



DIRECTORATE GENERAL FOR NEIGHBOURHOOD AND ENLARGEMENT NEGOTIATIONS – DG NEAR

## Short term high quality studies to support activities under the Eastern Partnership

#### **HIQSTEP PROJECT**

# THE CONSOLIDATION OF INTER- INSTITUTIONAL COOPERATION AND COMMUNICATION MECHANISM ON CSDP-RELATED MATTERS CASE STUDY: REPUBLIC OF GEORGIA

#### **PUBLIC STUDY REPORT**

-March 2017-

This report has been prepared by the KANTOR Management Consultants Consortium. The findings, conclusions and interpretations expressed in this document are those of the Consortium alone and should in no way be taken to reflect the policies or opinions of the European Commission.

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

The European Neighbourhood Policy (ENP) Review, and the Work Programme on 2014-2017 of the Platform 1 of the Eastern Partnership have provided a new impetus to cooperation with partners on matters related to the CSDP. This is to be achieved -on a case by case basis- by promoting the participation of partner countries in CSDP missions and operations, in EU Battlegroups, and via their association to relevant programmes and agencies such as the European Defence Agency and the European Security and Defence College.

Georgia (GE) has been one of the most committed EU partners in the framework of the Eastern Partnership. In this capacity, GE signed and is currently implementing an Association Agreement with the EU. In this context, the HiQSTEP project has commissioned a study on the "Consolidation of Inter-Institutional Cooperation and Communication Mechanism on CSDP-related matters: Case Studies Georgia and Republic of Moldova" that was implemented by an international Study Team (ST).

Over the last years, GE strived to tighten its ties with the EU on CSDP. However, it faced significant challenges in promoting participation in CSDP operations, missions and other CSDP-related activities, in three main areas: inter-institutional cooperation, public communication, and expanding CSDP and other defence and security cooperation.

In light of the findings of a fact-finding study-trip, and an expanded desk review, consolidated with the feedback received during the validation study trip to Tbilisi, the ST has proposed a draft Individual Implementation Action Plan for GE. This Action Plan included concrete recommendations to:

- Create a national data base of experts who might participate in CSDP missions and operations;
- Enhance inter-institutional communication in case there is an invitation to participate in a CSDP operation and mission;
- Complement the Framework Agreement (FA) with the EU on participation in EU crisis management operations with bi- or multi-lateral supporting agreements;
- Identify ways to co-finance participation in CSDP operations and missions;
- Establish clear procedures for staff selection, deployment in, and return from, CSDP civilian missions;
- Develop a sound education and training system in the field of CSDP;
- Enhance public communication on CSDP in line with EU Member States' best practices;
- Build-up/ strengthen the platform for dialogue with civil society and the media related to participation in EU-led crisis management, and, more generally, raise public awareness on CSDP cooperation;
- Enable representatives of the private sector to engage in CSDP missions and operations.

The ST has also proposed an outline for an EaP Model for Partner's Participation in CSDP, which might help regional countries to develop policy options to promote their participation in CSDP, while ensuring efficient cooperation and communication among stakeholder-institutions and with the public and civil society on CSDP-related matters and activities.

#### **Abbreviations and acronyms**

AA Association Agreement

CFSP Common Foreign and Security Policy
CSDP Common Defence and Security Policy
E&T Education & Training/ Capacity Building

EUD Delegation of the European Union

EUGS EU Global Strategy on foreign and security policy

EUMM EU Monitoring Mission
EUMS EU Member States

EUPST EU Police Services Training Consortium

FA Framework Agreement on Participation in EU Crisis Management Operations

FSR Final Study Report

HiQSTEP High Quality Studies for the Eastern Partnership

IR Inception Study Report
IRR Interim Study Report
MFA Ministry of Foreign Affairs
MIA Ministry of Interior Affairs

MoD Ministry of Defence
MoFin Ministry of Finance

PCDCB Process of Capability Development and Capacity Building

PSR Public Study Report
RTC Regional Training Centre
NSC National Security Council

SSCMC State Security and Crisis Management Council

SSS State Security Service

ST Study Team

TEU Treaty of the European Union

TFEU Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union

#### **Country codes**

GE Georgia MD Moldova

#### THE LAUNCH AND IMPLEMENTATION OF THE STUDY

In early 2016, the HiQSTEP project has commissioned, upon the initiative of Georgia and Moldova, a study on the "Consolidation of Inter-Institutional Cooperation and Communication Mechanism on CSDP-related matters" to support activities under Platform 1 of the Eastern Partnership. The two countries actively participated in the preparation and approval of its specific Terms of Reference (TOR). The study on Georgia was drafted by a Study Team (ST) under the leadership of George Vlad Niculescu, and composed of Grazvydas Jasutis, Senior International Expert, and Kakha Gogolashvili, national expert.

The main goal of this study was "to develop policy options and policies with a view to promote participation of Georgia in CSDP missions while ensuring efficient cooperation and communication among stakeholder-institutions, and with the civil society on CSDP-related matters and activities."

At the beginning of April 2016, the ST prepared an Inception Study Report (IR) that summarised its assignments, described the detailed methodology for research, introduced a number of indicators/ criteria for evaluation, assessed the risks, and proposed solutions to manage those risks. On April 12, the stakeholders of the CSDP Study discussed the IR during a joint meeting held in Brussels, at the EC/DG Near, with the participation of all members of the ST. A number of amendments were proposed, and the most concrete were included in the final version of the IR. Eventually, on April 20, the amended IR has been approved by the stakeholders via a silence procedure.

At the end of June 2016, the ST prepared two separate Interim Reports (IRRs) -one for GE and the other for MD- that described the implementation of the study from April to June, presented the main findings of the fact-finding study trips of May-June, and outlined the next steps in the implementation of the Study, until the end of November. On July 14, 2016 the stakeholders of the CSDP Study discussed and approved the IRRs in two separate Interim Study meetings, held in Brussels at the EC/DG NEAR.

The IRR for GE concluded, and the stakeholders agreed, to focus further research on the following tasks:

- Re-examine the legal framework on the secondment of civilian and military personnel
  to CSDP missions and operations with a view to developing proposals aimed to adjust
  the existing procedures and mechanisms for selection, secondment and post-arrival
  procedures according to EUMS best practices.
- 2. Provide advice in the process of creation of national experts' pool for CSDP missions and operations. This should include guidance on best practices from EUMS on establishing, managing and sustaining national experts pool. New legal acts might have to be introduced at governmental level in support of creating of the pool.
- 3. Explore various options for increasing EU financial support to enhancing GE participation in CSDP operations and missions.

- 4. Provide a package of recommendations focused on training and education. There is a need to review existing capacities in the field. An idea of creating new training facilities which would meet national and regional needs could be further explored.
- 5. Issue specific recommendations on establishing a private-public partnership to enhance GE participation in CSDP missions and operations by enabling representatives of the private sector to engage in CSDP missions and operations.
- 6. Advise on further enhancing public communication on CSDP. There is a need for a comprehensive public awareness raising campaign with regard to Georgia's participation to the CSDP (including targeting Georgians who live in remote areas or who belong to ethnic minorities).
- 7. Provide advice and information on hybrid threats and on possibilities of cooperation with different EU agencies and institutions to counter them (for example, ENISA, INTCEN, the EU cell for intelligence).

After the Interim Study meeting, the CSDP ST expanded the desk review with questionnaire-based interviews with EU experts from 10 different organizations involved in CSDP (including EEAS/CMPD, EEAS/CPCC, EEAS/Foreign Policy Instrument/ Instrument contributing to Stability and Peace, EEAS/Stratcom Task Force, the EU Military Staff, European Security and Defence College, the EU Police Services Training Consortium, EU Institute for Security Studies, European Defence Agency, and the EaP Trust Fund for CSDP), and drafted and consolidated the Final Study Report (FSR) for GE, while focusing its efforts on updating, and implementing the tasks described in the IRR. On 30 October-3 November 2016, the ST has conducted a validation study trip to GE aiming to: update the findings on progress on CSDP (legal, policy, capabilities, communication, deployment plans); and to discuss with local authorities and with the civil society the initial recommendations, prior to finalizing the study, as to their content, level of priority (high, medium, low), and assistance needs for implementation. The Final Study Report (FSR) was then discussed with the stakeholders on 23 January 2017.

#### CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FOLLOW-UP

Georgia has been, aside Moldova, one of the most committed EU partners in the framework of the Eastern Partnership. GE has signed, and it is currently implementing an Association Agreement with the EU. GE government and civil society have repeatedly expressed their high interest and strong commitment for expanding and enhancing their cooperation with the EU in the area of CSDP. Extensive research conducted in Central and East European countries has shown that establishing sound inter-institutional cooperation, and public communication frameworks and mechanisms are crucial for both expanding and enhancing partners' involvement in CSDP missions and operations, and for their closer association with related European programmes and agencies.

Over the last years, Georgia undertook significant steps towards tightening its ties with the EU in the area of CSDP:

- In November 2013, a Framework Agreement for the participation of Georgia in EU crisis management operations was signed;
- In June 2014, the EU and Georgia signed an Association Agreement (AA), which laid down a strengthened framework for enhanced political dialogue on all areas of mutual interest, allowing the development of closer political relations. The AA is the legal framework underpinning the intensified dialogue and cooperation between Georgia and the EU, and is promoting their gradual convergence on foreign and security policies, including on CSDP.
- To enhance inter-institutional coordination at the national level, the Government of Georgia decided in 2014 to establish an Inter-agency Working Group on CSDP matters, led by the State Security and Crisis Management Council (SSCMC), and composed of representatives of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Defence, the State Ministry for European and Euro-Atlantic Integration, Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Interior Affairs, Ministry of Justice and the State Security Service (SSS). It is worth noting that, under the auspices of the Inter-agency Working Group, two fundamental documents were agreed: a governmental decree "On approving the rules for the participation of Georgia in the EU Civilian Crisis Management Operations", and another decree "On approving the rules and conditions for the reimbursement of social guarantees and secondment costs of the personnel participating in the EU Civilian Crisis Management Operations".
- In January 2015, the Government of Georgia adopted the 2015 National Action Plan (NAP) for the Implementation of the Association Agreement Georgia, which is seeking, inter alia, to facilitate and ensure Georgia's participation in CSDP missions and operations, as well as in related trainings and consultations. This issue was further referred in the 2016 NAP, adopted in March 2016.
- In June 2016, the Georgian Foreign Minister, and EU's High Representative for Foreign and Security Policy signed the Agreement Between Georgia and the European Union on Security Procedures for Exchanging and Protecting Classified Information.

In this context, the CSDP Study Team has presented the following recommendations:

- Prepare a new Law on Secondment to enable substantial contributions to the implementation of CSDP.
- Finalize all the procedures needed for the entry in to force of the Agreement Between Georgia
  and the European Union on Security Procedures for Exchanging and Protecting Classified
  Information.
- Amend the Law referring to Georgia's participation in peacekeeping operations, as appropriate.
- Prepare Terms of Reference for the Commission for Selection of seconded personnel.
- Create a pool of national experts for CSDP missions and operations.
- Conduct bilateral and multilateral discussions with EU Member States to explore opportunities for financial support.
- Designate an agency responsible for training candidates for CSDP missions and operations.

- Develop relations with the European Security and Defence College and the EU Police Services Training Consortium.
- Request access to the Goalkeeper program.
- Establish a regional CSDP training centre.
- Explore the necessity to join the EU battle groups.
- Approve the Communication Strategy on Georgia's EU and NATO Membership for 2017-2020.
- Organize comprehensive public awareness campaigns with regard to Georgia's participation in CSDP.
- Deepen cooperation with the East STRATCOM Task Force on addressing the on-going Russian disinformation campaigns in GE.
- Continue informal staff talks with the European Defence Agency (EDA) to discuss the potential
  value added and possible mutual benefits of GE concluding an Administrative Arrangement
  with the EDA.
- Establish private-public partnership to enable better contributions to CSDP missions and operations.

Consequently, the ST proposed the following **draft Individual Implementation Action Plan**:

#### DRAFT INDIVIDUAL IMPLEMENTATION ACTION PLAN FOR GEORGIA

No	Recommendation	Implementing agency	Priority	Resources	Timeframe
1	Preparation of a new Law on Secondment	MFA, SSCMC, Research study team	High	Visibility workshop	
2.	Finalize all the procedures needed for the entry in to force of the Agreement Between Georgia and the European Union on Security Procedures for Exchanging and Protecting Classified Information	SSSG	High		
3.	Amendment of the Law referring to Georgia's participation in peacekeeping operations.	MOD, MFA, SSCMC	Low		
4.	Preparation of Terms of Reference for the Commission for Selection of seconded personnel	MFA, SSCMC, Research study team	Medium		

No	Recommendation	Implementing agency	Priority	Resources	Timeframe
5.	Creation of a pool of national experts and forces for CSDP missions and operations	Government, Parliament, SSCMC, MFA, Line ministries, SSS	High	Visibility workshop	
6.	Conduct bilateral and multilateral discussions with EUMS to explore opportunities for financial support	Government, Parliament, CSDP WG, EEAS/CMPD, EEAS/EUMS, EaP Trust Fund	Medium	GE resources for bilateral and multi- lateral meetings EaP TF funding	
7.	Designation of the agency responsible for training candidates for CSDP missions and operations.	CSDP WG	High	Visibility workshop	
8.	Develop relations with the ESDC and the EUPST Consortium	Designated agency, CSDP WG, MoD, MIA, ESDC, EUPST, EEAS/CMPD, EaP Trust Fund	Medium	EU funding, EaP TF funding	
9.	Request access to Goalkeeper program	CSDP WG, EEAS/CMPD	Low		
10.	Organize tailored training on completing CSDP application forms and preparation for interviews	Designated agency, CSDP WG, EEAS/CPCC	Medium	EU funding	
11.	Establish regional CSDP training centre	Prime minister's office, MIA, MFA, SSCMC, MoE, MoFin	Medium	Visibility workshop. Burden sharing by government and EU/EUMS, subject to separate agreement.	

No	Recommendation	Implementing agency	Priority	Resources	Timeframe
12.	Explore the necessity to join EU battle groups	MOD, CSDP WG, MoD, EEAS/EUMS, FN Battlegroup	Low		
13.	Approve the Communication Strategy on Georgia's EU and NATO Membership for 2017-2020	Government, The Office of the State Minister on European and Euro-Atlantic Integration, CSDP WG	Medium		
14.	Organize comprehensive public awareness campaigns with regard to Georgia's participation in CSDP	The Office of the State Minister on European and Euro-Atlantic Integration Government, CSDP WG, Line ministries, EEAS/STRATCOM Civil Society	Medium	GE resources along with materials provided by EU EU funding	
15.	Deepen cooperation with the East STRATCOM Task Force on addressing the on-going Russian disinformation campaigns in GE	CSDP WG, Line ministries, SSS, EEAS/STRATCOM East, Civil Society	High	EU funding	
16.	Continue informal staff talks with the European Defence Agency (EDA) to discuss the potential value added and possible mutual benefits of GE concluding an Administrative Arrangement with the EDA.	CSDP WG, MoD, EDA	High		
17.	Establish private-public partnership to enable better contributions to CSDP missions and operations.	MFA, MOD, SSCMC, Research study team	Medium	Visibility workshop	

During the validation study trip, the ST was re-assured by the deputy secretary of the SSCMC that he intended to organize, in early 2017, a meeting of the CSDP Inter-agency working group, in deputy ministers format, to assess the recommendations included in the above draft Individual Implementation Action Plan, and to set clear tasks, responsibilities, and timelines for each recommendation they intended to implement. The ST will be available to further support the implementation of this Action Plan, including by possibly organizing in 2017 up to two "visibility workshops" to present the study results to specialized audience and diplomats, and to discuss with them the way ahead, particularly in some of the areas deemed of high and medium priority.

### THE PROSPECTS AND POSSIBLE SHAPE OF AN EASTERN PARTNERSHIP MODEL FOR PARTNERS' PARTICIPATION IN CSDP

The CSDP Study TOR tasked the ST to "assess the prospects and possible shape of an Eastern Partnership (EaP) Model for partners' participation in CSDP".

An EaP Model could only add value by promoting a practical approach to partners' participation in CSDP. A practical approach would involve, on the one hand, greater flexibility of the model which should be adaptable to the individual needs and circumstances of interested countries. On the other hand, dedicated advisory teams and capacity building programs should support its adaptation to the individual needs of each interested regional country. In addition, this Model may become a regional resource for increasing the effectiveness and efficiency of relevant international assistance by the EU institutions, and the EUMS.

The EaP Model for Partner's Participation in CSDP should aim at helping regional countries to develop policy options to promote their participation in CSDP, while ensuring efficient cooperation and communication among stakeholder-institutions and with the public and civil society on CSDP-related matters and activities. To this end, the EaP Partners should strive to meet four standard-objectives:

SO-1) Develop, review and implement legislation fully compatible with the Framework Agreements on Partners' participation in EU crisis management operations. That would entail that their national legislations should provide:

- the legal basis and general principles for participation in international missions, while explicitly referring to commitments under the "treaties concluded with the EU":
- the decision making on the deployment and the withdrawal of military personnel, as well as the procedures for transfer of authority for military contingents assigned to an international operation or mission;
- the intra-governmental decision making on the secondment of civilian personnel to, and withdrawal from, an international mission;
- requirements for the selection, E&T, and registration of the personnel proposed to participate in civilian missions;
- the status, rights and obligations of the seconded staff;

- guarantees for social protection of the deployed staff;
- a broad framework for handling the related financial and logistical aspects;
- procedures for the secondment of individual experts from the private sector.

## SO-2) Develop and implement effective and transparent national policies, plans, capabilities, as well as management mechanisms. That would entail:

- Developing a National Policy Document on the Selection, Education and Training, Deployment, and Return of Seconded Personnel for Civilian Missions providing for the requirements and procedures for the secondment of personnel to be applied across relevant governmental institutions;
- Defining the level of ambition for capabilities to support EU-led operations and missions by establishing a national pool of CSDP experts and forces;
- Developing and implementing policies, structures, as well as financial and logistic arrangements to facilitate covering the costs of participation in CSDP operations and missions;
- Developing a sound E&T/capacity building system in the field of CSDP;
- Developing and implementing policies, structures, as well as inter-institutional, and international arrangements to streamline the information flow related to the Calls for Contribution to CSDP operations and missions;

SO-3) Enhance the involvement of non-institutional actors, including the civil society, the media, and individual experts, in policy formulation and implementation, as well as in explaining to the wider public the interests, practical benefits, and expected outcomes of increasing participation in CSDP activities. That would entail:

- Setting up/maintaining an effective organization for public and strategic communications on European Integration, including branches in all line ministries, EU Information and Documentation Centres, and an operational mechanism for cooperation and coordination with the civil society, and the media:
- Drafting and approving National Public Communication and Information Strategies on European Integration on the medium term, as well as Annual Action Plans for the implementation of this strategy;
- Planning and conducting periodic public information campaigns on CSDP matters;
- Facilitating the education and training/capacity building on CSDP of journalists, researchers, academics, and other experts of the civil society;
- Setting up **Public-Private Partnerships (PPP)** to engage private capital and civil society in decision-making and cost-sharing in three areas:
  - o Private sector contributions to CSDP missions.
  - Developing training capabilities. For instance, private capital and expertise could help the Government to set up CSDP training centres which could serve for capacity building for both private and governmental experts.

 Developing strategic communication, i.e. civil society could play a key role in adapting and implementing the strategy of communication, and in facilitating reaching out to ethnic minorities and to local communities who live in remote areas.

SO-4) Develop, contribute to, and implement practical supporting mechanisms for cooperation between interested EU institutions, the EUMS, and the EaP states (such as the existing EaP Trust Fund for CSDP). This would entail:

- A Process of Capability Development and Capacity Building (PCDCB) aiming to help EaP countries to meet the four Standard Objectives through fostering and promoting dialogue, exchange of experience and practical cooperation at both institutional and non-institutional levels. At the institutional level, this process could involve relevant public institutions in formats with variable geometry enabling project/issue-oriented participation of Eastern Partners while avoiding political sensitivities against some neighbours, for example Azerbaijan vs. Armenia. At non-institutional level, participation of the relevant civil society organizations, media, and academic institutions should be envisaged, while appropriate exchanges and coordination with the institutional level should be maintained. The CSDP Regional Training Centre could offer institutional support to the PCDCB.
- A CSDP Regional Training Centre (RTC) would develop EaP professional expertise required to address the specific needs of CSDP missions and operations, and the development and implementation of related policies. procedures, and capabilities. Closer cooperation with the European Security and Defence College (ESDC) and with the EUMS education and training institutions could open the way for the international accreditation of this RTC. Courses should use English as the main language, and include modules on: CFSP and CSDP-history, structures, procedures; crisis management in CSDP missions and operations; mechanisms for funding; gender and human rights; cyber security; terrorism; hybrid threats; strategic communication. It is axiomatic that EUMS would need to be supportive of this Centre, and may provide appropriate funding and other assistance. This RTC should present quarantees that the existing training capacity for Eastern Partners would be enhanced by a sound process of curriculum and content development. In addition to developing CSDP expertise, the Regional Training Centre could also offer expert advice to those Eastern Partners who would undertake efforts to adapt the EaP model on CSDP to their individual needs and circumstances, as well as research capabilities on regional security and defence affairs.
- The **Public-Private-Civil Partnerships** would expand the PPPs at national level (suggested under SO-3) into a multilateral Eastern Partnership framework with a view to creating regional synergies and exchanges of information.
- The EaP Trust Fund for CSDP Civilian & Military Capabilities Development and Deployment would be built upon the existing EaP Trust Fund for CSDP

with a view to further support Eastern Partners' participation in CSDP E&T activities, as well as personnel contributions to military operations. The membership of the Trust Fund should be broadened, and its mandate should be extended to cover also costs for personnel contributions to civilian missions, as well as logistic, deployment, and other costs related to Eastern Partners' participation in CSDP operations and missions.

#### EAP MODEL ON CSDP -Strategy Chart Legislation Develop. National Review & Policies, institutional Plans, Implement. actors active Capabilities. Harmonized involvement Management with the FAs Mechanisms Promote Eastern Partners participation in CSDP, while ensuring effective interinstitutional cooperation and communication, and public communication and information on CSDP matters

Setting up practical EaP cooperation on CSDP would require:

- a good blueprint, which could be provided by the EaP Model;
- political will and support from regional countries;
- an appropriate legal basis providing cooperation mechanisms which would allow effective resources pooling and capabilities sharing;
- practical projects supported by international donors aiming at supporting the development of regional capability and capacity building.

While talking to the relevant public authorities and civil societies in GE and MD, the ST noted mutual interests, and common assistance needs related to the consolidation of their inter-agency cooperation, and public communication mechanisms on CSDP-related matters. These interests and assistance needs may enable an active bilateral dialogue and concrete cooperation between GE and MD in areas such as:

- updating national legislation, and the inter-institutional regulatory framework to enable increased civilian participation;
- education and training;
- strategies for public communication;
- effective responses to hybrid, cyber and terrorist threats.