD policy? Are there budget lines for CPD? Who is providing CPD programmes? Often much is done by donors, NGOs or faith-based organisations where they are strongly involved in running schools. Are CPD programmes offered to primary as well as secondary teachers Where aspects of CPD are privatized, what type of training is offered? At which levels (training opportunities for secondary education are often quite limited)? Is the training linked with teacher assessment cycles? It is helpful to make a distinction between initial qualification/training courses for serving unqualified teachers (as above) and more general opportunities for serving teachers to improve their skills and abilities – CPD. Few developing countries have coherent CPD programmes; the majority of activity tends to be project-related and externally (donor) financed. It is worth doing some mapping of recent and on-going CPD programmes. Are there any good evaluations of teacher training (both pre- and in-service), especially of impact (i.e. improvements in learning outcomes or changes in teacher effectiveness) not just activity (teacher satisfaction with the training)? Most evaluations of CPD programmes are done internally through the projects or programmes of which they are part. These generally look at the successful completion of activities and rarely monitor positive change in the classroom. Robust independent evaluations of CPD programmes that link to improved learning outcomes are rare.
What approaches or models of CPD are used?	There are a number of common approaches to CPD, and often these can be used in combination. The most common is perhaps the **cascade model**, often used when wishing to reach a large number of teachers with a common message (e.g. introducing a new curriculum). The cascade involves a number of "master trainers" providing training of trainers who then train teachers in a defined number of workshops. Problems with this model are high cost, "dilution" of quality down the cascade and variability of quality depending of the skills of a diverse number of trainers. Another, less centralised model is the "**cluster" approach**, where groups of schools/teachers in close proximity organise their own CPD activities, often lead by a facilitator or locally appointed trainer. This model gives teachers more autonomy and choice over the content of their CPD, it is cheaper to run and often felt to be more closely related to the reality of teacher's own classrooms. Similar to this are **school-based** or **peer-to-peer** CPD programmes, where small groups of teacher work together to resolve common problems and promote better practice. Technology is opening up new possibilities for improving teachers' skills and knowledge and is a powerful way of bringing high quality ideas and materials to classroom teachers. A good example is the "trainer in the pocket" approach from the *English in Action* programme in Bangladesh[19]. Hardware costs and connectivity are key cost considerations. Hardware costs and connectivity are key cost considerations.

[19] http://www.eiabd.com/eia/

	A common problem in many countries is the separation of CPD from initial teacher training programmes. Staff from teacher training institutions is often not involved in CPD programmes, depriving them of the opportunity to upgrade their skills and knowledge – and failing to ensure that pre-service programmes incorporate the new ideas and innovations being promoted through CPD.
What is known about the quality of teaching?	What teachers actually do in class is determined by a number of things. Large class sizes, cramped spaces, lack of textbooks and other materials all restrict what teachers can do. Very frequently the dominant style is didactic, "chalk and talk". What documentation or evidence is there on teaching? Good observational data is often hard to come by. School supervision and inspection reports may contain some useful data, but are often very general and subject to the capability of the supervisor or inspector.

4 Recommendations for policy dialogue

The following eight points offer some guidance for policy dialogue: how to generate interest and open up opportunities for reform.

- Map the territory: find out what others are doing on teacher policy, governance and teacher education and what impact it is having.
- Start from a position of evidence, so where there is incomplete data and information, commission a detailed study that examines both qualitative and quantitative aspects of teacher governance, management and training so that investment decisions are based on sound analysis. This should include a good needs analysis of the current state of teaching in schools. This will bring out the degree of alignment between what goes on in teacher training institutions and what is needed in schools. It should also include a study of existing teacher policies, which should cover recruitment, deployment, career progression and pay and conditions of service. What factors appear to limit teacher effectiveness and what opportunities are there for reform?
- Engage with teacher unions: they are powerful stakeholders and their inclusion in policy discussion essential to promote ownership and support for reform. Often where there is friction in the relationship between unions and government, an external agency such as the EU can act as a honest broker to improve the relationship.
- Consider what to focus on: whether a discrete focus and investment in teacher education, either pre-service or in-service, or both, is the most sensible starting point or whether broader, more systemic issues around teacher governance, are likely to have greater impact. The relatively easier entry point to teacher training may open doors to engage in more contentious issues of teacher policy and governance.

- **Do not ignore the hard parts!** Supporting improvements in pre-service teacher education may not be effective if wider structural problems in the way teacher training is currently organised and run are not addressed. Training will only make a difference if it is good, so supporting the reform of the way teacher training is organised and delivered can have far reaching and sustainable benefits. Does the EU Delegation, and more importantly do the Government, Teacher Unions and other key stakeholders have the necessary appetite for what can be a difficult process?
- **Define the problem that you are trying to solve**. If it is to provide training to un- or under-trained teachers, and/or to raise specific skill and competency levels in certain/all teachers, what is the best approach?
- **What opportunities exist for using ICT**? Extending the use of technology in education is often politically popular through association with modernity. The focus is often on the technology itself and not the application: so be clear about how it can add value over other approaches. Technology offer attractive and cost effective ways of getting high quality materials and ideas to teachers and classrooms.
- Any focus on **Teacher Training Institutions** (TTI) should look at:
    - Reform of the training curriculum to link it more closely to the reality of classrooms
    - Upgrade the skills and competencies of TTI staff
    - Improving the status of TTIs so they are considered places of adult education and not schools
    - Place a greater emphasis on effective teaching practice within initial training programmes: less theory, more practical
    - Look at ODL as a cost effective alternative to residential, full time programmes
    - Concentrate on building both teachers subject knowledge and understanding of effective pedagogy
    - Place emphasis on trainees' performance rather than knowledge in final assessment.

5 References for further reading, including sources for this paper

Key Resources

- UNESCO Institute for Statistics (UIS) and EFA Global Monitoring Report, Policy paper and factsheet. http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0022/002299/229913E.pdf
- UNESCO International Task Force on Teachers for Education For All http://www.teachersforefa.unesco.org/v2/index.php/en/
- BMZ/GIZ (2013): Teacher policy in Primary and Secondary Education in Development Cooperation.

http://www.iiep.unesco.org/fileadmin/user_upload/Info_Services_Publications/pdf/2012/GIZ_Strengthening__Ed_Systems.pdf

- UNESCO 2006 Teachers and Education Quality: Monitoring Global Needs for 2015 http://www.uis.unesco.org/Library/Documents/teachers06-en.pdf
- UNESCO (2014) Global Monitoring Report - Teaching and Learning: Achieving Quality for All. Chapter 6: A four part strategy for providing the best teachers http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0022/002256/225660e.pdf
- HEART/DFID (Health and Education Advice and Resource Team) (2013) Attracting and Retaining Teachers. http://www.heart-resources.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/05/Language-of-Instruction-June-2011.pdf?062746
- Geeta Kingdon et al (2014) A Rigorous review of the political economy of education systems in developing countries. DFID. https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/305753/Political-economy-education-systems1.pdf
- MacKinsey (2010) "How the World's Most Improved School Systems Keep Getting Better". http://mckinseyonsociety.com/downloads/reports/Education/How-the-Worlds-Most-Improved-School-Systems-Keep-Getting-Better_Download-version_Final.pdf
- Westbrook, Jo et al (2013) Pedagogy, Curriculum, Teaching Practices and Teacher education in Developing Countries. DFID Rigorous Literature Review. http://eppi.ioe.ac.uk/cms/LinkClick.aspx?fileticket=XHbLclohFq0%3D&tabid=3433
- Schustereder, J (2014) Teacher Policies in the European Union and Central Asia. European Union Programme for Central Asia (CAEP).

Links to low cost private school chains:

- Bridge International Academies http://www.bridgeinternationalacademies.com/company/about/
- Gyan Shala http://gyanshala.org/
- Omega Schools http://www.omega-schools.com/index.php
- Punjab Education Foundation http://www.pef.edu.pk/
- iSchool http://ischool.zm/

Other useful reading:

- Glewwe, P; Hanushek, E, Humpage, S, Ravina, R (2011) School Resources and Educational Outcomes in Developing Countries: A Review of the Literature from 1990 to 2010. National Bureau of Economic Research Working Paper 17554
- MacKinsey (2007) "How the World's best performing schools come out on top" http://www.smhc-cpre.org/wp-content/uploads/2008/07/how-the-worlds-best-performing-school-systems-come-out-on-top-sept-072.pdf
- ESSPIN (2011) "Teacher Development Needs Analysis", Kano State, Nigeria. http://www.esspin.org/index.php/resources/abs/non-esspin/321/Kano-Teachers-Development-Needs-Analysis-Report-June-2011
- Hayes, D (2000) Cascade Training and teacher professional development. English Language Teaching Journal 54(2) http://www.freewebs.com/lilianriverazenoff/English%20Methodology%20II/Teachers_development.pdf

- DFID (2013) Business Case for Teacher Development Programme, Nigeria
- Bernard et al in Edge et al (2002) "The role of teachers in improving learning in Burundi, Malawi, Senegal and Uganda: Great Expectations, little support" ILOPS Programme report on Teacher Quality. (cited in DFID 2013)
- Darling-Hammond, L and Post L, (2000) "Inequality in teaching and schooling: Supporting high quality teaching and leadership in low income schools" in Kahlenberg, R D (ed) "A Nation at Risk: Preserving public education as an engine for social mobility" (cited in DFID 2013)
- Dembélé, M (2005) "Breaking the mould: teacher development for pedagogical renewal" in Verspoor, A (ed) (2005) "The Challenge of Learning: Improving the Quality of basic Education in Sub Saharan Africa, ADEA Paris. (cited in DFID 2013)
- The Centre for International Education (University of Sussex, UK) Multi-Site Teacher Education Research (MUSTER): *Researching Teacher Education: new Perspectives on Practice, Performance and Policy Synthesis Report* (2003)
- EdQUAL Research led by Bristol University: Final Report 2012