

Minutes of TWG-FR Development Partner meeting
16 February 2015
At the EU Delegation

The meeting began with a warm welcome of Ms. Elodie Maria-Sube, Attaché to the EU Delegation and the DP Lead Facilitator of the TWG-FR. She informed the participants that the 43rd TWG-FR meeting will be held on 9 March 2015.

Agenda:

1. Completion of implementation of Annual NFP (National Forest Program) work plan 2014 (10 min)

Mr. Sok Srun presented the completion of the implementation of the annual NFP work plan 2014. It is time to complete the report of the expenditure of the work plan 2014. The total expenditure is 77% compared to total annual budget plan of **22,766,656 USD**. The expenditures are mostly ranging from 70% to 100%. However some DPs and NGOs had not yet reported, therefore he called the partners to report before the 43rd TWG-FR that is scheduled on 9 March 2015 to complete the report. There is no indication of needed intervention from FA or/MoE. More information is in the annex 1 and is available in www.twgfr.org

2. Update NFP Work Plan for 2014-2018 (5 min.)

Mr. Sok Srun presented the update NFP Work Plan for 2014-2018. There are 28 partners that are supporting the implementation of NFP. The annual budgets from 2015 to 2018 have increased every year because of new supported projects by DPs. In 2015 = 20,049,049 USD; 2016 = 10,239,143 USD; 2017 = 8,175,127 USD; 2018 = 7,735,480 USD. When EU launch natural resources management programme the budget will increase a lot from 2017. More information is in the annex 2 and is available in www.twgfr.org.

Ms. Elodie informed that EU bilateral cooperation has budget of 95 million Euro for support to the natural resources management that includes forestry. The identification and formulation of EU supported programme will start in April or May 2015. The programme could start implementation in the beginning of 2017.

3. Draft TWG-FR Work Plan 2015 (5 min.)

Mr. Sok Srun presented the draft TWG-FR Work Plan 2015. He emphasized that the work plan has 4 DP meetings and 4 TWG-FR meetings and 2 TWG-FR Retreats. The draft Work Plan will be presented in the coming TWG-FR meeting on 9th March for final discussion and approval. More information is in the annex 3 and is available in www.twgfr.org

Ms. Elodie called donors for support to the TWG-FR Secretariat in 2016 and if any DPs could provide support and if it is possible plan for long term support to the Secretariat.

Ms. Elodie informed the TWG-FR Retreat-1 will be on 28 February-1 March 2015 to Koh Kong province. She recalled the previous plan is to Mondulkiri but now change to Koh Kong province. She encouraged the DP members to join the retreat.

Mr. Seng Bunra, CI expressed regret that CI could not prepare the joint program of TWG-FR retreat-1 to visit the Central Cardamom Mountains due to CI has a lot of missions in that time.

4. TWG-FR Strengthening Exercise (5 min.)

Ms. Elodie/EU reported the results of the TWG-P&H (Partnership & Harmonisation) meeting that chaired by CDC and co-chaired by UNDP and Sida for finalizing the draft report of TWG Performance survey. The TWG-FR is considered to have demonstrated good performance compared to other TWGs. Some DPs suggested merging some TWGs, i.e TWG-FR, TWG-FiA and TWG-A&W, but CDC did not agree with that. The survey requested all TWGs to prepare TWG Strengthening Exercise for improvement of the performance. The TWG-FR Strengthening Exercise need be sent to CDC by end of March. The TWG-FR Secretariat has drafted the Exercise as in handout. She requested the members to have comment on the draft and may have more discussion in the TWG-FR Retreat. The report will be finally discussed and approved in the coming TWG-FR meeting. More information is in the annex 4 and is available in www.twgfr.org

5. NFP Results Framework (5 min.)

Ms. Elodie recalled the NFP Results Framework that was presented by Mr. Sok Srun during the DP meeting in August 2014. But some DPs felt difficulty with the template report in following the NFP results framework. The NFP results Framework is aligned with the NFP and could monitor the progress of achieved result of indicators. She encouraged all partners to accept and report in following the format template that developed by the Secretariat. She asked the DP members if it is agreeable then it could be raised in the coming TWG-FR meeting. The DP members agreed. More information is in the annex 5 and is available in www.twgfr.org

6. Update Forest Financing Group (15 min.)

Mr. Ross Sinclair (WCS) presented the progress of the sub-group on forest financing. The sub-group is conducting a study to look for forest financing options to support the forest conservation and the implementation of NFP as well. The study report suggests the possible new financial products and structures to pay for Cambodia forests, finance strategy; role of NGO and private sector and recommendations for further studies to make forest financing is usable. The report dissemination workshop will be in March 2015. More information is in the annex 6 and is available in www.twgfr.org

CI suggested identification of the role of RGC's institutions in management of fund. CI has experience in development of trust fund for forest conservation is very slow due to RGC has no trust fund law.

It was asked that if the study is focusing only forest conservation as it seems not to have a comprehensive outlook and if the study could include REDD+ fund.

Mr. Ross took these points for consideration and asked members to send direct comments to the consultant. The comments can be integrated before the dissemination workshop.

7. Update Community Forestry Group (15 min.)

Mr. Heng Da, (RECOFTC), sub-group of Community Forestry Development presented the progress of CF JMIs of the TWG-FR's JMI.

JMIs 2014-2015	Progress as Oct 2014	Remarks
62 new CFs potential area approved with Prakas by MAFF	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• 67 CFs, has been submitted to MAFF in the process to review• 19 CFs approved by MAFF on 10th Oct 2014	

100 CFs agreements signed with FAC	29 CF signed agreement	- 19 CFs PVH (28 Jan 2014) - 7 CFs Kg. Thom (7 Apr 2014) - 3 CFs Kg. Speu (23 Jun 2014)
150 CFMPs approved by FA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1 CFMP approved May 2014 in Kg. Thom • 85 CFMPs in step 8 of development • <i>60 CFMPs of the 85 CFMPs submitted to FA for review</i> 	

More information is in the annex 7 and is available in www.twgfr.org

The challenges are the approval of CFs by MAFF and the CFMPs by FA. Suggestions are to have meeting with FA first and then with MAFF to speed up approval of CF and the CFMPs to meet achievement of TWG-FR's JMIs 2014-2015. He presented the next plan:

- Coordinate with working group to review CFMPs
- Continue to establish PCFPCC Battambang, Kratie and Stung Treng provinces
- NCFPCC meeting
- FA cantonment Stung Treng requests support to establishment of CF in the 7 former ELCs.

He requested the FA official who is in charge of Forest and CF Department to attend the TWG-FR meeting for discussion and speed up the achievement of the JMIs.

JICA suggested that it should set up an incentive/encouragement mechanism for officials who review the proposed CF/CFMP for approval, then it could be speed up the process.

WWF suggested preparing guideline for the development of CF in the Protected Forest in the TWG-FR meeting.

8. Draft Agriculture Strategic Development Plan 2014-2018/MAFF (15 min.)

Ms. Elodie briefed the results in the consultation workshop on the draft Agriculture Strategic Development Plan 2014-2018. The Plan covers many sectors including forestry, fisheries, agronomy, livestock, etc. FAO is the Lead Facilitator of TWG-A&W and leads in reviewing and commenting on the draft. It was noted that the strategic plan is not fully coherent with each sector strategic plan. She called for comments on the strategic plan. It will be circulated the plan again for comments before it submits for approval. More information is in the annex 8 and is available in www.twgfr.org

It was suggested that the strategic plan could be improved if it had TA support to assist MAFF in consolidating comments and improve the strategic plan.

9. Update on upcoming retreat (WA) (10 min.)

Mr. John Willis (WA) briefed the program of the TWG-FR Retreat on 28 Feb-1 March.

Day 1: 28 Feb 2015	
06:00	Meeting at FA and Depart for SreAmbel ranger station in the Southern Cardamom Forest Protection Program
09:00	Arrive at SreAmbel ranger station. All 6 stations are Forestry Administration in cooperation with Wildlife Alliance. Each station has 14 men (2 Forestry Administration, 10 Military Police and 2 Wildlife Alliance). - Meet with Patrol Unit - Introduction to the Southern Cardamoms Forest Protection Program by Suwanna Gauntlett - Visit the station, hear about patrolling strategy, challenges and achievements
10:00	Depart for Community Agriculture Development Project (CADP)

10:30	Arrive at CADP in Sovanna Baitong village - Meet with Director of Agriculture and Reforestation - Meet the Agriculture Association and WA technical team of agronomists and community developers; Presentation on how WA has helped former poachers and slash-and-burn farmers living isolated in the jungle and well below the poverty line of \$200 per year to become sustainable community farmers, form a civil society, access education, create community organizations, and manage their revenues through a Community Fund based on the savings and loan model - Visit family farms and community vegetable nursery, irrigation system, and agriculture store
11:45	Depart for AndoungTeuk bridge
11:55 am	Arrive at AndoungTeuk bridge and take speedboats (12 people) to Chi Phat Community Based-Ecotourism (CBET) Visitor Center . Taking boats from AndoungTeuk to Chi Phat is the best opportunity to see excellency forest protection and beautiful landscape for ecotourism. Too many cars in Chi Phat will spoil the ecotourism experience.
12:30	Arrive at CBET Visitor Center - Lunch at CBET Visitor Center - Learn why WA initiated the CBET Project and how it provides legal, sustainable, and gainful employment to former wildlife poachers and slash-and-burn farmers
13:30	Take car to the Million Tree Nursery
14:00	Visit the nursery and learn how WA is restoring the rainforest where it been previously destroyed by human intervention, and how former poachers and slash-and-burn farmers are helping to turn devastation into sustainable forest management. - Plant your trees
15:00	Depart for Chi Phat village
15:30	Depart for Andoung Teuk bridge and then to Koh Kong town
16:00	Check in Koh Kong Resort (near border Cambodia-Thailand)
18:00	Solidarity Dinner
Day 2: 1 Mar 2015	
06:30	Breakfast in Koh Kong Resort (for whom stay in the Resort)
07:30	Depart for FA Cantonment Koh Kong,
08:00	Presentation by Chief of Koh Kong Cantonment: Forest Management
08:15	Presentation by CRDB/CDC: PBA-Country System and PBA clinic support.
10:30	Boat-Tour in PrekKohPor -Ecotourism
12:00	Lunch at KohPor
13:00	Back to Koh Kong Town and Depart for Phnom Penh

Ms. Elodie emphasized that the most important programme is the presentation by CDC about PBA and its support.

10. Mondulkiri Protected Forest road project–(10 min.)

Mr. Moul Phat (WWF) presented the RGC's planning for road construction through the Mondulkiri Protected Forest. WWF has conducted a primary investigation of the plan and seeing that it has so much impact on the forest resources and wildlife in the protected forest. WWF has taken action by sending letters to RGC institutions, MAFF, MoI, MoE to inform the impact of the road construction and suggested alternative road to be constructed that has less impact on the forest resources. WWF also met and informed the impact to the Mondulkiri provincial governor. More information is in the annex 7 and is available in www.twgfr.org

It was suggested finding a way to meet RGC leaders to describe the impact and make suggestions of alternative options.

Ms. Elodie informed that EU Delegation met MAFF and talked about impact of the plan road construction. But MAFF seemed not be aware of the plan. EU Delegation also plans to meet the MoE and include this issue.

It was suggested to have a clear study report of the impact and send to RGC institutions (Ministry of Foreign Affairs, MoI and Border Committee) to re-consider the road construction.

11. Incentive to Government officers for facilitating work–(15 min)

Mr. Tuy Sereivathana (FFI) presented the challenges and potential consequences when NGOs decide to stop payments to RGC official s for facilitating NGO’s works: Slow responses against any requests from government partners; Documents and request letters are reported to be lost. He asked some NGOs how they work with RGC’s institutions.

Mr. Ross Sinclair, WCS Country Director, has good collaboration with RGC’s institutions shared his experience. They have contract with RGC officials for field work and pay incentives and operation cost and per diem.

Mr. Seng Bunra, CI Country Director, also has good collaboration with RGC’s institutions shared his experience. CI supported the rangers of RGC official for patrol in the Protected Forests and Protected Areas in term of contract with individual. The payments are incentives, operation cost and per diem in minimum cost. The contract is also recognised by CI headquarters.

Mr. Vathana: FFI also confirmed that we do have the same arrangements as WCS and CI – we also are happy to pay per diems, ranger salaries – these are all agreed in MoUs and we don’t have a problem with that. FFI was raising the issue of monthly payments to senior government staff.

Ms. Elodie suggested that if the NGOs want to have further discussion in a donor lunch and have joint report to EU Delegation for consideration.

12. Sharing of information on the website – (5 min)

Mr. Sok Srun presented the website of TWG-FR (www.twgfr.org). The website has information for public visitors. The information includes the minutes, presentations, plans, laws, regulations, study’s reports, etc. He asked the partners if they have information/report for sharing in the website then send it to the Secretariat and he submits the proposal to FA for decision.

Ms. Elodie encouraged partners to share information in TWG-FR website and/or in EU-web private platform for sharing information. Our members could sign in the EU web platform for sharing information. The minutes of DP meeting is not uploaded in the twgfr.org

13. Draft agenda of the 43rd TWG-FR Meeting– (10 min.)

Mr. Sok Srun presented the draft agenda of the 43rd TWG-FR Meeting. The meeting will be held on 9 March 2014. The result of discussion was coming up the agenda as below:

Time	Agenda	Purpose	Responsible
08:00 - 08:30	Registration of participants		
08:30 - 08:40	Welcome and Open meeting		H.E. Dr. Chheng Kimsun
	I. Policy and Strategic Management dialogue		
08:40 -08:50	1. Review and follow up action points and approval of the minutes of the 42 nd TWG-FR meeting	For finalization and approval	All
08:50 -09:10	2. TWG-FR Work Plan 2015	For approval	Mr. SokSrun

09:10 -09:20	3. Report of TWG-FR Strengthening Exercise.	Discussion and approval	Mr. SokSrun
09:20 -09:35	4. Plan of road construction in Mondulkiri Protected Forest	For information	WWF
II. National Forest Program			
09:35 -09:55	5. Completion Report on the implementation of NFP Work Plan 2014, and Update of NFP Work Plan 2014-18	Sharing information	Mr. SokSrun
09:55- 10:10	<i>6. Update of establishment of Prey Long Protected Forest</i>	Update progress	Dr. Keo Omaliss
10:20 – 10:40	7. Update of Task Group 1 Forest Financing	Update progress	Chhun Delux/FA
	8. Update of Task Group 2 Community Forestry	Update progress	Mr. Heng Da RECOFTC
III. Protected Areas Management (GDANCP)			
10:40 – 11:00	9. Update the development of the National Strategic Management Plan of Protected Areas	For information	H.E Chuop Paris, MoE Deputy Secretary General
IV. Flooded Forest Management (FiA)			
11:00 – 11:15	10. Introduction of SDC supported projects	For information	SDC
V. Any Other Business and Closing			
11:15 – 11:30	11. Any Other Business	For information	All
11:30-11:45	12. Wrap up and Closing		Ms. Elodie Maria-Sube
11:45-12:00	The 44 th TWG-FR meeting 12 June 2015 (Friday)		H.E Dr. Chheng Kimsun

14. Results of a study on the impacts of Charcoal Production in the Northern Cardamoms -10 min

Mr. Yann, GERES presented the results of a study on the impacts of Charcoal Production in the Northern Cardamoms. The study found in 2013 that 85% of wood energy cooking demand were used in domestic cooking, 7% in garment factories, 4% in manufacturing, 1% in fish smoking, 1% in ice making, 1% in tobacco curing, 1% in small scale food processing.

GERES survey from 1,969 households, representatives of the Cambodian population, shows that the share of households that use charcoal as a primary fuel does not decrease with an increase in wealth.

In Cambodia, GERES's preliminary estimation of annual wood-fuel demands around 1.7 million ton for firewood and 336,000 ton for charcoal (requiring 2 million ton of wood);

Most of this wood is lost due to inefficiency all over the wood-fuel value-chain.

Wood-fuel represents an estimated economic value of 350 million USD and is essential to sustain the livelihoods of millions of households relying on rain-fed rice;

Currently an important share of the biomass energy is supplied by land cover change for agriculture; tackling the issues of wood-fuel requires a more systemic approach and better integration with other initiatives: conservation and income diversification programmes, Community Forestry, REDD+ mechanisms etc...

For more information is annex 14 and is available in www.twgfr.org

15. Any Other Business

- Non

Participants:

- | | |
|---------------------------------|---|
| 1. Ms. Elodie Maria-Sube | DP Lead Facilitator of TWG-FR, Attaché, EU Delegation, |
| 2. Mr. Uchida Togo | Project Formulation Advisor, JICA |
| 3. Ms. Siv Cheang | Program Officer, JICA |
| 4. Mr. Hiroshi Nakata | Technical Advisor to DG-FA |
| 5. Ms. Naomi Matsue | Administrative Coordinator, FA-JICA |
| 6. Ms. Maria Iniguez de Heredia | Officer in charge of the Natural Science Sector, UNESCO |
| 7. Dr. Moeko Saito-Jensen | Program Analyst, UNDP |
| 8. Mr. Mathieu Van Rijin | Forestry Officer, FAO |
| 9. Ms. Delphine Vann | Program Manager, SDC |
| 10. Dr. Ross Sinclair | Country Director, WCS |
| 11. Mr. Moul Phath | EPL Manager, WWF |
| 12. Mr. Un Chakrey | Communication Manager, WWF |
| 13. Mr. Jonh Willis | Director of Program, WA |
| 14. Mr. Seng Bunra | Country Director, CI |
| 15. Mr. Curtis Hundley | Chief of Party, WINROCK |
| 16. Mr. Tuy Sereivathana | Country Director, FFI |
| 17. Mr. Rob Harris | Project Manager, FFI |
| 18. Mr. Wayne Burton | CEO, Grandis Timber Ltd |
| 19. Mr. Mathieu Ruillet | Regional Director, GERES |
| 20. Ms. Chailotte Nicollet | Development Director, GERES |
| 21. Mr. Yann FRANÇOIS | Technical Advisor, GERES |
| 22. Ms. Claire Dufour | Executive Director, Nexus |
| 23. Mr. Heng Da | Deputy Country Program Coordinator, RECOFTC |
| 24. Mr. Oum Sony | Country Coordinator, NTFP-EP |
| 25. Mr. Sok Srun | Coordinator of TWG-FR Secretariat. Tel:012 940936 |
| 26. Mr. Som Sopheak | Administrative Assistant, TWG-FR |

Recorded by Mr. Sok Srun

Approved by Ms. Elodie Maria-Sube



Coordinator of TWG-FR



Lead DP Facilitator of TWG-FR

